

spearheaded Istanbul's urban growth after the city's fifteenth-century conquest by the Ottomans, and she underlines the importance of the services provided by such foundations in the lives of their neighborhoods. The chapter is peppered with remarkable information, such as the fact that Istanbul had more than three thousand endowments by the end of the sixteenth century. Macaraig also makes the important point that such foundations operated through extensive economic networks that helped weave together the different parts of the empire. Çemberlitaş Hamamı was a small component of a substantial endowment that included income-generating properties both inside and outside the city, intended to bring material and spiritual blessings to the queen mother and her descendants and beneficiaries. Also in this chapter, Macaraig examines the historical experiences of various individuals at the Çemberlitaş Hamamı complex, from the faithful praying in the mosque to the madrasa students who resided there to the sick and weary travelers who received care at the hospital, all thanks to the endowment deed.

In the next chapter, "From Birth to Breadwinner," Macaraig provides a detailed description of Çemberlitaş Hamamı's construction as well as bathhouse operations, discussing the various mechanics involved in an Ottoman bathhouse, from the bringing of water to the production of steam. She also addresses economic considerations throughout the bathhouse system, from the employees and their guilds to the bathers, owners, and operators.

Chapter 4, "Impressions and Identities," provides an excellent discussion of how early modern Ottoman social life centered on the hamam. Macaraig explains the requirements for bodily cleanliness in Islam, noting that the greater ablution, which was "required after sexual activity, menstruation, childbirth, touching a dead body and before Friday prayers, the two major Muslim holidays, and departure on the pilgrimage to Mecca, consists of a careful scrubbing and rinsing of the entire body" (117). This meant that every male and female Muslim visited the bathhouse at least once a week. The chapter provides a fascinating view of the hamam's role in social life. Macaraig describes, for example, the ritual bathhouse visit of a newborn with

its mother on the fortieth day of life, as well as the uses of hamams by non-Muslims, issues of class and ethnic differences in the use of hamams, and the effects of these differences on bathhouse design. She also considers how carnal desires have been projected onto hamams in literature and art by both Ottomans and foreigners, and analyzes the role of hamams in the prevention and treatment of diseases.

Chapter 5, "In Sickness and in Health," focuses on the various renovations to Çemberlitaş Hamamı over the years, with particular attention to eighteenth-century interventions. Macaraig considers how repairs were funded and explains how monetary support for architectural renovation and preservation was originally built into the endowment system. She also discusses the 1768 imperial edict that forbade the building of new bathhouses in the city—because of the strain these institutions placed on urban water and fuel supplies—but stated that existing facilities should be subject to careful upkeep.

The next chapter, titled "Old Age," moves into the nineteenth century, as Macaraig shows how endowed properties in the empire passed slowly into private hands, while both urban modernization efforts and major fires had deleterious effects on bath buildings. In 1868, Çemberlitaş Hamamı was partially demolished to make way for the enlargement of the Divan Yolu. The damage caused to the southwest corner of the women's dressing room at that time led to the closure of the women's section until 2011. In this chapter Macaraig also examines bathhouses as emblems of Ottoman heritage. She discusses the hamam built for the Ottoman display at the 1867 World's Fair in Paris, which was presented to fairgoers as a symbol of Ottoman identity. She also considers the fate of hamams during the early Turkish Republic's modernization campaigns and its efforts to distance itself from the Ottoman past.

In her final chapter, "Second Spring," Macaraig examines the rise of the hamam as a tourist attraction beginning in the nineteenth century and suggests that this revived popularity has led some locals to appreciate the hamam anew. This chapter is concerned above all with the experiences of those who use the hamam, including its managers and employees.

In her epilogue, Macaraig emphasizes the need for scholars to provide different narratives of the hamam and to address its shifting symbolism and meaning for visitors and passersby alike. Her fascinating study underscores this last point by focusing on the different audiences who have encountered the hamam over the centuries. A rich account of the social lives of Ottoman bathhouses, this book is an indispensable and exciting new addition to the literature.

EMINE FETVACI  
*Boston University*

Mohammad Gharipour, ed.

**Gardens of Renaissance Europe and the Islamic Empires: Encounters and Confluences**

University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2017, 272 pp., 55 color and 67 b/w illus. \$94.95 (cloth), ISBN 9780271077796

This edited volume from Mohammad Gharipour presents research on cross-cultural influences in garden design between Renaissance-era Europe and three Islamic empires: Mughal, Safavid, and Ottoman. It begins with a prologue by D. Fairchild Ruggles that summarizes relevant work on Islamic garden traditions, including themes of poetry and metaphor, form and typology, agricultural production, environmental concerns, and gardens as agents for cultural production. The book concludes with an epilogue in which Anatole Tchikine asks whether the term "global Renaissance" allows for new perspectives on the study and comparative understanding of gardens produced by European and Islamic rulers. Between prologue and epilogue are eight essays. In comparison to Renaissance gardens of Italy, France, England, and Portugal, two of the essays explore Ottoman gardens, four look at Mughal gardens, one examines the Safavid gardens established by Shah Abbas in and around the city of Isfahan, and another considers varied gardens of Islamic geography.

The book's first essay, "Embracing the Other: Venetian Garden Design, Early Modern Travelers, and the Islamic Landscape," by Christopher Pastore, documents the travel of several Venetians who went east from the later fifteenth through the late seventeenth centuries. Pastore discusses

their observations of multiple cultures and sites in Egypt, Syria, the Indian subcontinent, Ethiopia, the Arabian desert, Baghdad, the Ottoman and early Safavid Empires, and Al-Andalus. Venetians embraced novel garden ideas derived from these cultures and applied them to the designs of sixteenth- and seventeenth-century estates in the Veneto, alongside their borrowings from the classical villa tradition. The essay includes references and plans showing how Venetian gardens were expanded and updated through the use of novel hydraulics and vegetation, and how they were influenced by illustrations of landscapes encountered by those traveling abroad. Pastore argues that Venetian gardens served as experimental nodes of transformation and change, and as sites of intellectual and aesthetic exploration, ultimately helping to diversify the Venetian economy through agricultural production. The garden became a medium of translation in Venice's embrace of cultural otherness, inspiring Venetian elites who believed that "the path to knowledge lay open to those who break the shackles of tradition" (15). In addition to offering a well-documented assessment of how Venetians engaged with other cultures and garden traditions, Pastore proposes new perspectives and suggests topics in need of further study.

In the essay that follows, "Staging the Civilizing Elements in the Gardens of Rome and Istanbul," Simone M. Kaiser offers a comparable discussion of landscape traditions in two urban centers, Renaissance Rome and Ottoman Istanbul. In both cases, the gardens of royal residences were informed by earlier suburban gardens and villas. Kaiser examines shared characteristics in European and Ottoman garden traditions, including the planting of trees to evoke paradise on earth and the role of hierarchical garden and courtyard arrangements in villa and palace design as means of distinguishing public from private quarters. Kaiser identifies similarities between European and Ottoman practices and designs: the use of *spolia*, which could make gardens into showcases of power and geographical domination; the emphasis on water; and the use of slave labor in the building and maintenance of gardens (a significant if underexamined vector of cultural exchange). Despite the brevity of

her analysis, Kaiser provides a fresh perspective on the value of comparative study.

In "The Art of Garden Design in France: Ottoman Influences at the Time of the 'Scandalous Alliance'?" Laurent Paya offers a well-structured theoretical framework, original research supported by a range of sources, and a convincing argument. His essay documents possible Ottoman influences on the sixteenth-century French garden designs of the emerging "pleasure palaces," particularly at Blois and Fontainebleau, that took the place of "fortified castles" (58). French "creative imitation" (59) led to "mimetic desire" (60; 75, n. 26) directed toward Turkish culture, which had major impacts not only on garden designs and garden traditions but also on a diverse range of artistic production, as well as the "art of memory" (73). Paya examines in detail the documentation of Ottoman gardens by French humanist scientists and discusses the employment of Ottoman and other non-Western garden specialists in French royal gardens and the resulting exchange of horticultural expertise, as well as the inspiration derived from such Oriental sources as plants, exotic flowers, herbs, and garden layouts, in addition to carpets, fabrics, ornaments, and costumes. The author incorrectly dates the Ottoman Sa'dabad garden in an endnote (75, n. 7), but this otherwise meticulously written essay is an outstanding contribution and prompts important questions about histories that cross conventional disciplinary boundaries.

Editor Mohammad Gharipour's essay, "The Gardens of Safavid Isfahan and Renaissance Italy: A New Urban Landscape?," provides a thorough summary of Shah Abbas's building activity, mainly in Isfahan. Gharipour cites important textual and visual references, including maps, to assess characteristics of the Safavid city in relation to its European counterparts, and to examine the role of gardens as constructive components of the urban fabric. He illuminates the garden's role in alluding to historical architectural elements, considers the use of hydraulic engineering in enabling functional and aesthetic uses of water, and discusses new modes of garden-inspired visuality, where perspectival views connected surrounding landscapes and offered new types of public space.

As noted, four of the essays focus on gardens of the Mughal empire. In "For Beauty, and Air, and View': Contemplating the Wider Surroundings of Sixteenth-Century Mughal and European Gardens," Jill Sinclair discusses how early Mughal gardens related to their surroundings and compares these gardens to contemporaneous European cases such as the reconstructed Château de Gaillon and the Villa Madama. Paula Henderson, in "Elysian Fields Such as the Poets Dreamed of: The Mughal Garden in the Early Stuart Mind," considers impressions of Mughal gardens as recorded in early Stuart-era English travelers' accounts, particularly that of Peter Mundy (ca. 1596–1663). Cristina Castel-Branco's essay, "Garden Encounters: Portugal and India in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries," presents her novel research documenting five viceregal gardens in Sintra, Azeitão, and Lisbon, all built after Portuguese expansion into India, and all possessing direct formal affinities with recent Mughal gardens. Her study is well supported by rich cartographic evidence, beautiful images, and reconstruction drawings.

The volume also includes a revised version of Ebba Koch's 2008 essay "Carved Pools, Rock-Cut Elephants, Inscriptions, and Tree Columns: Mughal Landscape Art as Imperial Expression and Its Analogies to the Renaissance Garden." Koch points to lesser-known features of the Mughal landscape tradition, including the layered use of physical and metaphorical landscape elements, the employment of extraordinary design strategies similar to those of contemporary earthworks, and skillful plays with scale in various mediums. She presents these interventions as agents for mapping and territorializing Mughal landscapes and suggests comparisons with well-known allegorical designs of late Renaissance Italy, especially the Sacro Bosco at Bomarzo.

Reading Islamic garden traditions alongside European Renaissance ones, the essays in this volume offer valuable insights on the history of gardens and on space more generally, making the book relevant for scholars of architectural and urban history as well as for scholars of landscape history. The book thoughtfully and productively links garden history with these other disciplines. It is also successful in its comparative coupling of distinctive landscape traditions,

and in its effort to present garden traditions not as culturally isolated phenomena but as important parts of cross-cultural discourses.

That said, while the volume's stated aim is to explore "transcontinental mutual influences" (xv) in garden design, alluding to a "reciprocal flow of ideas and concepts" (xiiv) within the framework of a "global Renaissance" (xiii), most of the essays review this flow as one-directional, mainly considering the impacts of Islamic gardens on European ones. All of the authors vividly re-create the historical settings wherein Venetians, Stuart-era English intellectuals, French humanists, and Portuguese viceroys, among others, examined Islamic garden traditions and, frequently, documented them in travel accounts. As many of the essays show, Renaissance-era Europeans sought to translate and adapt what they learned from their travels and their reading. Despite the "striking parallels" (91) and "analogous approaches" (121) discussed, the essays focus primarily on European impressions and/or translations of Islamic garden forms, traditions, and ideas, paying little attention to what Islamic designers might have learned and adapted from Europe. Readers may thus be left with the impression that Islamic cultures failed to grow from this cross-cultural engagement, or that builders and maintainers of Islamic gardens operated within static and fixed traditions. The book's historiographical classification of Islamic cultures into three imperial periods underscores this shortcoming, suggesting a conventional understanding of the Islamic world, and this reliance on standardized taxonomy risks undermining the volume's purpose.

Still, the challenging nature of this research and its goal of opening up new horizons in cross-cultural garden studies is laudable and highly valuable, and the book's limitations may be viewed as offering ideas for future research. The editor has brought together the work of scholars whose novel approaches raise new questions, paving the way for alternative, complex, and layered garden histories, histories that go beyond the limitations posed by current disciplinary boundaries and cultural constraints.

B. DENİZ ÇALIŞ KURAL  
*Istanbul Bilgi University*

Chanchal B. Dadlani

**From Stone to Paper: Architecture as History in the Late Mughal Empire**

New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 2018, 232 pp., 97 color and 22 b/w illus. \$65 (cloth), ISBN 9780300233179

Chanchal B. Dadlani has produced the first full-length book on late Mughal architecture, a topic often dismissed in older scholarship and in popular literature as essentially unworthy of study. Her richly illustrated volume *From Stone to Paper*, full of reproductions in superb color, provides deep insights into this period, making us rethink our understandings of the later Mughals and of how Mughal architecture came to be defined. As Dadlani says in her conclusion, "This book has centered on the fundamental question of how the *concept* of Mughal architecture emerged over the course of the long eighteenth century" (175). An evaluation of its contents provides a response to that question.

In the book's introduction, "The Mughal Eighteenth Century," Dadlani argues that it was during this fraught period that the architectural style now called Mughal emerged. It was the result of architects and patrons looking to the past—that is, to the seventeenth century—for a new architectural style appropriate for their present. She suggests that this process was ongoing throughout the long eighteenth century, although her book's final three chapters make clear that it continued into the mid-nineteenth century, when the Mughal Empire dissolved. In the rest of the introduction Dadlani discusses trends in scholarship on late Mughal architecture as well as the wide variety of sources she used in her study.

Chapter 1, "Between Experimentation and Regulation: The Foundations of an Eighteenth-Century Style," focuses on architecture built during the late seventeenth century under Mughal emperor Aurangzeb (r. 1658–1707). Here Dadlani introduces the concept of *istiqbāl*, a recognition of existing masterpieces along with a desire to refine them, suggested initially by literary scholar Paul Losensky to describe the composition of Persian poetry. Applying this poetic concept to architecture is both innovative and appropriate. Dadlani argues that the visual past was reorganized for Aurangzeb's present. She

analyzes architecture constructed under this Mughal ruler in a particularly productive manner, suggesting that while he is usually seen as having been disinterested in or even hostile to culture, he never banned the arts as is commonly believed. Dadlani posits that Aurangzeb used and enhanced the balanced and harmonious architectural style introduced by his father, Shah Jahan, builder of the Taj Mahal, to contradict the widespread perception of his own rule as illegitimate. We might wonder if this visual ploy was successful, for the Badshahi Masjid (Badshahi Mosque) in Lahore was Aurangzeb's only truly accessible project. The Moti Masjid in the Delhi Mughal palace and the tomb in Aurangabad, both discussed here in detail, were more private structures.

Chapter 2 surveys the urban landscape of eighteenth-century Mughal Delhi. This is not a study of individual structures or an attempt to bring new ones to light but an overview of how mosques, tombs, garden estates, and shrines marked key places in the city. Focusing on major sites such as the Sufi shrines of Bakhtiyar Kaki and Nizam al-Din Auliya, as well as the Fakhr al-Masajid (Pride of the Mosques), built by a noblewoman, Dadlani discusses how the city was transformed throughout the century, especially with the loss of access to the important shrine of Mu'in al-Din Chishti in Ajmer. This is not the first exploration of this material, but it fits well with the author's overall argument. In addition to the built environment, Dadlani examines the writings of Dargah Quli Khan, a visitor to Delhi who wrote an engaging memoir of his time there, to enhance our understanding of the city and how its significant locales were used by the public, both elite and common.

The main focus and strength of chapter 3, "The Last Flicker in the Lamp of Mughal Architecture: Transforming the Imperial Capital," concerns the growth of Shia structures in Mughal Delhi. Although the Shia–Sunni divide was not overwhelmingly significant in Mughal India, it was not until the eighteenth century that a Shia political presence was seen in northern India, most notably in Awadh, a rich swath of land to the east of Delhi, between the rivers Ganges and Jumna (Yamuna), and still further east in Bengal. Awadh's Mughal governor, Safdar Jang, a Shia, was increasingly