

İSTANBUL BİLGİ UNIVERSITY
INSTITUTE OF SOCIAL SCIENCE
MEDIA AND COMMUNICATION SYSTEMS
GRADUATION PROGRAM

HATE SPEECH IN NEW MEDIA: ANALYSIS OF HATE SPEECH
AGAINST SYRIAN REFUGEES IN DIGITAL PARTICIPATORY
DICTIONARIES

Master Thesis

Aybike Tuba BURKAY

Thesis Advisor

Prof. Dr. Aslı TUNÇ

İstanbul - 2016

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I am thankful to;

My dear mother Nalan Karaoğlanlar Düven, my father Hasan B. Yağız and my grandfather Nihat Karaoğlanlar, who have never deprived material and moral support all my life, have the biggest contribution to my achievements,

Mehmet Burkay, my beloved spouse who supports me in all aspects of my life, including my thesis study, who is beside me in every decision I give,

My dear director Rafet Çimen who has never deprived his help in all respect, followed my thesis study with curiosity; Dr. Özmen who put my back into complete my thesis study,

My thesis advisor, Prof. Dr. Aslı TUNÇ, who I take as a role-model at academic field, inspires me to keep wondering and researching.

ABSTRACT

In this study; How hate speech is produced in the new media is analyzed through examples of hate speech directed at Syrian refugees in digital participatory dictionaries. The means of communication by providing certain messages to reach the audience, direct how the recipients interpret the messages reflected, what they think about the contents, and serve some groups to diffuse their ideology. Ruling groups; obtain the possession of mass media, by their economic powers and they judge issues to be presented to the audience and how to present them. The groups through these, ensure the reproduction of their dominant ideologies on the masses and the continuation of their power. In societies in which the free thought did not develop, groups with different racial, religious, and sexual preferences are excluded from the idealized ideological boundaries and are exposed to discourses of exclusion, humiliation, physical violence and hate. The media is also used to propagate hate speech as a carrier and produce the dominant ideology. New media environments that enable the user-based content are also tools for individuals to produce hate speech at this point.

Keywords: Syrian, Refugee, Hate Speech, Digital Participatory Dictionary

ÖZET

Bu arařtırmada; yeni medyada nefret söyleminin nasıl üretildiđi, dijital katılımcı sözlüklerde Suriyeli mültecilere yöneltilen nefret söylemleri örnekleri üzerinden analiz edilmektedir. İletişim araçları, belirli söylemlerin kitlelere ulaşmasını sağlayarak alıcıların yansıtılan mesajları nasıl yorumlayacaklarını, içerikler hakkında ne düşüneceklerini yönlendirmekte; kimi grupların ideolojilerini yaymasına aracı olmaktadır. İktidar sahibi gruplar; ekonomik güçleri elinde bulundurmaları ile kitle iletişim araçlarının sahipliğini elde etmekte, izleyiciye sunulacak konuları ve konuların nasıl sunulacağını belirlemektedirler. Bu sayede bahsedilen gruplar, hakim olan ideolojilerinin kitleler temelinde yeniden üretilmesini ve iktidarlarının devamını sağlamış olmaktadır. Özgür düşünce ortamının gelişmediđi toplumlarda, hakim ideolojinin idealize ettiđi sınırlar dışında kalan ve kabul gören insan tipinden farklı ırka, dine, cinsel tercihe sahip gruplar dışlanma, aşağılanma, fiziksel şiddet ve nefret söylemine maruz kalmaktadırlar. Medya da hakim ideolojinin taşıyıcısı ve üreticisi olarak nefret söylemini yaymada kullanılmaktadır. Kullanıcı türevli içerik üretilmesine olanak sağlayan yeni medya ortamları da bu noktada bireylerin nefret söylemi üretmesine aracı olmaktadır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Suriyeli, Mülteci, Nefret Söylemi, Dijital Katılımcı Sözlük

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	ii
ABSTRACT	iii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	v
1. INTRODUCTION	1
2. SYRIAN REFUGEES	9
2.1. Political History of Syria and Demographic Information	9
2.2. The Arab Spring and Syria	10
2.3. Syrian Civil War	11
2.4. Migration from Syria	13
2.5. Conceptual Discussions on Migration and Asylum	14
2.6. Syrian Refugees Took Refuge in Turkey	17
2.6.1. Legal Status of Syrian Refugees in Turkey	18
2.6.2. Problems of Syrian Refugees in Daily Life	19
2.6.2.1. Problems Related to Financial Situation	19
2.6.2.2. Problems in Access to Services	22
2.6.2.3. Social Problems	23
3. LANGUAGE, DISCOURSE AND HATE SPEECH	26
3.1. Ideology and Relation to Social Life	26
3.1.1. Conceptual Discussions on Ideology	26
3.1.2. How Does Ideologies Affect Social Life?	29
3.2. Language, Discourse and Their Relations with Ideology	31
3.2.1. Conceptual Discussions on Language	31
3.2.2. Conceptual Discussions on Discourse	33
3.2.3. The Relationship Between Discourse and Ideologies	35

3.3. The Relationship Between Power and Discourse	38
3.4. Ideological State Apparatuses and The Diffusion of Ideologies	40
3.5. Hate Speech and It's Production	43
3.5.1. Conceptual Discussions on Ideology	43
3.5.2. The Role of Media in Producing Hate Speech	48
4. NEW MEDIA AND NETWORK SOCIETY	51
4.1. The Definition and Characteristics of New Media	51
4.1.1. Mass Media and Traditional Media	51
4.1.2. The Definition and Characteristics of New Media	54
4.2. Network Society Theories	59
4.2.1. Philosophical Basis of Network Society Theories	59
4.2.2. What is The Network Society?	61
4.3. Internet as a Public Sphere and New Media	64
4.4. Advantages and Disadvantages of New Media	66
4.4.1. "Bright Side" of the New Media	66
4.4.2. "Dark Side" of the New Media	70
5. HATE SPEECH AGAINST "SYRIANS" ON DIGITAL PARTICIPATORY DICTIONARIES	74
5.1. Research Population – Digital Participatory Dictionaries	75
5.2. Research Method – Critical Discourse Analysis	83
5.2.1. Application of Critical Discourse Analysis	88
5.3. Quantitative Findings	93
5.4. Interpretation of Qualitative Findings	94
5.4.1. Hate Speech Examples Against Syrians from Ekşi Sözlük	94
5.4.2. Hate Speech Examples Against Syrians from Uludağ Sözlük	102
5.4.3. Hate Speech Examples Against Syrians from İTÜ Sözlük	107

6. ASSESSMENTS AND CONCLUSION	113
--	------------

BIBLIOGRAPHY	120
---------------------------	------------

.....

HATE SPEECH IN NEW MEDIA: ANALYSIS OF HATE SPEECH AGAINST
SYRIAN REFUGEES IN DIGITAL PARTICIPATORY DICTIONARIES

YENİ MEDYADA NEFRET SÖYLEMİ: DİJİTAL KATILIMCI
SÖZLÜKLERDE SURİYELİ MÜLTECİLERE YÖNELİK ÜRETİLEN NEFRET
SÖYLEMİ ANALİZİ

Aybike Tuba BURKAY
112680010

Tez Danışmanı: Prof. Dr. Aslı TUNÇ

Jüri Üyesi: Yard. Doç. Dr. Esra Ercan BİLGİÇ

Jüri Üyesi: Yard. Doç. Dr. Diğdem SEZEN

Tezin Onaylandığı Tarih: 18.02.2017

Toplam Sayfa Sayısı: 146

Anahtar Kelimeler (Türkçe)

Anahtar Kelimeler (İngilizce)

Suriyeli	Syrian
Mülteci	Refugee
Nefret Söylemi	Hate Speech
Yeni Medya	New Media
Dijital Katılımcı Sözlük	Digital Participatory Dictionary

1.INTRODUCTION

Globalization, widespread use of communication and transportation means related to technological development has led the world become even smaller and human groups that have not had a chance to meet before have come together in the physical and virtual environment. This encounter not only increases tolerance and respect due to meeting different cultures, but also reveals hate and exaggeration.

Lots of groups that are classified on the basis of many different ethnic, religious, political, gender and sexual orientations living in the same geography in Turkey; are under threats of exclusion, contempt, deprivation of fundamental rights, verbal and physical assaults and murder due to incompatibility to the identities that are accepted as social norms.¹

The Syrian Civil War, which has begun on 15 March 2011 and is still ongoing, has led to the deaths of an estimated 470,000 people² and the migration of more than 4,800,000 people.³ From the beginning of the war, the Syrian people took refuge in neighboring countries such as Turkey, Lebanon, Jordan, Iraq and Egypt. It is observed that attempts to migrate to European countries illegally via Turkey and Egypt resulted in tragic deaths.

According to the numbers determined by The UN Refugee Agency (UNHCR), it is determined that the number of registered Syrian refugees living in

¹ Jagland, Thorbjørn. *Cinsel yönelim veya cinsiyet kimliği temelli ayrımcılık ile mücadele*. İstanbul: Avrupa Konseyi Yayıncılık, 2014. *Açık Toplum Vakfı*. 2014. [https://aciktoplumvakfi.org.tr/Dosyalar/Yayinlar/DesteklenenYayinlar/lgbt_insan_haklari_rapo_ru_kaosql_2016_eylul\(1\).pdf](https://aciktoplumvakfi.org.tr/Dosyalar/Yayinlar/DesteklenenYayinlar/lgbt_insan_haklari_rapo_ru_kaosql_2016_eylul(1).pdf). 14.11.2016.

² Black, Ian. "Report on Syria conflict finds 11.5% of population killed or injured." *The Guardian*. 11.02.2016. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/feb/11/report-on-syria-conflict-finds-115-of-population-killed-or-injured>. 05.11.2016.

³ "Syria Regional Refugee Response." *The UN Refugee Agency*. The UN Refugee Agency, 07.11.2016. <http://data.unhcr.org/syrianrefugees/regional.php>. 23.11.2016.

Turkey is 2.750.000 as of 19.10.2016. It is known that on average 10% of the refugees reside in the camps.⁴

As stated in the document "Syrian Refugees in Turkey" that the UNHCR has prepared; The Temporary Protection Regulation published by the Council of Ministers of the Republic of Turkey on 22.10.2014 states that the Syrians have been admitted to the status of "temporary protection". Syrian refugees, who can register for temporary protection documents, can not obtain a residence permit while they can get permission to stay in Turkey with their registration documents.

⁵ On 15.01.2016 the "Regulation on the Work Permits of Foreigners Provision of Temporary Protection" was published and the Syrian refugees were allowed to work legally.⁶

But in the five years since the war began, until the publication of the regulations in 2011, Syrian refugees living in Turkey were unable to obtain work permits because of the lack of residence permits. As a result, refugees who flee from war and have already struggled with poverty have faced great challenges in meeting their basic needs like health, education and shelter. Syrian workers without alternative solutions other than working informally to meet their needs were seen as cheap labor by employers and forced to work on quite few salaries. In addition, landlords who want to use people's grievances to meet the need for shelter, Syrian refugees rented their homes at prices much higher than their regular price.⁷

According to Turkish Statistical Institute's March 2016 data, the average number of unemployed in Turkey during the working period was 3,000,000.⁸ The employer has been working with Syrian refugees at very low rates for the purpose

⁴ The UN Refugee Agency, ibid.

⁵ "Türkiye'deki Suriyeli Mülteciler Sık Sorulan Sorular." *The UN Refugee Agency* (2015): *BMMYK Türkiye*. BMMYK Türkiye, 2015.
http://www.unhcr.org/turkey/uploads/root/s%C4%B1k_sorulan_sorular.pdf 22.11.2016.

⁶ 6575 Regulation on the Work Permits of Foreigners Provision of Temporary Protection (2016)

⁷ Yılmaz, Halim. *Türkiye'de Suriyeli Mülteciler - İstanbul Örneği*. Rapor, İnsan Hakları ve Mazlumlar İçin Dayanışma Derneği, 2013.
http://istanbul.mazlumder.org/webimage/suriyeli_multeciler_raporu_2013.pdf 06.11.2016.

⁸ *İşgücü İstatistikleri - Mart 2016*. Rapor, Türkiye İstatistik Kurumu, 15.06.2016.
<http://www.tuik.gov.tr/PreHaberBultenleri.do?id=21571> 06.11.2016

of cost-containment, leading to the reaction of Turkish citizens fighting unemployment. Also the rise in rent rates due to supply-demand balance has also led to an increase in social tension.

The dominant ideology in the current society and the society itself are seen as major factors in the formation of personal convictions. An individual born in a society with tabula rasa⁹ and it is shaped through the family, the education system, religious institutions and the media, and in this way ideological basis of the individual can be formed. French philosopher Louis Althusser calls these institutions "ideological state apparatuses".¹⁰ Individuals who do not encounter any alternative thought other than the state's ideological devices, even if they meet who does not even question becomes an ideal individual targeted by the government and maintains the dominant ideology by reproducing it again.

In his book "Ideology" published in 1991, Terry Eagleton mentions that there is no definite definition of the concept of ideology, and it makes 16 different definitions of ideology to show the diversity of meaning.¹¹ In this thesis, the ideology debates will predominantly Marxist philosophy's theoretical infrastructure. Marxist thinkers define ideology as "false consciousness". Ideology is the whole set of distorted thoughts that imposes collectivity in order to legitimize the power of the dominant social class.¹² Individuals, as far as adopting the ideology of power will not be aware of their "real" position, admit the system and not strive for change.

Ideologies express themselves via language and also formed within language. Discourse is formed by the use of language; choice of words by speakers, the phrases of the speech, the form of speech, the expression and even

⁹ The proposition that stands for "empty mind" revealed by John Locke.

¹⁰ Althusser, Louis. *İdeoloji ve Devletin İdeolojik Aygıtları*. Trans. Alp Tümertekin. 4th ed. İstanbul: İthaki Yayınları, 2010.

¹¹ Eagleton, Terry. *İdeoloji*. Trans. Muttalip Özcan. 3th ed. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2011.

¹² Eagleton, ibid.

the ability to form sentences effects discourses.¹³ The daily life of society is being experienced and sustained with daily communicative activities. This communicative activities are spread over almost all areas of society and is based on the discourse that society expresses itself. One cultures all areas whether linguistic or non-linguistic shows that society's world view.¹⁴

The verbal violence that groups which is not approved by dominant culture is called hate speech. Hate speech, in a comprehensive manner, in the Council of Europe Committee of Ministers' Recommendation 1997, is described as follows;

the term "hate speech" shall be understood as covering all forms of expression which spread, incite, promote or justify racial hatred, xenophobia, anti-Semitism or other forms of hatred based on intolerance, including: intolerance expressed by aggressive nationalism and ethnocentrism, discrimination and hostility against minorities, migrants and people of immigrant origin.¹⁵

This violence does not always stay in verbal dimensions, but it also turns into hate crimes that cause people to suffer physical harm and even death.

The power wants to control what the society thinks about, concepts of knowledge, attitudes, thoughts and ideologies. People adopt knowledge, attitudes and ideologies by discourses. The power rules over the discourse also controls the actions of the society.¹⁶ As mentioned earlier; the family, educational institutions, religious institutions and media involved in the ideological apparatuses of the state are under state control within the related ministries, laws and regulations.

¹³ İnceoğlu, Yasemin, Prof.Dr. "Medya'da Nefret Söylemi." *Medyada Nefret Söyleminin İzlenmesi Projesi*. Medyada Nefret Söyleminin İzlenmesi Çalışma Toplantısı. 2013. <http://www.nefretsoylemi.org/resimler/20091110728113056.pdf> 10.09.2016.

¹⁴ Aygöl, Eser. "Yeni Medyada Nefret Söyleminin Üretimi: Bir Toplumsal Paylaşım Ağı Olarak Facebook Örneği." Thesis. Gazi Üniversitesi, 2012. *Ulusal Tez Merkezi*. 2012. https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/TezGoster?key=vVNzTGHHhjH-u3WMToxQ-rRejRyHxAGeqkNdUCUAmxZ5aGMqlvyx_x3Hx3Gwnd-o 10.09.2016.

¹⁵ as quoted in Alp, Hakan. "Medyada Nefret Söylemi ve Çingene Toplumuna Yönelik Ayrımcı Söylemin Suça Dönüşme Süreci." Thesis. İstanbul Üniversitesi, 2015. *Ulusal Tez Merkezi*. *Ulusal Tez Merkezi*, 2015. https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/TezGoster?key=WY5CM7tPNE2z_YM6pBu0tzNOI-S_57YFWc1Ri6yKlbDH2OCNmYbE3KkalzlmzYUY 15.10.2016.

¹⁶ van Dijk, Teun A. "Söylem ve İktidar." *Nefret Suçları ve Nefret Söylemi*. Ed. Ayşe Çavdar and Aylin B. Yıldırım. İstanbul: Uluslararası Hrant Dink Vakfı Yayınları, 2010. 9-45. <http://hrantdink.org/attachments/article/73/NefretSoylemiveNefretSuclari.pdf>. 2016

The most effective way for government to establish control over discourse is to keep the media within certain boundaries. If you can control the discourse, then you are not only controlling the newspapers, but also the minds of the readers -not directly or automatically but indirectly-. People who have access specifically to the media, parliamentary debates or scientific inquiries discourses main topics.¹⁷

Like all forms of discourse, hate speech is also reproduced through the media and spreads to masses. Hate speech can be observed from different examples based on race, religion, sex, sexual orientation is produced in the media. One of the most painful consequences of these examples is undoubtedly the systematic hate speech produced for Armenians and Christians before the murder of Hrant Dink. On 19.01.2007 after Hrant Dink's assassination in front of Agos Newspaper, the production and results of hate speech in the media have begun to be considered and studied more. Since 2009, the Hrant Dink Foundation's "Monitoring Hate Speech" study has contributed to strengthening the respect for human rights and different identities in the media, and for the development of tools to encourage both media and civil society to take an active role in this issue.

18

The hate speech towards Syrians is not observed much in the mainstream media due to the positive attitude of the present day's government to the Syrian refugees and the supportive policies it implements. But this can not be said to be true for new media in which individual users are producing content. Especially after the announcement that President Recep Tayyip Erdogan conferring citizenship to the Syrian immigrants made on 03.07.2016, many hatred based contents about "We do not want Syrians in our country" started to be produced in the social media.

Mass communication sometimes becomes a carrier of things, facts and meanings, and sometimes creator / producer. One of the most important functions

¹⁷ van Dijk, ibid.

¹⁸ Çavdar, Ayşe, and Aylin B. Yıldırım, ed. *Nefret Suçları ve Nefret Söylemi*. İstanbul: Uluslararası Hrant Dink Vakfı Yayınları, 2010. 2010.

<http://hrantdink.org/attachments/article/73/NefretSoylemiveNefretSuclari.pdf> 06.11.2016

of the mass media -which includes radio, newspaper, television, internet and so on- is the "informing" function.¹⁹ The communication at the aforementioned tools and the Internet's early years defined as Web 1.0, is one way, the message reaches from a source to multiple receivers, and there is no role for the receiver to produce the content. Because of its commercial and organizational characteristics, traditional media is controlled by both capitalist companies and the nation-state; So the interests of the elite or advertising agencies are represented in the media texts. For this reason, dissident, minority or secondary groups in the society, can not find enough place in the media.²⁰

The transition from Web 1.0 to Web 2.0 implies that the Internet will be transformed from a one-way broadcast to a shared platform and a public production space.²¹ This new media area includes blogs, social media (eg Facebook), audiovisual hosting services (eg YouTube), Twitter, email and chat rooms.²²

The new media field that makes up the population of the research is the digital participatory dictionaries. One of the applications that offer important possibilities in the name of participation and interaction of the individual who is promoted from the audience seat to the user seat with the new technology is coming out as the digital participatory dictionaries.²³ The precursor of digital participatory dictionaries, Ekşi Sözlük can be given as an example with Uludağ Sözlük and İTÜ Sözlük (Instela). Digital participatory dictionaries are not just

¹⁹ Ergül, Hakan. *Televizyonda Haberin Magazinelleşmesi*. 2nd ed. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2005.

²⁰ Çoban quoted in Aygül, ibid.

²¹ Fuchs, Christian. "The Self-Organization of Virtual Communities." *Journal of New Communications Research* 1.1 (2006): 29-68. Christian Fuchs. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 20.12.2014.

²² Aday, S., H. Farrell, D. Freelon, M. Lynch, J. Sides, and M. Dewar. "Watching From Afar: Media Consumption Patterns Around the Arab Spring." *American Behavioral Scientist* 57.7 (2013): 899-919. <http://henryfarrell.net/wp/wp-content/uploads/2013/04/ABS4793731.pdf> 4.11.2014.

²³ Akyazı, Ayşenur. "Yeni İletişim Ortamı Olarak Dijital Katılımcı Sözlüklerde Nefret Söylemi." *Marmara İletişim Dergisi* 22 (2014): 183-93. Academia.edu. Academia.edu, 2014. https://www.academia.edu/21948095/Yeni_ileti%C5%9Fim_ortam%C4%B1_olarak_dijital_kat%C4%B1%C4%B1mc%C4%B1_s%C3%B6zl%C3%BCklerde_nefret_s%C3%B6ylemi_AY%C5%9EENUR_AKYAZI 07.11.2016.

just a glossary containing a definition. They are fields in which users are interacted with each other, different definitions are gathered together, different opinions can be discussed. In dictionaries, opinions that can not provide access to mainstream or traditional media can easily take place, and official speech can be encountered with contradictory political thoughts.

The new media offers many benefits, such as communicating individually, cooperating, facilitating access to information through open sources, providing a democratic platform for alternative ideas that can not be heard in the mainstream media, building independent self-governing structures, enabling citizen journalism, and collective intelligence .²⁴ Social media has played a supporting role in social movements such as Arab Spring, Occupy Wall Street movement, Gezi Park protest.

Besides that there are also some negative outcomes of the new media; social media sites owned by major trading companies can be used by governments to keep users under surveillance,²⁵ companies that are enabled by user content, such as YouTube and Facebook, are able to earn revenue from their ads through their users and return those ads back to their users²⁶, they allow access to illegal content, authoritarian regimes easily capture activists using social media, social media users generate advertising by entering content for money,²⁷ terrorist and extreme racist groups using social media to transform media into a communication tool for supporters and actions,²⁸ they can be used to distribute

²⁴ Fuchs, ibid.

²⁵ Fuchs, Christian. "The Political Economy of WikiLeaks: Power 2.0? Surveillance 2.0? Criticism 2.0? Alternative Media 2.0?" *Global Media Journal* 5.1 (2011): 49-76. Christian Fuchs. 2011. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 28.11.2014.

²⁶ Fuchs, Christian. "Cognitive Capitalism or Informational Capitalism? The Role of Class in The Information Economy." *Cognitive Capitalism, Education and Digital Labor*. Ed. Michael Peters and Ergin Bulut. New York: Peter Lang, 2011. 75-119. 2011. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 01.12.2014.

²⁷ Morozov quoted in Ersöz Karakulakoğlu, Selva. "Sosyal Medyanın Karanlık Yüzü" *The Turkish Online Journal of Design, Art and Communication* 2.4 (2012): 32-40. *İstanbul Kültür Üniversitesi - Açık Erişim*. İstanbul Kültür Üniversitesi, 2012. <http://acikerisim.iku.edu.tr:8080/xmlui/handle/11413/1086> 06.11.2016.

²⁸ "Propaganda, Extremism and Online Recruitment Tactics." *Anti-Defamation League*. 2015. <http://www.adl.org/education-outreach/anti-bias-education/c/propaganda-extremism-and.html?referrer=https://www.google.com.tr/#.WIPDZiOLQ1I> 06.11.2016.

racist and violent publishing and reproduce & circulate the thesis' main topic, hate speech.²⁹

In the thesis study, it is tried to be avoided from a technological determinist point of view while investigating the position of the new media - especially the dictionaries- at the production and distribution of the hate speech; neither be as optimistic as Henry Jenkins³⁰ or Clay Shirky³¹ nor as pessimistic as Evgeny Morozov.³² But the debate that will continue around the notion of hate speech will undoubtedly be taken as a critical point of view.

The identities, thoughts, ideologies that users reflect in the new media can not be thought independent from daily life. The hate speech produced in the new media is based on the communication between the family and the social environment, at school or through all kinds of media. It is assumed that the hate speech dose of hate speech is increased because users usually hide behind their nicknames, they do not use their daily identity.

²⁹ Akdeniz, Yaman. "İnternet'te Irkçılık." Ed.s Ayşe Çavdar and Aylin B. Yıldırım. *Nefret Suçları ve Nefret Söylemi*. İstanbul: Uluslararası Hrant Dink Vakfı Yayınları, 2010. 175-92. *Medyada Nefret Söyleminin İzlenmesi Projesi*. Hrant Dink Vakfı, 2010.
<http://hrantdink.org/attachments/article/73/NefretSoylemiveNefretSuclari.pdf> 03.09.2016.

³⁰ Jenkins, Henry. *Convergence Culture: Where Old and New Media Collide*. New York: New York UP, 2006. PDF.

³¹ Shirky quoted in Fuchs, Christian. "New Media, Web 2.0 and Surveillance." *Sociology Compass* 5.2 (2011): 134-147. Christian Fuchs. 2011. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 22.12.2014.

³² Morozov, Evgeny. *The Net Delusion: The Dark Side of Internet Freedom*. New York: Public Affairs, 2011. PDF.

2. SYRIAN REFUGEES

In this chapter; The Syrian people's situation will be discussed with the ongoing Syrian Civil War which has started on March 15, 2011, with their consequences of death, injury, destruction and loss of property, migration and the refugee status due to our research. First of all, to understand the background of the subject, the Arab Spring and the Syrian Civil War will be examined together with the beginning and present situation. Migrations caused by the Syrian Civil War and the situations that Syrian refugees face will be explained under a separate title. Finally, the legal status, vital conditions, the problems they face and the exposure to discrimination and hate speech of Syrian refugees who have emigrated to Turkey will be discussed.

2.1. Political History of Syria and Demographic Information

"Syria has been used throughout history to describe the geography that encompasses all the eastern shores of the Mediterranean. For the first time, the Greeks used this name to describe the place where the three continents joined. Until the beginning of 20th the century, the region includes Syria, Lebanon, Jordan, Palestine and Israel today." ³³

"The first settlement in Syria dates back to 5000 BC and the city of Damascus is probably the oldest and most continuous city in the world." ³⁴ Many kingdoms and states were founded by Akad, Hittites, Egyptians, Assyrians, Persians, Macedonians, Byzantines, Umayyads, Abbasids, Great Seljuks, Eyyubi

³³ Collelo quoted in Yazıcı, Nevin. "Suriye Siyasi Tarihi." *21. Yüzyıl Türkiye Enstitüsü*. 21. Yüzyıl Türkiye Enstitüsü, 29.05.2012. http://www.21yyte.org.tr/arastirma/suriye/2012/05/29/6619/suriye-siyasi-tarihi#_ftn1 22.11.2016.

³⁴ Yavuz quoted in Yazıcı ibid.

and Memluk until the 16th century when they were under Ottoman rule in Syria.

35

Before the Civil War, the vast majority of the Syrian population, about 22 million, was formed by Arabs, followed by Kurds, Armenians, Circassians, Assyrians and Turkmen. In terms of religion, 74% of the population were Sunni, 13% were Alevis and 10% were Christians.³⁶

2.2. The Arab Spring and Syria

The Arab Spring is an anonymous concept used to express popular movements at different scales that oppose oppressive and authoritarian governments in the Arab world and to identify positively the process as a wave of democratization.³⁷ It is Arab grassroot movements that are caused by the peoples of the countries of the Middle East, especially in the countries of North Africa and the Middle East, leads to changes, revisions and renewals, especially in regime, administration and managerial changes.³⁸

The Arab Spring first started in Tunisia on 17 December 2010. Muhammad Bouazizi, a unemployed university graduate who is a mobile salesman, gave himself to the fire when his loom was confiscated and ignited the wrist of the rebellion in the country. The people, who are adversely affected by social injustice, unemployment and poverty in the country, have fallen into the

³⁵ Yazıcı ibid.

³⁶ "Suriye'nin Dini ve Etnik Haritası." *Al Jazeera*, 2011.

<http://www.aljazeera.com.tr/haber/suriyenin-dini-ve-etnik-haritasi> 22.11.2016.

³⁷ Doğan, Gürkan, and Bülent Durgun. "Arap Baharı ve Libya: Tarihsel Süreç ve Demokratikleşme Kavramı Çerçevesinde Bir Değerlendirme." *Süleyman Demirel Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi* 1.5 (2012): 61-91. S.D.U. Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi. S.D.U. Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 2012. <http://sosyalbilimler.sdu.edu.tr/assets/uploads/sites/102/files/4-22042012.pdf> 22.11.2016.

³⁸ Kovucu, Mustafa. "Suriyeli Sığınmacıların Gaziantep Yerel Basınında Temsili." Thesis. Gaziantep Üniversitesi, 2016. *Ulusal Tez Merkezi*. Ulusal Tez Merkezi, 2016. https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/TezGoster?key=Br_XTptK8CZ70f0JGX9xEk4I_k1xep3ShZLaLrSTOtsX7LwzG8tqz-Epto_Onk8E 19.11.2016.

streets and on January 16, 2011 Tunisian prime minister Zeynel Abidin Bin Ali has fled the country and declared victory.³⁹

At the time of the collapse of Ben Ali's power, the protests began in the Tahrir Square of Egypt and then the rebellion reflected on Algerian, Jordan, Yemen, Libya, Bahrain and Syria.⁴⁰ Arab movements spreading throughout the Middle East and North Africa resulted in the overthrow of 30-years dictator Hosni Mubarak in Egypt and Muammer Gaddafi, a 42-years dictator in Libya.⁴¹

By the expression of Sandıklı and Semin,

The Arab Spring has begun to show effect in Syria on 15 March 2011. Anti-government people; demanded expansion of individual rights, fair distribution of income, and restricting the power of the Ba'ath Party. Although the Assad regime had made various arrangements in March to cut off the protests, such as reducing the number of conscripts, raising salaries, and releasing some political prisoners, these regulations did not adequately meet the demands of the people. In April 2011, it tried to suppress the rebellious people with armed force.⁴²

2.3. Syrian Civil War

As opposed to the suppression of Besar Assad by the armed forces, "the opposition of the regime began to increase / organize and eventually an internal war for Syria became inevitable."⁴³ The ongoing civil war and the "opposition

³⁹ Çıldan, Cihan, Mustafa Ertemiz, Evren Küçük, H. Kaan Timuçin, and Duygu Albayrak. "Sosyal Medyanın Politik Katılım ve Hareketlerdeki Rolü." 2011. <http://ab.org.tr/ab12/bildiri/205.pdf> 22.11.2016.

⁴⁰ Kovucu, ibid.

⁴¹ Toraman, İbrahim. "Arap Baharı ve Suriye." Thesis. Yalova Üniversitesi, 2015. *Ulusal Tez Merkezi*. Ulusal Tez Merkezi, 2015. https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/TezGoster?key=sY7m19PfcL6F1NUw-cr80ILPLHhGeF1bB_OnYn_q06pFf6eKT6yqxAYXDhi1-eLM 21.11.2016.

⁴² quoted in Aktaş, Aslı. "Türkiye'de Yaşayan Suriyeli Kadın Mülteciler: Kilis Örneği." Thesis. İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi, 2016. *Ulusal Tez Merkezi*. Ulusal Tez Merkezi, 2016. https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/TezGoster?key=cbOXH84ZayrLjc0tI-QXKj3N-eeZNi5U_LW6V6XhLmVx7DcAawi7wzWu0jn1mKwp 17.11.2016

⁴³ Kovucu, ibid.

groups" opposing each other not only entering the power struggle with the Assad regime but also between themselves has dragged Syria into a difficult chaos. In Biner and Soykan's research on the refugees who had migrated from Syria to Gaziantep, a Syrian woman defines her country's situation as; "In the beginning, when the war first started, the sides were clear. Now it is unclear. There are so many sides inside outside, there that it is now impossible to tell who is in whose side." ⁴⁴

The most influential groups among about 40 opponents are; The Free Syrian Army, The Syrian National Council, The Democratic Unity Party-PYD, and The Iraqi Sami Islamic State-ISIS.

In the Civil War; chemical weapons was used such as sarcophagus, mustard, chlorine; in 2012 1,491 people lost their lives and about 17,000 people were affected by the gas. ⁴⁵

The civilian population in Syria, between the Assad administration and demonstrators / opponents, has been forced to leave their countries due to the fact that their minimum living conditions have been wiped out and the life safety has been jeopardized. ⁴⁶

In consequence of the ongoing civil war; United Nations special envoy for the Syria crisis Staffan de Mistura stated that as of April 2016, 400,000 people

⁴⁴ Biner, Özge, and Cavidan Soykan. "Suriyeli Mültecilerin Perspektifinden Türkiye'de Yaşam." *Mülteci-Der*(2016): 1-24. *Mültecilerle Dayanışma Derneği*. Mültecilerle Dayanışma Derneği, Nisan 2016. <http://www.multeci.org.tr/> 20.11.2016.

⁴⁵ Graham-Harrison, Emma. "Chemical Weapons Attacks in Syria May Normalise War Crimes, Experts Warn." *The Guardian*. The Guardian, 11.08.2016. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/aug/11/syria-suspected-chlorine-gas-attack-in-aleppo-kills-woman-and-two-children> 23.11.2016.

⁴⁶ Uzman, Nasrullah, and Rasim Tösten. "Suriyeli Akademisyenlerin Bakış Açısından Türkiye-Suriye İlişkisi ve Sığınmacılar Meselesi." *Hacettepe Üniversitesi Türkiyat Araştırmaları Dergisi* 24 (2016): 251-72. *Hacettepe Üniversitesi Türkiyat Araştırmaları Dergisi*. Hacettepe Üniversitesi Türkiyat Araştırmaları Dergisi, 2016. <http://hutad.hacettepe.edu.tr/index.php/hutad/article/download/488/787> 20.11.2016.

have lost their lives.⁴⁷ 6.6 million people have been forced to emigrate in Syria after the conflicts and settlements have been destroyed.⁴⁸

2.4. Migration from Syria

According to UNHCR data; From the beginning of the Civil War until November 2016, 4.8 million Syrians migrated out of the country, especially to neighboring countries such as Turkey, Lebanon, Jordan and Iraq. Only 10% of the migrants (485,000) live in refugee camps. Among the Syrian refugees, 1,178,000 people applied various European countries for asylum. From the applications, in 2015, 292,540 people were admitted to different European countries as refugees.

⁴⁹

As reported by the International Organization for Migration, In 2015, 1,015,000 refugees traveled illegally via the sea to Europe from Turkey, Tunisia and Morocco. By November 2016, 345,440 people were migrating and 4,655 people were killed.⁵⁰

As shown, the Syrian Civil War has created a refugee crisis for neighboring countries and European countries, as well as for loss of life and financial losses. The Syrian refugees living in Turkey are experiencing many economic, physiological and social problems and trying to immigrate to European countries with the hope of make a better life.

⁴⁷ "Syria Death Toll: UN Envoy Estimates 400,000 Killed." *Al Jazeera*. Al Jazeera, 23.04.2016. <http://www.aljazeera.com/news/2016/04/staffan-de-mistura-400000-killed-syria-civil-war-160423055735629.html> 23.11.2016.

⁴⁸ "The Syrian Refugee Crisis and Its Repercussions for the EU." *Syrian Refugees EU*. Syrian Refugees EU, Sept. 2016. <http://syrianrefugees.eu/> 23.11.2016.

⁴⁹ "Syria Regional Refugee Response." *The UN Refugee Agency*. The UN Refugee Agency, 07.11.2016. <http://data.unhcr.org/syrianrefugees/regional.php> 23.11.2016.

⁵⁰ "Mediterranean Migrant Arrivals Reach 345,440; Deaths at Sea: 4,655." *International Organization for Migration*. International Organization for Migration, 22.11.2016. <http://www.iom.int/news/mediterranean-migrant-arrivals-reach-345440-deaths-sea-4655> 23.11.2016.

2.5. Conceptual Discussions on Migration and Asylum

The concept of "migration" basically means that people - either temporary or permanently - are relocating from one region or place to another.⁵¹ Göç sadece bireysel olarak gerçekleştirilen bir eylem değildir. Migration is not just an individual action. World history is full of many mass immigration examples.⁵² Individual migrations were made with more favorable causes and hopes for a better future; And that mass migrations take place due to some external negative factors rather than the preferences of the people.

Eisenstadt and Jackson have taken into account the social dimension of migration and have pointed out that it is happened to another society rather than another geography.⁵³ Particularly in migrations between societies with different cultural characteristics, there can be problems of harmony between the settled population and migrants, which can lead to varying results between dissatisfaction and lynching.

As International Organization for Migration suggests;

It is acknowledged that the term "immigrant" covers situations in which the person concerned decides to immigrate freely for "personal comfort" and without any external coercion. For this reason immigration is a term that includes people and family members who have migrated to another country or region to improve both their financial and social situation and to increase their future expectations for themselves and their families..⁵⁴

⁵¹ Chomsky quoted in Akşit, Gökçeşu, Mehmet Bozok, and Nihan Bozok. "Zorunlu Göç, Sorunlu Karşılamlar: Hisar Köyü, Nevşehir'deki Suriyeli Göçmenler Örneği." *TC. Maltepe Üniversitesi Fen-Edebiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 1.2 (2015): 92-116. *Maltepe Üniversitesi İnsan ve Toplum Bilimleri Fakültesi*. Maltepe Üniversitesi İnsan ve Toplum Bilimleri Fakültesi, 2015. http://www.asosjournal.com/Makaleler/877582955_1131%20G%C3%B6k%C3%A7esu%20AK%C5%9E%C4%B0T.pdf 19.11.2016.

⁵² Kovucu, ibid.

⁵³ quoted in Kovucu, ibid.

⁵⁴ Uluslararası Göç Örgütü quoted in Koç, Mustafa, İbrahim Görücü, and Nihat Akbıyık. "Suriyeli Sığınmacılar ve İstihdam Problemleri." *Birey ve Toplum Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi* 5.1 (2015): 63-

Refugee defined in The Convention on the Legal Status of Refugees, signed in Geneva in 1951 as;

"A person who owing to a well-founded fear of being persecuted for reasons of race, religion, nationality, membership of a particular social group or political opinion, is outside the country of his nationality and is unable or, owing to such fear, is unwilling to avail himself of the protection of that country; or who, not having a nationality and being outside the country of his former habitual residence as a result of such events, is unable or, owing to such fear, is unwilling to return to it." ⁵⁵

A refugee is someone who has been subjected to forced migration. "The mandatory immigration statement excludes the refugee's activism, while the concept of immigration parallels itself in relation to choice and decision." ⁵⁶

The asylum-seeker is called to the people, who has left the country by the forced migration and took refuge in another country but has not yet got a refugee status ⁵⁷ When the necessary investigations are made and the validity of the claims is proved, "refugee status" is given to him. ⁵⁸ As described in the above section, 292,540 persons from 1,178,000 persons who have applied to European countries for asylum application have been granted refugee status, while the rest are resident asylum-seekers.

UNHCR was established by the United Nations General Assembly on 14 December 1950 and was tasked with coordinating and conducting international activities to address refugee problems and to protect refugees worldwide. The Convention on the Legal Status of Refugees, which reflects the purpose of the

96. *Birey ve Toplum Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*. Birey ve Toplum Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 2015. <http://bireyvetoplumdergisi.com/article/viewFile/5000164605/5000148997> 20.11.2016.

⁵⁵ "Mültecilerin Hukuki Statüsüne İlişkin Sözleşme." *Göç İdaresi Genel Müdürlüğü*. Göç İdaresi Genel Müdürlüğü, 03.12.2015.

<http://www.goc.gov.tr/files/files/multec%C4%B1ler%C4%B1nhukuk%C4%B1statusune%C4%B1%C4%B1sk%C4%B1nsozlesme.pdf> 23.11.2016.

⁵⁶ Turton quoted in Biner and Soykan, *ibid*.

⁵⁷ Akşit, Bozok and Bozok, *ibid*.

⁵⁸ Ural quoted in Gökçan, Gül, Çiğdem Açıkıldız, and Senar Ataman. "Mültecilik Hakkında - Göç ve Mültecilik." *Multeci.net*. Multeci.net, http://multeci.net/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=58%3Agoc-ve-multecilik&catid=35%3Agoc-ve-multecilik&Itemid=14&lang=tr 23.11.2016.

UNHCR and is the basis for resolving the refugee problem, was adopted on 28 July 1951 and is implemented in 145 countries.⁵⁹

In Turkey, the Directorate General for Migration Management, which was established by the Foreigners and International Protection Law No. 6458 dated 2013, carries out the policies and strategies regarding the immigration area.⁶⁰

Foreigners and International Protection Law no. 6458 entered into force on April 11, 2013, refugee status, as well as conditional refugee and secondary protection statuses are announced. Turkey accepted the 1951 Convention on the Status of Refugees, with geographical limitation condition.⁶¹ In Article 61 of the Law, the refugee is only used for immigrants from European countries.⁶²

The Republic of Turkey is only taking the protection of refugees who migrate from Europe. Immigrants from outside Europe on the above mentioned conditions receive a "conditional refugee" status."⁶³

The secondary protection status in Article 63 of the Foreigners and International Protection Act is for people if returned to the country, death penalty and torture shall apply.⁶⁴

The "temporary protection" status set forth in the Provisional Protection Regulation, which is issued in accordance with Article 91 of the Foreigners and International Protection Law dated 13.10.2014, is applied to Syrian refugees and will be discussed in the future under the heading "Legal Status of Syrian Refugees in Turkey".

⁵⁹ "UNHCR'nin Tarihçesi." *BMMYK Türkiye*. BMMYK Türkiye, <http://www.unhcr.org/turkey/home.php?page=53> 23.11.2016.

⁶⁰ "Göç İdaresi Genel Müdürlüğü." *Göç İdaresi Genel Müdürlüğü*. Göç İdaresi Genel Müdürlüğü, 03.11.2015. http://www.goc.gov.tr/icerik6/genel-mudurluk_273_274_275_icerik 23.11.2016.

⁶¹ *Türkiye'de Mültecilerin Kabul Koşulları, Hak ve Hizmetlere Erişimleri*. İzmir: Egeus Matbaacılık, 2015. *Mültecilerle Dayanışma Derneği*. Mültecilerle Dayanışma Derneği, 2015. <http://multeci.info/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/Turkiye-de-Multecilerin-Kabul-Kosullari-Hak-ve-Hizmetlere-Erisimleri-Uydu-Kentler-Izleme-ve-Raporla.pdf> 23.11.2016.

⁶² 6458 Foreigners and International Protection Law, Article 61 (2013).

⁶³ YUKK, Madde 62 (2013).

⁶⁴ YUKK, Madde 63 (2013).

2.6. Syrian Refugees Took Refuge in Turkey

As of November 2016, the number of Syrian refugees who took refuge in Turkey was 2,764,000. About 9% of the refugees in Turkey live in the camps and the remaining refugees live in certain cities near Syria or in big cities like Istanbul and Izmir. Of the refugees who have emigrated to Turkey, 45% are children under the age of 18 and 23% are over 18 years old. ⁶⁵

According to the data of the Directorate of Disaster and Emergency Management under the Prime Ministry of the Republic of Turkey; There are 23 tent cities and container cities in Turkey that are prepared for Syrian refugees in 10 cities. 256,871 people from Syrian refugees live in the camps. Approximately 2.5 million refugees live in various cities, especially Istanbul, Şanlıurfa, Hatay and Gaziantep. ⁶⁶ The services provided in the tent cities are varied; housing, nutrition, security and cleaning services are offered in all of them. ⁶⁷

Despite the basic needs being met in the camps, the vast majority of refugees prefer to live outside the camp. The biggest problem in camps is the boredom of camp life. Moreover, entries and exits stricted with permission and that causes campers people to feel the freedom is restricted. Also most Syrians want to work to earn income so they prefer to live at the outside. ⁶⁸

⁶⁵ The UN Refugee Agency, ibid.

⁶⁶ "Barınma Merkezlerinde Son Durum." *Afet ve Acil Durum Yönetimi Başkanlığı*. Afet ve Acil Durum Yönetimi Başkanlığı, 21.11.2016. <https://www.afad.gov.tr/tr/2374/Barinma-Merkezlerinde-Son-Durum> 23.11.2016.

⁶⁷ Yıldız, Özkan. "Türkiye Kamplarında Suriyeli Sığınmacılar: Sorunlar, Beklentiler, Türkiye ve Gelecek Algısı." *Sosyoloji Araştırmaları Dergisi* 16.1 (2013): 140-71. *Dergipark Akademik*. Dergipark Akademik, 2013. <http://dergipark.ulakbim.gov.tr/sosars/article/view/5000093014> 20.11.2016.

⁶⁸ Koç, Görücü and Akbıyık, ibid.

2.6.1. Legal Status of Syrian Refugees in Turkey

Temporary Protection Regulation dated 13.10.2014 according to Article 91 of the Foreigners and International Protection Law includes refugees who are admitted to the status of "temporary protection". The temporary protection status is expressed as follows;

(1) The objective of this Regulation is to determine the procedures and principles pertaining to temporary protection proceedings that may be provided to foreigners, who were forced to leave their countries and are unable to return to the countries they left and arrived at or crossed our borders in masses to seek urgent and temporary protection and whose international protection requests cannot be taken under individual assessment ; to determine proceedings to be carried out related to their reception to Turkey, their stay in Turkey, their rights and obligations and their exits from Turkey, to regulate the measures to be taken against mass movements, and the provisions related to the cooperation between national and international organizations under Article 91 of the Law No. 6458 on Foreigners and International Protection of 4/4/2013.⁶⁹

Foreigners within the scope of this regulation; Health, education, access to labor market, social assistance and services and interpreting services can be provided. Registration is required to access these services. International protection applications are made by the person himself / herself, the governorships, the Directorate of the Police Department, and the Directorate General for Migration Management. The person making the application for international protection must first be registered and an interview date must be given. Refugees may face problems such as the date of appointment exceeding a year for enrollment in the application. Following the interview, an "international protection applicant identity card" is given which renewed every six months. "International identity

⁶⁹ 6458 Foreigners and International Protection Law, Article 91, 2013.

card with protection status" is issued to the refugees who received protection requests.⁷⁰

While the registration documents give the right to stay in Turkey, according to Article 25 of the temporary protection regulation, these are not equivalent to a residence permit. For that reason, Syrian refugees were not allowed to work until the "Regulation on Work Permit of Refugees Under Temporary Protection" dated 15.01.2016.

In the Regulation on Work Permit; It is stated that foreigners who are temporarily protected can apply to the Ministry to obtain a work permit after 6 months from the date of registration, the employers who will employ foreigners has to apply himself, foreigners who have the right to apply for an independent work permit may apply on their behalf and the provincial and quota restrictions on seasonal agricultural and livestock can be applied.⁷¹

2.6.2. Problems of Syrian Refugees in Daily Life

Syrian refugees who reside outside the tent city and the container city in Turkey face some social and social problems, especially economic, access to services. All these problems cause other problems in interaction with each other.

2.6.2.1. Problems Related to Financial Situation

In various academic researches, the main economic problems faced by Syrian refugees are mentioned as inadequacy in housing, working and nutrition.

⁷⁰ TÜRKİYE'DE MÜLTECİLERİN KABUL KOŞULLARI, HAK VE HİZMETLERE ERİŞİMLERİ. İzmir: Egeus Matbaacılık, 2015. *Mültecilerle Dayanışma Derneği*. Mültecilerle Dayanışma Derneği, 2015. <http://multeci.info/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/Turkiye-de-Multecilerin-Kabul-Kosullari-Hak-ve-Hizmetlere-Erisimleri-Uydu-Kentler-Izleme-ve-Raporla.pdf> 23.11.2016.

⁷¹ 6575 Regulation on the Work Permits of Foreigners Provision of Temporary Protection (2016).

Refugees are largely using informal mechanisms, kinship relations, and social networking to solve their needs for settlement, attachment to life and adaptation in the target country.⁷² The Syrians, who have no relation to nobility and kinship, are already poor or have few savings. Some of the settlers in the cities took all their accumulated deposits with them while they are coming from Syria; they became impoverished/workers after they had consumed their savings.

73

Refugees are settling in neighborhoods that allows them to live on an affordable budget, and these are often poor neighborhoods on the periphery of the city. Thus they are also excluded from spatial, social and public spaces.⁷⁴

In a survey conducted by the Mazlum-Der Gaziantep Branch on the attacks against the Syrians in 2014; a Turkish citizen distinguished between the "rich" and the "poor" Syrians and stated that the poor and therefore the ones who have "psychological disorders" were always in their neighborhoods, the rich ones live in luxury neighbourhood in a civilized manner. The source of possible hatred / anger at the wealthy Syrians is their status visibility and practices, such as roaming in the city with luxury cars, not making concessions from having fun and grooming, or shopping at luxury malls.⁷⁵

Landlords are not willing to rent their homes to Syrian refugees for reasons such as distrust of the refugees, having too many children, and having several

⁷² Hynes quoted in Deniz, A. Çağlar, A. Banu Hülür, and Yusuf Ekinci. "Göç, Strateji ve Taktik: Suriyeli Sığınmacıların Gündelik Hayat Deneyimleri." *Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi* 9.42 (2016): 1077-1089. *Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi*. Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi, Jan. 2016.

http://www.sosyalarastirmalar.com/cilt9/sayi42_pdf/4sosyoloji_psikoloji_felsefe/denizcaqlar_banu_hulur_yusufekinci.pdf 19.11.2016.

⁷³ Çağlar, Hülür and Ekinci, ibid.

⁷⁴ Deniz, A. Çağlar, Yusuf Ekinci and A. Banu Hülür. "Suriyeli Sığınmacıların Karşılaştığı Sosyal Dışlanma Mekanizmaları." *Sosyal Bilimler Araştırma Dergisi* 24 (2016): 17-40. Sosyal Bilimler Araştırma Dergisi, Spring 2016. <http://docplayer.biz.tr/21920900-Suriyeli-siginmacilarin-karsilastigi-sosyal-dislanma-mekanizmalari.html> 20.11.2016.

⁷⁵ Çelik, Abdurrahim, Mehmet Alkış, Sabri Sayan, and Yusuf Ekinci. "Gaziantep'te Suriyelilere Yönelik Saldırıları ve Toplumsal Nefretin Sebeplerinin Analizine Dair Rapor." *İnsan Hakları ve Mazlumlar İçin Dayanışma Derneği* (2014): 1-44. İnsan Hakları ve Mazlumlar İçin Dayanışma Derneği, Nov. 2015. <http://gaziantep.mazlumder.org/fotograf/yayinresimleri/dokuman/Suriyeliler-1.pdf> 20.11.2016.

families to live in the same house. Moreover, with the preference of the Syrian refugees for the poor neighborhoods, the rents of the residents in these neighborhoods have risen and thus "a shortage of resources in the city" constituted an important pillar of urban tension.⁷⁶

It is known that irregular migrants, who entered country undocumented and unregistered by official authorities, are involved in the labor market unregistered in order to provide livelihoods.⁷⁷ Syrian asylum seekers are working unregistered, although they are registered as refugees in Turkey and other countries in the region.⁷⁸ The first reason is that the work permit for the Syrian refugees has just been issued in January / 2016, many refugees are not informed about the new arrangements and the employer who employs foreign employee has to inform the Ministry of Labor by himself. The second reason is the fact that the employer prefers the Syrian worker because they accept lower wages than the local people. Refugees are taken to fields, constructions to work half the price of the indigenous poor in very severe conditions. As the number of those involved in this cheap labor market increases day by day, while the daily prices are falling, the working hours are increasing.⁷⁹

The decline in wages leads local people's hatred to the Syrian refugees from the original responsible employer and the state. According to the work done by Hacettepe University Migration and Politics Research Center; 70.8% of the Turkish citizens who participated in the survey were in the opinion that the Turkish economy was damaged due to asylum seekers and 56.1% of the respondents suggested that "Syrians are stealing our jobs".⁸⁰

⁷⁶ Çağlar, Ekinci and Hülür, ibid.

⁷⁷ Castles and Miller quoted in Doğan, Elif Tuğba. "Ortadoğu'nun Yeni Yoksulları: Suriyeli Sığınmacılar." *Yüzüncüyıl Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi* (2016): 11-38. *Dergipark Akademik*. Dergipark Akademik, 2016.
<http://dergipark.ulakbim.gov.tr/yyusbed/article/view/5000189596> 19.11.2016.

⁷⁸ Doğan, Elif Tuğba, ibid.

⁷⁹ Gültekin quoted in Çelik, Alkış, Sayan and Ekinci, ibid.

⁸⁰ Erdoğan, M. Murat. "Türkiye'deki Suriyeliler: Toplumsal Kabul ve Uyum." *Hacettepe Üniversitesi Göç ve Siyaset Araştırmaları Merkezi* (2014): *Hacettepe Üniversitesi Göç ve Siyaset Araştırmaları Merkezi*. Hacettepe Üniversitesi, 2014.
<https://data.unhcr.org/syrianrefugees/download.php?id=8228> 21.11.2016.

According to UNICEF January 2016 data, 2.4 million of Syrian asylum seekers are children. The physical and mental health of children is deteriorating due to long working hours, low wages, violent and abusive working environment, and working at jobs where security measures are not taken; and many employing children are preferred due to low labor costs. Fathers who are sick or old, or can not find jobs, children's irregular relationships with their families (or who have left their families); are situations that can directly lead to the child labor. Many Syrian children are obliged to work whose father died in war or still fighting.⁸¹

It has been seen in the research of Hayata Destek Derneği on Syrian refugees living in Istanbul, refugees are restricting food expenses while struggling with poverty. 89% of The Syrian families who were interviewed were looking for food products that were less preferred and cheaper, while 59% had reduced the number of meals consumed each day, while 9% said they did not eat anything on some days.⁸²

2.6.2.2. Problems in Access to Services

Syrian refugees are having problems accessing services such as education, health and social assistance, due to mainly the language problem, ignorance and poverty. The inadequacy of schools and teachers causes the vast majority of Syrian asylum seekers not to benefit from these rights. Especially in some cities the number of Syrian refugees is so large that the hospitals in these cities became crowded, thus causes disruption in services. Aside from all these reasons, one of the most fundamental problems that asylum seekers experience with public

⁸¹ Deniz, Hülür and Ekinci, ibid.

⁸² Kaya, Ayhan, and Aysu Kırac, "İstanbul'daki Suriyeli Mültecilere İlişkin Zarar Görebilirlik Değerlendirme Raporu." *Hayata Destek Derneği* (2016): *İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi*. İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi, April 2016.
<http://openaccess.bilgi.edu.tr:8080/xmlui/bitstream/handle/11411/822/%C4%B0stanbul'daki%20Suriyeli%20m%C3%BCltecilere%20ili%C5%9Fkin%20zarar%20g%C3%B6rebilirlik%20de%C4%9Feri%20değerlendirme%20raporu%20Nisan%202016.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y> 20.11.2016.

services is that they do not know the language problem and how to apply to the institution.⁸³

2.6.2.3. Social Problems

Syrian refugees face negative consequences such as discrimination, as well as social hatred, hate speech and hate crimes. Language barrier, financial hardship, a struggle for survival and trying to survive in a foreign society is often results for asylum seekers to "leisure time" activities either at home, visiting relatives, or spending time in parks with their families.⁸⁴ Refugees who can not communicate with the local people are becoming more isolated and excluded.

The hate speech which will be discussed in more detail in the following sections can be explained as "offensive use of the discourse targeting race, religion, ethnicity and sexual orientation."⁸⁵ The observed hate speech for Arabs in Turkey dates much earlier than the acceptance of Syrian refugees. In our education system, the words of "The Arabs shot us from behind" were repeated in the history lessons when the First World War was being discussed.⁸⁶ In addition, the black dogs often called as "Arab", to express an unexplained situation, the expression means "I didn't understand like an Arab" is used and the Arab women are humiliated through the "Arab hair" discourse.⁸⁷

Syrian men are subjected to a hate speech by locals as traitors to their homeland and that they have run away from war while there is a war in their country.⁸⁸

⁸³ Deniz, Ekinci and Hülür, *ibid.*

⁸⁴ Çağlar, Hülür and Ekinci, *ibid.*

⁸⁵ Smolla quoted in Kovucu, *ibid.*

⁸⁶ Çelik, Alkış, Sayan and Ekinci, *ibid.*

⁸⁷ Çelik, Alkış, Sayan and Ekinci, *ibid.*

⁸⁸ Çağlar, Hülür and Ekinci, *ibid.*

Among local people, it is quite common for Syrians to be associated with crimes such as theft, prostitution, extortion, and damage to public property. However, in all the studies conducted, it was determined that the crime rate of the Syrians is much lower than that of the local people. Despite, perception is exaggeratedly negative.⁸⁹

In a field survey conducted in the village of Nevşehir, Hisar, the villagers criticized Syrian refugee women for "wearing short skirts," "consuming much coffee and cigarettes", and "having fun in the middle of the night" and men for "smoking hookah and arranging entertainments".⁹⁰

In the research conducted by Mazlum-Der in Gaziantep, the social problems encountered by the Syrian women are expressed as follows;

It has almost become a sectoral area to marry Syrian woman as a second wife who escaped from war or has worsening living conditions. The number of women or children mated to a certain amount of money, voluntarily, reluctantly or deceived tends to increase. This situation has begun to cause uneasiness especially in women living in poor neighborhoods. Gaziantep women's complaints such as "Syrian women will seduce our husbands" also bring a hatred against Syrian women and see them as potential "sedition".⁹¹

In addition, in the study of Deniz, Hülür and Ekinçi, it is reported that women asylum seekers are being exploited as cheap labor as well as exposed to sexual abuse during their efforts to make their living in poverty.⁹²

The hate speech observed for the Syrian refugees is occasionally turned into hate crimes, causing social lynchings, harming homes and businesses and exposing them to physical violence.

After a landlord in Gaziantep was killed by a Syrian tenant, a crowded group started attacking Syrians on streets and the events reached a social lynching

⁸⁹ Erdoğan, *ibid.*

⁹⁰ Akşit, Bozok and Bozok, *ibid.*

⁹¹ Çelik, Alkış, Sayan and Ekinçi, *ibid.*

⁹² Deniz, Hülür and Ekinçi, *ibid.*

dimension. Some Syrians were attacked and injured in these incidents that last for several days; houses, workplaces and vehicles were destroyed. After the incidents Syrian refugees, started hanging Turkish flags on houses and work places, men leaving "jellabi" which is a local dress and women wearing headscarves like Turks in order to ensure their safety.⁹³

In the social media, the contents like "I do not want Syrians in my country" started to be shared, "Groups wanting Syrian asylum seekers to return, are organizing through social networks, arranging protests on streets and social networks are generally used for to inform people about when and where the protests will take place."⁹⁴

⁹³ Deniz, Hülür and Ekinci, ibid.

⁹⁴ Karataş, Mustafa. "Türk Yazılı Basınında Suriyeli Sığınmacılar ile Halk Arasındaki İlişkinin İncelenmesi." *Göç Araştırmaları Dergisi* 1.2 (2015): 112-51. *Göç Araştırmaları Merkezi*. Göç Araştırmaları Merkezi, Dec. 2015. <http://www.gam.gov.tr/files/d5.pdf> 19.11.2016.

3. LANGUAGE, DISCOURSE AND HATE SPEECH

The practices of exclusion, hate speech and hate crimes faced by Syrian refugees in social life based on the discourses created by discriminatory ideology. Discourse is a social phenomenon produced through language, and it also functions as a way of making sense of social life as well as shaping it. The dominant discourse is the discourse of the dominant group, which has power in the material and immaterial fields of the society; it is both nourished by ideologies and also forms them.

In this section, first of all, definitions of the concept of ideology by different doctrines will be mentioned, then what the concepts of language and discourse mean and their relation with ideology will be discussed. The debate will continue with the "ideological state apparatuses" which used for spread the ideology, to ensure society to embrace this ideology; and also with these apparatuses' functions. The sovereign's domination on the forms of material production thus domination over the "ideological apparatus of the state" also their use of ideology to legitimize its power will be discussed in a separate chapter. Finally, the concept of "hate speech" which is the basis of this thesis study will be discussed theoretically and the way in which hate speech is produced, how it is legitimized and naturalized through media will be concentrated.

3.1. Ideology and Relation to Social Life

3.1.1. Conceptual Discussions on Ideology

The ideology was first used in 1796 by the French philosopher Destutt de Tracy to describe the theory (logy) about the formation of ideas (idea). The main

focus in this period was on language and the relation between language and thought.⁹⁵

When it came to the 19th century, the concept of ideology gained a critical meaning with Karl Marx; Marx and later Marxist thinkers have described the ideology as "a false consciousness that distorts real relations in order to protect class interests".⁹⁶ According to this group, ideologies are for legitimizing and protecting the position of those in the dominant position.⁹⁷ "The ideas that are valid for a time reflect the interests of the ruling class."⁹⁸ Because the class which dominates the forms of production and the relations of production (infrastructure) has a right to say in the determination of a certain society structure and the superstructure - laws, government forms and ideas.⁹⁹

Raymond Geuss; in his book *Critical Theory*, classifies different definitions of the concept of ideology under the titles of descriptive, critical, and positive. Ideology in descriptive sense; is mostly used in the classification of cultures according to similarities or differences by anthropology. In the project of describing and clarifying some features of social groups of people or the events related to them comes out as an ideology theory. Ideology in critical sense, entails criticizing the beliefs, attitudes and wishes of the subjects in a society. It is based on the observation that the subjects in society are in a state of being in a delusion about themselves, their positions, their societies, or their interests. The project aims to show that the subjects are in illusion. Finally, in a positive sense, ideology interprets a culture or a socio-cultural system, a set of attitudes, habits, beliefs,

⁹⁵ Althusser, Louis. *İdeoloji ve Devletin İdeolojik Aygıtları*. Trans. Alp Tümerterkin. 4th ed. İstanbul: İthaki Yayınları, 2010.

Kennedy quoted in Fairclough, Norman, and Phil Graham. "Eleştirel Söylem Çözümlemecisi Olarak Marx: Eleştirel Yöntemin Yaratılışı ve Küresel Sermayenin Eleştirisi ile Bağlantısı." *Söylem ve İdeoloji*. Ed.s Barış Çoban and Zeynep Özarslan. 2nd ed. İstanbul: Su Yayınevi, 2015. 147-97.

⁹⁶ Swingewood, Alan. *Sosyolojik Düşüncenin Kısa Tarihi*. Trans. Osman Akınhay. 2nd ed. Ankara: Bilim ve Sanat Yayınları, 1998.

⁹⁷ Wallace, Ruth A., and Alison Wolf. "Çatışma Kuramı." *Çağdaş Sosyoloji Kuramları*. Trans. Leyla Elburuz and M. Rami Ayas. 3rd ed. Ankara: Doğu Batı Yayınları, 2012. 107-221.

⁹⁸ Marx quoted in Wallace and Wolf, *ibid*.

⁹⁹ Wallace and Wolf, *ibid*.

artistic expressions that each of the groups of people has, as a positive value.¹⁰⁰ Participating in a culture is a way of satisfying human needs. People have a vital need for meaningful life and identity.¹⁰¹

Terry Eagleton, in his work *Ideology*, talks about the lack of a definite definition of ideology, and makes 16 different definitions of ideology to show the diversity of meaning. Then, he merges his viewpoint in 6 different definitions;

- Ideology is a general material process that produces ideas, beliefs and values in social life. By this definition, it has a meaning close to the culture.
- It corresponds to beliefs and ideas that symbolize the situation and life experiences of a particular class or group of socially important people. In short, it can be summarized as "worldview".
- It is the legitimation and promotion of the interests of social groups. Ideology is the discursive area, that the social forces that take care of their own interests, colliding for the sake of the issues that are central to the reproduction of social power.
- Sovereign ideologies help to provide a social unity in accordance with the demands of the administrators. These ideologies are a matter of ensuring the crime partnership of the subordinated classes and groups than forcing adoption of the ideas from above.
- Ideology is a symbol of ideas and beliefs that help legitimize the interests of a ruling group or class, especially by hypocrisy and distortion. It is a discourse that supports and legitimizes their real interests by methods such as preservation, universalization and naturalization.
- The ideology, as false or deceptive beliefs, arises not only from a single class, but from the material structure of the whole society.¹⁰²

¹⁰⁰ Geuss, Raymond. *Eleştirel Teori: Habermas ve Frankfurt Okulu*. Trans. Ferda Keskin. 2nd ed. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2013.

¹⁰¹ Habermas quoted in Geuss, ibid.

¹⁰² Eagleton, Terry. *İdeoloji*. Trans. Muttalip Özcan. 3rd ed. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2011.

Ideology like we see Geuss and Eagleton's in different terms can be interpreted; Neutrally in terms of defining just the cultural differences / characteristics of a community; Positively in the sense of establishing identity for members of a community and organizing social life; Negatively in terms of ideas that are created as illusion like it is necessary for the whole society while being in the interest of a sovereign minority. In this thesis, the negative definition of the ideology as false consciousness will be based on. As it can be seen in the following sections, it is mainly negative ideologies that lead to discrimination, exclusion, hate speech.

3.1.2. How Does Ideologies Affect Social Life?

Ideologies are stereotypes / rules that we use to position ourselves in social life and to determine how we behave. According to Louis Althusser, "ideology represents the imaginary relationship of individuals to their real conditions of existence."¹⁰³ As false consciousness, ideology hinders the possibility of opposing the system, striking the operation, or totally destroying it, by hiding the real illusion of the people.

Teun A. van Dijk categorized the "group self-schema", which describes what it means to be a group member, as follows;

- Membership criteria: Who does not belong?
- Typical events: What are we doing?
- General objectives: What do we want? Why are we doing this?
- Rules and values: What is good or bad for us?
- Situation: What kind of associations do we have?

¹⁰³ Althusser, *ibid.*

- Resources: Who has the right to access our group resources? ¹⁰⁴

People feel that they belong to a community according to the criteria specified and they divide and label other people into groups within these criteria. In communities one or several groups are more dominant than others, they are more powerful, control resources. This dominant group uses legitimizing ideologies to ensure its own legitimacy. Through these ideologies, the dominant group reveals their own image, their actions, their language as normal, and those that are not included to their own groups stigmatized as deviant. ¹⁰⁵

Ideologies, in addition to the establishment of subjects, also direct how they perceive real life. The creation of reality is one of the basic functions of ideology, and it is a system that shows how the codes used in making this reality understandable. The subjects are trying to understand the reality of the social life, they are aware of, by using the semantic rules. ¹⁰⁶

Wallace and Wolf argue that we interpret reality with our individual experiences and continue as follows;

The genre of individual experiences that will enable people to see the social order as real and legitimate and thus change the way of social conflict can be diagnosed. These experiences are obtained through 1- taking and sending orders 2- communication forms. Communication determines how people will accept the ideas and norms of the society they belong, and whether people will see the social order as legitimate. ¹⁰⁷

The forms of communication include all forms of communication that begin with a spoken language and include different written / non-written or verbal

¹⁰⁴ van Dijk, Teun A. "Söylem ve İdeoloji: Çok Alanlı Bir Yaklaşım." *Söylem ve İdeoloji*. Ed. Barış Çoban and Zeynep Özarslan. 2nd ed. İstanbul: Su Yayınevi, 2015. 15-97.

¹⁰⁵ Çayır, Kenan. "Gruplararası İlişkiler Bağlamında Ayrımcılık." *Ayrımcılık, Çok Boyutlu Yaklaşımlar*. Ed.s Kenan Çayır and Müge Ayan Ceyhan. İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2012. 5-16.

¹⁰⁶ Çoban, Barış. "Söylem, İdeoloji ve Eylem: İktidar ve Muhalefet Arasındaki Mücadeleyi Çözümleme Denemesi." *Söylem ve İdeoloji*. Ed.s Barış Çoban and Zeynep Özarslan. 2nd ed. İstanbul: Su Yayınevi, 2015. 199-234.

¹⁰⁷ Collins quoted in Wallace and Wolf, ibid.

/ nonverbal discursive practices. Individuals within the community adopt the ideology of that community through communication.

3.2. Language, Discourse and Their Relations with Ideology

3.2.1. Conceptual Discussions on Language

Features distinguish people is establishing a social life and using language to communicate in this sociality.¹⁰⁸ According to Marx, language is a social and material fact. "Language derives only from the necessity and need of engaging with other people."¹⁰⁹ At the beginning, the person uses the language to simply by the "survival" instinct, to cooperate with other and in time he/she acts with same instinct, not to struggle with the physical condition, but to get "acceptance" in social life.

Hall correlates the meaning that expresses reality and the language as a social practice.¹¹⁰ "In order to understand the world, the objects in the external world must be transformed into meaningful concepts and placed in the linguistic space, and after a process in which they can be expressed with linguistic symbols, they need to be reconstituted in language and create living spaces."¹¹¹ The languages connection with the reality is it's interpretation function. Because according to Hall, language and symbols are tools where the meanings, that make the world real, are created.¹¹²

¹⁰⁸ Çoban, ibid.

¹⁰⁹ Marx quoted in Fairclough and Graham, ibid.

¹¹⁰ Hall quoted in Göker, Göksel, and Savaş Keskin. "Haber Medyası ve Mülteciler: Suriyeli Mültecilerin Türk Yazılı Basınındaki Temsili." *İletişim Kuram ve Araştırma Dergisi* 41 (2015): 229-56. *İletişim Kuram ve Araştırma Dergisi*. İletişim Kuram ve Araştırma Dergisi, 2015. <http://iletisimdergisi.gazi.edu.tr/site/index.php/IKAD/article/view/204>. 21.11.2016.

¹¹¹ Hall quoted in Çoban, ibid.

¹¹² Hall quoted in Göker and Keskin, ibid.

According to Foucault, language is a means of "naming, separating, combining, tying and untying by signifying things in the transparency of words" to make things representable to human beings.¹¹³ Language is a system of constructed symbols consisting of literary and visual signs, sensory callings and sounds and used for producing and sharing meaning.¹¹⁴ Through the use of language, thoughts, beliefs, emotions and consciousness are expressed; at the same time, thoughts, beliefs, emotions and consciousness are influenced and shaped.¹¹⁵

The meaning of a message in communication is understood through codes / symbols and these codes are used to select and combine the signs that form the messages.¹¹⁶ According to Saussure, a sign consists of a signifier and a signified. The signifier is the perceived side of the sign, and the signified is a mental concept that the sign expresses.¹¹⁷ In the encoding-decoding model that Hall has developed, the sender encodes the message and against the recipient receives the message by decoding. Hall emphasizes that each recipient's interpretation of the message will be different according to their social background, states that the viewer can accept the message as it is or reject the message and oppose it.¹¹⁸ According to the model, it is necessary for the sender and the receiver to perceive the code in the same way in order to make meaningful communication.

¹¹³ Foucault quoted in Çoban, ibid.

¹¹⁴ Alp, ibid.

¹¹⁵ Erdoğan quoted in Alp, ibid.

¹¹⁶ Çoban, ibid.

¹¹⁷ Saussure quoted in Çomu, Tuğrul. "Video Paylaşım Ağlarında Nefret Söylemi: Youtube Örneği." Thesis. Ankara Üniversitesi, 2012. *Ulusal Tez Merkezi*. Ulusal Tez Merkezi, 2012. https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/TezGoster?key=RYan9_S-Z7Eir3xdWGXBiMSMeQ_SNdyyuR7qfFEtQZATzhapUDVh5gRVq5kC_hH4 09.09.2016.

¹¹⁸ Spitulnik, Debra. "Anthropology and Mass Media." *Annual Review of Anthropology* 22.1 (1993): 293-315.

3.2.2. Conceptual Discussions on Discourse

The concept of discourse also has many neutral, positive, or negative definitions, such as the concept of ideology. The concept of discourse is basically defined as "the use of language, so, communication with language".¹¹⁹ Ethymologically discourse, corresponds to "discurrere" in Latin, and / or the word "dissociation", "dissolution", "dissemination" and various versions of the word "discursus". In the metaphorical sense, it means "long-distance conversation about the subject", "communication about something".¹²⁰

According to Çoban, mythology is "the product of human discourse's struggle to understand and give meaning to life, by its own conscious activity, and it is a mind structure that act as tools for people to reposition and shape themselves in the world by using their linguistic realm."¹²¹ In his book *Mythologies*, Barthes was much more interested in the way the ideology was established in language than the social aspect of the ideology, and regarded the language only as a system of verbal speech act.¹²² Barthes divides myths into connotation and denotation. Denotation is the primary meaning that comes to mind first. Connotation is the meaning of "associative" quality.¹²³ Denotation formed by conceiving the signified objectively, and the connotation expresses the special values due to the sign's form and function. The connotational reference field is determined by Barthes as the field of ideological infiltration into the language system.¹²⁴ The reason why Barthes calls the connotation is myth that; myth naturalizes the ideological meaning to be conveyed and plays a role to make

¹¹⁹ Cook quoted in Çomu, *ibid.*

¹²⁰ Sözen quoted in Aygöl, *ibid.*

¹²¹ Çoban, *ibid.*

¹²² Barthes quoted in Çomu, *ibid.*

¹²³ Barthes quoted in Alp, *ibid.*

¹²⁴ Barthes quoted in Çoban, *ibid.*

it innocent.¹²⁵ "Mythology is produced by the removal of the objective reality and reproduction of it in a new context."¹²⁶

Discourses can be described as "a set of statements that constructs objects, a ruler of subject positions". These constructions later make certain ways of interpreting the world and certain ways of being in the world, accessible.¹²⁷ The subject in society finds its own identity and purpose in the direction of the discourse that appeals to it, and acts in the direction of this purpose. According to Pospelov, discourse is "language in action. So, it's the linguistic communication process that is linked with the relevant emotions and efforts which occurs within certain living conditions and the pronouncing of certain considerations."¹²⁸

Hall states that the meaning underlying language and discourse is also socially created. According to Hall, "meanings are entirely contained in social relations and structures. Through certain cultural and political practices, they function and process as socially as long as they articulate to various social positions and constitute and reconstitute social subjects."¹²⁹ Potter also emphasizes that discourses were not created by individuals. Discourses existing at the social level builds the meaning. In this way, societies connects the existing symbols with meanings. Societies thus acquire several discursive practices about how they think about issues, events and facts or how they communicate.¹³⁰

According to van Dijk; our daily reality is perceived, understood and interpreted through the establishment of mental models. Mental models; represents prejudiced information; submits concrete examples (definitions) for

¹²⁵ Barthes quoted in Çomu, ibid.

¹²⁶ Çoban, ibid.

¹²⁷ Willig quoted in Ertaş, Alper. "Nefret Suçları ve Nefret Söyleminin Yazılı Basında Üretimi." Thesis. Selçuk Üniversitesi, 2014. *Ulusal Tez Merkezi*. 2014. https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/TezGoster?key=48XPj7KKQhKUgntkUiKO3BL12b_m3_yQSs4WQ9stkdKx1JvE8853WHrMP9iOPjG 16.10.2016.

¹²⁸ Pospelov quoted in Ergül, ibid.

¹²⁹ Hall quoted in Göker and Keskin, ibid.

¹³⁰ Potter quoted in Bayram, Yavuz. "Bir Hak İhlali Olarak Ötekileştirme: Gazetelerin Üçüncü Sayfa Haberlerinde Suriyeli Sığınmacıların 'Öteki' Temsili." *Güvenlik Çalışmaları Dergisi* 17.3 (2015): 1-36. *Polis Akademisi*. 2015. <https://www.pa.edu.tr/Project%5CFiles%5CStatic%5CEgitimBirimleri%5CGBE%5CGuvenlikCalismalariDergi%5C3%5C17-3.pdf> 22.11.2016.

general, abstract beliefs. Knowledge, attitudes, and ideologies can affect the content and structures of mental models we build for specific events. The interface between discourse and ideology is mental models. Speech involves the expression of mental models and the understanding the formation of mental models.¹³¹

3.2.3. The Relationship Between Discourse and Ideologies

All linguistic and nonlinguistic fields of a social culture reflects it's discourse and signification of the world.¹³² Ideologies express and form themselves and with language. The words chosen, phrases, form of speech, expression, even the ability to make sentences form the basis of discourse; as well discourse forms the basis of ideologies.¹³³ People construct beliefs, representations, attitudes shared within a particular group or group ideology through discourse.¹³⁴ Most ideological ideas are learned by listening other group members, primarily parents and peers; then among a pile of a bunch of speech and text forms by watching television, from the books taught in school, commercials, newspapers, novels or daily conversations with colleagues or friends.¹³⁵ According to van Dijk, the most important social practices influenced by ideologies are language use and discourse that influence how we acquire, learn and change ideologies.¹³⁶

Ideology is a performative language rather than a constative; it is not included in description discourse, but is in the speech-act category that tell to do something.¹³⁷ Ideology is the set of ideas people use to identify, explain and

¹³¹ van Dijk, *ibid.*

¹³² Oskay, Ünal, Prof.Dr. *Söylem ve İdeoloji*. 2nd ed. İstanbul: Su Yayınevi, 2015.

¹³³ İncoğlu, *ibid.*

¹³⁴ Göregenli quoted in Kovucu, *ibid.*

¹³⁵ van Dijk, *ibid.*

¹³⁶ van Dijk quoted in Aygöl, *ibid.*

¹³⁷ Austin quoted in Eagleton, *ibid.*

verify the tools and purposes of organized social action, and in particular political action.¹³⁸ According to Fairclough, discourse manifests itself in three ways in social practice:

1) Discourse is the social activity in a practice. It involves using the language in a specific way as part of a job. For example, a clerk or politician will use language for work.

2) Discourse shows itself in representations. In all practices, social actors represent their own practices and other practices in the context of activities within practice. Representations are involved in and form social processes and practices.

3) Discourse functions as the form of existence in the creation of identities.¹³⁹

Perhaps the most important one of these three ways is the role of discourse in the formation of identities; Because the person presents his ideas and behaviors in parallel with the social identity s/he has created.

Discourse contributes to the creation of relationships, subjects and objects that fill the social world.¹⁴⁰ As a social practice, discourse constructs belongings to groups, and inter-group relations, gives a meaning and even legitimizes it. In other words, people constructs beliefs, representations, attitudes, or group ideology shared within a particular group through discourse.¹⁴¹ According to van Dijk;

Since ideologies have emerged within a particular group dynamics, they present a descriptive structure to the group members, from their perceptions of themselves to the perception and appropriation of other groups. In this respect, the boundaries between the group members and the other groups are clarified as a result of ideological representations. Individuals are instilled with "us" and

¹³⁸ Seliger quoted in Eagleton, *ibid.*

¹³⁹ Fairclough, Norman. "Söylemin Diyalektiği." Trans. Barış Çoban. *Söylem ve İdeoloji*. Ed.s Barış Çoban and Zeynep Özarlan. 2nd ed. İstanbul: Su Yayınevi, 2015. 137-146.

¹⁴⁰ Fairclough, Norman. "Dil ve İdeoloji." Trans. Barış Çoban. *Söylem ve İdeoloji*. Ed.s Barış Çoban and Zeynep Özarlan. 2nd ed. İstanbul: Su Yayınevi, 2015. 121-136.

¹⁴¹ Alp, *ibid.*

"them" consciousness in this way. This process causes the discourse to proliferate and the descriptive representations to turn into a dominant perspective.¹⁴²

The most fundamental point of hate speech is that us-them dichotomy and fear of different one.

Lacan treats the subject as a product of discourse while explaining the relation of "subject-discourse". According to him, "the discourses are things that create personalities and selves".¹⁴³ According to Althusser, ideology "is a way of regulating the practice of signification; which constitutes human beings as social subjects, links these subjects to the dominant relations of production in a society and produces experienced relations."¹⁴⁴ Althusser, in *Ideology and Ideological State Apparatuses*, Althusser mentions that .there is no ideology except by the subject and for the subject. According to him, ideology calls individuals as subjects. He gives an example like; when a police officer shouts (or hails) "Hey, you there!" and an individual turns around and so-to-speak 'answers' the call, he becomes a subject. Because the individual has realized that the hailing was addressed at him and aimed him.¹⁴⁵

Orwell, in his article titled Politics and English Language; mentions ways of using language for manipulating thoughts.¹⁴⁶ For example; The bombing of defenseless villages can expressed as "neutralization" or the resettlement of the peasants as "the regulation of the borders". The truth is symbolically manipulated in order to hide unfavorable situations from the community.¹⁴⁷ Pecheux claims that the meanings of words have been transformed depending on who uses the discourse.¹⁴⁸ As the political side where the politicians stand; the use of the word "Armenians", for example, changes.

¹⁴² van Dijk quoted in Göker and Keskin, *ibid.*

¹⁴³ Lacan quoted in Alp, *ibid.*

¹⁴⁴ Althusser quoted in Eagleton, *ibid.*

¹⁴⁵ Althusser, *ibid.*

¹⁴⁶ Orwell quoted in Wilson, John. "Politik Söylem." Trans. Zeynep Özarslan. *Söylem ve İdeoloji*. Ed.s Barış Çoban and Zeynep Özarslan. 2nd ed. İstanbul: Su Yayınevi, 2015. 101-120.

¹⁴⁷ Wilson, *ibid.*

¹⁴⁸ Pecheux quoted in Wilson, *ibid.*

According to Foucault, discourse is a phenomenon that actually reflects ideology and aims to shape social practices in a sense or reconstruct in their favor.¹⁴⁹ Foucault points out discourses are not independent of power relations, but power /knowledge relationships among groups of people also the determinants of discourse formation.¹⁵⁰ The ideas of the ruling class are in every epoch the ruling ideas, i.e. the class which is the ruling material force of society, is at the same time its ruling intellectual force. The class which has the means of material production at its disposal, has control at the same time over the means of mental production, so that thereby, generally speaking, the ideas of those who lack the means of mental production are subject to it.¹⁵¹ Ideology is related to legitimizing the power of the dominant social group and class. It is to study the situations in which meaning serves to sustain relations of domination.¹⁵² It is inevitable that the sovereign power hides the ideas that shake their power which has ownership of intellectual spheres such as mass media, publishing houses, educational institutions.

van Dijk states that the provision of social control is achieved through the control of discourse or the direct production of discourse. "Thus, one way of controlling power in society is not only to control such discourse or action, but also to control the practice of specific discourses we call text or speech."¹⁵³ The public is manipulated by the power via controlling whom will speak about what.

3.3. The Relationship Between Power and Discourse

¹⁴⁹ Yegen, Ceren. "Yazılı Basında HIV/AIDS ile Yaşayan Bireylere Yönelik Nefret Söylemi." Thesis. Gazi Üniversitesi, 2013. *Ulusal Tez Merkezi*. 2013. <https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/TezGoster?key=iTkOhwevEenJZ3onUvs52us5qGH9kWJYbjRgOzlFn05uUrrHNhFFyKuZZujsX6bC> 15.11.2016.

¹⁵⁰ Foucault quoted in Çomu, ibid.

¹⁵¹ Marx quoted in Alp, ibid.

¹⁵² Thompson quoted in Eagleton, ibid.

¹⁵³ van Dijk quoted in Çomu, ibid.

"Power is the control of one group on another, and ideologies function as the mental dimension of such control." ¹⁵⁴ The struggle for power expresses itself through discourse, and political discourse tries to fix and close the society within the boundaries of its discourse. Power effectively uses the ideological devices to keep the main determinative points of the field of discourse and identify the social discourse and reproduces its own ideological discourse in all social discursive practices. ¹⁵⁵ The discourse that is confirmed in each communication channel becomes dominant over the society after a while and is accepted without questioning.

According to Jürgen Habermas; Ideology is a form of communication that is systematically distorted by power -a form of discourse that serves to legitimize the organized power relations-. ¹⁵⁶ van Dijk says that social power operates indirectly through people's "minds". ¹⁵⁷ The person who adopts the ideology of the power advocates the dominant ideas in his own favor and acts accordingly.

Every discourse that has become sovereign among socially created discourses; is an umbrella that establish and legitimize hegemony produce social consent for that hegemony, determines 'truth' and 'wrong', 'good' and 'evil' as social concepts, and places these concepts as they were social norms as ideological notions. ¹⁵⁸

Fairclough argues that in order to provide institutional order, discourse is used 1) by hiding power asymmetry between unequal groups, 2) by "synthetic personalization" and especially by offering discourses as simulations to the audience in the mass media. The viewer identifies himself with the synthetic

¹⁵⁴ van Dijk, ibid

¹⁵⁵ Oskay, ibid.

¹⁵⁶ Habermas quoted in Eagleton, ibid.

¹⁵⁷ van Dijk quoted in Doğanay, Ülkü, and Hatice Çoban Keneş. "Yazılı Basında Suriyeli 'Mülteciler': Ayrımcı Söylemlerin Rasyonel ve Duygusal Gerekçelerinin İnşası." *Mülkiye Dergisi* 40.1 (2016): 143-184. *Academia.edu*. 2016. <http://mulkiyederqi.org/article/view/5000186481> 21.11.2016.

¹⁵⁸ Çınar quoted in Kovucu, ibid.

person he sees on the screen, so that power relations can be sustained by consenting and internalizing.¹⁵⁹

According to Antonio Gramsci, hegemony is "the way a power in the executive takes the consent of the people he has ruled for his own dominance," and the person internalizes the dominant ideas with consent. Thus, power becomes "common sense" of social order as a whole. Unlike hegemony, dominance continues its existence with the state's disciplining and punishing power.¹⁶⁰ Spreading to the social life entirely, and thus becoming "naturalized" and invisible, such as a habit, custom or spontaneous activity; are preferable situations for the government.¹⁶¹

"It may not be easy to identify hate speech because it does not always reveal itself with hatred and anger, and sometimes it appears to be fairly normal."¹⁶² Usually, the discourse of hatred is so natural that people do not even realize that their words are hateful. Groups exposed to hate speech are invisible to avoid confrontation with negative reactions,¹⁶³ and dissolve within the majority as the government desires.

3.4. Ideological State Apparatuses and The Diffusion of Ideologies

According to Althusser, "the ruling class must reproduce the material, political and ideological conditions of its existence. This reproduction is never complete, it has to be constantly renewed. " It works through two different ways; coercion and consent. Government, administration, army, police, courts, prisons,

¹⁵⁹ Fairclough, Norman. "Dil ve İdeoloji." Trans. Barış Çoban. *Söylem ve İdeoloji*. Ed.s Barış Çoban and Zeynep Özarslan. 2nd ed. İstanbul: Su Yayınevi, 2015. 121-136.

¹⁶⁰ Gramsci quoted in Eagleton, *ibid*.

¹⁶¹ Eagleton, *ibid*.

¹⁶² İnceoğlu, Yasemin. "Önsöz." *Nefret Söylemi ve/veya Nefret Suçları*. Ed. Yasemin İnceoğlu. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2012. 11-22.

¹⁶³ Karan, Ulaş. "Nefret İçerikli İfadeler, İfade Özgürlüğü ve Uluslararası Hukuk." *Nefret Söylemi ve/veya Nefret Suçları*. Ed. Yasemin İnceoğlu. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2012. 81-101.

etc. compose the repressive state apparatuses. These devices use force at extreme situations. Ideological state apparatuses can be grouped into religion, education, family, law, politics, trade union, communication and cultural forms. While repressive state apparatuses appear entirely in the public sphere, most of the ideological state apparatuses exist in the private sphere. While repressive apparatuses act forcefully, ideological devices diffuse by the imposition of the ideology.¹⁶⁴ Ernest Gellner, in his theory that he developed on nationalism, has mentioned the importance of the education and communication system for homogenization of societies and for national identities.¹⁶⁵ According to Gellner, without these fields national identities and citizenship can not be instilled.

For Gramsci, the ruling class uses cultural and ideological instruments as well as physical power to establish and legitimize his government. Gramsci's key concept in culture and ideology is "hegemony," and Hegemony is "a reconciliation that shows the groups' sovereigns natural and legitimate in a society."¹⁶⁶ Gramsci has stated that "some professional groups in society, such as journalists or pastors, spread a hegemonic ideology that combines nationalist and common thinking views, for hiding existing class positions."¹⁶⁷ According to Gramsci, "consent means that the ruling class to impose its own worldview and way of thinking into the members of the society."¹⁶⁸ This acceptance will be so "natural and legitimate" that the society will consider the conditions appear through its consent is the best result, will not need to question and struggle. Those who voluntarily accept the thoughts of the sovereigns as their own thoughts through power and consent have a structure of consciousness that sees people who think or try to live differently, as enemies.¹⁶⁹

Among the means of producing consent, it is the mass media which spreads the widest audience and its accuracy discussed least. "Mass

¹⁶⁴ Althusser, *ibid.*

¹⁶⁵ Ercan Bilgiç, Esra. "Media Theory II - Module II - Media and Social Change." İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi. 12.03.2013. Lecture.

¹⁶⁶ Gramsci quoted in Aygül, *ibid.*

¹⁶⁷ Gramsci quoted in Çomu, *ibid.*

¹⁶⁸ Gramsci quoted in Aygül, *ibid.*

¹⁶⁹ Alp, *ibid.*

communication continues to exist as a carrier of things, facts and meanings, and sometimes as a creator / producer of messages in a sense." ¹⁷⁰ According to Gramsci, mass media, serves to strengthen the dominant culture's conditions of existence and to spread its cultural / philosophical / moral values. ¹⁷¹ "The mass' control and social adjustment through publishing is quite easy, and so mass media is transformed into a tool of political manipulation." ¹⁷²

Especially when it is thought that the ideal function of the news is to "inform", generally the reader or the audience accepts the information they see in any news, and believes in that information without debating its legitimacy. A person that reads a news item, who has no information about the subject previously, through the news in the media, is informed as the journalist has reported the subject and acquires the first impressions of that topic by this way. ¹⁷³ The most controversial issue about the media is "its role for molding public opinion. Ideas widely expressed in the media are often perceived as ideas shared by the society. " ¹⁷⁴

Capital holders who have investments in many different sectors also have media ownership for profit. "The gigantic capital behind the mass media is the power that profits most from the sustained economic-political dominance." ¹⁷⁵ Capital owners are able to earn a significant economic income through the media, as well as to maintain the existing order by legitimizing it, and to disseminate their own ideas to the society.

"The media serves a social purpose, educating people's minds in a way that will lead them to a virtuous commitment to their governments and, more generally, to the regulations of social, economic and political order." ¹⁷⁶

¹⁷⁰ Ergül, ibid.

¹⁷¹ Gramsci quoted in Ergül, ibid.

¹⁷² Williams quoted in Ergül, ibid.

¹⁷³ Sekman, Esra. "Nefret Söyleminin Ortaya Çıkmasında Medyanın Etkisi." <https://istanbul.academia.edu/EsraSekman> 26.11.2016.

¹⁷⁴ Irvin quoted in Yegen, ibid.

¹⁷⁵ Ergül, ibid.

¹⁷⁶ Chomsky quoted in Alp, ibid.

Defending the fact that the media does not reflect reality in fact constitutes the reality, Hall tells that the media carries its own reality.¹⁷⁷

3.5. Hate Speech and It's Production

3.5.1. Conceptual Discussions on Hate Speech

In Turkish, the word "hate" is based on Arabic language and stands for the feeling of wanting one's unhappiness, misfortune; disgust. At the same time, it can be defined as a denial of wanting to destroy someone; a desire someone to fail one evil days.¹⁷⁸

Hate speech can be defined as "words that incite and support hatred against persons through race, color, ethnicity, gender, nationality, religion, sexual orientation, disability, or other forms of individual discrimination".¹⁷⁹ Hate speech is generally ideologically based, and it is seen with / in other ways with otherization, discrimination, prejudice, stereotyping, labeling and racism. "It is ideology that leads people from time to time to see themselves as gods or insects. Ideas are things that people to live for and kill for their sake."¹⁸⁰ Hate speech can also be grow exponentially into hate crimes that cause physical harm to people and even death of them.

¹⁷⁷ Hall quoted in Ertaş, ibid.

¹⁷⁸ Ataman, Hakan. "Nefret Suçlarını Farklı Yaklaşımlar Çerçevesinden Ele Almak: Etik, Sosyo-Politik ve Bir İnsan Hakları Problemi Olarak Nefret Suçları." *Nefret Söylemi ve/veya Nefret Suçları*. Ed. Yasemin İnceoğlu. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2012. 47-80.

¹⁷⁹ Akdeniz, Yaman. "İnternet'te Irkçılık." *Nefret Suçları ve Nefret Söylemi*. Ed.s Ayşe Çavdar and Aylin B. Yıldırım. İstanbul: Uluslararası Hrant Dink Vakfı Yayınları, 2010. 175-192.

¹⁸⁰ Eagleton, ibid.

Prejudice can be defined in general terms as negative ideas based on prejudgment, intolerance or hatred directed towards a specific group.¹⁸¹

According to van Dijk;

Generalizations are one of the basic elements that cause prejudices to arise. People form their own mental models based on their discourse in prejudiced texts. At this point, people just not form prejudiced mental models, but also build prejudicial attitudes when there is no other knowledge, no counter-ideology or counter-discourse.¹⁸²

Eagleton states that, without some kind of prejudice, we can not judge any issue or situation, even we can not fully define this issue or situation.¹⁸³ As noted earlier, van Dijk emphasized that our sense of perception, comprehension and interpretation of our daily reality can exist with the establishment of mental models. What makes the difference at this point is harsh prejudices and racist thoughts.

The dominant group can name, identify and stigmatize low status groups. Because it has the power.¹⁸⁴ Stigmatization is about all behaviors related to prejudices, the attitudes of society towards some groups, and even cause these groups to be excluded from society. Stigma can be summarized as negative labels attached to a racial, ethnic, gender, or religious group.¹⁸⁵ Goffman talks about three different types of stigma; First one are related to the horrors of the body - its various physical deformations. Second constitutes, weak will, unnatural passions, perverted and rigid beliefs, and features that perceived immoral - personality disorders, alcoholism, homosexuality, unemployment, and so on. The third is ethnological stigma such as race, culture, nation and religion.¹⁸⁶

¹⁸¹ Sosyal Değişim Derneği. *Nefret Suçları ve Nefret Söylemi İzleme Rehberi*. İstanbul: Sosyal Değişim Derneği, 2012. http://aciktoplumvakfi.org.tr/pdf/nefret_suclari.pdf 2016

¹⁸² van Dijk quoted in Çomu, ibid.

¹⁸³ Eagleton, ibid.

¹⁸⁴ Çayır, ibid.

¹⁸⁵ Goffman quoted in Çomu, ibid.

¹⁸⁶ Goffman quoted in Kovucu, ibid.

The members of the group are identified generally only with the negative qualities of that group by labelling. Stereotypes are formed by the reduction of all the qualities of one person to the main features of that person's type, the essentialization, the naturalization and the permanent fixation of the change forever of these qualities. " ¹⁸⁷

Kristina Boréus describes the otherization as "the mental difference created between us and them". " ¹⁸⁸ "The otherness", which basically refers to an exclusionary practice; simply is "not me" at the individual level, and "non-us" at the social level. ¹⁸⁹ A person distinguishes himself from other individuals in defining "me" or "us". Us and them opposition do not only contain just individuals, but also the differences such as religion, language, race. The other in otherization actually perceived as non-us, so the otherization is an ideological practice in the broadest sense. ¹⁹⁰ "The others sometimes include the definition of an ethnicity (Kurdish, Laz, Roman, etc.), and sometimes gendered discrimination (women, gay, etc.) and sometimes economic discrimination (poor, workers etc.).It is generally the powerless segments of society that are positioned as the other." ¹⁹¹

Boréus distinguishes discrimination and otherization from each other. Discrimination is hostile and humiliating.It does not have to happen in communities. But otherization may be inevitable; it may seen as classifying other people and finding differences between people and thinking about differences. Discrimination should be perceived as negative behaviors for people who feel belonging to a group, because of the group they feel belong to. ¹⁹² The everyday social practices of discrimination presuppose the cognitive basis of negative beliefs about others: they include stereotyped ideas, prejudices, racist attitudes or

¹⁸⁷ Hall quoted in Ertaş, ibid.

¹⁸⁸ Boréus, Kristina. " Söylemsel Ayrımcılık ve Dışavurumları."Trans. Emre Can Dağlıoğlu. *Nordicom Review*(2009): 2012. <http://www.nefretsoylemi.org/detay.asp?id=50&bolum=makale> 17.07.2016.

¹⁸⁹ Yanıkkaya quoted in Aygöl, ibid.

¹⁹⁰ Yegen, ibid.

¹⁹¹ Bayram, ibid.

¹⁹² Boréus, ibid.

negative thoughts because of their structuring by racist ideologies.¹⁹³

"Discrimination and its discriminatory behavior are like the other name of violence."¹⁹⁴

"The construction of nation states included the removal of the complexity, the exclusion of elements that would harm the "clarity" of national bonds.¹⁹⁵ The management of a single group of people is easier than for hundreds of different fractions. Also with the "imaginary" elements created, people will consider the nations to be more important than themselves, and when appropriate, they will not avoid killing and dying for the sake of the nation.

The existence of ethnic, linguistic, religious, or cultural groups that are outside of the "nation", which the state defines as their subject, and legal frameworks related to these groups, has created the concept of minority. Groups (ethnic / religious) that fall within the limits and do not comply with the definition and standards of the "nation" become "minority"¹⁹⁶ "In terms of any kind of nationalism, minorities within the national state are 'others', enemies/aliens, their existence is exceptional/accidental."¹⁹⁷ The monotheist nature of nation states rejects "immigrants" as well as all "others" that are in conflict with their identities. The substance of the 'other', according to its positioning, is evil, dangerous, disquieting, threatening. Therefore, excluded ones (or others) do not only become alien and different, they are also seen as "invaders" and occupiers who are not qualified to be there.¹⁹⁸

According to van Dijk, racism in daily life is reproduced through discourse:

¹⁹³ van Dijk, *ibid.*

¹⁹⁴ Alp, *ibid.*

¹⁹⁵ Morley and Robins quoted in Kovucu, *ibid.*

¹⁹⁶ Önk and Selçuk quoted in Kovucu, *ibid.*

¹⁹⁷ Bora quoted in Kovucu, *ibid.*

¹⁹⁸ Man, Fuat. "Modernlik ve Yabancılar: Bir 'Günah Keçisi' Kategorisi Olarak Emek Piyasasındaki Suriyeli Göçmenler Örneği" *VII. Sosyal İnsan Hakları Uluslararası Sempozyumu*(2015): 419-438. 2015. <http://www.sosyalhaklar.net/2015/bildiriler/man.pdf> 21.11.2016.

Casual speeches are the natural result of everyday popular racism. Ethnic stereotypes and prejudices thus spread more quickly, like rumors. In other words, in the process of social life, all social practices can be seen as processes in which the racist thoughts, discourses and actions defined by the ideology of power are repeated and reproduced in a normalized manner.¹⁹⁹

Hate speech, in a comprehensive manner, in the Council of Europe Committee of Ministers' Recommendation 1997, is described as follows;

the term "hate speech" shall be understood as covering all forms of expression which spread, incite, promote or justify racial hatred, xenophobia, anti-Semitism or other forms of hatred based on intolerance, including: intolerance expressed by aggressive nationalism and ethnocentrism, discrimination and hostility against minorities, migrants and people of immigrant origin.²⁰⁰

Tarlach McGonagle describes hate speech as follows; "Hate speech is a negative discourse spreading over a broad spectrum. This discourse is contradictory, because it is a discourse, which can lead to hatred and encourage hatred, that consists of words and phrases based on abuse, humiliation, insult, vilify; and on the other hand, it is not free from prejudices and unconditional provisions."²⁰¹

"Expressions used in hate speech reinforce the oppression of various groups in society by creating various stereotypes which legitimize this suppression, thereby make these groups, that are targeted by hate speech, passive and cynical, and prevent them from participating in democratic gathering equally with other groups."²⁰² The passive group internalizes passivity after a while, and may not enter fight for any right.

Karaköse mentions that hate speech leads to various negative consequences;

¹⁹⁹ van Dijk quoted in Alp, *ibid.*

²⁰⁰ quoted in Alp, *ibid.*

²⁰¹ McGonagle quoted in Karaköse, Nayat. "Nefret Söylemi ve Medyadaki Yansımaları." Nefret Söylemi Çalışma Toplantısı. <https://nefretsoylemi.org/detay.asp?id=57&bolum=makale> 19.07.2016.

²⁰² Karaköse, *ibid.*

The primary outcome of hate speech is harm, which can be psychological or physical. Hate speech may cause short-term losses or, if it happens frequently in the media, or if the hate merchants are constantly propagate in a various means, they may also cause long-term losses. It can encourage hate crimes and cause these crimes to be committed. In a media and political environment where hate speech is dominant, individuals internalize this discourse in the long run and practices that threaten the rights of various groups or legal regulations that violate these rights are normalized.²⁰³

According to Inceoglu; hate speech, which is the outlet of hate crimes, make things easier for hate crimes, promote it, is the expression of intolerance and austereness, gives the targeted groups a message that "there is no room for you in society". This situation wears out the democratic order, because the right to live and participation, which is the most fundamental right of man, is taken away.²⁰⁴

3.5.2. The Role of Media in Producing Hate Speech

News and other media content; mediate in creating the prejudices about certain events by the language used, and reinforcing the constant thoughts or thoughts desired to remain same by the dominant ideology, as well as function to inform the society.²⁰⁵ van Dijk has attributed "central importance to media texts at recreating discriminatory beliefs and judgments and legitimizing stereotypes of various social groups".²⁰⁶ "In particular, the conservative and popular press sometimes make obvious "harassments to foreigners" and reproduce and confirm

²⁰³ Karaköse, *ibid.*

²⁰⁴ İnceoğlu *ibid.*

²⁰⁵ Sekman, *ibid.*

²⁰⁶ van Dijk quoted in Doğanay and Keneş, *ibid.*

racist prejudices. Grudging against refugees, immigrants and minorities is both legitimized and triggered." ²⁰⁷

van Dijk defines "persons controlling symbolic, political, mediatic, and academic discourses as symbolic elites". These people have a say in what content will take place in discourses. ²⁰⁸ These people have a say in what content will take place in discourses.

While establishing the news content and the ideological and semantic contexts of news, accordance with the definitions of the strengths; the media power restructures discursively the form of social control that causes the exclusion of minorities or dissident groups. ²⁰⁹

The Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe emphasizes that the dissemination of hate speech through the media is quite detrimental. ²¹⁰ Because the media, by its spreadability to large communities, and its credibility which is often not questioned, leads to an unquestioned acceptance of hate speech.

Çoban, quotes the role of the traditional media in the production of hate speech as follows;

Because of its commercial and organizational characteristics, traditional media is controlled by both capitalist companies and the nation-state; So the interests of the elites, who own or direct it, or advertising agencies' are represented in media texts. For this reason, dissident, minority or secondary groups in the society do not find enough room for themselves in the media. Moreover, these groups, lacking in expressing themselves well in the traditional media, are defined and represented in the media texts by the discourses produced by the dominant

²⁰⁷ van Dijk, Teun A. "Avrupa'da Çokkültürlü Bir Medya İzleme için Öneri." Trans. Özlem Dalkıran. *Electronic Journal of Communication* 5.2 (2009): 2012.

<http://www.nefretsoylemi.org/detay.asp?id=22&bolum=makale> 17.07.2016.

²⁰⁸ van Dijk, ibid.

²⁰⁹ Alp, ibid.

²¹⁰ İnçeoğlu, ibid.

ideologies, and "otherized". The media uses discursive violence to generate anger, hatred, and directing these feelings to "the others".²¹¹

There is no experience that a social person can grasp without the concepts, rituals and structures which are provided through its own language and are defined culturally. The discourse of the mass media presents us daily ones with an updated version of social relations and cultural perception.²¹² Everyday racism is reproduced through the media and presented to the viewer / reader.

According to Althusser, "The communications apparatus by cramming every 'citizen' with daily doses of nationalism, chauvinism, liberalism, moralism, etc., by means of the press, the radio and television."²¹³ The media legitimizes and provokes aggression against "other" groups through racist and discriminatory hate speech.²¹⁴ The media are using the identity features that predominate to the other and are presenting the existence of the "other" if it is dissolved in this identity. The other is being presented as a "potential danger and threat" if it does not accept that identity.²¹⁵ The media, that reproduces nationalism and racism, leads hatred to "the other", especially in times of crisis and conflict, creates an atmosphere of "insanity" and "lynching". As natural consequence, this atmosphere is internalized as it was natural and legal.²¹⁶

²¹¹ Çoban quoted in Aygöl, ibid.

²¹² Fiske quoted in Ergöl, ibid.

²¹³ Althusser, ibid.

²¹⁴ Alp, ibid.

²¹⁵ Kovucu, ibid.

²¹⁶ İnceoğlu, Yasemin, and Ceren Sözeri. "Nefret Suçlarında Medyanın Sorumluluğu: "Ya sev ya terk et ya da..."." *Nefret Söylemi ve/veya Nefret Suçları*. Ed. Yasemin İnceoğlu. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2012. 23-37.

4. NEW MEDIA AND NETWORK SOCIETY

In the previous section; It is emphasized that mass communication plays a critical role in the context of the dissemination of ideological discourses and the production of social consent. Depending on the development of technology, new mass media have come to the fore in communication, and new social forms have emerged along with social change.

In this section, firstly, what is meant by the concept of "new media" will be discussed, differences of new media from traditional media, new media types will be explained. The "network society" theories, that can be defined as a new kind of society, that develops with new media communication will be discussed under a separate title. Then, the internet and the new media's formation of a new "public space" arguments, will be mentioned. Finally, the advantages and disadvantages of the new media providing to society will be addressed, with emphasis on providing a basis for hate speech.

4.1. The Definiton and Characteristics of New Media

4.1.1. Mass Media and Traditional Media

"Information is sending thoughts, attitudes, or emotions from one person or group to another, especially through symbols." ²¹⁷ Communication is a reciprocal process in which symbols are mutually exchanged between at least two people, and all those in interaction assign meaning to these symbols. ²¹⁸ So

²¹⁷ Theodorson and Theodorson quoted in McQuail, Denis, and Sven Windahl. *İletişim Modelleri - Kitle İletişim Çalışmalarında-*. Trans. Konca Yumlu. 3rd Ed.. İstanbul: İmge Kitabevi Yayınları, 2010.

²¹⁸ Fuchs, Christian. "Sosyal Medyaya Eleştirel Bir Giriş Nedir?" *Sosyal Medya - Eleştirel Bir Giriş*. 1st Ed.. Ankara: NotaBene Yayınları, 2016. 8-42.

communication addresses, an area where an information source, a channel, a message, a receiver, a relationship, effect, communication between the sender and the receiver occurs, and a number of things that messages refer to.²¹⁹

Morris Janowitz, says "mass communication comprise the institutions and techniques by which specialized groups employ technological devices (press, radio, films, etc.) to disseminate symbolic content to large, heterogeneous and widely dispersed audiences."²²⁰ Raymond Williams notes that communication tools help to create meanings in society by storing and distributing information.²²¹

Debra Spitulnik; conceptualizes mass communication as a tool for transmitting culture, imagining and²²² creating "imagined communities".²²³ Communication process, that involves a source and a receiver, codes the message with symbols and these symbols can be interpreted as "imaginary" things that do not reflect the reality. The media creates and imposes the symbolic systems of thought and the expression of reality. In other words, the media is a cultural system that enables the social construction of reality. The media enable human activity and thoughts; is the result of the productive social communication and the collaborative processes.²²⁴

According to Habermas; a medium (eg mass media) is a the medium in which social relations exist.²²⁵ The two basic elements that allow for the formation of societies are the communication of people and the establishment of a post-communication relationship. Christian Fuchs, interprets media as a techno-

²¹⁹ McQuail and Windahl, *ibid*.

²²⁰ Janowitz quoted in McQuail and Windahl, *ibid*.

²²¹ Williams quoted in Fuchs, Christian. "Social Media and The Public Sphere." *tripleC: Communication, Capitalism & Critique* 12.1 (2014): 57-101. 2014.
<http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 31.12.2014.

²²² The concept Benedict Anderson used to describe the "nation" in his work on nationalism.

²²³ Spitulnik, Debra. "Anthropology and Mass Media." *Annual Review of Anthropology* 22.1 (1993): 293-315.

²²⁴ Rothenbuhler, Eric W., and Mihai Coman, Ed.s *Media Anthropology*: SAGE Publishing, 2005. PDF.

²²⁵ Habermas quoted in Fuchs, Christian. "Social Media and The Public Sphere." *tripleC: Communication, Capitalism & Critique* 12.1 (2014): 57-101. 2014.
<http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 31.12.2014.

social system, not a technological one. Mass media are systems created with the help of technological-level constructs that create the diffused and consumed knowledge and allow the social level of human activities.²²⁶

Fuchs mentions that media structures and media practices are dialectically connected and produce each other so that the media system is a dynamic system that is reproduced through a dialectic of media subjects (human actors who engage in media production and reception) and media objects (media structures). Produced goods are only meaningful if they are consumed.²²⁷ Confronted with content provided by the media, humans create, re-create and differentiate meanings of the world in various social roles.²²⁸

John B. Thompson refers to four forms of power; economic, political, coercive and symbolic power. The symbolic power is the capacity to "intervene in the course of events, influence others' actions and create events through the production and diffusion of symbolic forms."²²⁹ Johan Galtung divides the violence into direct violence, structural violence and cultural violence. Cultural or ideological violence occurs when the mind is manipulated or the reputation is impaired.²³⁰ Media in today's society, is formed by economic, political and cultural power structures, and acts as a carrier of cultural violence.

Capitalist media are companies that are privately owned by single individuals, families or shareholders. They are culturally located in the public sphere, but at the same time they are part of the capitalist economy and therefore not only produce public information, but capital and monetary profit by selling audiences/users and/or content. *Public media* are funded by or with the help of the state and/or are created and maintained by a specific statute. They are seen as a

²²⁶ Fuchs, Christian. "Sosyal Medya Nedir?" *Sosyal Medya - Eleştirel Bir Giriş*. 1st Ed.. Ankara: NotaBene Yayınları, 2016. 48-73.

²²⁷ Fuchs, Christian. "Alternative Media as Critical Media." *European Journal of Social Theory* 13.2 (2010): 173-92. 2010. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 18.12.2014.

²²⁸ Fuchs, Christian. "Social Media and The Public Sphere." *tripleC: Communication, Capitalism & Critique* 12.1 (2014): 57-101. 2014. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 31.12.2014.

²²⁹ Thompson quoted in Fuchs, Christian. "Sosyal Medya ve İletişim Gücü." *Sosyal Medya - Eleştirel Bir Giriş*. 1st Ed.. Ankara: NotaBene Yayınları, 2016. 99-125.

²³⁰ Galtung quoted in Fuchs, Christian. "Sosyal Medya ve İletişim Gücü." *Sosyal Medya - Eleştirel Bir Giriş*. 1st Ed.. Ankara: NotaBene Yayınları, 2016. 99-125.

public service that plays the role of providing political, educational and entertainment information to citizens.²³¹ Especially in our country, it can be said that the capitalist media and the public media are intertwined, they act with the same profit motivation, they give the same ideological messages.

According to Fuchs, *Civil society* media are full parts of the public sphere. They are economically related to the state if they receive subsidies and often stand in an antagonistic relation to the capitalist economy and governments because as alternative media they tend to reject for-profit and commercial logic and they tend to express alternative points of view that challenge governments and corporations. Civil society media are media that are run, owned and controlled by citizens as common projects. They express alternative points of view on the level of culture and have alternative organization models at the level of political economy.²³²

New media or web 2.0 split up with traditional media for the opportunity to reach them at low cost, to be independent from censorship relatively, to allow everybody spreading their own thoughts and to be heard their voice globally, and to contribute to the formation of civil society media or alternative media.

4.1.2. The Definiton and Characteristics of New Media

Web 2.0 concept used firstly by Tim O'Reilly in 2005. O'Rielly defines web 2.0 as;

Web 2.0 is the network as platform, spanning all connected devices; Web 2.0 applications are those that make the most of the intrinsic advantages of that platform: delivering software as a continually-updated service that gets better the more people use it, consuming and remixing data from multiple sources, including individual users, while providing their own data and services in a form

²³¹ Fuchs, Christian. "Social Media and The Public Sphere." *tripleC: Communication, Capitalism & Critique* 12.1 (2014): 57-101. 2014. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 31.12.2014.

²³² Fuchs, Christian. "Social Media and The Public Sphere." *tripleC: Communication, Capitalism & Critique* 12.1 (2014): 57-101. 2014. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 31.12.2014.

that allows remixing by others, creating network effects through an “architecture of participation,” and going beyond the page metaphor of Web 1.0 to deliver rich user experiences.²³³

New media is a general name of web sites allows applications like social networking platforms, wikis, blogs, tagging, social bookmarks, video sharing, or photo sharing.²³⁴ Social networking sites (SNS) are integrated world wide web-based information, communication, and community platforms that allow the creation of personal profiles, the upload and sharing of multimedia data, networking with other users with the help of “friends lists”, communication by tools such as e-mail, guest books, or forums.²³⁵ Clay Shirky believes that the “linking of symmetrical participation and amateur production” in Web 2.0 spaces such as Flickr, YouTube, MySpace, and Facebook creates environments of “public participation.”²³⁶ boyd argues that the specific characteristic of Web 2.0 is that it allows the appropriation of global knowledge in local contexts (Web 2.0 as glocalization of communication).²³⁷

Fuchs, defines some important aspects of web 2.0 applications allows m2m (machine to machine) communication, cooperation, open source/content, real participation, self-organized structures, civic journalism and collective intelligence.²³⁸ Rainer Dringenberg argues that the Internet is a social fact because it is a structure that is cognized, internalized and about which many

²³³ O'Rielly quoted in Fuchs, Christian. "Sosyal Medya Nedir?" *Sosyal Medya - Eleştirel Bir Giriş*. 1st Ed.. Ankara: NotaBene Yayınları, 2016. 48-73.

²³⁴ Fuchs, Christian. "Social software and web 2.0: their sociological foundations and implications. ." *Handbook of research on web 2.0, 3.0, and X.0: technologies, business, and social applications*. Ed. San Murugesan. Vol. 2. New York: IGI Global, 2010. 764-789.
<http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 2016

²³⁵ Fuchs, Christian. "Social networking sites and complex technology assessment." *International Journal of E-Politics* 1.3 (2010): 19-38. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 06.12.2014.

²³⁶ Shirky quoted in Fuchs, Christian. "Sosyal Medyaya Eleştirel Bir Giriş Nedir?" *Sosyal Medya - Eleştirel Bir Giriş*. 1st Ed.. Ankara: NotaBene Yayınları, 2016. 8-42.

²³⁷ boyd quoted in Fuchs, ibid.

²³⁸ Fuchs, Christian. "The Self-Organization of Virtual Communities." *Journal of New Communications Research* 1.1 (2006): 29-68. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 08.11.2014.

people interact in everyday life. They are social facts defined by human actors and they influence the behaviour of others.²³⁹

According to Weber, categories of sociology are social action and social relations. Weber stresses that for behaviour being considered as social relation, it needs to be a meaningful symbolic interaction between human actors, hence communication. So these applications are social because they all increase the possibility of finding other people like us, and therefore enhance communication possibilities and their value.²⁴⁰ Finally, in the Tönniesian sense, web 2.0 is social because of technologies that allow community-building online. It is related to the concept of virtual communities, which gains new relevance by the rise of social networking platforms.²⁴¹

For example Facebook consists all three types of sociality of web 2.0.²⁴² Facebook is the third most visited website in the world and the fourth website in Turkey.²⁴³ The thing distinguishes social media sites like Facebook is that; they are integrated platforms that combine information and communication technologies with many different media such as web page, web mail, digital image, video, discussion groups, guest books, contact lists or search engines.²⁴⁴

The most important feature of new media is its ability to allow society formation. In subjective concepts virtual community is conceived as continuous communicative online arctics that produce meanings and don't require homogenous interests and a consensus on values and interpretations. For Manuel Castells virtual communities are "self-defined electronic networks of interactive communication organized around a shared interest or purpose, although

²³⁹ Dringerberg quoted in Fuchs, Christian. "Social software and web 2.0: their sociological foundations and implications. ." *Handbook of research on web 2.0, 3.0, and X.0: technologies, business, and social applications*. Ed. San Murugesan. Vol. 2. New York: IGI Global, 2010. 764-789. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 2016

²⁴⁰ Pascu et al. quoted in Fuchs, ibid.

²⁴¹ Fuchs, ibid.

²⁴² Fuchs, Christian. "Sosyal Medyaya Eleştirel Bir Giriş Nedir?" *Sosyal Medya - Eleştirel Bir Giriş*. 1st Ed.. Ankara: NotaBene Yayınları, 2016. 8-42.

²⁴³ Dec., 2016. <http://www.alexa.com/>

²⁴⁴ Fuchs, ibid.

sometimes communication becomes the goal in itself".²⁴⁵ An integrative approach captures all these moments as important for virtual communities by considering the latter as dynamic socio-technological systems of communication and meaning-production.²⁴⁶

Manuel Castells defines Web 2.0 as "the set of technologies, devices, and applications that support the proliferation of social spaces on the Internet."²⁴⁷ New media are simultaneously used for the production, circulation, and consumption of knowledge. They support cognition (thought, language), communication (one-to-one, one-to-few, one-to-many, few-to-one, few-to-few, few-to-many, many-to-one, many-to-few, many-to-many), and co-operation (peer production, sharing, virtual communities, social networking, cyberlove, online collaboration, etc) by combining the universal digital machine of the computer with networking functions as structural principles.²⁴⁸

Henry Jenkins, in his book *Convergence Culture: Where Old and New Media Collide* talks about 4 main characteristics of new media; convergence, transmedia, participatory culture and collective intelligence. Media convergence refers that at least two different mediums are connected and intertwined. Reading newspapers on television shows, radio theaters or hypertexts in online newspapers, photo galleries can be used as examples. Transmedia, on the other hand, refers to that more than one medium can be used to transmit a message. Participatory culture means that the audience can become producer at the same time with the new media. Collective intelligence explains that more than one

²⁴⁵ Castells quoted in Fuchs, Christian. "The Self-Organization of Virtual Communities." *Journal of New Communications Research* 1.1 (2006): 29-68. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 08.11.2014.

²⁴⁶ Fuchs, *ibid.*

²⁴⁷ Castells quoted in Fuchs, Christian. "Some reflections on Manuel Castells' book "Networks of outrage and hope. Social movements in the Internet age"." *Triple C: Communication, Capitalism & Critique. Open Access Journal for a Global Sustainable Information Society* 10.2 (2012): 775-97. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 25.11.2014.

²⁴⁸ Fuchs, Christian. "Cognitive capitalism or informational capitalism? The role of class in the information economy." *Cognitive Capitalism, Education and Digital Labor*. Ed. Michael A. Peters and Ergin Bulut. New York: Peter Lang Inc., 2011. 57-75. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 2014

person can contribute to produce media messages. The most basic example of this can be given as Wikipedia.²⁴⁹

Jan van Dijk describes the new media under three titles. The most important structural new media characteristic is the integration of telecommunication, data communications and mass media in a single medium. van Dijk also gives importance to the convergence process as Jenkins. The second structural new media feature of the current communication revolution is expressed as the rise of interactive media. A very general definition of interaction is an action, and a reaction sequence. The most basic level of interaction is the possibility of bilateral or multilateral communication. The third characteristic of the new media is the usage of digital code. The digital code is the transmission of each information and communication structure with codes consisting of sequences of zero and one, called bytes, while using computer technology. This artificial code takes the place of analog creation and natural codes in the transmission of information and communication items.²⁵⁰

McLuhan tells us that a "message" is, "the change of scale or pace or pattern" that a new invention or innovation "introduces into human affairs."²⁵¹ So what is important is the change that the technology creates in the society rather than the content of the message. A medium is "any extension of ourselves." Classically, he suggests that a hammer extends our arm and that the wheel extends our legs and feet. Each enables us to do more than our bodies could do on their own. Similarly, the medium of language extends our thoughts from within our mind out to others. Mediums reshape and reconfigure social interdependence patterns and every aspect of our personal lives.²⁵² Thus, on the basis of

²⁴⁹ Saka, Erkan. "Media Theory II - Module III - New Media and Convergence Culture." İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi. 12.03.2013. Lecture.

²⁵⁰ van Dijk, Jan. *The Network Society: Social Aspects of New Media*. London: Sage Publications, 1999. PDF.

²⁵¹ McLuhan quoted in Federman, Mark. "What is The Meaning of The Medium is The Message?" *The University of Toronto*. 23.07.2003.

http://individual.utoronto.ca/markfederman/article_mediumisthemessage.htm 31.05.2013.

²⁵² McLuhan quoted in Federman, ibid.

technological development, new types of human relations and new types of societies emerge.

4.2. Network Society Theories

4.2.1. Philosophical Basis of Network Society Theories

"Assemblage" is a widely used concept in explaining network societies. The concept was first used in the 1980s by Gilles Deleuze and Felix Guattari, in their book *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia*. When things unrelated to each other combine to form an entity, "assemblage" occurs.²⁵³ Using rhizom as a cultural metaphor, Deleuze and Guattari refer to a non-hierarchical society with no power relations. We can resemble rhizomes, root plants such as "ginger"; There are no starting and ending, different ends can be spread out as different centers, there can be more than one central points.²⁵⁴

Deleuze and Guattari use the concept of "deterritorialization" in the 1972 *Anti-Oedipus* book to describe the state of subjective human in capitalist society that the loss of its essence and become rootless.²⁵⁵ According to Toni Negri, the old "modern sovereign state" order has begun to be shaken by post-industrial societies, which is largely cause deterritorialization. Deterritorialization began to be seen mostly in the field of communication;

In the field of communication, the paradoxes implied in the dissolution of territorial and/or national sovereignty, and by the breakdown in the singularised relationship between order and space, are taken to extremes. (...) it no longer merely limits or weakens modern sovereignty; it removes even the possibility of a

²⁵³ Saka, Erkan. "Cyber Culture." İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi. 11.03.2013. Lecture.

²⁵⁴ Güvenç-Salgırlı, Sanem. "Contemporary Sociological Thought." Marmara Üniversitesi, İstanbul. 2011. Lecture.

²⁵⁵ Saka, Erkan. "Cyber Culture." İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi. 11.03.2013. Lecture.

link between a given order and a given space. In other words, communication is the form of the capitalist process of production at the point where capital has conquered and subjected to itself the whole of society, in real terms, globally, by suppressing any margins of alternative: if ever an alternative is to be proposed, this will have to be done through the intermediary of the society of real subsumption, and it will have to be constructed within it, playing up new contradictions. The alternative will be posed within the "new", in fact within the "very new".²⁵⁶

Michael Hardt and Antonio Negri in *Empire* call the sovereign power "Empire", which governs the new world order that coexists with globalization. In this order, transnational units like the World Bank have a right to say rather than the nation-states, in governance. Within these mixed units, there is no center of the power, the power is distributed among the different units, and a mentality of sovereignty is seen that dominates almost the whole world and has no specific limit. The empire is a decentered, network-dominated and deterritorialized management apparatus.²⁵⁷

In the Empire, "multitude" is seen instead of old nations. Communication and interaction, which lift the boundaries of time and space with globalization, allow new networks of cooperation and partnership to emerge. The multitude describes people who can coexist within differences, exclude all limiting attributes, and meet in common. The multiplicity is an effective pluralism that resists globalization, struggling for democracy. Political movements that have a similar theme, seen in different parts of the world, and communities that are attacking global forms of power can be counted in multiplicity.²⁵⁸

Hardt and Negri, indicate that the masses that surf on the internet networks with the new technologies do not belong to one place, that they travel

²⁵⁶ Negri, Antonio. "Siyasal Alanın Krizi." Trans. Özgür Gökmen. *Birikim* 122 (1999): 85-89. *Körotonomedyä*. <http://www.korotonomedyä.net/kor/index.php?id=7,31,0,0,1,0> 2011.

²⁵⁷ Hardt, Michael, and Antonio Negri. *İmparatorluk*. Trans. Abdullah Yılmaz. 6th Ed. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2008.

²⁵⁸ Hardt, Michael, and Antonio Negri. *Çokluk - İmparatorluk Çağında Savaş ve Demokrasi*. Trans. Barış Yıldırım. 2nd Ed.. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2011.

nomadically, the spaces has become liquid and blurry, and they define the virtual environment as "non-place". ²⁵⁹

4.2.2. What is The Network Society?

Computer-based information and communication networks play an important role in society today because they enable communication that transcends certain spatial and temporal borders and limits. Spatial descriptions such as ‘global village’, ‘cyberspace’, ‘digital city’, ‘space of flows’ or ‘virtual community’ indicate a desire of scientists and stakeholders to describe cyberspace as a new type of space. ²⁶⁰ A network is generally defined as a structure where nodes are interrelated by ties, ties are seen as channels for the transfer or flow of resources, and the network is considered as constraining individual agents. ²⁶¹ For example; In the Internet the nodes are computer networks, in a genetic network the nodes are genes, in the brain the nodes are neurons..in a social network the nodes are human beings or groups, etc. By networking processes the space of a system is permanently created and recreated, the space of a system is a condition for the continuous networking of a system. Space is medium and outcome of networking processes in self-organising systems. space is an integral feature of society and all social systems. Space is a given pre-condition of all social activity and is modified continuously by social activity. At the same time it is a container and a creation, it is a variable container of social activity that is the medium and outcome of social activity and is continuously transformed by humans. ²⁶² Society creates space, space creates society, people modify and (re)create the spaces they

²⁵⁹ Tunç, Aslı. "Digital Activism - Week 8." İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi. 30.04.2014. Lecture.

²⁶⁰ Fuchs, Christian. "Transnational Space and the "Network Society"." *21st Century Society* 2.1 (2009): 49-78. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 06.11.2014.

²⁶¹ Wasserman & Faust quoted in Fuchs, ibid.

²⁶² Fuchs, ibid.

live in and in turn are modified by them. This is what Edward W. Soja has termed the 'socio-spatial dialectic'.²⁶³

For Manuel Castells in the Information Age are increasingly organised around networks. Networks constitute the new social morphology of our societies, and the diffusion of networking logic substantially modifies the operation and outcomes in processes of production, experience, power, and culture.²⁶⁴ Castells opposes the concept of "mass self-communication" to mass communication. It is mass communication because it can potentially reach a global audience, the production of the message is self-generated, the definition of the potential receiver(s) is self-directed, and the retrieval of specific messages or content from the World Wide Web and electronic networks is self-selected.²⁶⁵ Mass self-communication makes it possible for the subjects to "monitor the powerful" by creating a counter-force. People may sometimes have all kinds of thoughts in cyberspace, including challenging the corporate power, tearing up the governmental authority and changing the cultural bases of our ancient civilizations.²⁶⁶

Jan van Dijk describes the 21st century as the "age of networks". Networks are becoming the nervous system of our society and these internet infrastructures have important effects on our social and personal life. Media technologies, make significant changes especially as time and space; make it possible to communicate between different locations and times. The concept of "network society" emphasizes the high-level information exchange and the usage of information and communication technologies in contemporary developed and modern societies. In the concept of a network society, the changing organizational forms and (infra) structures of these societies are emphasized. Network society can be defined as a

²⁶³ Soja quoted in Fuchs, ibid.

²⁶⁴ Castells quoted in Fuchs, ibid.

²⁶⁵ Castell quoted in Fuchs, Christian. "Some reflections on Manuel Castells' book "Networks of outrage and hope. Social movements in the Internet age"." *Triple C: Communication, Capitalism & Critique. Open Access Journal for a Global Sustainable Information Society* 10.2 (2012): 775-97. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 25.11.2014.

²⁶⁶ Castells quoted in Fuchs, Christian. "Sosyal Medya ve İletişim Gücü." *Sosyal Medya - Eleştirel Bir Giriş*. 1st Ed.. Ankara: NotaBene Yayınları, 2016. 99-125.

social formation with the infrastructure of social and media networks providing first class organization at all levels (individual, group / organizational and social). These networks connect all units or departments (individuals, groups and organizations) of this formation.²⁶⁷

The scope of the network society also is both global and local, sometimes indicated as 'glocal'. The organization of its components (individuals, groups, organizations) is no longer tied to particular times and places. Aided by information and communication technology, these coordinates of existence can be transcended to create virtual times and places and to simultaneously act, perceive and think in global and local terms. Networks are relatively flat and horizontal, so-called heterarchical social structures. However, this does not mean that they do not have centres. For this reason, the network society is less centralized in the sense of having single centres in the economy, politics, government, culture and community life. They are replaced by a multitude of centres cooperating and competing with each other.²⁶⁸ As Deleuze and Guattari mentioned in the concept of rhizome; a number of centers cooperating with each other and competing with each other.

Frank Webster, in his book *Theories of the Information Society*, is emphasizing the changes that occur in technology, economics, professional, spatial and cultural fields with the information society. 1) Tells that with the information revolution (starts in late 70s) that is engulfing us now and which presages a new way of living. 2) The growth in economic worth of informational activities. 3) Since the raw material of non-manual labour is information, substantial increases such informational work can be said to announce the arrival of the information society. 4) information networks which connect locations and in consequence can have profound effects on the organization of time and space. 5) We inhabit a media-laden society. Fashion, habits, everyday life, leisure times..

²⁶⁷ van Dijk, Jan. *The Network Society: Social Aspects of New Media*. London: Sage Publications, 1999. PDF.

²⁶⁸ van Dijk, Jan, *ibid*.

We express our selves and understand others with signs. As Baudrillard mentions; signs become more real than reality and form a "hyper-reality". ²⁶⁹

Society can be seen as being composed of relative autonomous subsystems that all have their own specificity, but nonetheless, depend on each other and influence each other. As subsystems of a model of society, one can conceive the ecological system, the technological system, the economic system, the political system, and the cultural system. Fuchs in his, *The Participatory, Co-Operative, Sustainable Information Society*, theory; imagines a society as free access to knowledge, knowledge as public good owned by all (the Commons), openness of technical standards and organization forms, securing privacy, cultural and linguistic diversity, diversity of the media and public opinion, the long-term conservation of knowledge, bridging the digital divide, freedom of information as a civil right to political activity and transparent administration, and securing freedom in work environment. ²⁷⁰ This society can only be achieved through the proper use of information technologies.

4.3. Internet as a Public Sphere

For Habermas, the public sphere as ideal-type is a realm that is accessible to all citizens so that they can control and limit state power through discussion, criticism, control, and elections (formation of public opinion). ²⁷¹ The public sphere is merely "conditions of communication under which there can come into being a discursive formation of opinion and will" ²⁷² Habermas imagines a true

²⁶⁹ Webster, Frank. *Theories of The Information Society*. Vol. 3. London and New York: Routledge, 2006. PDF.

²⁷⁰ Fuchs, Christian. "Theoretical foundations of defining the participatory, co-operative, sustainable information society." *Information, Communication, and Society* 13.1 (2010): 23-47. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 01.12.2014.

²⁷¹ Habermas quoted in Fuchs, Christian. "Alternative Media as Critical Media." *European Journal of Social Theory* 13.2 (2010): 173-192. 2010. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 18.12.2014.

²⁷² Habermas quoted in Valtysson, Bjarki. "Facebook as a Digital Public Sphere: Processes of Colonization and Emancipation." *Triple C: Communication, Capitalism & Critique*. Open Access

public sphere, in which all competing groups and parties make information accessible to the public, engage in public discussion, and make political compromises that are 'legitimized through this process of public communication'.

273

Habermas's articulation of the historical emergence of the public sphere: In his model, media is a central part of public culture, particularly important to the articulation of the national and transnational through local processes.²⁷⁴ The media is not only a social system but also a system of communication that reaches a wide audience and constitutes the communication step of the public sphere. Media production, circulation, and reception links in broad intersection social and cultural fields: local, regional, national, transnational. Flows created by communication technologies has an important role on production of culture and identity in contemporary world.²⁷⁵

Habermas distinguishes between a 'manipulated public sphere'/manipulated publicity and 'a critical publicity'. For Habermas, critical publicity is a quality of a true public sphere that is based on communicative action.²⁷⁶ Oskar Negt and Alexander Kluge's notion of a proletarian (counter-)public sphere can be read as both a socialist critique and a radicalization of Habermas's approach. For them, the critical function of a proletarian public sphere is to contribute intellectual means to class struggles. They characterize the proletarian counter-public sphere as being radically different from and opposed to the bourgeois public sphere, as an expression of the degree of emancipation of the working class, a sphere of autonomous communication of the proletariat, a society

Journal for a Global Sustainable Information Society 10.1 (2012): 77-91.

<http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 19.12.2014.

²⁷³ Habermas quoted in Fuchs, *ibid.*

²⁷⁴ Ginsburg, Faye D., Lila Abu-Lughod, and Brian Larkin. *Media Worlds: Anthropology on New Terrain*. Berkeley: Uni. of California Press, 2002. PDF.

²⁷⁵ Ginsburg, Abu-Lughod and Larkin, *ibid.*

²⁷⁶ Habermas quoted in Fuchs, *ibid.*

within society, an expression of the self-organization and unfolding of the interests of workers, and a self-defense organization of the working class ²⁷⁷

On social media, users generate, upload and update personal, communicative and social network data stemming from their roles in the economy, politics, civil society and culture. ²⁷⁸ Social media, is a fluid, ever-changing environment, which affects the types of publics, and the agency of different kinds of publics that choose to communicate within its sphere. ²⁷⁹ Web 2.0 and social networking sites expand the potentials of individual opinion into public opinion, the achievability of participation and the development of a transnational, deterritorialized public sphere, consisting of the global communication networks of individuals, organizations and movements ²⁸⁰

4.4. Advantages and Disadvantages of New Media

4.4.1. "Bright Side" of the New Media

The interactivity of Web 2.0 would be disciplining people “into a liberal ideal of subjectivity based around notions of freedom, choice and activity. (...) participatory media is the ideal, active neoliberal citizen”. ²⁸¹ Participatory media, is giving ordinary people a voice by opening up access to media production and it enables a democratic media system to emerge. Critical media in one or the other respect take the standpoint of oppressed groups or exploited classes and make the judgement that structures of oppression and exploitation benefit certain classes at

²⁷⁷ Negt and Kluge quoted in Fuchs, *ibid.*

²⁷⁸ Fuchs, Christian. "Social Media and The Public Sphere." *tripleC: Communication, Capitalism & Critique* 12.1 (2014): 57-101. 2014. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 31.12.2014.

²⁷⁹ Valtysson, *ibid.*

²⁸⁰ Splichal quoted in Valtysson, *ibid.*

²⁸¹ Jarrett quoted in Fuchs, Christian. "Social software and web 2.0: their sociological foundations and implications. ." *Handbook of research on web 2.0, 3.0, and X.0: technologies, business, and social applications*. Ed. San Murugesan. Vol. 2. New York: IGI Global, 2010. 764-789. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 2014

the expense of others and hence should be radically transformed by social struggles.²⁸² In examining the impact of the Internet on the process of politics and political change, scholars often focus on topics such as the changes to mechanisms of participation, development of sense of collective identity, creation of community, weakening of “preference falsification,” and framing of political discourse.²⁸³

Today, political parties and movements use the Internet as an alternative path for creating public opinion. Through mobile phones and the internet, they can reach people in much larger numbers and move them into action. Böylece internet, iktidarın temel ilişkileri ile savaşmak için kullanılmaktadır çünkü artık partiler eskiden ulaşamadıkları kitleleri bir araya getirebilmektedir. Social networks present a new structure in which political news and information can spread and can not be restricted by political elites. In countries where state units have main media resources, Public space can be defined in a limited way with selected news headlines. In the face of these constraints, the internet becomes an alternative source of information and reflects the voice of minorities.²⁸⁴

Alternative media is different from mass media in 4 ways;

First, the community media approach argues that participation of members of a community in content production and media organization is central for alternative media. Others see the provision of content by alternative media as alternative to mainstream media (large-scale, state-owned or commercial, hierarchical, dominant discourses vs. small-scale, independent, non-hierarchical, non-dominant discourses). Third, one can identify approaches that use the notion of counter-hegemonic media that are part of civil society and form a third voice

²⁸² Fuchs, Christian, and Marisol Sandoval. "Towards a critical theory of alternative media." *Telematics and Informatics* 27 (2010): 141-150. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/>18.12.2014.

²⁸³ Tüfekçi, Zeynep. "Not This One": Social Movements, the Attention Economy, and Microcelebrity Networked Activism." *American Behavioral Scientist* 57.7 (2013): 848-70. https://www.academia.edu/3136872/Not_This_One_Social_Movements_the_Attention_Economy_and_Microcelebrity_Networked_Activism 02.01.2015.

²⁸⁴ Howard, Philip N., Aiden Duffy, Deen Freelon, Muzammil M. Hussain, Will Mari, and Marwa Mazaid. "Opening Closed Regimes: What Was the Role of Social Media During the Arab Spring?" *SSRN Electronic Journal* (2011): 1-30. PDF.

between state media and commercial media. And, finally, one can identify approaches that speak of rhizomatic media that are relational because they link different protest groups and movements, connect the local and the global, and establish different types of relationships with the market and/or the state.²⁸⁵

The totality of alternative media constitutes an alternative public sphere, a sphere of protest and political discussion that has an oppositional role and hence enhances the vividness of democracy.²⁸⁶ Web 2.0 allows for the creation of alternative media to the mainstream media with many features.

Critical media, according to Deuze, provide oppositional content that are alternatives to dominant repressive heteronomous perspectives that reflect the rule of capital, patriarchy, racism, sexism, nationalism and so on. Such content expresses oppositional standpoints that question all forms of heteronomy and domination. So there is counter-information and counter-hegemony that includes the voices of the excluded, oppressed, dominated, enslaved, estranged, exploited, dominated. One goal is to give voices to the voiceless, media power to the powerless as well as to transcend filtering and censorship of information by corporate information monopolies, state monopolies, or cultural monopolies in public information and communication.²⁸⁷

"Participatory journalism is any kind of news work at the hands of professionals and amateurs, of journalists and citizens, and of users and producers benchmarked by what Benkler calls commons-based peer production".²⁸⁸ The model of citizen journalism, in which one finds the independence of writers from corporate and political influences and pressures, challenges this production model. Anybody can be an author without specific training or expertise. Ordinary citizens

²⁸⁵ Bailey, Cammaerts and Carpentier quoted in Fuchs, Christian. "Alternative Media as Critical Media." *European Journal of Social Theory* 13.2 (2010): 173-192. 2010. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 18.12.2014.

²⁸⁶ Fuchs, *ibid.*

²⁸⁷ Deuze quoted in Fuchs, Christian. "The political economy of WikiLeaks: Power 2.0? Surveillance 2.0? Criticism 2.0? Alternative media 2.0? ." *Global Media Journal – Australian Edition* 5.1 (2011): 1-17. 2011. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 28.11.2014.

²⁸⁸ Deuze quoted in Fuchs, Christian. "WikiLeaks: İktidarı Şeffaflaştırabilir Miyiz?" *Sosyal Medya - Eleştirel Bir Giriş*. Trans. Diyar Saraçoğlu and İlker Kalaycı. Ankara: NotaBene Yayınları, 2016. 326-345.

can become journalists, so journalism is citizen-controlled. Such journalistic practice is frequently part of protest movement practices. Consumers become producers (prosumers, produsers), the audience becomes active.²⁸⁹

Civil society leaders can use the internet to reach out to both foreign and local people, to connect people who agree with them, to raise donations, to garner support in crisis situations and to provide social services. At the same time, the internet provides an environment for criticizing the government and producing alternative policies. For today's civil society actors, internet gains importance in two places; Because access to other political networks is almost impossible for "powerless" people, and content on the internet can be independently published from the state control, and that gives the publisher a partial anonymity.²⁹⁰ The Internet besides being a tool of domination also supports cyberprotest and cyberactivism; acts as critical medium that enables information, co-ordination, communication, and co-operation of protest movements. it has a potential to act as a critical alternative medium for progressive social movements.²⁹¹

Digital media and global internet infrastructure have led to marginalized groups entering public speech. With this access, people can have information about things beyond their own regimes and borders, and encounter international news as an alternative to the state-owned media. Between 2010 and 2011, significant uprisings were observed in 23 Arab countries. Mass and continuous demonstrations for democratic change have sprung up from Tunis to Cairo and other major metropolitan centers. It have led major changes in many regimes but some revolutions have not been very peaceful. But in this regard, democracies born in the digital age has been witnessed.²⁹²

²⁸⁹ Fuchs, *ibid.*

²⁹⁰ Howard, et al., *ibid.*

²⁹¹ Fuchs, Christian. "Social networking sites and complex technology assessment." *International Journal of E-Politics* 1.3 (2010): 19-38. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 06.12.2014.

²⁹² Howard, et al., *ibid.*

4.4.2. "Dark Side" of the New Media

Evgeny Morozov in his book, *The Net Delusion: The Dark Side of Internet Freedom*, published in 2011, criticizes theorists who "bless" the benefits of the Internet and presents a largely negative viewpoint. He indicates that with the dominant "cyber-utopianism", the facts that internet access can not be used by everyone and the manipulation of information in new media ownership is overlooked.²⁹³ A certain level of education, literacy, leisure time, and constant access to the Internet are required for the access to the Internet. Also, most of the frequently used web sites are owned by big companies.

Michel Foucault interprets discipline as a modern form of power. The disciplinary power enables the person to self-regulate, not by suffering and pressure, but by improving the body and by supervising it. Inspired by the prison model Bentham had designed, Foucault states that in his panoptic model there is a tower that watches inmates and can see all the prisons, that prisoners can not see whether someone in the tower watches them, but always regulates their behavior with fear of being guarded.²⁹⁴ Today, we left "digital footprints" with the internet usage. Profit-oriented firms collaborate with governments and states to share user information and increase digital surveillance.²⁹⁵ The Internet extends the panoptic eye of power.²⁹⁶

Morozov criticizes online activism because people make themselves feel good just by "clicking" without making any impact in real life;

Participating in a slacktivist campaigns, gives the illusion of making a meaningful impact on the world without demanding anything more by joining a Facebook

²⁹³ Ercan Bilgiç, ibid. and Saka, Erkan. "Media Theory II - Module III - New Media and Convergence Culture." İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi. 12.03.2013. Lecture.

²⁹⁴ Yeğenoğlu, Meyda. "Social and Cultural Theory - Michel Foucault." İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi. 31.11.2013. Lecture.

²⁹⁵ Tunç, Aslı. "Digital Activism - Week 2." İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi. 26.03.2014. Lecture.

²⁹⁶ Fuchs, Christian. "The political economy of WikiLeaks: Power 2.0? Surveillance 2.0? Criticism 2.0? Alternative media 2.0? ." *Global Media Journal – Australian Edition* 5.1 (2011): 1-17. 2011. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 28.11.2014.

group. Slacktivism is an ideal type of activism for a lazy generation: if there is a loud campaign in the virtual arena, why are you dealing with sit-in and arrest, police brutality or the danger of torture?" ²⁹⁷

According to Morozov, online activists relieve their consciences by sharing political content and do not need to take any other action.

Another dark side of the new media, which also forms the subject of this thesis, is the reproduction of the dominant ideological discourse and hate speech, by allowing the production of user-based content. In particular, "social media is increasing the production of hate speech because of the opportunity to be anonymous to the user, the comfort of not coming face to face with counters, and its structure to give emotional sudden reactions without thinking." ²⁹⁸

There was racism before the Internet and different communication channels were used in this way. However, the development of digital communication technologies such as the Internet has added a new dimension to this problem by handing over individuals and organizations the "modern and powerful means to support racism and xenophobia". ²⁹⁹ "Some racist controversial publications or various publications supporting violence are now distributed through a series of websites, blogs and newsgroups." ³⁰⁰ According to the Simon Wiesenthal Center, the unprecedented global reach and scope of the Internet combine with the difficulty of finding and monitoring communication, and the Internet has become a primary tool for of extremists and terrorists such as Al Qaeda, Hamas, Hizbullah, Combat 18 and the Ku Klux Klan. ³⁰¹

For example, a Facebook group called document.no brings Norwegian right-wing extremists, who advocate the development of Islamophobia and the idea of cultural welfare, opposed to immigration to Norway, together. Anders

²⁹⁷ Fuchs, Christian. "Twitter ve Demokrasi: Yeni Bir Kamusal Alan?" *Sosyal Medya - Eleştirel Bir Giriş*. 1st Ed.. Ankara: NotaBene Yayınları, 2016. 248-288.

²⁹⁸ Yaman, Ulvi. "Nefretin Adı Söylem." *BTnet.com.tr*. 2012. [http://www.btnet.com.tr/konuk-yazarlar/nefretin-adi-soylem-\[konuk-yazar\]/1/13000](http://www.btnet.com.tr/konuk-yazarlar/nefretin-adi-soylem-[konuk-yazar]/1/13000) 25.07.2016.

²⁹⁹ The European Council quoted in Akdeniz ibid.

³⁰⁰ Akdeniz, ibid.

³⁰¹ Simon Wiesenthal Center, iReport quoted in Akdeniz, ibid.

Behring Breivik, who killed 77 people in Norway in 2011, was one of the active members of the group. Also on the www.ultras.ws forum, anti-Semitic and racist jokes can be found. One of the most common jokes in the forum is; "How do you put 30 Jews in a car, two in the front, three in the back and rest in the ashtray." ³⁰²

Aygül stated that hate speeches are common at reader reviews section in news sites in Turkey. For example, there is a comment in the comments of the readers on the habervaktim.com, for a news titled "Is this a student house or an organization house?", dated 31.12.2012, like "They can be bandits at best. These terrorists, who harm the teaching profession, should be exported from the profession." Also after the death of suicide of BDP Deputy Sırık Sakık's son Sidar Sakık, on 16.09.2012, tweets on Twitter taken on the following; "The son of the BDP Mus deputy Sırık Sakık has committed suicide, my condolence with him. If wish his turn is next." , "The son of the BDP Mus deputy Sırık Sakık committed suicide .. His son is more honorable and we are waiting for you too ..." ³⁰³

Aygül's research on hate speech produced on Facebook revealed that ethnic nationalist, racist and discriminatory hate speech were produced on Facebook groups such as "Anti Armenian", "Inglorious Armenians", "If We Had Genocied, Your Ancestory Would Have Dried Bastards!!", "We Do Not Apologize to the Armenians", "We Are not Armenians", "Turks Say Best Armenian/Greek is the Dead Ones" and these hate speeches produced were intensely circulated in the environment. ³⁰⁴

In her research that Akyazı was based on the sexist hate speech produced against women in digital participatory dictionaries; A total of 2172 entries that contains "woman" and "man" words in Uludağ Sözlük, ITU Sözlük and Ekşi Sözlük in the 585 titles, were evaluated from the point of view of hate speech. As

³⁰² Fuchs, Christian. "Katılımcı Kültür Olarak Sosyal Medya." *Sosyal Medya - Eleştirel Bir Giriş*. Trans. Diyar Saraçoğlu and İlker Kalaycı. 1st Ed.. Ankara: NotaBene Yayınları, 2016. 76-96.

³⁰³ Aygül, ibid.

³⁰⁴ Aygül, ibid.

a result; it has seen that 360 entry (%16,5) contains hate speech while 86 (24%) of them had sexual content.³⁰⁵

According to Vardal, the most dangerous aspect of the hate speech produced in the new media is that people internalize discourses without realizing it. "The individual feels obliged to otherize one another in order to be able to belong to a group, just as it is at almost every level of social life. After a while, the sharing of hate speech gets natural and acceptable appearance in the eyes of the user. " ³⁰⁶

Turkey has not yet signed the additional protocol of European Council Convention on Cybercrime that punishes racist / xenophobic content.³⁰⁷ As there is no separate regulation for hate speech and hate crime in the Turkish Criminal Law as well as the hate speech seen in the cyber area is not subjected to any trial, evaluation is made in the context of insulting crime, not on hate speech on individual application.

³⁰⁵ Akyazı, ibid.

³⁰⁶ Vardal, Zeynep Burcu. "Nefret Söylemi ve Yeni Medya." *Maltepe Üniversitesi · İletişim Fakültesi Dergisi* 2.1 (2015): 132-57.

<http://iletisimdergi.maltepe.edu.tr/article/viewFile/1099000026/1099000020> 02.12.2016.

³⁰⁷ İncoğlu, ibid.

5. HATE SPEECH AGAINST "SYRIANS" ON DIGITAL PARTICIPATORY DICTIONARIES

The main purpose of the research is to analyze the hate speech produced against Syrian refugees in digital media through digital participatory dictionaries. Putting forth the seriousness of hate speech through concrete examples, revealing the hazards and risks of the groups exposed to hate speech and making the verbal violence visible, makes up the moral purpose of the research. In the dictionaries that will constitute the research population, it is started by the hypothesis that the number of hate speech produced in these environments is increased due to the representation in a nickname rather than real identities as it is like in many new media medium.

In this section, first of all, what "digital participatory dictionaries" are, Ekşi Sözlük, İTÜ Sözlük and Uludağ Sözlük that are the sample of the research, will be explained in detail. In the second section, Critical Discourse Analysis method which is used to analyze the hate speech in dictionaries will be explained. In the section of Quantitative Findings, the titles from the above mentioned dictionaries that contain 10 and above entries that includes "Syrian" word, and the entries which are found to contain hate speech are going to be analyzed quantitatively. Later on, the entries containing hate speeches shall be separated quantitatively and qualitatively as hate categories that the Hrant Dink Foundation is implementing as a method in the "Monitoring of Hate Speech" project, 1) Exaggeration / Ascribing / Distortion, 2) Swearing / Insulting / Humiliation, 3) Hostility / War Discourse 4) Usage of the Natural Identity Item as Hate, Humiliation Fact / Stigmatization. Finally, one entry from each of the three digital participatory dictionaries, under the hate categories mentioned, 12 entries in total will be interpreted by the Critical Discourse Analysis method.

5.1. Research Population – Digital Participatory Dictionaries

Digital participatory dictionaries are websites, occurred in Turkey and generally written in Turkish, that have a very large content structure that expands with users' own titles and comments made by other users to these titles.³⁰⁸ These dictionaries, which are "web sites consisting of some items such as a dictionary, aimed at ever-changing and increasing content with the contribution of members," are known as "sites where information is formed, shared and categorized in a cumulative manner." These dictionaries can be described as "a collectively produced hyper-textual dictionary based on the concept of a user-generated website".³⁰⁹

Digital participatory dictionaries are separated from classical dictionaries in several contexts;

- 1) It is not only based on the definition of words and phrases, but also a platform for discussing social and political problems on the agenda. In this sense, it is both a means of politics and a means of politicizing its users.
- 2) They give definitions and meanings of words and idioms just as they are in a classical dictionary, but these meanings and definitions are not generally accepted meanings and definitions. These are subjective, fully reflecting the views of the authors. For this reason, apart from general definitions, there are different opinions about how each author perceives the concept.
- 3) Apart from official speech, it is an important area where civilian discourse is established. In the controversial issues, in historical matters, it is possible to

³⁰⁸ Kahraman quoted in Gençer, Yeliz. "Sosyal Medya Ağların Örgütlenme: Dijital Aktivizmin Toplumsal Dönüşüme Yansımaları." *E-journal of Intermedia* 2.2 (2015): 505-522. <http://dergipark.ulakbim.gov.tr/intermedia/article/view/5000171193> 24.12.2016.

³⁰⁹ Uçkan, Özgür. "Sözlükler: Türkiye İnternet Kültürünün Vazgeçilmezi..." *Türkiye Bilişim Derneği Bilişim Dergisi* 40.140 (2012): 23-27. http://www.bilisimdergisi.org/s140/pages/s140_web.pdf 24.12.2016.

access a lot of information and documents not included in the official discourse.

310

In digital participatory dictionaries, opinions that can not reach the mainstream or traditional media can easily take place and official speech can be encountered in contradictory political thoughts. At this point they can be given as an example to the democratization contributions of the new media.

Since the Internet has existed, anonymity culture has improved and this is one of the deepest contributions to social movements. These dictionaries have become more important as anonymous areas since the beginning. Especially in terms of social opposition, the right to be anonymous in an environment where the opposition is constantly and violently suppressed becomes even more valuable.³¹¹

Digital Participant Dictionaries is divided into three categories; General Interactive Dictionaries, Thematic Interactive Dictionaries and University Dictionaries. Generally Interactive Dictionaries provide feedback on almost every topic and open the title. Ekşi, Uludag, ITU, Kötü, Eko Sözlük are among them. Thematic ones are driven on more specific themas like makeup or cinema. University dictionaries are generally established by and used by these universities' students. It is known that there are over 100 clone dictionaries in Turkey.³¹² The clone dictionary is a general name given to all the dictionaries established after the first digital participatory dictionary, Ekşi Sözlük.

"Digital participatory dictionaries have become able to compete with many traditional media tools, especially with the potential to create agenda over the Internet."³¹³ We use these dictionaries when we want to get "real" information written by "real" users about a subject. "If we are watching any event on Twitter

³¹⁰ Armağan, Ahsen, and Şadiye Deniz. "Çocuk İstismarının Sosyal Paylaşım Platformlarında Temsil Biçimleri: Pozantı Cezaevinde Kalan Çocuklar Örneğinin Ekşi Sözlük'te Sunumu." *The Journal of Academic Social Science Studies* 5.7 (2012): 69-88. http://www.jasstudies.com/Makaleler/1444904971_arma%C4%9Fanahsendeniz%C5%9Fadiye_69-88.pdf 24.12.2016.

³¹¹ Uçkan, ibid.

³¹² "Etkileşimli tematik sözlükler ve sosyal medya." *Türkiye Bilişim Derneği Bilişim Dergisi* 40.140 (2012): 16-60. http://www.bilisimdergisi.org/s140/pages/s140_web.pdf 24.12.2016.

³¹³ Kahraman quoted in Gençler, ibid.

that will set the country's agenda, we look at the dictionaries to interpret this event." ³¹⁴ Sedat Kapanoğlu, founder of Ekşi Sözlük, explains the difference of dictionary from mainstream media as follows;

You get "ad hoc" information. You know instantly when there is an earthquake in a place. In a similar way, you can see all kinds of views in a single platform, unlike a media that has chosen itself, a political position and a stance. Unlike social media like Twitter / Facebook, you have a chance to get a clear idea about a specific topic under certain headings. It exposes you to less noise. ³¹⁵

The first digital participatory dictionary that started broadcasting is Ekşi Sözlük. Ekşi Sözlük was founded by Sedat Kapanoğlu on February 1, 1999 and the first entry is the "tiny plastic strange object used to play the guitar" written in the title of "pena" with the nickname "ssg" belonging to Kapanoğlu. ³¹⁶ Sedat Kapanoğlu, defines Ekşi Sözlük in an entry dated 2003:

a tiny and simple piece of program, with more than 1000 authors contributing to its formation from the date it was first opened, with a sub-culture that created in itself, it has completely revealed how actually flexible the concept of 'right', and the knowledge can be looked at from different angles, that is a completely irrelevant and unnecessary, but a realization of a gigantic information treasury, and growth by the help of technology, which has started to bloom inside me years before the date it was opened. ³¹⁷

There are 50,000 writers and 450,000 people waiting to be writers at Ekşi Sözlük, according to the last available data. ³¹⁸ Ekşi Sözlük is the 19th most visited website in Turkey. ³¹⁹ Uludag Sözlük was founded in 2005 with the slogan

³¹⁴ Uçkan, ibid.

³¹⁵ Kapanoğlu, Sedat. "Etkileşimli Tematik Sözlükler ve Sosyal Medya." *Türkiye Bilişim Derneği Bilişim Dergisi* 40.140 (2012): 29-35. http://www.bilisimdergisi.org/s140/pages/s140_web.pdf 24.12.2016.

³¹⁶ <https://eksisozluk.com/entry/1>

³¹⁷ quoted in Uçkan, ibid.

³¹⁸ Cinmen, Işıl. "Ekşisözlük'te neler oluyor?" *Habertürk Gazetesi*. 25.04.2015.

<http://www.haberturk.com/yasam/haber/1082647-eksisozlukte-neler-oluyor>. 24.12.2016.

³¹⁹ <http://www.alexa.com/siteinfo/eksisozluk.com>

"till an undefined word remains".³²⁰ Today, it has 62,000 writers.³²¹ Uludağ Sözlük, the most visited digital participant dictionary after the Ekşi Sözlük in Turkey.³²² When ITU Sözlük was first established, it can only be accessed from the ITU campuses, it has been open to all internet usage since April 2004. In 2015 it was named "instela".³²³

Some concepts used in the terminology of Ekşi Sözlük are as follows; "Title: Separate directories for each topic, Entry: Comments under the headings, Şukela / Şuku: Positive vote for the entry, Newbie (Çaylak): Title given to new users in formatted dictionaries. Entries written by the newbies can only be seen by the management, Author: The title given to the users who have successfully completed the newbie period. Everybody can see the author's entries."³²⁴

Ekşi Sözlük in a new media space, has a closed and hierarchical organization in which the membership can be obtained after certain stages.³²⁵ In order to be an author in Ekşi Sözlük, it is necessary to register as readers, to go up to the newbie status before being an author, and to become author after the 10 entries written by newbies are evaluated by the moderators.

The Ekşi Sözlük does not make a pre-evaluation to entries before publication. In Ekşi Sözlük, writers can write what they want within the law and the general format of the dictionary.³²⁶ Dictionary management adopts an opinion

³²⁰ Gürleyendağ, Gökhan. "Etkileşimli Tematik Sözlükler ve Sosyal Medya." *Türkiye Bilişim Derneği Bilişim Dergisi* 40.140 (2012): 45-53.

http://www.bilisimdergisi.org/s140/pages/s140_web.pdf 24.12.2016.

³²¹ <http://www.uludagsozluk.com/istatistik/>

³²² <http://www.alexa.com/topsites/countries;1/TR>

³²³ <https://tr.wikipedia.org/wiki/%C4%B0nstela>

³²⁴ "Katılımcı Sözlük." *Vikipedi*. Vikipedi, 09.09.2016.

https://tr.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kat%C4%B1%C4%B1mc%C4%B1_s%C3%B6zl%C3%BCk 24.12.2016.

³²⁵ Aslantürk, Gülten, and Hasan Turgut. "8284 Vakası: Ekşi Sözlük'te Cinsiyetçi Kamusalığın Yeniden Üretilmesi." *Ankara Üniversitesi İLEF Dergisi* 2.1 (2015): 45-76.

http://ilef.ankara.edu.tr/wp-content/uploads/id_1_3_3.pdf 24.12.2016.

³²⁶ Doğu, Burak, Zehra Zıraman, and D. Emrah Zıraman. "Web Based Authorship in the Context of User Generated Content, An Analysis of a Turkish Web Site: Eksi Sozluk."

https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Burak_Doqu/publication/242100750_Web_Based_Authorship_in_the_Context_of_User_Generated_Content_An_Analysis_of_a_Turkish_Web_Site_Eksi_Sozluk/links/54b79da50cf2e68eb2803137.pdf?origin=publication_list 24.12.2016.

that the ideal state of the society is a stand where everybody has the ability to evaluate the information, and adopt a critical approach to knowledge.³²⁷

Ekşi Sözlük is administrated by the people with specialized duties. Doğu, Zıraman and Zıraman explains these staff as;

Among them, moderation is the vital and the most distinctive one. As a matter of course, moderators are basically occupied with assigning the newcomers to become authors and deleting the incorrect entries that are violating the rules. If necessary, they have the right to dismiss an author. Other than moderating, informing is another supportive duty. Informer (gammaz) helps moderators to carry out their job easily and faster. These are the authors of older generations, well-informed on the format of the Ekşi Sozluk. They report the incorrect or foul entries to the moderation to have them examined. "Praetors"³²⁸ are the attorneys affiliated to the laws of the Republic of Turkey. These law officers represent Ekşi Sozluk on the legal ground with the possible lawsuits that are brought against and they also consider the entries to be labeled as legally controversial. They have the right to ask the moderation for deleting entries. The least active group is the hacivats. They check the entries considering Turkish grammar rules and if necessary share their corrections with the authors.³²⁹

Entries in Ekşi Sözlük must comply with the Turkish Criminal-Law. Although authors seem to be anonymous with a nickname, they are themselves responsible for the content submitted. When an entry related to these conditions is encountered, moderation has the right to delete without notice and, if necessary, the author's name and IP number must be reported to the legal authorities. However, such problems are tried to be solved within the internal control mechanisms. If the author keeps writing these types of articles, then s/he can be completely removed from the site. Besides, in the event of a lawsuit, the moderators may be removed or the author may be removed from the site.

³²⁷ Kapanoğlu, *ibid.*

³²⁸ The person who is the judge and the ruler who resolves the disputes among the citizens in ancient Rome.

³²⁹ Doğu, Zıraman and Zıraman, *ibid.*

Kapanoğlu explains the policy of the Ekşi Sözlük in relation to the insulting entries as follows;

We fulfill all the requirements of the law of the Republic of Turkey and entitle a very broad right to response. We evaluate complaints coming from both phone, e-mail and web, and we intervene the entries which we think violates personality rights without need for any legal involvement. So I can say that while we maintain the freedom of expression, we are making an effort beyond our legal obligations to protect personal rights at the same time.³³⁰

Kapanoğlu opines about the problems faced by the authors related to the Turkish legal system as, "Anonymity is not legally protected because of distortions in the legal process, if there is a complaint about something you wrote anonymously, you are being tagged in the case file and exposed, even if you are completely innocent!"³³¹ Ekşi Sözlük's broadcast suspended in 2006 by court decision at first and three times in total.³³²

Ekşi Sözlük was closed by court order for an indefinite period of time in 2006 by İstanbul 3th Magistrates' Court due to the claim of the Istanbul Security Directorate on the grounds that the writings under the heading of "cannabis" encouraging drugs to young people. In 2007, its publication suspended by court decision after the case which was opened by Adnan Oktar due to offense of libel. In 2010, a lawsuit was filed against Fatih Altaylı on the grounds that he had insulted dictionary authors on an article entitled "The Meeting Place of Sour Souls" about Ekşi Sözlük and Fatih Altaylı had to publish a palinode from his newspaper column. On the other hand, Fatih Altaylı has removed 97 comments written about him about comments which are abusing and defamatory in the Ekşi Sözlük, according to a court decision taken by Beyoğlu 4th Magistrates' Court. On June 21, 2011, 35 Ekşi Sözlük authors were quoted by the police on the grounds that "insulting spiritual values". Yusuf Devran, a lecturer at Marmara University Communication Faculty, pressed charges on the grounds that there are insulting

³³⁰ Kapanoğlu, *ibid.*

³³¹ Kapanoğlu, *ibid.*

³³² Kapanoğlu, *ibid.*

messages about him at Ekşi Sözlük. Thereupon, the 2 Ekşi Sözlük author standed trial in Istanbul 25th Magistrates' Court and the court suspended the prosecution with no further crime within 3 years.³³³

Along with the development of communication technologies, individuals have begun to meet, share, and create common values with people who have similar views and interests regardless of time and space. This situation has also changed social units such as community and society.³³⁴ Uçkan describes digital-participatory dictionaries as "above all, areas of social interaction that create a subculture within popular culture by creating their own privileged community".³³⁵ According to Rheingold, virtual communities are defined as communities that "appear in the cyber-space when enough people are able to discuss a public debate long enough with sufficient humane emotions to form their personal relationship networks."³³⁶ Maffesoli describes digital communities as modern tribes. According to Maffesoli, in modern societies, micro groups are formed that share a shallow and transient culture, and these groups are common shared formations that have an emotional connection between group members, even if they are short-lived.³³⁷ Dictionary authors who meet around common interests, form virtual communities, sometimes these communities come together in real life.

Network-based interpersonal communication provides a distinct way of participating in social communication by its ability to engage in social behavior and participation.³³⁸ Dictionaries, like an important part of social media, are one

³³³ "Ekşi Sözlük." *Wikipedi*. 27.11.2016.

https://tr.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ek%C5%9Fi_S%C3%B6zl%C3%BCk 25.12.2016

³³⁴ Türk, Gül Dilek, and Bahar Tugen. "Dijital Cemaatler ve Postmodern Kabile Örneği: İnci Sözlük." XIX. Türkiye'de İnternet Konferansı, Yaşar Üniversitesi, İzmir. 2014 <http://inet-tr.org.tr/inetconf19/bildiri/70.pdf> 24.12.2016.

³³⁵ Uçkan, ibid.

³³⁶ Rheingold quoted in Uzunoğlu, Sarphan. "Bir Postmodern İntiharın Ardından Sözlük'te Kanaatlerin Oluşumu ve Grupların Biçimlenme Biçimleri." *E-journal of Intermedia* 2.3 (2015): 424-439. <http://search.proquest.com/openview/53a10a905ab05043e4e8f0c212194fd2/1?pq-origsite=qscholar&cbl=2042737> 24.12.2016.

³³⁷ Maffesoli quoted in Türk and Tugen, ibid.

³³⁸ Doğu, Zıraman and Zıraman, ibid.

of the rare public spheres where the alternative speech and opposition can find the opportunity to live.³³⁹ According to Armağan and Deniz;

The Internet and the Ekşi Sözlük can be regarded as a new form of public space because they meet some criterias as; the free flow of information and ideas, which means that people can freely express their opinions on a public issue; while people are expressing their opinions, they do not pursue personal and institutional economic interests due to the fact that the economy and the market are not included in the public sphere; and the public sphere is a separate, autonomous civic sphere, where government policies can be controlled sistematically and critically.³⁴⁰

In the digital participatory dictionaries, "the ease of expressing each view allows to see the opinion that is dominant in the society about the issue discussed, in macro and micro level."³⁴¹ In addition, dictionaries, that dominant discourses are criticized extensively and can never be reduced to a uniform look, make a unique contribution to the field of politics and communication.³⁴² For this reason, digital participatory dictionaries can be interpreted as an ideal public sphere.

Dictionaries are not just areas of critical thinking and alternative views. "Dictionaries are also like a microcosmos that reflects the society in which they come from within the widest variety".³⁴³ These dictionaries "based on the experiences faced nowadays, daily life, popular culture."³⁴⁴ Dictionaries can be perceived as a place where everyday social practices can be conveyed through cultural habits. The concept of Alexander's "pluralizations of life-worlds" emerges in such fields.³⁴⁵ The mentioned approach is not independent of the individual's daily life. In other words, the behavior of individuals in social networks is part of

³³⁹ Uçkan, ibid.

³⁴⁰ Armağan and Deniz, ibid.

³⁴¹ Armağan and Deniz, ibid.

³⁴² Uçkan, ibid.

³⁴³ Uçkan, ibid.

³⁴⁴ Lüküslü, Demet. "Bilişim Teknolojileriyle Örgütlenen Gençlik Hareketleri ve Yeni Bir Siyaset Arayışı." *Katılımın "e-hali": Gençlerin Sanal Alemi*. Ed. Aslı Telli Aydemir. 2011. 48-68. https://www.academia.edu/3506851/Bili%C5%9Fim_Teknolojileriyle_%C3%96rg%C3%BCtlene_n_Gen%C3%A7lik_Hareketleri_ve_Yeni_Bir_Siyaset_Aray%C4%B1%C5%9F%C4%B1

³⁴⁵ Alexander quoted in Doğu, Zıraman and Zıraman, ibid.

their daily life, and even an activity that is thought to be irrelevant is involved in the context of its effects. For this reason, many opinions that support the dominant discourse, including hate speech, can be found in dictionaries.

There is a special supervision which is developed and applied by Ekşi Sözlük on hate speech, "Ekşi Sözlük HateSpeech Supervision Project". According to the "Ekşi Sözlük Hate Speech Supervision Regulation", the titles and expressions that match the definition of hate speech can be deleted after reviewed by the "Hate Speech Supervision Group", and the memberships of the authors sharing the hate speech can also be cancelled. All dictionary authors have the right to complain about hate speech containing titles and entries to the Hate Speech Supervision Group. The complained contents are examined by the Supervision Group, decisions are made by the members of the group about whether or not they include hate speech and some sanctions can be applied to the authors.³⁴⁶ The site also adopted the following definition based on the European Commission on Human Rights, the European Commission Against Racism and Intolerance, the court decisions referred to, and the relevant laws of certain Nordic countries;

Any expression of any hate and / or violence which may be directed against any person or group of persons based on these basic features, due to race, ethnic origin, language, belief, physical or mental disability, regional differences, gender, sexual identity or sexual orientation, is considered hate speech.³⁴⁷

5.2. Research Method – Critical Discourse Analysis

Discourse analysis method has emerged in the field of mass communication between 1960-1970 in order to make communication structures

³⁴⁶ quoted in Öztekin, Hülya. "Yeni Medyada Nefret Söylemi: Ekşi Sözlük Örneği." *Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi* 8.38 (2015): 925-36.
http://www.sosyalarastirmalar.com/cilt8/sayi38pdf/6iksisat_kamu_isletme/oztekinhulya.pdf http://www.sosyalarastirmalar.com/cilt8/sayi38pdf/6iksisat_kamu_isletme/oztekinhulya.pdf 24.12.2016.
24.12.2016.

³⁴⁷ İnceoğlu, ibid.

more understandable. Discourse analysis is concerned with what the text is about, what it is meant to say through the text, and its meaning. By means of semantic analysis, it is aimed to reveal hidden information in the text.³⁴⁸ Discourse analysis differs from form-based linguistic analysis by considering language as an influence in the society and establishes a link between linguistic analysis and social analysis.³⁴⁹

The studies in discourse analysis, that developed within interdisciplinary approaches and aiming to explain systematically the linguistic structures which is asserted they are ideology laden, are called "critical discourse analysis".³⁵⁰ Representatives include Teun A. van Dijk, Norman Fairclough, and Ruth Wodak. "Critical discourse analysis" emerges as an approach that critically criticizes inequalities and power relations that have been introduced or that have gained a legitimate structure through language, and which actively seeks to create social and political changes, not just scientific ones, while examining the context of discourse during this examination.³⁵¹

According to van Dijk, critical discourse analysis focuses more on the legalization, validation, legitimization, transformation, restructuration or challenge of relations of power and dominance in society. According to him, while critical discourse analysis focuses on social problems and political problems instead of existing paradigms and styles, it does not only describe and explain discourse structures, but also explains the interaction of these discourses with the social structure.³⁵² Critical discourse analysis treats texts as a moment of material production and reproduction of social life and focuses on solutions and political orientation as the main focus of criticism of social work in texts.³⁵³

van Dijk defines media texts as texts in which social power is established and reproduced. What is desired to be revealed by the analysis of critical

³⁴⁸ Ergül, *ibid.*

³⁴⁹ Çomu, *ibid.*

³⁵⁰ Özer quoted in Kovucu, *ibid.*

³⁵¹ Kovucu, *ibid.*

³⁵² van Dijk quoted in Bayram, *ibid.*

³⁵³ Fairclough and Graham, *ibid.*

discourse is that the discourse itself has a tendency to be misused and it may result in abuse of inequity, injustice and power by those who use the discourse.³⁵⁴ In critical discourse analysis, the contents of mass media are regarded as a "structured socio-cultural discourse", which suggests that social power is reestablished through language with these contents.³⁵⁵

The transfer of context and background information is important in the solution of the discourse and in the ideological differentiation.³⁵⁶ Context is a phenomenon that occurs when people attribute the position of a thing in society; It is something that everyone interprets in their mind, which means that the context is interpreted subjectively.³⁵⁷ Context is whole formed by a set of factors such as "social structure, relations of sovereignty, economy-political structure."³⁵⁸ The meaning and language in use is socially constructed, which is why all the discourses and discourses of the media are the results of verbalization of social, cultural and political contexts.³⁵⁹

van Dijk explains the relationship between social cognition and discourse at six levels; Cultural / Common ground Information -> Group Ideologies -> Group Attitudes -> Group Information -> Personal Mental Models -> Discourse

According to this model, the first thing occurs in individual's mind is cultural / common ground knowledge. Sociocultural knowledge is the general belief shared by people in the same society or culture. People learn about the rest of the world through interacting with other people and groups, objects in their environment, community institutions, mass media, or educational discourse. The concept of knowledge is relative and depends on the beliefs of our group, our society or our culture. Socially shared beliefs constitute social memory and sociocultural knowledge is the main system of mental representations in the social

³⁵⁴ van Dijk quoted in Ertaş, ibid.

³⁵⁵ Cangöz quoted in Ergül, ibid.

³⁵⁶ van Dijk' quoted in Ertaş, ibid.

³⁵⁷ van Dijk, Teun A. "Söylem ve İktidar." *Nefret Suçları ve Nefret Söylemi*. Ed. Ayşe Çavdar and Aylin B. Yıldırım. İstanbul: Uluslararası Hrant Dink Vakfı Yayınları, 2010. 9-45.

³⁵⁸ İnal quoted in Ergül, ibid.

³⁵⁹ Ergül, ibid.

memory. The beliefs / knowledge that is accepted by almost all constituents of a culture, that people assumed that known to all in everyday interaction and discourse, and that no need to be expressed, can be called a socio-cultural communal common ground of a culture or group. There is no need to explain the common ground knowledge to the members except small children and foreign persons to the culture.

Group ideologies are the basis of the social memory shared by the groups. Ideologies constitute the basic social representations of beliefs shared by a group and precisely serve as a structure that defines the overall consistency of these beliefs. Mental representations have rules and values that govern our actions and our evaluations. These rules and values basically define the main objectives for which good and bad, allowed or prohibited, and similar struggle against individuals, groups and societies will be given. They are generally unconvincing beliefs in culture. These rules and values basically define the which good and bad, allowed or prohibited, and the main ideals to struggle by similar individuals, groups and societies. They are generally unchallengeable beliefs in the culture.³⁶⁰

Group attitudes are behaviors that we have in common with other people. Attitudes are the concrete and more observable aspects of ideologies. People have developed attitudes about migration, abortion, divorce, euthanasia, and many other important things that take place in people's lives.³⁶¹

Group information includes the "group self-schema" as described in the third section, Language, Discourse and Hate Speech;

- Membership criteria: Who does not belong?
- Typical events: What are we doing?
- General objectives: What do we want? Why are we doing this?

³⁶⁰ van Dijk, Teun A. "Söylem ve İdeoloji: Çokalanlı Bir Yaklaşım." *Söylem ve İdeoloji*. Ed. Barış Çoban and Zeynep Özarslan. 2nd Ed. İstanbul: Su Yayınevi, 2015. 15-97.

³⁶¹ van Dijk, Teun A. "Söylem ve İktidar." *Nefret Suçları ve Nefret Söylemi*. Ed. Ayşe Çavdar and Aylin B. Yıldırım. İstanbul: Uluslararası Hrant Dink Vakfı Yayınları, 2010. 9-45.

- Rules and values: What is good or bad for us?
- Situation: What kind of associations do we have?
- Resources: Who has the right to access our group resources?

These categories define what it means to be a group member. The group self-schema is one of the basic forms of social cognition, which defines the identity of a group and also the subjective feelings of the social identity of its members.

Personal mental models represent prejudiced knowledge and provide concrete examples of general, abstract beliefs (definitions). Our daily reality is perceived, understood and interpreted through the establishment of mental models. Representation is often influenced by previous experiences, habits that can prejudice current perceptions and interpretations.³⁶²

As a result, a person learns about the common knowledge of the group in which he/she is born, and does not question this knowledge that he / she has accepted quite naturally afterwards. The individual adopts the ideology of the group of people when this unquestioned knowledge deepens towards shared common rules and beliefs. The ideologically-minded person develops attitudes toward some situations they are facing and he/she is judging persons, actions, goals, values and situations on the basis of group information. All this unquestionable information creates some representations in the mind of the person and he/she automatically judges in the light of the representatives without needing the necessity of re-questioning the events that encountered. Finally, in all of this context, he/she reveals a discourse. According to the analysis of critical discourse, all these mentioned steps need to be taken into consideration in order to analyze any discourse.

According to Norman Fairclough, all these steps are dialectically interconnected. So, they are different elements, but they are not exactly

³⁶² van Dijk, Teun A. "Söylem ve İdeoloji: Çokalanlı Bir Yaklaşım." *Söylem ve İdeoloji*. Ed. Barış Çoban and Zeynep Özarslan. 2nd Ed. İstanbul: Su Yayınevi, 2015. 15-97.

dissociated elements. For example, social relations, identities, cultural values and consciousness are not indicative, but are tied to each other by language. Critical discourse analysis is the analysis of the dialectical relationship between discourse and other social practices.³⁶³

van Dijk states that our lexical choice, which is highly dependent on our thinking about such a person, is related with whether or not we can call someone "freedom fighter", "rebel" or "terrorist". He states that such a thought is also depends on our ideological position and our attitudes about the group to whom he/she belongs. The production of speech is beyond just the control of any action. Because minds form ideologies, ideologies form attitudes, behaviors, and discursive practices.³⁶⁴

5.2.1. Application of Critical Discourse Analysis

Teun A. van Dijk expresses that the ideological analysis can be practically done with the "us-them dichotomy" are based on the "group self-image". He indicates that ideological discourse is basically created by strategies of "positive self-presentation" and "negative other-presentation"; 1- Emphasize positive things about us, 2- Emphasize negative things about them, 3- Do not emphasize negative things about us, and 4- Do not emphasize positive things about them.³⁶⁵

Analysis of critical discourse is carried out through the examination of meaning, propositional structures, actors, modality, provability, indirect speech and incomprehensibility, traditional themes, formal structures, sentence sequences, forms of discourse, reasoning, rhetoric and action and interaction.

In the meaning of the text; attention should be paid to the subjects, definition level and level of detail, implications and pre-assumptions, local

³⁶³ Fairclough, Norman. "Söylemin Diyalektiği." Trans. Barış Çoban. *Söylem ve İdeoloji*. Ed. Barış Çoban and Zeynep Özarslan. 2nd Ed. İstanbul: Su Yayınevi, 2015. 137-146.

³⁶⁴ Aygül, *ibid.*

³⁶⁵ van Dijk, *ibid.*

consistency, synonyms, re-expression, opposition, examples and explanations, denail phrases:

1. The subjects represent the main idea or the most important knowledge of discourse and tell what the discourse is "related" to. The first thing we do if we want to emphasize our good things or their bad things is to make such a statement.
2. The definiton level and level of detail are about giving a lot or insufficient detail about an event or describing the event at a somewhat abstract, general, or special level. We speak more specific and detailed about our good things. For example, we can talk about "police violence" in general and abstract or we can go one step further and explain what the police has done.
3. Implications and preconceptions describe how we express only part of an information in a model. Information that is incompatible with the positive motives of people is remained implicit, and details about the bad things of the external group members are given. To presume a known, non-shared knowledge is to present it from the back door. For example; If the police report that "they are concerned about the young migrant workers' high crime rate", this declaration presupposes that the young migrant workers have a high crime rate.
4. Local consistency is that the meanings of the clauses are related to one another in a way and there is a global and local consistency between them. A propositional sequence is assumed to be locally consistent, if it relates to sequences of actions, events, or situations that are mutually related to each other, for example with causality or possibility of relativity.
5. Synonymity and restatement are expressions with more or less the same meaning with different words. Lingual and stylistic changes are made based on context with different word choice. For example; Talking about "foreigners" in Western Europe usually means referring to immigrants or ethnic minorities, not "real" foreigners.

6. Opposition is established through us-them dichotomy. Ideologies often arise when social struggle and competition exists, sovereignty is concerned, and two or more groups' interests conflict.
7. Examples and explanations are used often and as evidence for positive self-presentation and negative other-presentation. Racist discourse is often described by examples and explanations in the form of stories about our good actions and their bad behavior. We can find a general statement about how they are violating rules, not obeying, pervert, or even guilty.
8. The denial phrases are established in the format of "I am not against x ...". For example; "I am not against the Syrians living between us, but they speak very loudly." It is only the first sentence that denies racism, the rest of the discourse can say very negative things about the others.

The meaning of local discourse is set in statements. A sentence contains one or more statements - things that can be judged as right or wrong-. Verbs of statements can be more or less positive or negative, depending on the base thoughts. Sentences about others are usually established by negative verbs. Statement structures include actors, modals, provability, and indirect speech.

1. Actors can be seen in various roles in arguments. In the sentences, made with us-them dichotomy, the inner group or outer group can be represented in many disguises. Racist discourse has a tendency to represent minorities or immigrants first of all as "them". Instead of speaking individually and privately, all others are homogenized. For example, "Syrian killed the Turkish Landlord!"
2. Modality is seen as "must/have to" in statements. For example, in order to promote police cruelty as a necessity, events are launched in the form of "racial rebellion" and the justification of violence is implied.
3. Provability is a way to objectify which speakers refer when speaking of a belief and in subjective expressions. Prejudiced ideas are supported by ideological evidence. Mass media, for example, often report on the

criminality of immigrants, and these reports are proved in a racist discourse by saying "I read at the newspaper".

4. Indirect speech and incomprehensibility are common on the diplomatic language. If the correct answer of a question is unknown, evasive or ambiguous answers can be given. Or what can be said is indirectly expressed if it is politically incorrect. An example is the use of "widespread discontent" rather than racism term.

Traditional themes are standard arguments. These arguments do not need to be defended, they are used as basic criteria. Ideological or racist discourse is full of traditional themes. Expressions such as "burden" and "threat" are usually traditional themes used in anti-immigrant discourses. For example, the arrival of immigrants "in crowds" to our country is a threatening expression.

Formal structures consist of plot, people, time and space in a text. Discourse can affect the structure of the text, the form of the clause, the format of the discussion, the order of the news story, the size of the headline, and so on. These methods are used to emphasize or not emphasize meanings.

Clause sequence can be arranged with some methods, such as using phrase, word order, causation, and passive, according to discourse. For example, in the "the police arrested the demonstrators." sentence, police is an active subject. In the phrase "demonstrators arrested by the police", police's subjectivity is attempted. In sentences like "The demonstrators are arrested." the subject can be completely covered.

Forms of discourse affect the meaning of the sentence. There will be an extra emphasis on the information expressed at the beginning of a text. Because it is read first, it will have more control over the interpretation of the rest of the text than the information expressed at the end. News headlines, presentation summaries, headings and abstracts in a scientific article are typical examples.

Reasoning, (discussion, argumentation) is a structure seen in many kinds of discourses. The person who advocates a certain vision, if there are different

thoughts, different perspectives or worldviews of those who participate in the conversation, try to come to a reasonable point while they are acting in common. The rules of reasoning are violated when others are not allowed to express their discourse, when people are threatened, when the interaction of the discussion is obstructed or disrupted. An ideological group and its members defend worldviews by referring leaders, heroes and trustworthy authorities.

Rhetoric is an art of convincing speech. In rhetoric, style figures such as repetitions, metaphors, analogies, ironies, euphemisms, are used ideologically. The metaphor of "filthy animals" is often used to identify the others.

Action and interaction is the most important part of the discourse after meaning and format. The members of the sovereign groups enjoy orders or threats while speaking with members of the ruled groups. Discrimination, non-legitimization, slanderous words, humiliation, problematization, marginalization are frequently seen in discourses. Action in discourse may be valid for actions merely done with discourse such as education, legislation or the management of the country.³⁶⁶

³⁶⁶ van Dijk, *ibid.*

5.3. Quantitative Findings

Within the scope of the research, Ekşi Sözlük, Uludağ Sözlük and ITU Sözlük, titles, contains 10 entries or more and "Syrian" word, which was opened until 15.12.2016. Later, it was researched how many of entries are in these titles. Table I shows how many titles are opened in each dictionary and how many entries are written in the total of these titles.

D.P.D.	Total N. of Titles	Total N. of Entries
Ekşi Sözlük	179	12182
Uludağ Sözlük	172	3928
Instela	87	3356

Table-I

Each entry was scanned according to whether it contained hate speech or not. In Table II, the ratio of entries with hate speech to total entries is shown in each dictionary.

D.P.D.	Total N. of Entries	Entries Include Hate Speech	Ratio
Ekşi Sözlük	12182	3913	32,1%
Uludağ Sözlük	3928	1208	30,8%
Instela	3356	1030	30,7%

Table-II

Although Ekşi Sözlük has a Committee on the Hate Speech Supervision, the rate of inclusion of hate speech by entities is higher than the other two. Nevertheless, when it is considered that dictionaries authorship requires some sort of digital literacy and a certain level of culture, it is believed that the rate of inclusion of hate speech is actually less than the real life. Especially in small cities or neighborhoods where the Syrians frequently prefer hate speech is encountered quite often. 30% is assumed to be low for Turkey average.

5.4. Interpretation of Qualitative Findings

Samples from Ekşi Sözlük, Uludağ Sözlük and İTÜ Sözlük, were selected according to the hatred categories determined by the Hrant Dink Foundation's "Monitoring of Hate Speech" project. These categories are as follows; 1) Exaggeration / Ascribing / Distortion, 2) Swearing / Insulting / Humiliation, 3) Hostility / War Discourse 4) Usage of the Natural Identity Item as Hate, Humiliation Fact / Stigmatization. The first category includes "discourse of negative generalizations, distortions, exaggerations, negative references to a whole community by referring a person or a situation". In the second category, there are "direct curse, humiliation, insulting discourses about a community". (For example, Rat, Animal, Corrupt) The third category includes "discourses of hostile, warlike expressions about a community". (For example, Non-Muslim Cruelty) Finally, there are discourses in which "a natural identity item is used as an element of hatred, humiliation, symbolism" (eg, "your mother is Armenian already" in a negative sense)³⁶⁷ In accordance with these categories, one sample was selected from each dictionary and interpreted using critical discourse analysis method.

5.4.1. Hate Speech Examples Against Syrians from Ekşi Sözlük

Sample I.

The first example is selected from the Exaggeration / Ascribing / Distortion category. On 26.09.2013 under the heading of "Syrian Asylum-Seekers" the entry written by the author "hoopp cardak gitti" is as follows;

³⁶⁷ "Metodoloji." *Medyada Nefret Söyleminin İzlenmesi Projesi*. Uluslararası Hrant Dink Vakfı, 2009. <http://www.nefretsoylemi.org/metodoloji.asp> 27.09.2016.

they are the people who f*cked up the country. in the southeast, they have been infiltrated every street, some people begging, some stealing, hi-jacking and murdering. people who i do not want to be defended. many restaurants in urfa have not been able to do business for months to feed these people because when they do not give food, the shop window is being broken or the shop is looted. streets are insecure and transformed into areas of exploitation. as if thieves were not enough, and we are trying to do humanity to these people. if there is anyone do not believe me, can go to suruç, antakya. many cities have become uninhabitable because of these people. i never said to belittle or dismiss people, but believe me, these events do not occur neither a newspaper nor in the media. folks have neither life nor property security.³⁶⁸

As it is seen, the authors charged all Syrian asylum seekers with crimes such as theft, begging, and extortion, which can be involved by any person in any community.

The us-them dichotomy has been emphasized within the entry's integrity of meaning, the actors are compared and presented as parties, and it is stated that the life and property safety of "us", the real people, is at stake. With the denial expressions like "I never said to belittle or exclude people, but ...", the writer taking himself in a safe area by positive self-presentation and legalizing negative opinions about the Syrians. In the phrase, "Those who do not want me to be defended", the Syrian asylum seekers referred as "those", on the other hand by not using a name, the author is putting a distance between him/herself and the asylum seekers and again try to glorify his nation with the us-them dichotomy. By using metaphors such as "They have infiltrated every street in the Southeast", it is mentioned that Syrian refugees have been secretly reaching out everywhere without "our" knowledge, the danger of infiltration everywhere is emphasized with terms illegality and secrecy.

³⁶⁸ <https://eksisozluk.com/entry/37216229>

The author dramatizes results by using rhetorical techniques, emphasizing that actually the local people, not the asylum seekers, are in danger, and "we" is being victimized. Attempts are made to justify the hate speech produced, by sorting negative examples such as the breaking of shop windows, looting. Although these types of examples are individual actions, all Syrian asylum seekers are blamed and these negative behaviors are reflected as typical characteristics of the group. Syrian asylum seekers are presented as negative-other, the group is illegitimized and criminalized by giving examples that violating the law and do not obeying the rules. It is more rational to object to the people who violate the law than to object them just because they are members of a race.

By dramatizations like "Many cities have become uninhabitable because of these people." Or "people have neither life nor property safety.", the severity of the situation tried to be exaggerated, and it tried to be justified to unwanted Syrian asylum-seekers in cities.

Sample II.

The second example was chosen from the category of Swearing / Insulting / Humiliation and from the title "Syrian Mastiffs on Flora Beach". "Mastiff" is used in Ekşi Sözlük terminology to describe conservative and ignorant Anatolian people, and people are humiliated as a dog. There is a video added by a user in the title and taken on 07.07.2016 at Florya Beach in Istanbul and the discussions are being conducted through this video. There are young Syrian men dancing on the beach in the video and shouting "Syria, Syria". Young people, throughout the title, were criticized and disparaged for reasons such as no Syrian women among them, having been escaping from the war in Syria and having fun in Turkey while they were cheering on "Syria" and taking pictures of "Turkish ladies" with their mobile phones, even though that claim was not seen on the video. The entry written by "sallamakahve" on 07.07.2016 is as follows;

some of the syrians are still on their territory and in defense of their country to the death. another syrian who is in Turkey rush about where to enjoy.

these are ungrateful. they are corrupted and dishonorable, they are cowards. will these be citizens? look carefully, are these? they should not be citizens!

edit:

those who are watching this video are still talking about humanity, well i am seriously surprising. look what the ones at the beach wrote in those comments? "taking photos of women, entering women's locker rooms". what kind of a person does this? no one has the right to make somebody uneasy. nobody tells anyone not to have fun, but it seems that their amusement purposes are bothering women and girls. if you like them very much, you will get a couple of them to your home, and enjoy their desire to your mother, wife.

f*ck that fun! ³⁶⁹

In the first paragraph, the author otherizes the Syrians who took refuge in Turkey in a negative way by classifying the Syrians who "fought in their country" and "fleeing from the war".

In the second paragraph, people are being insulted and humiliated by the use of adjectives such as "dishonorable", "corrupted", "unfaithful" and "coward" for the Syrian youth who have fun on the beach. It is opposed to the Turkish citizenship of the Syrian refugees, by the behavior of the people was assumed negatively without showing any reason.

³⁶⁹ <https://eksisozluk.com/entry/61600286>

After writing the first two paragraphs, the author probably added a third paragraph to his/her entry, after some reactions received through messages. It is tried to justify hate speech by showing evidence of behaviors that are not seen in the video such as "taking photos of women, entering women's lockers". The statement starts with a so-called empathy by the sentence, "nobody says anybody not to have fun..." but after that with the "it seems that their amusement purposes are bothering women and girls" sentence and it is opposed to all of the refugees by the so-called immoral behaviors of the young people ascribed to all Syrian refugees. It is implied that writers who advocate Syrian refugees, want the Syrians' bothering to their own families, with rude sentences such as "if you like them very much, you will get a couple of them to your home, and enjoy their desire to your mother, wife.", and at the same time, potential hazards are emphasized. Finally, by "f*ck that fun!" it has been cursed publicly.

Sample III.

The third example is chosen from the category of Hostility / War Discourse. The entry written by the author of "jugglingmolecules" under the title of "Syrian Asylum-seekers" on 15.06.2015 is as follows;

which asylum seekers, men become citizens.

they should be putted in gas chambers like hitler. like at our country, our level of welfare, our economic situation is very good, and we take 5 million foreign arabs to the country.

the edges of the tem highway, grasses, trees are sh*t, go to hell. where do they washed and get cleaned these scums in these hot days.

we do not kick the fallen, the ones who say they are war victims, they are innocent not guilty shall feed them at their homes. at every traffic light, they come to the window like allahu-akbar money money, f*ckers.

there used to be a lot of sniffers in istanbul. young people trying to find their way with the bag in their hands in the daytime ... tell, what happened to them. you can not bring all of them in humanity suddenly..

it won't stop till burning and killing these motherf*cking scums. i am not a humanist in this regard. who love them can feed them at their home. our own citizen can not walk comfortably on the street. they are harassing people in the daytime by saying money money in kadıköy.³⁷⁰

The author, in the first sentence, ironically, accepts the rumor of giving citizenship status to Syrian refugees as reality, by saying "men became citizens".

In the second paragraph, by the sentence "they should be putted in gas chambers like hitler", it is declared clearly that Hitler's Jewish Holocaust is supported, Hitler's holocaust of Jews in gas chambers referred as an exemplary behavior and moreover Syrian refugees should be killed like Jews.

Without using the name of refugees, by writing only "these", the author puts a distance between the Syrians and his group, and does not need to define Syrian refugees. The Arabs are otherized by questioning why did we take "Foreign Arabs" to our country and that it is implied that the Arabs are "foreigners", they are not from us and that they do not concern us at all.

In the third paragraph, Syrian refugees accused by the garbages on the side of the TEM highway, not any other nation living in Istanbul, and generalization is made assuming that the pollution was created by the Syrians. By the sentence,

³⁷⁰ <https://eksisozluk.com/entry/52319307>

"where do they washed and get cleaned these scums in these hot days." the Syrian refugees are assumed as "filth", presented as negative-other by being not washed or cleaned.

The writer substitutes Syrians refugees with an animal and can be fed at home by saying "who love them can feed them at their home." to people defend Syrian refugees. By generalizing all Syrian refugees who are begging, all Syrian society is regarded as beggars and the hate speech is based on the illegal and disturbing behavior of Syrian refugees. The Syrians, who are said to be begging with the words "Allah-u Akbar money money", are humiliated by both speaking Arabic and being a Muslim.

In the fourth paragraph, it is exemplified that the Syrian refugees should be killed by implying that there was a lot of sniffers in İstanbul once upon a time but there aren't many as before, by saying they all can not "bringed into humanity", it is implied that these sniffers died or get killed, by this way Istanbulites had gotten rid of "sniffers terror", it has been stated that Syrian refugees also should be killed.

In the last paragraph, by stating Syrian refugees should be burned and killed, the war discourse made publicly. The author victimizes his own group by stating that "their own" citizen can not walk easily on the streets, and justifies the war rhetoric by giving negative examples. In the general sense of the entry, it is emphasized that Syrian refugees are threatening the lives of "us" because of their begging, and therefore must be killed.

Sample IV.

The fourth example is selected from the category of Usage of the Natural Identity Item as Hate and Humiliation Fact / Stigmatization. On 12.11.2013, the entry written by the "serkaninci" nicknamed auther under the heading "Boss Beater Syrian Worker" is as follows;

arap again made his treachery and shot the turk from his back. history repeats itself.

my words hasn't finished edit: the ones worry about getting a little more vote, do not hesitate to cherish the ignorant Syrian people and do not see the citizens who are shot into heads in the country, keep on running down mixed rooms of people... enough to fool this nation!

i have nothing to say to the syrians. it is arab. it does what is in his blood.³⁷¹

In the entry, being arab is being equalized with "treachery" and "unfaithfulness", and the natural identity item is used as a humiliation fact. By sayings like "The Arab again made treason and shot the Turks from the back." or "History repeats itself. " it has been referanced that "the Arabs in the First World War cooperated with the British to betray the Ottoman State" and it is reminded that the Arab Nation has been hostile to Turks since centuries. It is also legitimized as a fact known by all that Arabs are traitors by resorting to an authority like official history. As a negative-other the Syrian who beat his employer has been generalized and all Syrians and even all the Arabs are held responsible for this negative example and it is stated that what they do is normal because of treachery is in Arabs' blood. The event is exaggerated without mentioning the reasons behind the beating of the boss who is a "Turkish" by the Syrian worker, and illegal behavior is charged to all Arabs.

Moreover, the government, accused by letting to the arrival of the Syrian refugees in the country, has been criticized by combining different wrongs, by opposing the government's policies unrelated with Syrian refugees such as the ignorance to the people and interfening life choices' of the people. The people of

³⁷¹ <https://eksisozluk.com/entry/38256427>

Syria are humiliated here while trying to criticize the government's Syrian refugee policy.

5.4.2. Hate Speech Examples Against Syrians from Uludağ Sözlük

Sample I.

The first example is selected from the Exaggeration / Ascribing / Distortion category. The entry written by the author "ateistvaiz" under the title "Syrians" on 02.09.2013 is as follows;

people who on the one hand i feel sorry for the innocent ones, on the other hand my racist side comes forward and i can able to desist from saying "they deserve".

why they deserve it, they deserve because of their impassiveness, treachery, low cultures and theocratic/sectarian attitude. shame to babies, children died.³⁷²

The author both generalizes all the Syrian refugees by stigmatizing them as passive, traitor, low cultured and theocratic / sectarian and also degrades the whole population and culture. Author uses denial expressions, beginning the sentence with "while on the one hand, he feels sorry for those who are ..", indicates the so-called empathy. The author emphasizes that he/she is actually a "humanist" person, saying "shame to the dead babies and children .." and states that his racial expressions are used not because of his racism but because of the treachery of Syrian refugees. Syrian refugees are classified as "innocent" and

³⁷² <https://www.uludagsozluk.com/e/21148331/>

"deserving", and it has been declared that all Syrians deserve war, humiliation, desertion and death because of "bad" Syrians.

Sample II.

Second example is selected from, Swearing / Insulting / Humiliation category. The entry written on the date of 25.04.2015 by the "protest sanayici" for the title of "If 1 Year Nobody Taxes Kurdish and Syrian Won't Stay" is as follows;

it's a reality of turkey.

yeah,

i know, you are also tired of the kurds, the syrians.

this formula is an effective method that can be applied to get rid of these two gang sucking our blood.

because our muaviye³⁷³ follower state is not going to give up giving our rights to them a month of mondays.

the thing we do is very simple.

we do not pay taxes for 1 year, we do not deposit vehicle stamps, we do not pay income tax, real estate tax, VAT, stoppage, insurance premiums.

we are going to pay indirect tax (reflected on invoices) that we have to pay forcefully.

³⁷³ The caliph who invalidated the election of Caliphate by the council in Islam and made it pass from father to son.

see, this state will stagger in the first 6 months. when it is staggered, it's first thing to do is getting rid of these parasites. at the end of the next 6 months, the kurds fed from the state will be cutted off and they will leave the country automatically.

yes, we have a f*cked up country, but we make sure that turks have succeeded once again, we have established empires, states from the rough many times.

as long as we can get rid of the parasites that suck our blood ... ³⁷⁴

Both Kurdish and Syrian people are publicly humiliated in the title; It is implied that the Kurds and Syrians can live through the taxes of "us" and Populism is done by saying this statement is "A reality of Turkey" and it is presented as a fact that everyone knows and accepts correctly.

By the call, "I know you are also tired of the Kurds and the Syrians.", It is emphasized that it is necessary to speak about "the truths" "bluntly" by leaving the "political rightness" aside. Moreover, the writer is convinced that the people called are also have a consensus with himself. The Kurds and Syrians are described as "two gang that suck our blood" and they are regarded as a mosquito and it is stated that they harm "us" and they are dangerous for "us".

Moreover, referring to history, the government is liken to I. Muaviye in Histroy of Islam. Mu'āviyye ibn Abu-Sufiyyān changed the rule of election of Caliphate and guaranteed the dominion of himself and his family, and established Umayyad Dynasty. Muaviyye incident in historical criticism is usually made by people belonging to the Shiite sect, it has been said that the caliphate is the right of Ali ibn Abi Talib. The author criticizes such government executives as those who seem to have adopted the Sunnism by the constant reference to religion.

³⁷⁴ <https://www.uludagsozluk.com/e/27472757/>

In the third paragraph, the unfair tax system of the state is criticized and the Kurds and Syrians are held responsible. It is stated that the Kurds and the Syrians have been living by means of the taxes that the state collected from "us" unfairly. The fourth paragraph explains how to get rid of this "negative" situation.

In the fifth paragraph, the author continues to insult these people by guaranteeing that we can get rid of these two "parasitic" nations who are "burden" to the Turks if the proposed formula is applied. In the last paragraph, it is stated that "the Turks established states from rough" on the basis of historical knowledge and the Turkish nation was declared to be able to get rid of the "blood-sucking" nations within the context of this sacrifice and the Turks had praised by positive self-representation.

Sample III.

The third example is chosen from the category of Hostility / War Discourse. It is written on 18.03.2016 under the heading "Syrian Requests Arabic Signs", written by "ucamayipelenenadam" the author. Negative other-presentation is adduced with a screen shot taken from Twitter with a link added to the entry. In the attached picture, Ahmad Edaham named Twitter user, who is supposed to be a Syrian, tweeted (with a broken Turkish) "You are ignoring us, Syrians, We are living in Turkey now, there is no single Arabic sign. Not only Turks live in this country. Where is the equality? Do Syrians have to learn Turkish" The author's entry is as follows;

As seen in the picture, because of the increase in numbers, they already want a sign in their own language, they are dishonorable, immoral. If they have already begun this, we will not be able to get away with even if we burn them later.³⁷⁵

³⁷⁵ <http://www.uludagsozluk.com/e/31780552/>

The author justifies his rise up by going through a negative example and denounces and denigrates all Syrian refugees as "dishonorable", "immoral" because of a tweet written by a single Syrian.

By the sentence "If they have already begun this...", it is assumed that the Syrians will cause much more trouble in the future than asking for an Arabic sign in the future, and it is exaggerated that one situation would lead to great catastrophes.

The last sentence clearly says, "Even if we burn them, we will not be able to get away." it is emphasized that it is necessary to burn Syrian refugees and even worse things must be done because we can not get away the troubles they cause even by just burning. It is being attempted to justify burning all Syrians against a single Syrian demanding Arabic sign.

Sample IV.

The fourth example is selected from the category of Usage of the Natural Identity Item as Hate and Humiliation Fact / Stigmatization. On 08.07.2016 under the title of "Syrians who have fun at Florya Beach", was written by the author "nickinindikinegidenyazar". The title is about the image of the Syrian youth swimming in Florya Beach, discussed in the Ekşi Sözlük, the previous section. The example entry is as follows;

they celebrate the citizenship they have achieved.

f*cking mesopotamia *sses.³⁷⁶

³⁷⁶ <https://www.uludagsozluk.com/e/33165414/>

Even the citizenship is not conferred to the Syrian refugees, this possibility is considered to have been realized, and the racist discourses that are used are being tried to be normalized within the critique of a Turkish policy. Due to the absence of any Syrian refugees within the Turkish Grand National Assembly even in the case of citizenship status being granted to Syrian refugees, the criticism of this subject to Syrian refugees arises from trying to find a legal cause for hatred. Syrian refugees are defined as "Mesopotamian *sses" and are included in the people of Syrian and Mesopotamia, being equivalent to being an *ss, and a natural identity item is used as a humiliating element. Kurdish nationalists generally regard themselves as an archaic people of Mesopotamia. From here it seems that the writer is using the Kurdish as an element of humiliation as well as being Syrian.

5.4.3. Hate Speech Examples Against Syrians from İTÜ Sözlük

Sample I.

The first example is selected from the Exaggeration / Ascribing / Distortion category. On 12.03.2013, under the heading of "Syrian Refugees", the entry written by the author "taşımaları" is as follows;

according to some reports I have heard from others, they are human wastes who tries to get humanitarian aid (baby blanket, blanket, woman pediatrics, cleaning supplies etc) even not deserved, by in disguise (playing a pregnant role by using a pillow even not being pregnant to get baby diapers or trying to get a sanitary pad even being pregnant), and when they receive goods they also sell them for money among themselves. of course, the ones who are innocent are distinguished from these definitions. they are my dear, my love. they are always welcomed here.

- this woman who acted as a pregnant woman came this week for the fourth time. she wants to clean the tent with cleaning material. the translator said like that.

- you are wrong, it counts nine this week. it has been said that it will be given only brush, broom from cleaning materials. tell the translator to explain the situation.

while the interpreter comes and tells the woman in Arabic.

the woman goes out speaking in anger. then the interpreter is asked.

- what did she say?

- she will complain you to the prime minister.

and those who distribute humanitarian aid with the best possible means shocked.

377

The author, in general meaning of the entry, humiliates all Syrian refugees as "human wastes" by generalizing on a single example that he does not witness but "heard from someone else". It has been tried to make a real impression on the reader through the portrayal and the dialogues, by elaborating on the negative example mentioned above. By saying "innocent people are separated from this definition." , also the refugees are classified as being good, but the majority are as bad and moreover the writer's humanist side is emphasized, and the generalization is thus legalized.

In the last sentence, delivering aids is considered a source of national pride, examples are given to present positive self, "we" who delivers aid is glorified by saying "those who distribute humanitarian aid with the best possible means". However, it is assumed that distributors of aid are doing it with "best means", even there is no certain knowledge about, but it is presumed that those who distribute aid to "weak, poor" Syrians are doing their best.

³⁷⁷ <https://tr.instela.com/suriyeli-multeciler---10310507>

Sample II.

Second example is selected from, Swearing / Insulting / Humiliation category. The entry written into the title "Increasing Syrian Hate" by "yaşlı bir kelebek" on 07.08.2016 is as follows;

beyoğlu become horrible, 30 darkskinned noisy runt walk side by side, at the exact time i'm going to eat, a girl child is clinging to my led, with a a flute in her hand, a 4 year old girl is playing the pathetic songs, syrian drug dealers at mis street and küçükparmakpı pretend raising caine and pickpocket along with tarlabası kurds, already there are a lot of uneducated people, there occurs a mutant monster when they collated with these.³⁷⁸

The author assumes that Beyoglu belongs to "us" as himself and himself, and that after the arrival of the "others", Beyoglu becomes horrible. It is declared that Beyoglu is so bad because of the people humiliated because of the color of the skin, children who are forced to beg. Kurds are also exposed to hate speech with the Syrians in the entry. The Syrians and Kurds are being criminalized on grounds that they are pickpocketing and selling drugs, and the illegal crimes mentioned are generalized to all Syrian and Kurdish. The author tries to present himself positively by emphasizing that the otherized people are too loud and uneducated, implying that "we" are civilized and educated. Finally, Syrian refugees and Kurds and their illegal behavior are metaphorically resembling a "mutant monster", insulting all people belonging to these groups through bad examples.

³⁷⁸ <https://tr.instela.com/giderek-artan-suriyeli-nefreti---15953330>

Sample III.

The third example is chosen from the category of Hostility / War Discourse. The entry on 13.02.2014 written by "tayyarağa" the title of "Syrian Beggars" as follows;

as i should pity these men, i should give them money, i should give them home, i should give them jobs, citizenship, and even education without examination. also let's give them our *sses.

was not it the syria support the pkk, terrorist group, during the 90s? was not it syria that opened the dam covers of the asi river every year and left hatay under water because of did not forgiving possessing us hatay? was not it the syrian who wandered like "it serves those bastards right" while we were struggling with these? all i care for those foreign syrians? if they do not f*ck of, turkey will begin to adopt the nazi ideology. we do not get so much trouble with the kurds because of having been together for so many years, living together, even laughing the same crappy jokes. sometimes I even say "fuck off man, you exxagerated" even though i am personally quite racist. what about this *sshole rapist pedophile thieving arabs? do you think we will tolerate them too? we will kill everyone from childhood to dogs; we will do what timur did on the date, without hesitation. do not get our dander up.³⁷⁹

The first paragraph of the entry criticizes fundamental and social rights recognized in Syrian refugees and implied that they are not human rights but granted as a mercy. The author, at the second paragraph, is criticizing the Syrian government by giving various examples from the past.

The Syrian Arab Republic policies such as, Supporting the PKK, the problem of the dam, are imputed on Syrian refugees who have to migrate to our

³⁷⁹ <https://tr.instela.com/suriyeli-dilenciler---12155011>

country. By saying "foreign Syrians", the writer puts a distance between himself and the Syrians, emphasizing that he and the Syrians are different. The author states in the entry that he also does not want Kurdish people, but at least they do not pose so much problem because he/she have to live together with the Kurds.

The Arabs are labeled as pedophiles and thieves, and the Arabs are generalized as a criminal race. The author declares that he is "racist" and, if Syrian refugees won't return to their countries, he/she imitates Nazi Germany and Hitler, as have seen in the previous examples, and implies that they will kill the Syrians. An example from the past is that Syria is conquered by the Tymur Empire, indicating that like Timur, will kill Syrians' children and even dogs.

Sample IV.

The fourth example is selected from the category of Usage of the Natural Identity Item as Hate and Humiliation Fact / Stigmatization. On 19.03.2016, under the title of "Syrian Demands Arabic Signs", it is written by a an author nicknamed as "yaglısacıkarızması". It is discussed on the tweet of a Syrian requesting putting Arabic signs on Twitter as in Uludağ Sözlük under the same heading which is examined under that dictionary. Example entry is like that;

if the country is filled with all the mesopotamian rats, and compromise them so much, they will want more things. gather them in a buffer zone near the border, let them stew in their own juice, but no, all the turkey is a buffer zone for the europe.³⁸⁰

In the entry, the peoples of Mesopotamia are humiliated by being compared to a rat, and the entire nation is attributed to the rat in return for wanting an Arabic sign. "If compromise them so much, they will want more", sentence is

³⁸⁰ <https://tr.instela.com/arapca-tabela-isteyen-suriyeli---15444054>

pointing out the possible threats in the future, the Turks are being victimized. Government is criticized for allowing Syrian refugees to emigrate to cities and to interfere with these "rats" to "our" area, suggesting that Syrian refugees should reside in the camps where they won't engage with the Turks, the original owner of the land.

6. ASSESMENTS AND CONCLUSION

To make a general assesment about the findings; It is observed that the hate speech exerted in all three dictionaries are not so different from each other and the density is similar, even though the Ekşi Sözlük has the Committee on the Hate Speech Supervision, there is no difference between it and the Uludağ and İTÜ Sözlük.

It has been observed that the hate speech in the category of Exaggeration / Ascribing / Distortion is presented with the emphasis of "danger" as indicated by van Dijk. In this category, crimes such as theft, extortion and prostitution are given exaggeratedly. Even behaviors that do not directly harm anyone, such as doing make-up, talking loudly, drinking coffee, are considered disturbing and comments made like the Syrians can not adapt to Turkey. In particular, Syrian men are accused of treason for "fleeing war", and it is stated that a person who flees in battle must live in a miserable state and should not normally participate in life. Finally, Syrian refugees, who have been already struggling with poverty and sometimes can not even meet their nutritional needs, are humiliated because of they are dirty, they smell and wear bad clothes.

On the other hand, under the category Swearing / Insulting / Humiliation, n the second category, the Syrian men have been swore and insulted because they flee the war and behind this allegation, it has been implied that Syrian men deserve the insults. In addition, within the Arabs and the Syrians, are liken to animals such as mice, dogs, pigs, it has been expressed that they are at a lower level than the group belonged and disgusting. Besides, it has been observed that the Syrians have been seen low due to physical appereances, skin colors, clothing styles and lifestyles.

In the category of Hostility / War Discourse, In the category of hostility, Hitler and Nazi Germany are taken as example in a rather surprising and widespread manner, implying that the applications made at that time are right, and

it is emphasized that the same must be applied to the Syrians. On the dictionaries, it is clearly stated that the Syrians should be killed, that they should be burnt, if not, they will bring big troubles, and that the only way to get rid of the Syrians is to apply physical violence to them. Besides this, it is seen that many lynch calls were made and those against the Syrians were invited to the streets.

In the last category, Usage of the Natural Identity Item as Hate and Humiliation Fact / Stigmatization, it is implied that it is sufficient for being inferior to be only "Arab" or "Syrian", Arab nation and culture are insulted only by the characteristics acquired at birth. It is not need to make any reasonable explanation to these insults except for "They are Arabs, anyway!" It has also been observed that much of examples given from the history, it is repeated that the Arabs have already betrayed the Turks, the two nations have been hostile for centuries, and the hate speech made have been tried to be legitimized and justified. Finally, the Syrians are despised simply because they speak Arabic, Arabic is unreasonably coexisted with the low-culture, Arabic's phonetics and alphabet are not liked.

Generally speaking, verbal violence is applied to different groups by combining under the name of Mesopotamian peoples, and hate speech is also produced on the Kurds along with the Syrians.

In the quantitative research conducted, it has been determined that on average 30% of the entrys, under the headings about the Syrians, include hate speech. This means that the remaining 70% of the entries contain neutral or positive expressions about the Syrians. As Kapanoğlu points out, the dictionaries are "micro cosmoses"; people from each political opinion and every thought meet in a common network.

In the dictionaries, it is observed that different opinions are collected under the same heading and information is formed in a cumulative and pluralistic manner. In this respect, it can be said that the dictionaries are democratic public spheres where different opinions can be represented and political discussions can

be held. Dictionaries are places where contradictory thoughts are also seen. As can be seen in the thesis topic example (even if it may be negative), the current government treats Syrian refugees as "our embracing brothers", perhaps signing politics that can be argued; In dictionaries, anti-governmental, or at least, anti-Syrian political thoughts can have a voice.

Dictionary authors are hiding behind a nickname, blatantly insulting, threatening deaths. I believe that many of them are more civilized with their real-life identity. Being human and living in a community requires some rules and acting respectfully. Worse aspects appear when the writers break out of human identity and become any person behind the computer. In addition, hate speech is increasing by the power of being majority-unity.

The limitations encountered during the research are as follows; The biggest limitation is to work bilingual. Analyzed texts were written in Turkish while the thesis was written in English, and meanwhile, meaning losses were experienced when the texts were translated from Turkish to English. The ideological sentiments hidden in the texts are usually done implicitly and idioms are used. Especially in Turkish there are many idioms which are insulting the Arabs, and these idioms are used quite normally in daily life. Of course, like all idioms, it is difficult to translate Turkish idioms into another language, and it is possible to translate the meaning of the idiom not itself. Also an expression that can be understood as neutral in one society can carry hate in another society. For example, there is a great difference between using the word "negro" in United States and using it in Turkey. Even in Turkey there is a chocolate chip cookie named "negro", which sometimes become an object of derision. On the other hand, the words "keko" and "kiro" which are Kurdish and mean siblings and boys are used to in Turkish humiliate people who have come from the countryside and have no manners. Again in Turkish, the word "tailed" is used to humiliate the Kurds, like animals with tails. 72 nations and a half used for defining Romany people, it refers whole world nations as 72 and half as Romany because they are no really a nation. "Armenian Offspring" or "Greek Spermo" used for non-

Armenians or Greeks as referring they are traitors. These do not have any equivalent meanings in other cultures.

Another limitation is that the implementation of the Critical Discourse Analysis method that it does not have strict rules, and there is no specific road map. Teun A. van Dijk gives a partial framework for analyzing news texts. News texts include many elements that can be evaluated such as title, subtitle, spot, visuals. Entries written in dictionaries are simply texts, and often contain short but concise definitions such as a classic dictionary.

Finally, another limitation is the people called "trolls". Internet trolls behave in some ways deliberately in order to irritate and annoy people. In these behaviors can be seen as sabotaging a web site's function, claiming untruth to just for mocking people, annoying people who trying to explain the truth by simply saying that they do not understand or misunderstand a thing by pretending to be naive, or constantly hassling for ridiculing people to each other, constantly being in an inappropriate criticism. There are also many trolls within the digital participatory dictionaries, and for this reason, sometimes it is not possible to distinguish whether the hate speech produced is the true opinion of the person or made just to annoy and react to others. In order to prevent this, 10 or more entries in the dictionaries have been selected as samples. It has been noticed that often very progressive and irrelevant titles have been opened by trolls. Other dictionary users did not consider what is written because they knew these trolls and did not enter into any discussion. But of course there can also be trolls in titles with more than 10 entries, and they can not be extracted from the entry crowd.

In conclusion, hate speech causes the exposed victims face social exclusion, psychological problems and trauma after their verbal violence, and to avoid being exposed again to such discourse, they try to become silent and invisible.

The Syrian Civil War, which started in 2011 and is still in progress, has caused millions of people to lose their lives or family members and become

injured, lose their home, work, status and accumulation, and also have to relocate. The Syrian refugees, whose number reached approximately 3 million, and perhaps much more off the record, had to migrate to Turkey. Refugees who emigrated to Turkey face economic problems such as poverty, exploitation of employers and landlords, inability to find jobs due to discrimination; physical problems like cannot reaching health services, again poverty, malnutrition; and social problems like language barrier, discrimination and racism. Ideologies are stereotypes / rules that we use to position ourselves in social life and to determine how to behave. The ideologies prevailing in the society are changing according to the societies and generally reflect the opinions of the groups who are dominant in the material resources of the society.

In the course of the formation of nation states in the 19th-20th century, nationalist ideologies came to the fore, nation who can establish nation-states at these times, also ruled the dominant ideology in that state. The "other" nations are regarded as enemies, excluded, despised by the ideology produced in order to facilitate the rule of nation states and to maintain the order of domination. The observed hate speech towards Syrian refugees throughout the study also derives its basis from nationalism.

Hate speech includes negative expressions, not because of individual qualities or individual behaviors but reasons suchs as race, religion, gender, class which the individual is belong or is thought to belong. As a carrier of messages, the mass media are used not only for spreading all kinds of discourse but also for hate speech to reach masses.

Along with the developments in computer and software technologies at the beginning of the 2000s, the internet has become a medium for mass communication and has become a network in which all participants can produce content. This has provided many positive contributions, such as alternative and critical information access, participating at content production by breaking of the power of knowledge and its hierarchy, allowing every user to participate in production, and citizen journalism; But at the same time it caused extremist and

racist messages to be produced and distributed, anonymity has increased the hate speech produced. At this point, it is necessary to avoid technological determinism, to think user-based before declaring technology or communication systems good or bad, and to realize that people use these networks in accordance with the profiles in their real lives.

In this study, hate speech in user-derived contents at digital participatory dictionaries in new media environments and discursive practices and processes in these contents are examined. At every new media environment (and, of course, in real life), as well as here, it can be found many different opinions, also people who produce hate speech.. Prior to the search, it was known that there will be negative discourses like swearing or humiliating, but it was not expected to faced with situations such as writers' statements like "Syrians should be killed" or taking Hitler as an example.

Hate speech is fed by stereotyped prejudices that are basically placed on the subconsciousness of the society. However, the increase in the dose of hate speech produced by the new media and especially in the digital participatory dictionaries that have been seen in the examples, caused by the partial anonymity and the Turkish Criminal Law that does not have a special regulation for the hate speech and the applicable law can not be applied properly. When it comes to hate speech, conflict arises between two human rights; The freedom of expression and the person or group exposed to hate speech are not subject to discrimination. At this point, it is necessary to find a solution in harmony with human rights and to resolve this conflict.³⁸¹

Humankind can exist within society; people can be open-minded as other people they communicate and interact with. It is not possible to think a person who has been raised with only one type of thought and never met an alternative thought and can be tolerant and open-minded. Yet, the main aim of ideologies is that people accept the dominant ideas with their own will and see these ideas as natural and necessary. It is inevitable for a people who is constantly surrounded

³⁸¹ Karan, *ibid.*

by racist, enthusiastic, or patriarchal thought to attempt hate speech or hate crime. At this point, thing that should be done is at individual level that individuals with awareness need to "call a spade a spade" and create a public opinion against hate speech and racism.

At the organizational level; "Since the most effective method in democracies is to decipher, the hate speech must be watched and recorded." ³⁸² People who consciously emit hate speech can assume that they can get away with the harm they cause or the whole society agrees with them. Deciphering these people and confronting them with their faults, defining them as "racist" in a report may reduce the hate speech produced.

"It is not possible for minority groups to struggle by themselves against hate speech and to resist it when it is thought that these groups are generally disadvantaged and their access to media organs is so limited as not to be compared with the majority groups." ³⁸³ At this point, the duty of protecting the rights of minority or majority people entrusted to the state. State with its legislative, executive and judicial organs should strengthen the laws against hate speech and crime, to punish criminals under the law, and to ensure that punishment is a deterrent for other people.

³⁸² İncoğlu, *ibid.*

³⁸³ Karan, *ibid.*

BIBLIOGRAPHY

6458 – Foreigners and International Protection Law (2013).

2014/6883 - Temporary Protection Regulation (2014).

6575 Regulation on the Work Permits of Foreigners Provision of Temporary Protection (2016).

Aday, S., H. Farrell, D. Freelon, M. Lynch, J. Sides, and M. Dewar. "Watching From Afar: Media Consumption Patterns Around the Arab Spring." *American Behavioral Scientist* 57.7 (2013): 899-919. <http://henryfarrell.net/wp/wp-content/uploads/2013/04/ABS4793731.pdf> 4.11.2014.

Akdeniz, Yaman. "İnternet'te Irkçılık." Ed.s Ayşe Çavdar and Aylin B. Yıldırım. *Nefret Suçları ve Nefret Söylemi*. İstanbul: Uluslararası Hrant Dink Vakfı Yayınları, 2010. 175-92. *Medyada Nefret Söyleminin İzlenmesi Projesi*. Hrant Dink Vakfı, 2010. <http://hrantdink.org/attachments/article/73/NefretSoylemiveNefretSuclari.pdf> 03.09.2016.

Aktaş, Aslı. "Türkiye'de Yaşayan Suriyeli Kadın Mülteciler: Kilis Örneği." Thesis. İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi, 2016. *Ulusal Tez Merkezi*. Ulusal Tez Merkezi, 2016. https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/TezGoster?key=cbOXH84ZayrLjc0tI-QXKj3N-eeZNI5U_LW6V6XhLmVx7DcAawi7wzWu0jn1mKwp 17.11.2016

Akyazı, Ayşenur. "Yeni İletişim Ortamı Olarak Dijital Katılımcı Sözlüklerde Nefret Söylemi." *Marmara İletişim Dergisi* 22 (2014): 183-93. *Academia.edu*. Academia.edu, 2014. https://www.academia.edu/21948095/Yeni_ileti%C5%9Fim_ortam%C4%B1_olar

[ak dijital kat%C4%B1l%C4%B1mc%C4%B1 s%C3%B6zl%C3%BCklerde nefret s%C3%B6ylemi AY%C5%9EENUR AKYAZI](#) 07.11.2016.

Akşit, Gökçesu, Mehmet Bozok, and Nihan Bozok. "Zorunlu Göç, Sorunlu Karşılamlar: Hisar Köyü, Nevşehir'deki Suriyeli Göçmenler Örneği." *TC. Maltepe Üniversitesi Fen-Edebiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 1.2 (2015): 92-116. *Maltepe Üniversitesi İnsan ve Toplum Bilimleri Fakültesi*. Maltepe Üniversitesi İnsan ve Toplum Bilimleri Fakültesi, 2015.

http://www.asosjournal.com/Makaleler/877582955_1131%20G%C3%B6k%C3%A7esu%20AK%C5%9E%C4%B0T.pdf 19.11.2016.

Alp, Hakan. "Medyada Nefret Söylemi ve Çingene Toplumuna Yönelik Ayrımcı Söylemin Suça Dönüşme Süreci." Thesis. İstanbul Üniversitesi, 2015. *Ulusal Tez Merkezi*. Ulusal Tez Merkezi, 2015.

https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/TezGoster?key=WY5CM7tPNE2z_YM6pBu0tzNOI-S_57YFWc1Ri6yKlbDH2OCNmYbE3KkalzlmzYUY 15.10.2016.

Althusser, Louis. *İdeoloji ve Devletin İdeolojik Aygıtları*. Trans. Alp Tümertekin. 4th Ed. İstanbul: İthaki Yayınları, 2010.

Armağan, Ahsen, and Şadiye Deniz. "Çocuk İstismarının Sosyal Paylaşım Platformlarında Temsil Biçimleri: Pozantı Cezaevinde Kalan Çocuklar Örneğinin Ekşi Sözlük'te Sunumu." *The Journal of Academic Social Science Studies* 5.7 (2012): 69-88.

http://www.jasstudies.com/Makaleler/1444904971_arma%C4%9Fanahsendeniz%C5%9Fadiye_69-88.pdf 24.12.2016.

Aslantürk, Gülten, and Hasan Turgut. "8284 Vakası: Ekşi Sözlük'te Cinsiyetçi Kamusalığın Yeniden Üretilmesi." *Ankara Üniversitesi İLEF Dergisi* 2.1 (2015): 45-76. http://ilef.ankara.edu.tr/wp-content/uploads/id_1_3_3.pdf 24.12.2016.

Ataman, Hakan. "Nefret Suçlarını Farklı Yaklaşımlar Çerçevesinden Ele Almak: Etik, Sosyo-Politik ve Bir İnsan Hakları Problemi Olarak Nefret Suçları." *Nefret Söylemi ve/veya Nefret Suçları*. Ed. Yasemin İnceoğlu. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2012. 47-80.

Aygül, Eser. "Yeni Medyada Nefret Söyleminin Üretimi: Bir Toplumsal Paylaşım Ağı Olarak Facebook Örneği." Thesis. Gazi Üniversitesi, 2012. *Ulusal Tez Merkezi*. 2012.

https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/TezGoster?key=vVNzTGHhHjH-u3WMToxQ-rRejRyHxAgeqkNdUCUAmxZ5aGMqIvyx_x3Hx3Gwnd-o
10.09.2016.

"Barınma Merkezlerinde Son Durum." *Afet ve Acil Durum Yönetimi Başkanlığı*. Afet ve Acil Durum Yönetimi Başkanlığı, 21.11.2016.
<https://www.afad.gov.tr/tr/2374/Barinma-Merkezlerinde-Son-Durum> 23.11.2016.

Bayram, Yavuz. "Bir Hak İhlali Olarak Ötekileştirme: Gazetelerin Üçüncü Sayfa Haberlerinde Suriyeli Sığınmacıların 'Öteki' Temsili." *Güvenlik Çalışmaları Dergisi* 17.3 (2015): 1-36. *Polis Akademisi*. 2015.
<https://www.pa.edu.tr/Project%5CFiles%5CStatic%5CEgitimBirimleri%5CGBE%5CGuvenlikCalismalariDergi%5C3%5C17-3.pdf> 22.11.2016.

Biner, Özge, and Cavidan Soykan. "Suriyeli Mültecilerin Perspektifinden Türkiye'de Yaşam." *Mülteci-Der*(2016): 1-24. *Mültecilerle Dayanışma Derneği*. Mültecilerle Dayanışma Derneği, Nisan 2016. <http://www.multeci.org.tr/>
20.11.2016.

Black, Ian. "Report on Syria conflict finds 11.5% of population killed or injured." *The Guardian*. 11.02.2016.
<https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/feb/11/report-on-syria-conflict-finds-115-of-population-killed-or-injured>. 05.11.2016.

Boréus, Kristina. " Söylemsel Ayrımcılık ve Dışavurumları." Trans. Emre Can Dağlıoğlu. *Nordicom Review*(2009): 2012.

<http://www.nefretsoylemi.org/detay.asp?id=50&bolum=makale> 17.07.2016.

Cinmen, Işıl. "Ekşisözlük'te neler oluyor?" *Habertürk Gazetesi*. 25.04.2015.

<http://www.haberturk.com/yasam/haber/1082647-eksisozlukte-neler-oluyor>.

24.12.2016.

Çayır, Kenan. "Gruplararası İlişkiler Bağlamında Ayrımcılık." *Ayrımcılık, Çok Boyutlu Yaklaşımlar*. Ed. Kenan Çayır and Müge Ayan Ceyhan. İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2012. 5-16.

Çelik, Abdurrahim, Mehmet Alkış, Sabri Sayan, and Yusuf Ekinci. "Gaziantep'te Suriyelilere Yönelik Saldırıları ve Toplumsal Nefretin Sebeplerinin Analizine Dair Rapor." *İnsan Hakları ve Mazlumlar İçin Dayanışma Derneği* (2014): 1-44. İnsan Hakları ve Mazlumlar İçin Dayanışma Derneği, Nov. 2015.

<http://gaziantep.mazlumder.org/fotograf/yayinresimleri/dokuman/Suriyeliler-1.pdf>

20.11.2016.

Çildan, Cihan, Mustafa Ertemiz, Evren Küçük, H. Kaan Timuçin, and Duygu Albayrak. "Sosyal Medyanın Politik Katılım ve Hareketlerdeki Rolü." 2011.

<http://ab.org.tr/ab12/bildiri/205.pdf> 22.11.2016.

Çoban, Barış. "Söylem, İdeoloji ve Eylem: İktidar ve Muhalefet Arasındaki Mücadeleyi Çözümleme Denemesi." *Söylem ve İdeoloji*. Ed. Barış Çoban and Zeynep Özarslan. 2nd Ed.. İstanbul: Su Yayınevi, 2015. 199-234.

Çomu, Tuğrul. "Video Paylaşım Ağlarında Nefret Söylemi: Youtube Örneği."

Thesis. Ankara Üniversitesi, 2012. *Ulusal Tez Merkezi*. Ulusal Tez Merkezi,

2012. https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/TezGoster?key=RYan9_S-

[Z7Eir3xdWGXBIMSMQ SNdyvuR7qfFEtQZATzhapUDVh5gRVq5kC hH4](http://www.sosyalarastirmalar.com/cilt9/sayi42_pdf/4sosyoloji_psikoloji_felsefe/denizcaglar_banuhulur_yusufekinci.pdf)

09.09.2016.

Deniz, A. Çağlar, A. Banu Hülür, and Yusuf Ekinici. "Göç, Strateji ve Taktik: Suriyeli Sığınmacıların Gündelik Hayat Deneyimleri." *Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi* 9.42 (2016): 1077-1089. *Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi*. Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi, Jan. 2016. http://www.sosyalarastirmalar.com/cilt9/sayi42_pdf/4sosyoloji_psikoloji_felsefe/denizcaglar_banuhulur_yusufekinci.pdf 19.11.2016.

Deniz, A. Çağlar, Yusuf Ekinici and A. Banu Hülür. "Suriyeli Sığınmacıların Karşılaştığı Sosyal Dışlanma Mekanizmaları." *Sosyal Bilimler Araştırma Dergisi* 24 (2016): 17-40. *Sosyal Bilimler Araştırma Dergisi*, Spring 2016. <http://docplayer.biz.tr/21920900-Suriyeli-siginmacilarin-karsilastigi-sosyal-dislanma-mekanizmalari.html> 20.11.2016.

Doğan, Elif Tuğba. "Ortadoğu'nun Yeni Yoksulları: Suriyeli Sığınmacılar." *Yüzüncüyıl Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi* (2016): 11-38. *Dergipark Akademik*. Dergipark Akademik, 2016. <http://dergipark.ulakbim.gov.tr/yyusbed/article/view/5000189596> 19.11.2016.

Doğan, Gürkan, and Bülent Durgun. "Arap Baharı ve Libya: Tarihsel Süreç ve Demokratikleşme Kavramı Çerçevesinde Bir Değerlendirme." *Süleyman Demirel Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi* 1.5 (2012): 61-91. *S.D.U. Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*. S.D.U. Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 2012. <http://sosyalbilimler.sdu.edu.tr/assets/uploads/sites/102/files/4-22042012.pdf> 22.11.2016.

Doğanay, Ülkü, and Hatice Çoban Keneş. "Yazılı Basında Suriyeli 'Mülteciler': Ayrımcı Söylemlerin Rasyonel ve Duygusal Gerekçelerinin İnşası." *Mülkiye*

Dergisi 40.1 (2016): 143-184. *Academia.edu*. 2016.

<http://mulkiyederigi.org/article/view/5000186481> 21.11.2016.

Doğu, Burak, Zehra Zıraman, and D. Emrah Zıraman. "Web Based Authorship in the Context of User Generated Content, An Analysis of a Turkish Web Site: Eksi Sozluk."

https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Burak_Dogu/publication/242100750_Web_Based_Authorship_in_the_Context_of_User_Generated_Content_An_Analysis_of_a_Turkish_Web_Site_Eksi_Sozluk/links/54b79da50cf2e68eb2803137.pdf?origin=publication_list 24.12.2016.

Eagleton, Terry. *İdeoloji*. Trans. Muttalip Özcan. 3rd Ed.. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2011.

"Ekşi Sözlük." *Wikipedi*. 27.11.2016.

https://tr.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ek%C5%9Fi_S%C3%B6zl%C3%BCk 25.12.2016

Ercan Bilgiç, Esra. "Media Theory II - Module II - Media and Social Change." İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi. 12.03.2013. Lecture

Erdoğan, M. Murat. "Türkiye'deki Suriyeliler: Toplumsal Kabul ve Uyum." *Hacettepe Üniversitesi Göç ve Siyaset Araştırmaları Merkezi* (2014): *Hacettepe Üniversitesi Göç ve Siyaset Araştırmaları Merkezi*. Hacettepe Üniversitesi, 2014.
<https://data.unhcr.org/syrianrefugees/download.php?id=8228> 21.11.2016.

Ergül, Hakan. *Televizyonda Haberin Magazinelleşmesi*. 2nd Ed. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2005.

Ersöz Karakulakoğlu, Selva. "Sosyal Medyanın Karanlık Yüzü" *The Turkish Online Journal of Design, Art and Communication* 2.4 (2012): 32-40. *İstanbul Kültür Üniversitesi - Açık Erişim*. İstanbul Kültür Üniversitesi, 2012.
<http://acikerisim.iku.edu.tr:8080/xmlui/handle/11413/1086> 06.11.2016.

Ertas, Alper. "Nefret Suçları ve Nefret Söyleminin Yazılı Basında Üretimi." Thesis. Selçuk Üniversitesi, 2014. *Ulusal Tez Merkezi*. 2014.
https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/TezGoster?key=48XPj7KKQhKUgntkUiKO3BL12b_m3_yQSs4WQ9stkdKx1JvE8853WHrMP9iOPjG 16.10.2016.

"Etkileşimli Tematik Sözlükler ve Sosyal Medya." *Türkiye Bilişim Derneği Bilişim Dergisi* 40.140 (2012): 16-60.
http://www.bilisimdergisi.org/s140/pages/s140_web.pdf 24.12.2016.

Fairclough, Norman. "Dil ve İdeoloji." Trans. Barış Çoban. *Söylem ve İdeoloji*. Ed. Barış Çoban and Zeynep Özarslan. 2nd Ed. İstanbul: Su Yayınevi, 2015. 121-136.

Fairclough, Norman. "Söylemin Diyalektiği." Trans. Barış Çoban. *Söylem ve İdeoloji*. Ed. Barış Çoban and Zeynep Özarslan. 2nd Ed. İstanbul: Su Yayınevi, 2015. 137-146.

Federman, Mark. "What is The Meaning of The Medium is The Message?" *The University of Toronto*. 23.07.2003.
http://individual.utoronto.ca/markfederman/article_mediumisthemessage.htm 31.05.2013.

Fuchs, Christian. "The Self-Organization of Virtual Communities." *Journal of New Communications Research* 1.1 (2006): 29-68.
<http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 08.11.2014.

Fuchs, Christian. "Transnational Space and the "Network Society"." *21st Century Society* 2.1 (2009): 49-78. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 06.11.2014.

Fuchs, Christian. "Alternative Media as Critical Media." *European Journal of Social Theory* 13.2 (2010): 173-92. 2010. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 18.12.2014.

Fuchs, Christian. "Theoretical foundations of defining the participatory, co-operative, sustainable information society." *Information, Communication, and Society* 13.1 (2010): 23-47. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 01.12.2014.

Fuchs, Christian. "Social networking sites and complex technology assessment." *International Journal of E-Politics* 1.3 (2010): 19-38. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 06.12.2014.

Fuchs, Christian. "Social software and web 2.0: their sociological foundations and implications. ." *Handbook of research on web 2.0, 3.0, and X.0: technologies, business, and social applications*. Ed. San Murugesan. Vol. 2. New York: IGI Global, 2010. 764-789. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 2014

Fuchs, Christian, and Marisol Sandoval. "Towards a critical theory of alternative media." *Telematics and Informatics* 27 (2010): 141-150. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/18.12.2014>.

Fuchs, Christian. "The Political Economy of WikiLeaks: Power 2.0? Surveillance 2.0? Criticism 2.0? Alternative Media 2.0?" *Global Media Journal* 5.1 (2011): 49-76. Christian Fuchs. 2011. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 28.11.2014.

Fuchs, Christian. "Cognitive Capitalism or Informational Capitalism? The Role of Class in The Information Economy." *Cognitive Capitalism, Education and Digital Labor*. Ed.s Michael Peters and Ergin Bulut. New York: Peter Lang, 2011. 75-119. 2011. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 01.12.2014.

Fuchs, Christian. "New Media, Web 2.0 and Surveillance." *Sociology Compass* 5.2 (2011): 134-147. Christian Fuchs. 2011. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 22.12.2014.

Fuchs, Christian. "New Media, Web 2.0 and Surveillance." *Sociology Compass* 5.2 (2011): 134-147. Christian Fuchs. 2011. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 22.12.2014.

Fuchs, Christian. "Social Media and The Public Sphere." *tripleC: Communication, Capitalism & Critique* 12.1 (2014): 57-101. 2014. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 31.12.2014.

Fuchs, Christian. "Sosyal Medya Nedir?" *Sosyal Medya - Eleştirel Bir Giriş*. 1st Ed.. Ankara: NotaBene Yayınları, 2016. 48-73.

Fuchs, Christian. "Sosyal Medya ve İletişim Gücü." *Sosyal Medya - Eleştirel Bir Giriş*. 1st Ed.. Ankara: NotaBene Yayınları, 2016. 99-125.

Fuchs, Christian. "Sosyal Medyaya Eleştirel Bir Giriş Nedir?" *Sosyal Medya - Eleştirel Bir Giriş*. 1st Ed.. Ankara: NotaBene Yayınları, 2016. 8-42.

Fuchs, Christian. "Twitter ve Demokrasi: Yeni Bir Kamusal Alan?" *Sosyal Medya - Eleştirel Bir Giriş*. 1st Ed.. Ankara: NotaBene Yayınları, 2016. 248-288.

Fuchs, Christian. "WikiLeaks: İktidarı Şeffaflaştırabilir Miyiz?" *Sosyal Medya - Eleştirel Bir Giriş*. Trans. Diyar Saraçoğlu and İlker Kalaycı. Ankara: NotaBene Yayınları, 2016. 326-345.

Fuchs, Christian. "Katılımcı Kültür Olarak Sosyal Medya." *Sosyal Medya - Eleştirel Bir Giriş*. Trans. Diyar Saraçoğlu and İlker Kalaycı. 1st Ed.. Ankara: NotaBene Yayınları, 2016. 76-96.

Gençer, Yeliz. "Sosyal Medya Ağların Örgütlenme: Dital Aktivizmin Toplumsal Dönüşüme Yansımaları." *E-journal of Intermedia* 2.2 (2015): 505-522.

<http://dergipark.ulakbim.gov.tr/intermedia/article/view/5000171193> 24.12.2016.

Geuss, Raymond. *Eleştirel Teori: Habermas ve Frankfurt Okulu*. Trans. Ferda Keskin. 2nd Ed. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2013.

Ginsburg, Faye D., Lila Abu-Lughod, and Brian Larkin. *Media Worlds: Anthropology on New Terrain*. Berkeley: Uni. of California Press, 2002. PDF.

Graham-Harrison, Emma. "Chemical Weapons Attacks in Syria May Normalise War Crimes, Experts Warn." *The Guardian*. The Guardian, 11.08.2016.

<https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/aug/11/syria-suspected-chlorine-gas-attack-in-aleppo-kills-woman-and-two-children> 23.11.2016.

Göker, Göksel, and Savaş Keskin. "Haber Medyası ve Mülteciler: Suriyeli Mültecilerin Türk Yazılı Basınındaki Temsili." *İletişim Kuram ve Araştırma Dergisi* 41 (2015): 229-56. *İletişim Kuram ve Araştırma Dergisi*. İletişim Kuram ve Araştırma Dergisi, 2015.

<http://iletisimdergisi.gazi.edu.tr/site/index.php/IKAD/article/view/204>.

21.11.2016.

Gökçan, Gül, Çiğdem Açıkyıldız, and Senar Ataman. "Mültecilik Hakkında - Göç ve Mültecilik." *Multeci.net*. Multeci.net,

http://multeci.net/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=58%3Agoc-ve-multecilik&catid=35%3Agoc-ve-multecilik&Itemid=14&lang=tr 23.11.2016.

"Göç İdaresi Genel Müdürlüğü." *Göç İdaresi Genel Müdürlüğü*. Göç İdaresi Genel Müdürlüğü, 03.11.2015. [http://www.goc.gov.tr/icerik6/genel-](http://www.goc.gov.tr/icerik6/genel-mudurluk)

[mudurluk](http://www.goc.gov.tr/icerik6/genel-mudurluk) 273 274 275 [icerik](http://www.goc.gov.tr/icerik6/genel-mudurluk) 23.11.2016.

Gürleyendağ, Gökhan. "Etkileşimli Tematik Sözlükler ve Sosyal Medya." *Türkiye Bilişim Derneği Bilişim Dergisi* 40.140 (2012): 45-53.

http://www.bilisimdergisi.org/s140/pages/s140_web.pdf 24.12.2016.

Güvenç-Salgırlı, Sanem. "Contemporary Sociological Thought." Marmara Üniversitesi, İstanbul. 2011. Lecture

Hardt, Michael, and Antonio Negri. *İmparatorluk*. Trans. Abdullah Yılmaz. 6th Ed.. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2008.

Hardt, Michael, and Antonio Negri. *Çokluk - İmparatorluk Çağında Savaş ve Demokrasi*. Trans. Barış Yıldırım. 2nd Ed. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2011.

Howard, Philip N., Aiden Duffy, Deen Freelon, Muzammil M. Hussain, Will Mari, and Marwa Mazaid. "Opening Closed Regimes: What Was the Role of Social Media During the Arab Spring?" *SSRN Electronic Journal* (2011): 1-30. Web. 07.04.2014. PDF.

İnceoğlu, Yasemin, Prof.Dr. "Medya'da Nefret Söylemi." *Medyada Nefret Söyleminin İzlenmesi Projesi*. Medyada Nefret Söyleminin İzlenmesi Çalışma Toplantısı. 2013. <http://www.nefretsoylemi.org/resimler/20091110728113056.pdf> 10.09.2016.

İnceoğlu, Yasemin. "Önsöz." *Nefret Söylemi ve/veya Nefret Suçları*. Ed. Yasemin İnceoğlu. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2012. 11-22.

İnceoğlu, Yasemin, and Ceren Sözeri. "Nefret Suçlarında Medyanın Sorumluluğu: "Ya sev ya terk et ya da..."." *Nefret Söylemi ve/veya Nefret Suçları*. Ed. Yasemin İnceoğlu. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2012. 23-37.

İşgücü İstatistikleri - Mart 2016. Report, Türkiye İstatistik Kurumu, 15.06.2016. <http://www.tuik.gov.tr/PreHaberBultenleri.do?id=21571> 06.11.2016

Jagland, Thorbjørn. *Cinsel yönelim veya cinsiyet kimliği temelli ayrımcılık ile mücadele*. İstanbul: Avrupa Konseyi Yayıncılık, 2014. *Açık Toplum Vakfı*. 2014. [https://aciktoplumvakfi.org.tr/Dosyalar/Yayinlar/DesteklenenYayinlar/lgbt_insan_haklari_raporu_kaosgl_2016_eylul\(1\).pdf](https://aciktoplumvakfi.org.tr/Dosyalar/Yayinlar/DesteklenenYayinlar/lgbt_insan_haklari_raporu_kaosgl_2016_eylul(1).pdf). 14.11.2016.

Jenkins, Henry. *Convergence Culture: Where Old and New Media Collide*. New York: New York U Press, 2006. PDF.

Kapanoğlu, Sedat. "Etkileşimli Tematik Sözlükler ve Sosyal Medya." *Türkiye Bilişim Derneği Bilişim Dergisi* 40.140 (2012): 29-35. http://www.bilisimdergisi.org/s140/pages/s140_web.pdf 24.12.2016.

Karaköse, Nayat. "Nefret Söylemi ve Medyadaki Yansımaları." Nefret Söylemi Çalışma Toplantısı. <https://nefretsoylemi.org/detay.asp?id=57&bolum=makale> 19.07.2016.

Karan, Ulaş. "Nefret İçerikli İfadeler, İfade Özgürlüğü ve Uluslararası Hukuk." *Nefret Söylemi ve/veya Nefret Suçları*. Ed. Yasemin İncoğlu. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2012. 81-101.

Karataş, Mustafa. "Türk Yazılı Basınında Suriyeli Sığınmacılar ile Halk Arasındaki İlişkinin İncelenmesi." *Göç Araştırmaları Dergisi* 1.2 (2015): 112-51. *Göç Araştırmaları Merkezi*. Göç Araştırmaları Merkezi, Dec. 2015. <http://www.gam.gov.tr/files/d5.pdf> 19.11.2016.

"Katılımcı Sözlük." *Vikipedi*. Vikipedi, 09.09.2016. https://tr.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kat%C4%B1l%C4%B1mc%C4%B1_s%C3%B6zl%C3%BCk 24.12.2016.

Kaya, Ayhan, and Aysu Kırarç, "İstanbul'daki Suriyeli Mültecilere İlişkin Zarar Görebilirlik Değerlendirme Raporu." *Hayata Destek Derneği* (2016): *İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi*. İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi, April 2016.

<http://openaccess.bilgi.edu.tr:8080/xmlui/bitstream/handle/11411/822/%C4%B0st%20anbul'daki%C3%BCltecilere%C5%9Fkin%C5%9Fzarar%C5%9Fde%C4%9Fferlendirme%C5%9Fraporu%C5%9F20Nisan%C5%9F202016.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y> 20.11.2016.

Kovucu, Mustafa. "Suriyeli Sığınmacıların Gaziantep Yerel Basınında Temsili." Thesis. Gaziantep Üniversitesi, 2016. *Ulusal Tez Merkezi*. Ulusal Tez Merkezi, 2016.

https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/TezGoster?key=Br_XTptK8CZ70f0JGX9xEk4Ik1xep3ShZLaLrSTOtsX7LwzG8tqz-Epto_Onk8E 19.11.2016.

Koç, Mustafa, İbrahim Görücü, and Nihat Akbıyık. "Suriyeli Sığınmacılar ve İstihdam Problemleri." *Birey ve Toplum Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi* 5.1 (2015): 63-96. *Birey ve Toplum Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*. Birey ve Toplum Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 2015.

<http://bireyvetoplumdergisi.com/article/viewFile/5000164605/5000148997> 20.11.2016.

Lüküslü, Demet. "Bilişim Teknolojileriyle Örgütlenen Gençlik Hareketleri ve Yeni Bir Siyaset Arayışı." *Katılımın "e-hali": Gençlerin Sanal Alemi*. Ed. Aslı Telli Aydemir. 2011. 48-68.

https://www.academia.edu/3506851/Bili%C5%9Fim_Teknolojileriyle_%C3%96rg%C3%BCtlenen_Gen%C3%A7lik_Hareketleri_ve_Yeni_Bir_Siyaset_Aray%C4%B1%C5%9F%C4%B1

Man, Fuat. "Modernlik ve Yabancılar: Bir 'Günah Keçisi' Kategorisi Olarak Emek Piyasasındaki Suriyeli Göçmenler Örneği" *VII. Sosyal İnsan Hakları Uluslararası Sempozyumu*(2015): 419-438. 2015.

<http://www.sosyalhaklar.net/2015/bildiriler/man.pdf> 21.11.2016.

McQuail, Denis, and Sven Windahl. *İletişim Modelleri -Kitle İletişim Çalışmalarında-*. Trans. Konca Yumlu. 3rd Ed.. İstanbul: İmge Kitabevi Yayınları, 2010.

"Mediterranean Migrant Arrivals Reach 345,440; Deaths at Sea: 4,655." *International Organization for Migration*. International Organization for Migration, 22.11.2016. <http://www.iom.int/news/mediterranean-migrant-arrivals-reach-345440-deaths-sea-4655> 23.11.2016.

"Metodoloji." *Medyada Nefret Söyleminin İzlenmesi Projesi*. Uluslararası Hrant Dink Vakfı, 2009. <http://www.nefretsoylemi.org/metodoloji.asp> 27.09.2016.

Morozov, Evgeny. *The Net Delusion: The Dark Side of Internet Freedom*. New York: Public Affairs, 2011. PDF.

"Mültecilerin Hukuki Statüsüne İlişkin Sözleşme." *Göç İdaresi Genel Müdürlüğü*. Göç İdaresi Genel Müdürlüğü, 03.12.2015. <http://www.goc.gov.tr/files/files/multec%C4%B1ler%C4%B1nhukuk%C4%B1statusun%C4%B1%C4%B1sk%C4%B1nsozlesme.pdf> 23.11.2016.

Sosyal Değişim Derneği. *Nefret Suçları ve Nefret Söylemi İzleme Rehberi*. İstanbul: Sosyal Değişim Derneği, 2012. http://aciktoplumvakfi.org.tr/pdf/nefret_suclari.pdf 2016

Negri, Antonio. "Siyasal Alanın Krizi." Trans. Özgür Gökmen. *Birikim* 122 (1999): 85-89. *Körotonomedyä*. <http://www.korotonomedyä.net/kor/index.php?id=7,31,0,0,1,0> 2011.

Oskay, Ünal, Prof.Dr. *Söylem ve İdeoloji*. 2nd Ed. İstanbul: Su Yayınevi, 2015.

Öztekin, Hülya. "Yeni Medyada Nefret Söylemi: Ekşi Sözlük Örneği." *Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi* 8.38 (2015): 925-36.

http://www.sosyalarastirmalar.com/cilt8/sayi38pdf/6iksisat_kamu_isletme/oztekin_hulya.pdf 24.12.2016.

"Propaganda, Extremism and Online Recruitment Tactics." *Anti-Defamation League*. 2015. <http://www.adl.org/education-outreach/anti-bias-education/c/propaganda-extremism-and.html?referrer=https://www.google.com.tr/#.WIPDZiOLQ1I> 06.11.2016.

Rothenbuhler, Eric W., and Mihai Coman, Ed.s *Media Anthropology*. SAGE Publishing, 2005. PDF.

Saka, Erkan. "Media Theory II - Module III - New Media and Convergence Culture." İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi. 12.04.2013. Lecture

Saka, Erkan. "Cyber Culture." İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi. 11.04.2013. Lecture

Sekman, Esra. "Nefret Söyleminin Ortaya Çıkmasında Medyanın Etkisi." <https://istanbul.academia.edu/EsraSekman> 26.11.2016.

Spitulnik, Debra. "Anthropology and Mass Media." *Annual Review of Anthropology* 22.1 (1993): 293-315. PDF.

"Suriye'nin Dini ve Etnik Haritası." *Al Jazeera*. Al Jazeera, 2011. <http://www.aljazeera.com.tr/haber/suriyenin-dini-ve-etnik-haritasi> 22.11.2016.

Swingewood, Alan. *Sosyolojik Düşüncenin Kısa Tarihi*. Trans. Osman Akınhay. 2nd Ed. Ankara: Bilim ve Sanat Yayınları, 1998.

"Syria Death Toll: UN Envoy Estimates 400,000 Killed." *Al Jazeera*. Al Jazeera, 23.04.2016. <http://www.aljazeera.com/news/2016/04/staffan-de-mistura-400000-killed-syria-civil-war-160423055735629.html> 23.11.2016.

"Syria Regional Refugee Response." *The UN Refugee Agency*. The UN Refugee Agency, 07.11.2016. <http://data.unhcr.org/syrianrefugees/regional.php> 23.11.2016.

"The Syrian Refugee Crisis and Its Repercussions for the EU." *Syrian Refugees EU*. Syrian Refugees EU, Sept. 2016. <http://syrianrefugees.eu/> 23.11.2016.

Toraman, İbrahim. "Arap Baharı ve Suriye." Thesis. Yalova Üniversitesi, 2015. *Ulusal Tez Merkezi*. Ulusal Tez Merkezi, 2015. https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/TezGoster?key=sY7m19PfcL6F1NUw-cr80ILPLHhGeFIbB_OnYn_q06pFf6eKT6yqxAYXDhi1-eLM 21.11.2016.

Tunç, Aslı. "Digital Activism - Week 2." İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi. 26.03.2014. Lecture

Tunç, Aslı. "Digital Activism - Week 8." İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi. 30.04.2014. Lecture

Türkiye'de Mültecilerin Kabul Koşulları, Hak ve Hizmetlere Erişimleri. İzmir: Egeus Matbaacılık, 2015. *Mültecilerle Dayanışma Derneği*. Mültecilerle Dayanışma Derneği, 2015. <http://multeci.info/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/Turkiye-de-Multecilerin-Kabul-Kosullari-Hak-ve-Hizmetlere-Erisimleri-Uydu-Kentler-Izleme-ve-Raporla.pdf> 23.11.2016.

Tüfekçi, Zeynep. "Not This One": Social Movements, the Attention Economy, and Microcelebrity Networked Activism." *American Behavioral Scientist* 57.7 (2013): 848-70. https://www.academia.edu/3136872/Not_This_One_Social_Movements_the_Attention_Economy_and_Microcelebrity_Networked_Activism 02.01.2015.

Türk, Gül Dilek, and Bahar Tugen. "Dijital Cemaatler ve Postmodern Kabile Örneği: İnci Sözlük." XIX. Türkiye'de İnternet Konferansı, Yaşar Üniversitesi, İzmir. 2014 <http://inet-tr.org.tr/inetconf19/bildiri/70.pdf> 24.12.2016.

"Türkiye'deki Suriyeli Mülteciler Sık Sorulan Sorular." *The UN Refugee Agency* (2015): *BMMYK Türkiye*. BMMYK Türkiye, 2015.
http://www.unhcr.org/turkey/uploads/root/s%C4%B1k_sorulan_sorular.pdf
22.11.2016.

"UNHCR'nin Tarihçesi." *BMMYK Türkiye*. BMMYK Türkiye,
<http://www.unhcr.org/turkey/home.php?page=53> 23.11.2016.

Uzman, Nasrullah, and Rasim Tösten. "Suriyeli Akademisyenlerin Bakış Açısından Türkiye-Suriye İlişkisi ve Sığınmacılar Meselesi." *Hacettepe Üniversitesi Türkiyat Araştırmaları Dergisi* 24 (2016): 251-72. *Hacettepe Üniversitesi Türkiyat Araştırmaları Dergisi*. Hacettepe Üniversitesi Türkiyat Araştırmaları Dergisi, 2016.
<http://hutad.hacettepe.edu.tr/index.php/hutad/article/download/488/787>
20.11.2016.

Uzunoğlu, Sarphan. "Bir Postmodern İntiharın Ardından Sözlük'te Kanaatlerin Oluşumu ve Grupların Biçimlenme Biçimleri." *E-journal of Intermedia* 2.3 (2015): 424-439.
<http://search.proquest.com/openview/53a10a905ab05043e4e8f0c212194fd2/1?pq-origsite=gscholar&cbl=2042737> 24.12.2016.

Uçkan, Özgür. "Sözlükler: Türkiye İnternet Kültürünün Vazgeçilmezi..." *Türkiye Bilişim Derneği Bilişim Dergisi* 40.140 (2012): 23-27.
http://www.bilisimdergisi.org/s140/pages/s140_web.pdf 24.12.2016.

Valtysson, Bjarki. "Facebook as a Digital Public Sphere: Processes of Colonization and Emancipation." *Triple C: Communication, Capitalism &*

Critique. Open Access Journal for a Global Sustainable Information Society 10.1 (2012): 77-91. <http://fuchs.uti.at/papers/social-theory/> 19.12.2014.

van Dijk, Jan. *The Network Society: Social Aspects of New Media*. London: Sage Publications, 1999. PDF.

van Dijk, Teun A. "Avrupa'da Çokkültürlü Bir Medya İzleme için Öneri." Trans. Özlem Dalkıran. *Electronic Journal of Communication* 5.2 (2009): 2012. <http://www.nefretsoylemi.org/detay.asp?id=22&bolum=makale> 17.07.2016.

van Dijk, Teun A. "Söylem ve İktidar." *Nefret Suçları ve Nefret Söylemi*. Ed. Ayşe Çavdar and Aylin B. Yıldırım. İstanbul: Uluslararası Hrant Dink Vakfı Yayınları, 2010. 9-45.

van Dijk, Teun A. "Söylem ve İdeoloji: Çokalanlı Bir Yaklaşım." *Söylem ve İdeoloji*. Ed. Barış Çoban and Zeynep Özarslan. 2nd Ed. İstanbul: Su Yayınevi, 2015. 15-97.

Vardal, Zeynep Burcu. "Nefret Söylemi ve Yeni Medya." *Maltepe Üniversitesi · İletişim Fakültesi Dergisi* 2.1 (2015): 132-57. <http://iletisimdergi.maltepe.edu.tr/article/viewFile/1099000026/1099000020> 02.12.2016.

Wallace, Ruth A., and Alison Wolf. "Çatışma Kuramı." *Çağdaş Sosyoloji Kuramları*. Trans. Leyla Elburuz and M. Rami Ayas. 3rd Ed. Ankara: Doğu Batı Yayınları, 2012. 107-221.

Webster, Frank. *Theories of The Information Society*. 3rd Ed. London and New York: Routledge, 2006. PDF.

Wilson, John. "Politik Söylem." Trans. Zeynep Özarslan. *Söylem ve İdeoloji*. Ed. Barış Çoban and Zeynep Özarslan. 2nd Ed. İstanbul: Su Yayınevi, 2015. 101-120.

Yaman, Ulvi. "Nefretin Adı Söylem." *BTnet.com.tr*. 2012.

[http://www.btnet.com.tr/konuk-yazarlar/nefretin-adi-soylem-\[konuk-yazar\]/1/13000](http://www.btnet.com.tr/konuk-yazarlar/nefretin-adi-soylem-[konuk-yazar]/1/13000) 25.07.2016.

Yazıcı, Nevin. "Suriye Siyasi Tarihi." *21. Yüzyıl Türkiye Enstitüsü*. 21. Yüzyıl Türkiye Enstitüsü, 29.05.2012.

http://www.21yyte.org/tr/arastirma/suriye/2012/05/29/6619/suriye-siyasi-tarihi#_ftn1 22.11.2016.

Yegen, Ceren. "Yazılı Basında HIV/AIDS ile Yaşayan Bireylere Yönelik Nefret Söylemi." Thesis. Gazi Üniversitesi, 2013. *Ulusal Tez Merkezi*. 2013.

<https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/TezGoster?key=iTkOhwevEenJZ3onUvs52us5qGH9kWJYbjRgQzIFn05uUrrHNhFFyKuZZujsX6bC> 15.11.2016.

Yeğenoğlu, Meyda. "Social and Cultural Theory - Michel Foucault." İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi. 31.10.2013. Lecture

Yıldız, Özkan. "Türkiye Kamplarında Suriyeli Sığınmacılar: Sorunlar, Beklentiler, Türkiye ve Gelecek Algısı." *Sosyoloji Araştırmaları Dergisi* 16.1 (2013): 140-71. *Dergipark Akademik*. Dergipark Akademik, 2013.

<http://dergipark.ulakbim.gov.tr/sosars/article/view/5000093014> 20.11.2016.

Yılmaz, Halim. *Türkiye'de Suriyeli Mülteciler - İstanbul Örneği*. Report, İnsan Hakları ve Mazlumlar İçin Dayanışma Derneği, 2013.

http://istanbul.mazlumder.org/webimage/suriyeli_multeciler_raporu_2013.pdf 06.11.2016.

Digital Participatory Dictionaries

<https://eksisozluk.com/entry/37216229>

<https://eksisozluk.com/entry/61600286>

<https://eksisozluk.com/entry/52319307>

<https://eksisozluk.com/entry/38256427>

<https://www.uludagsozluk.com/e/21148331/>

<https://www.uludagsozluk.com/e/27472757/>

<http://www.uludagsozluk.com/e/31780552/>

<https://www.uludagsozluk.com/e/33165414/>

<https://tr.instela.com/suriyeli-multeciler---10310507>

<https://tr.instela.com/giderek-artan-suriyeli-nefreti---15953330>

<https://tr.instela.com/suriyeli-dilenciler---12155011>

<https://tr.instela.com/arapca-tabela-isteyen-suriyeli---15444054>