

ISTANBUL BİLGİ UNIVERSITY
INSTITUTE OF GRADUATE PROGRAMS
CLINICAL PSYCHOLOGY MASTER'S DEGREE PROGRAM

THE PHENOMENOLOGY OF INTERGENERATIONAL TRANSMISSION OF
FATHERHOOD IN TWO GENERATIONS OF MIGRATED ALEVI FATHERS
IN TURKEY

Utku ÇETİN

119647010

Asst. Prof. Yudum SÖYLEMEZ

İSTANBUL

2022

The Phenomenology of Intergenerational Transmission of Fatherhood in Two
Generations of Migrated Alevi Fathers in Turkey

Türkiye'de Göç Eden İki Kuşak Alevi Babalarda Babalığın Nesillerarası Aktarım
Fenomenolojisi

Utku ÇETİN

119647010

Tez Danışmanı: Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Yudum Söylemez
İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi

Jüri Üyeleri: Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Anıl Özge Üstünel Balcı
İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi

Doç. Dr. Gizem Erdem
Koç Üniversitesi

Date of Thesis Approval: 24.06.2022

Total Number of Pages: 145

Anahtar Kelimeler (Türkçe)

Keywords (English)

1) Alevi Kültürü

1) Alevism Culture

2) Babalık

2) Fatherhood

3) Göç ve Kültürleşme

3) Migration and Acculturation

4) Kuşaklararası Aktarım

4) Intergenerational transmission

5) Yorumlayıcı Fenomenolojik
Analiz

5) Interpretive Phenomenological
Analysis

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to express my gratitude to my thesis advisor and supervisor Asst. Prof. Dr. Yudum Söylemez for the endless support and guidance she has given not only during this thesis process, but also during this three-year time frame, at many moments when I have had my ups and downs. Her attitude was always supportive even when we had different points of view. In this three-year journey, she has had a great impact on my therapist skills and personal development.

I started my first systematic studies on this thesis topic in advance research methods course. I would like to thank Asst. Prof. Anıl Özge Üstünel Balcı for your feedback at that time and for accepting to be one of my thesis jury members. Also, I want to thank Assoc. Prof. Gizem Erdem for quick answer which included accepting to be one of my thesis jury members. This was so meaningful to me.

I would like to express my gratitude to all my teachers who have added lots of knowledges and life experiences to me from the beginning of my undergraduate life until now, and who I have seen and not seen at the moment, but whose I have always felt their support by my side especially Dr. Zübeyit Gün, Dr. Ferhat Jak İçöz and Dr. Yudith Namer. When she found out that I was accepted to this program, she said that one of my missing parts was completed. Now, one of my missing parts is being completed by thanking her for all of her supports and believing to me.

My dear family, no matter how much I thank you, it is not enough. Until now, you have always supported me to follow my dreams and you have done your best for me. You have taught me not to despair and to struggle in my difficult times. If without you, I wouldn't be where I am now.

In addition, I would like to express my special thanks to Murat Koğu, Baran Küçük Koğu, Bahar Küçük and Elif Öz for the huge support that they have given me throughout my research.

I also want to thank my term friends. We have been separated for the last two years due to the pandemic and I have returned to Izmir. Despite this, I have

always felt your presence and support. This journey has been meaningful for me with you. I would especially like to thank Idil Biriken Gürses for being my companion on this journey and for being with me in many difficulties. I especially want to thank Eda Gayretli. Her support on this journey has always given me strength and hope.

And, Bilgi Clinic Family... In this journey, which started with my admission to this program three years ago, I have learned a lot from you. I have dared to look at my own life again and I have changed a lot. I am grateful for everything you have added to me. I would also like to thank Esra Akça and Sinem Kılıç. Your support has been very valuable to me since the beginning of this three years journey. I felt like I was in my second home thanks to you!

Lastly, I would like to thank all the participants who participated in the research for allowing me to listen to their experiences and giving me the opportunity to change and transform with this study by agreeing to participate in this research.

This thesis is dedicated to the people who are doing fathering whatever and whoever.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	ii
LIST OF TABLE	vii
ABSTRACT	viii
ÖZET	ix
INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER I	4
LITERATURE REVIEW ARTICLE	4
1.1. DEFINITIONS OF ALEVISM AND ALEVI CULTURE	4
1.2. CONCEPTS OF FATHERHOOD	8
1.2.1. Fatherhood and Gender Roles	8
1.2.2. Fatherhood in Minorities	11
1.2.3. Fatherhood in Turkey	13
1.3. MIGRATION	16
1.3.1. Migration and Mental Health	16
1.3.2. Migration and Acculturation Process	21
1.3.3. Migration and Family Dynamics	24
1.4. ALEVI MIGRATION IN THE TURKEY CONTEXT	28
1.5. CONCLUSION & SUMMARY	29
1.6. REFERENCES	31
CHAPTER II	41
RESEARCH ARTICLE	41
2.1. INTERGENERATIONAL TRANSMISSION OF FATHERHOOD VIEW OF BOWEN FAMILY SYSTEMS THEORY	41
2.2. THE PRESENT STUDY	45

2.3. THE PRIMARY INVESTIGATOR (PI)	47
2.4. METHOD	50
2.4.1. Participants	50
2.4.2. Settings and Procedure	55
2.4.3. Data Analysis	56
2.4.4 Trustworthiness	57
2.5 RESULTS	58
2.5.1. Difficulties of Being an Alevi Man	58
2.5.1.1. Past Difficulties	59
2.5.1.2. Coercivity of Exclusionary Behaviors	60
2.5.1.3. What am I doing here?	62
2.5.2. Being Alevi Father in Turkey	64
2.5.2.1. Defining Alevism as Honesty	65
2.5.2.2. Alevism as Tolerance	66
2.5.2.3. Concealment of Alevism Identity	68
2.5.2.4. Being Able to Live Alevism Over Time	70
2.5.2.5. İzmir as a Democratic City	72
2.5.3. Walking Through New Fatherhood	75
2.5.3.1. Difficulties After Migration	76
2.5.3.2. The Increasing Responsibilities of Fatherhood with Lots of Thoughts	79
2.5.3.3. Being a Father Twice	83
2.5.3.4. Look at This! I Have Grown This Tree, and How Beautiful It is!	84
2.5.3.5. We Hugged Each Other More	85

2.5.4. Fatherhood Transitions from 1 st To 2 nd Generations in The Passing Times	87
2.5.4.1. From Being Unable to Conflict with The Upper Generation to Experiencing Conflict	88
2.5.4.2. Still Protection but More Freedom.....	91
2.5.4.3. Being Able to Live Fatherhood with Their Children.....	95
2.5.4.4. I am Missing My Hometown!.....	97
2.5.4.5. The Desire to Keep Alevism Alive	100
2.6. DISCUSSION	103
2.7. CLINICAL IMPLICATIONS	118
2.8. LIMITATIONS AND FURTHER RESEARCH.....	121
2.9. REFERENCES.....	124
CHAPTER III	130
DISCUSSION	130
APPENDICES	132
APPENDIX A. INTERVIEW QUESTIONS.....	132
APPENDIX B. INFORMED CONSENT FORM.....	136
APPENDIX C. ADDENDIUM FORM.....	138
APPENDIX D. DEMOGRAPHIC FORM.....	139
APPENDIX E. ANNOUNCEMENT TEXT	141
APPENDIX F. MEMBER CHECKING CONTENT	142
APPENDIX G. ETHICS BOARD APPROVAL	145

LIST OF TABLE

Table 1 Demographic Characteristics of Participants.....	54
Table 2 Summary of First Theme.....	58
Table 3 Summary of Second Theme	64
Table 4 Summary of Third Theme	75
Table 5 Summary of Fourth Theme	87

ABSTRACT

This study includes two articles. The beginning article introduces is a literature review written to explain of Alevism culture, the phenomenon of fatherhood and migration. For this objective, the article includes (a) the definition of Alevism and Alevism culture, (b) fatherhood and gender roles, (c) fatherhood in minorities, (d) being a father in Turkey, (e) migration and mental health, (f) migration and acculturation process, and (g) migration and family dynamics. The second part was named research article which is the literature conducting qualitative study aim to understand the intergenerational transmission of fatherhood via essential viewpoint of Bowen's Family Systems Theory and participants' experiences via literature review article. As a result of the Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis conducted after the semi structured interviews with five first-generation and five second-generation Alevi fathers, 4 main themes were emerged: (a) difficulties of being an Alevi man, (b) being Alevi father in Turkey, (c) walking through new fatherhood and (d) fatherhood transitions from 1st to 2nd generations in the passing times. The results obtained were discussed in the presented literature, recommendations were made not only for clinicians, but also for researchers who are working in the field.

Keywords: Alevism culture, fatherhood, migration and acculturation, intergenerational transmission, Interpretive Phenomenological Analysis

ÖZET

Bu çalışma iki makale içermektedir. Sunulan başlangıç makalesi Alevilik kültürü, babalık olgusu ve göç olgusunu açıklamak amacıyla yazılmış bir literatür taramasıdır. Bu amaçla bu bölüm, (a) Alevilik ve Alevilik kültürünün tanımı, (b) babalık ve cinsiyet rolleri, (c) azınlık baba olmak, (d) Türkiye’de baba olmak, (e) göç ve ruh sağlığı (f) göç ve kültürleşme ve (g) göç ve aile dinamikleri başlıklarını içermektedir. Araştırma makalesi olarak isimlendirilen ikinci kısım, literatürden yola çıkarak oluşturulan nitel çalışma ekseninde göç eden Alevi babalarda babalığın nesiller arası aktarımını Nesiller Arası Aile Terapisinin temel kavramları ve literatür taraması makalesi aracılığıyla anlamayı amaçlamaktadır. Beş birinci kuşak ve beş ikinci kuşak Alevi baba ile yapılan yarı yapılandırılmış görüşmeler ardından yapılan Yorumlayıcı Fenomenolojik Analiz sonucunda 4 ana tema ortaya çıkmıştır: (a) Alevi erkek olmanın zorluğu, (b) Türkiye’de Alevi baba olmak, (c) yeni bir babalığa doğru yürüyüş ve (d) birinci kuşak babalardan ikinci kuşak babalara babalığın geçen zamanla aktarımı. Oluşan sonuçlar sunulan literatür ekseninde tartışılmış, sadece klinisyenler için değil aynı zamanda alanda çalışan araştırmacılar için de önerilerde bulunulmuştur.

Anahtar kelimeler: Alevilik kültürü, babalık, göç ve kültürleşme, kuşaklararası aktarım, Yorumlayıcı Fenomenolojik Analiz

INTRODUCTION

According to Gölpınarlı (1977, p.19), Alevism, which means belonging to Ali, means both descendants of Ali and is used in the sense of being a supporter of Ali and following his path. Alevism in Arabic and Persian; is used to mean the descendants of Ali and being pro-Ali. In Ottoman Turkish, Alevism means someone who is affiliated with Ali and means Qizilbash. (Savaşçı, 2004, p.19) According to Melikoff (1994, p. 33), the historical name of Alevi is Qizilbash. Qizilbashes are Turkmen tribes who support Shah Ismail. After the Celali Revolts, the word Alevi started to be used instead of Qizilbash. Due to the derogatory/derogatory meanings attributed to the concept of Qizilbash, which was used to mean 'religious, rebellious'.

Fatherhood should be understood like an establishment that has historically been built as a formation of male power. Fathers and paternity are social structures and institutions, not “natural” or biological. (O’Brien, 1981, p.57)

Research shows that two fatherhood models are predominate. The first of them describes men who are engaged in the care of their children. Although this rate is small, it is increasing more and more. In the second fatherhood model, it is a type of fatherhood that does not participate even at a minimum level in the care of children and does not bond with its children (Hobson, 2004, p.245).

Hofferth (2003) stated that the paternal behavior of fathers who are ethnically minority is influenced by aspects like economic status, geographical characteristics of the place where they live, cultural attitudes and beliefs. When the characteristics of nonresident fathers were analyzed, it was noted that the most influential factors in explaining racial or ethnic differences were income and education (King, Harris, & Heard, 2004).

One aspect of prejudice is the use of labeling against the minority group to legitimize discrimination against the minority group like a whole. “Different” becomes “mad” (Szasz, 1997, p. 21). A similar process in which cultural difference was pathologized by the dominant white middle-class group was also experienced

from the point of view of blacks and other racial/ethnic minorities (Hogg & Vaughan, 2014, p. 376).

People have moved from one place to another for many voluntary or involuntary reasons and during various time periods in human history from the moment human existence began to this time. One of the two important goals of this movement was discovery, and the other was survival. Researchers and clinicians, and reactions to explorers and traders began to wander the world have examined the impact of immigration since noticed, although sober consideration of the impact of globalization on social and economic factors of migration on individuals in a manner only recently closely examined in the evaluation. (Bhugra & Ghupta, 2011, p.1)

The acculturation model established by Berry (1997) is the most accepted today. According to this model, acculturation consists of two independent dimensions. These dimensions are cultural adaptation that means adaptation of majority culture and cultural maintenance that means protecting own minority culture where migrants come from. Berry has determined four types of cultivation strategies according to the position of the immigrant in these two dimensions. These strategies are integration, assimilation, separation, and marginalization.

Intergenerational transmission includes the transferring of values, roles, aspirations, practices, parent-child relationships, social learning models, , material resources and services, feelings and thoughts (Brannen, 2011).

Good and cultural transmission have been also created family identities, reproduces and transmits these identities through generations. Nevertheless, as family members try to separate themselves from each other, the identities with which they identify also change throughout life and across generations. Each generation repeatedly changes what has been transferred to it. (Bertaux & Wiame, 1997, p. 63 -97, as cited in Brannen, 2011).

The current study seeks to examine how different generations participate in fatherhood and the experience of fatherhood; how migration affects fatherhood; and the processes by which fatherhood is transmitted in Alevi fathers in who migrated to Izmir from different cities in Turkey. Two generational chains of men will be

selected from Turkey; five chains of first generation (migrant) fathers and five chains of second-generation fathers who will be the son of first-generation fathers. In this objective, the first part is a literature review, which first collects studies focused on the definition of Alevism and Alevism culture, the concepts of fatherhood and the individual, familial and cultural effects of migration with deeper and better understanding. Then, a brief history of the Turkish Alevi migration is given to understand the context in which these concepts were passed on. The article was ended with a brief summary of the literature and a discussion of the relationship of defined concepts to each other.

The second part which was named research article reaches the literature conducting a qualitative study willing to understand deeper and better for the intergenerational transmission of fatherhood and how participants' experiences can be associated with the essential viewpoint of Bowen's Family Systems Theory. In this respect, Bowen's Family Systems Model and three fundamental terms that are -differentiation of self, triangulation and multigenerational transmission process are applied for better and deeper understanding of Intergenerational Transmission of Fatherhood. One-on-one and semi-structured interviews conducted with five chains of first generation (migrant) fathers and five chains of second-generation fathers who will be the son of first-generation fathers for finding answers these 3 research questions: (a) "How do individuals experience being an Alevi father in Turkey?", (b) "How did migration experiences affect their fatherhood styles?", (c) How are these fatherhood experiences similar and different from the first and second generations of Migrated Alevi fathers?

CHAPTER I

LITERATURE REVIEW ARTICLE

1.1. DEFINITIONS OF ALEVISM AND ALEVI CULTURE

Alevism is defined as following Ali's path, connecting to Ali in the shortest and simplest sense. Later, it acquires the quality of a belief movement. It is understood as a special concept that expresses the views of a particular community. It is understood as a special concept that expresses the views of a certain community. Nowadays, Alevism is more of a rule of life, a way of life, than a belief, which should be understood when it is called. Independent thinking and free behavior are very important in the Alevism faith (Bozkurt, 2004, p. 1-2).

There are three basic dimensions of Alevism. Firstly, it has spread over a wide area, secondly, it has been formed over a long historical process, and thirdly, it has received some elements from the cultures of the societies living in the regions where it has spread. Although, Alevism came out as a faith based on the devotion of Ali and Ehli Beyt, its transformation into its current form has been due to the influence of Turkish culture and Shamanism in Central Asia (Öz, 2002, p. 73).

One of the most important stages in the construction of modern Anatolian Alevi memory has been to define Alevi communities as a “mourning society”. It will be difficult to say that the Alevis who managed to find a place for themselves at multiple stages of mourning have completed their mourning work. As with many groups defined as “other”, Alevis are also mourning his work has not been completed and mourning has been perpetuated. Grief has become a collective emotion that repeats itself and is perpetuated while mourning has become continuous. Especially close to Turkey the massacres, which are part of many otherization events that have taken place in its history, have created a structure that feeds on the grief and sadness of modern Alevi memory, while today in the halls of

Cem, Karbala his narrative is as upright as if it had happened yesterday. The distant past and the recent past are now identical to each other (Yalçın, 2021).

The well-known Alevism understanding of mourning establishes its memory within the framework of a certain skeleton. In this memory, the recent and distant past are not separated from each other. These tragic processes have somehow become intertwined and silicified, and each individual memory has been re-formed by integrating with the practices of collective remembering. Every pain recreates itself (Yalçın, 2021).

Alevism has also developed the rules of morality expressed in the commandment attributed to Hacı Bektaş Veli: “*Be master of your hand, your loins, and your tongue.*” (Kehl-Bodrogi, 2012, p. 137). Although the explanations related to these words are different, the most common one is the following: “Don't take things that don't belong to you, don't lie and don't commit adultery!”. This saying is widely used in Sufism and is called decency. The difference between Alevis is that they place this word at the center of their religious beliefs (Shankland, 2003, p. 27).

Ideally, the Alevi tradition is surrounded by norms that are considered sacred, and in parallel, those who carry the tradition have ceremonies that they respectfully adhere to. The most important religious worship for Alevis is the *Cem* ritual, where men and women worship together. Worship is not the only function of the *Cem* ritual: the main ritual of the *Cem* ritual is the worship that symbolizes the martyrdom of Hussein in Karbala, but like the philosophy of decorum, it is based on the key themes of the Alevi doctrine conversations and music are also included in the ceremony. Prayers in the communities are largely in Turkish (Shankland 2003, p. 27).

In Sunni Islam, a person who prays is called an imam, while Jam ceremonies are organized by a *dede* (grandfather) in Alevism, that is, a *dede* is the spiritual leader of worship in Alevism. The *Dedelik* foundation is often expressed as a guide for the Alevi community, a light for difficult times, a source of inspiration, and is one of the most important cornerstones in the development of oral traditions in the Alevi community. (Akbulut & Usal, 2008, p. 435).

There is an idiom in Alevilik: “yol bir sürekin binbir.” The *yol* (path) means to reaching God through a journey where you are not interested in the outside world and cut off your relationship with it, turn inside yourself and stay alone with yourself. The *sürekin* refers actions that are performed differently from each other along the *yol*. So, *Yol bir sürekin binbir* refers that although the path to be reached by the Alevis is one, it means that there are many different paths that can be followed. It is believed that becoming *insan-ı kamil* (perfect human being) at the end of the *yol* (Yıldırım, 2018).

In addition, one of the principles of Alevism emphasized in the literature is 'takiye', which means practicing of differentiating the beliefs of Shia. *Takiye* is part of the core of the Alevi faith and is often referred to as a 'eline, beline, diline sahip ol' (be the master of your hand, waist and tongue) (Yıldırım, 2018). Alevis often hide their identity, thereby preventing their neighbors and other people from engaging in hostile behavior towards them in a Sunni environment. It is called *takiye* principle (Bodrogi, 2012, p. 186).

International events of the Cold War period and the sociological and economic changes experienced after the movement from the countryside to the cities in the 1970s have also greatly influenced the political atmosphere of Turkey. A number of social problems have arisen over the years due to the events between Alevis who are defined as leftists and Sunnis who are considered right-wing. At that time, there were violent incidents in mostly cities where Alevi populations lived mostly such as Kahramanmaraş, Bingöl, Malatya, Çorum and Sivas (Yıldırım, 2018). In this context, the concealment of Alevi identity is also quite understandable.

Negative approaches to what are different have been observed in almost every society in history. This is usually related to the instrumental nature of othering. Because exclusion and discrimination responses serve the interests of groups. Because the excluded are bad, dangerous, or risky, the party gets the opportunity to deprive the excluded group of resources and legitimize it. Moreover, each exclusion serves the feeling that the belonging group is purified and the sense of security of its members. As a matter of fact, today, by creating common enemies,

the path of establishing a social bond is being taken; an internal group, that is, an external group that will function as our negative guarantee for creating us, that is, they are being created. This design the construction of one opposite is, in short, the invention of the other (Arar & Bilgin, 2010, p. 4).

In this context, it is also essential to assume the dynamics of Alevi families. In the Alevi society, the family institution is much more effective in terms of applying the principles of Alevism's beliefs in society and transferring them to individuals than other institutions (Yaman, 2001, p. 68).

Entering into a marital relationship and starting a family is considered one of the most basic conditions for participation in the Alevi society at the official level. The main reason why the marital relationship is so important in this society is not entirely due to the marriage itself, but to some other circumstances connected with the marriage. As long as a person remains single, he will not be able to fulfill any conditions necessary to become an official member of the society. A person will also not be able to take part in a *müşahip* relationship unless he is married. This means that the single person will be deprived of the path to the truth of Alevism (Yalçınkaya, 1996, p. 60).

The Alevis also operated the institution of marriage within themselves, and thus a forced state of social commitment emerged. As a result of this, only those who were born from Alevi parents were considered Alevi. Since the continuation of the Alevi family continued only depending on the lineage, marriages continued within themselves (Subaşı, 2003, p. 192).

In Alevi communities, there is a lot of emphasis on protecting the family. In order to protect the family, the indulgence institution is operated. Thus, it is aimed to prevent incidents that are contrary to the current structure of the family institution in society. It has been decided to exclude those who have committed such illegal acts. However, it is no longer traditionalism that has been effective in marriages, but new perspectives that institutions and organizations in cosmopolitan urban environments have been effective in. The Alevis point out that Alevi-Sunni marriages cause these situations to happen (Yaman, 2011, p. 269-272).

1.2. CONCEPTS OF FATHERHOOD

1.2.1. Fatherhood and Gender Roles

According to Kessler and McKenna (1985), the term "gender" has traditionally been used to describe and explain the psychological, social and cultural aspects of masculinity and femininity. Because the term gender contains these aspects as well as biological concepts.

Critical study of West and Zimmerman's (1987) on the concept of "doing gender" tells about the construction of gender as a result of the repetition of interaction in society at certain periods. The formation of gender is learned at an early age, and those who work in this field benefit from the concept of responsibility, which means that all social activities are subjective, that is, based on interpretation. All social entities, people and institutions are aware of this when interacting socially.

Gendered behaviors are learned through repeated social interactions. Everyone must "do gender" in order to be classified as a man or a woman and be considered members of society. To engage in sex with others, to do it in such a way that people perceive their actions as an expression of an underlying masculine or feminine ". On the basis of appearance and behavior in everyday social interaction, it is automatically classified as a man, or a woman based on gender (Coltrane, 1996, p.50).

Butler (1990) claimed that performative conceptualization of gender. This means that both gender roles, whether female or male, have certain roles that are determined by society and are expected to be followed by it. The effort given to realize these roles also forms the performance-based side of gender roles. Paechter (2003, 2006) proposed that the further development and application in studies of the concept of gender analysis, which defines masculinity and femininity as "practices of communities".

Carrigan, Connell and Lee (1985) claimed that in a time of chasing expansion of the information contained in the publication on various parts of masculinity, he highlighted the possibility of a rather unusual and new definition of

masculinity, which will focus on three basic assumptions. First thing first, the problems posed by sexual power should be taken much more seriously than observed within the gender categories (particular, with reference to relations between heterosexual and homosexual men). In addition, it was emphasized that masculinity is associated with other currents in feminism, as in the analysis, the division of labor and studies on the interaction of gender with different demographic classes. Thus, an assessment of the concept of "gender role" is highlighted.

Demetriou (2001) suggested that via Connell's theorization which questions patriarchal power and strongly emphasizes the possibility of social change by shaking up this power, creates a very important starting point for criticizing the concept of hegemonic masculinity. We can also think of fatherhood from this point of view. Perception as a patriarchal power, it may be possible to form a new concept of fatherhood by critiquing the representation of the main fatherhood definitions.

A practical distinction between "fathers", "fatherhood" and "fathering" has been proposed in some recent contributions. "Father" means to the relation between an actual boy and a actual man, and the term's process of attachment to an actual individual that might be both biological or social; "fatherhood" is general meaning related with being a father and cultural codification of men as fathers, which includes rights, duties, responsibilities and statuses along with declamation about good or bad fathers; "fathering" refers to actual "parenting" practices that can occur even when the child is not in their direct presence, such as when asking for parental consent or caring for a child (Dermott, 2008; Hobson, 2002, p.17).

A prelude to the study of fatherhood and masculinity can be considered in the following sentences:

"whilst so much around women's lives and motherhood is simplistically assumed, taken for granted and unquestioned, the relationship between men and fatherhood is seen as more problematic: requiring definition, 'claims' and other interventions in order to shape its visibility (or deny it), its dimensions and direction. The parameters of fatherhood are, then, less clearly drawn when set beside those which powerfully and morally

encompass motherhood. But both are shaped by the ‘choices and constraints in which gendered lives are lived and which converge on the domains of the home and paid work’ (Miller, 2011, p.7).

The emergence of research on fatherhood as a social phenomenon followed the rise of as though “new” fathers in the Western world, discourses that are more “involved” intending to participate in the life practices of his children (Dermott, 2008; Miller, 2011).

Family structures underwent significant changes during the 20th century, and it was on this ground that the transformations of fatherhood have taken place (Chambers, 2012, p.41). Different points of view have been suggested to study these transformations. The most influential among them has been individualization theory (Beck-Gernsheim, 2002, p.8). This led to the fact that Giddens conceptualized the “democratization of family ties” and “pure relationship” (Giddens, 1992, p.49).

Dermott (2008, p.127) stated some parts of intimacy and fatherhood found proximity as a “matter of emotional communication with others and with the self, in the context of interpersonal equality”, based on concept of Giddens’s “pure relationship” and the democratization of intimate interactions”.

Henwood and Procter (2003) explored the transition to fatherhood for the first time, the father of the “new” model of fatherhood that showed the possibility of becoming involved in family life rather than to leave. However, becoming as “equality and decision-making called” wanting to do more than helping the mother and childcare was reported for dads who want full participation in some areas of tension.

Thus, Aina and Cameron (2017) claimed that fathers and mothers are not the single actors determining gender in a family: children are primarily socialized according to gender in the family, and their attitude, feelings and behavior are largely assessed according to gender rules. This shows that gender roles are transferred between generations along with parenting at the same time.

In this part of the literature, paternity is discussed within the framework of gender roles and the practices of these roles. In the next part of the literature, the

concept of being a minority father will be examined. Because Alevism represents a minority group in Turkey. For this, it is quite important to explore the dynamics of minority fatherhood.

1.2.2. Fatherhood in Minorities

Hofferth (2003) examined that the effect of economic factors, neighborhood context and cultural factors on the explanation of racial/ethnic diversity in fatherhood in two-parent family systems.

According to Lamb and Pleck (1997) cognitive development and social competence of children are associated with a father's emotional support, attachment, and care for his child. In addition, such investments vary greatly from fathers to fathers.

Bronfenbrenner (1981, p.246) suggested that paternal behaviors may vary according to race/ethnicity for various reasons. Different paternal behaviors according to race/ethnicity may depend on various economic conditions and the neighborhood environment in which they live. Because parenting takes place in a social context, different paternal behaviors can also be caused by culturally based attitudes and values.

Baumrind's typology (1991) established as parents are divided into one of four parenthood styles which includes authoritarian, authoritative, permissive, and uninvolved, based on a cross-classification of demandingness and responsiveness. Parenting takes place in this context, and parents interact with their children in this context. However, the socialization behavior of racially/ethnically minority families may be different from that of culturally dominant white families (Garcia-Coll, Lamberty, Jenkins, McAdoo, Crnic, Wasik, et al., 1996).

Critical study of Ogbu (1981) has indicated that the process of raising children involves developing behaviors that will be appropriate for different environments that will support the development of children. Minority parenting also require teaching to their children some skills that will help them overcome ethnic and racial challenges (Bartz & Levine, 1978; Baumrind, 1968; Garcia-Coll, 1990).

Alwin (2001) study on minority parents showed that black parents may exert more control and show less warmth to their children than white parents, perhaps in response to an environment which they see as more dangerous and hostile and in which they do not feel safe. However, it is underlined that values and attitudes vary according to socioeconomic status and these may also change different ethnic groups. It has been shown that Latino families practice warm parenting practices in their parenting and emphasize the collective obligation for individualism view (Delgado-Gaitan, 1994; Fuller, Holloway, & Liang, 1996).

Baca Zinn (1994) claimed that Latino fathers may have less control over their children when it comes to raising children. Because there are roles that the root family also takes on for child care in their nuggets. Thus, responsibility is shared by family members. Root families where minority groups are in a relationship can increase fathers' responsibility to children (Hofferth, 2003).

In summary, Hofferth's (2003) highly critical study showed that the fathers of the black children exhibited less engagement and less warmth, they exhibited more control than the fathers of the white children, while the fathers of the Hispanic children did not differ in engagement or warmth but exhibited less control. This shows that the paternity practices of fathers from different ethnic identities differ from each other. This may be due to the environment in which they live, economic conditions, or because cultural attributions of paternity may differ in different groups. Both Black and Hispanic fathers exhibited greater responsibility than white fathers (Hofferth, Forry, & Peters, 2010).

In this part of the literature, the concept of minority fatherhood is examined in more depth. In the next section, the phenomenon of being a father on the axis of Turkey will be examined. This is due to the fact that fatherhood studies in Turkey have increased in recent years, but they are still not very much. However, studies on being a father from a minority group in Turkey can be said to be almost nonexistent. With this study, it is aimed to make a small contribution to this gap in the field.

1.2.3. Fatherhood in Turkey

The traditional concept of fatherhood refers to an authoritarian paternal role. The role of his child remains secondary after the mother, taking on the functions of earning money, maintaining the house, and ensuring discipline, with minimal emotional and physical presence in the life of the child (Freeman, 2008).

Kağıtçıbaşı (2005) who investigated agency and interpersonal distance as two different dimensions, proposed a new phenomenon to understand interpersonal dependence and interdependence for better understanding of contemporary family issues in different cultural contexts.

The psychological model of interdependence challenges the assessment of autonomy as a separation. She argues that autonomy is related to the dimension of agency and separation is related to the dimension of interpersonal distance. Kagitcibasi underlines the compatibility and coexistence of these concepts, rather than seeing autonomy and relatedness as separate and mutually exclusive concepts. Her model offers a synthesis of two constitutive human needs of agency and relatedness with her construct of autonomous-related self (Berry, Segall, & Kagitcibasi, 1997, p. 36-39).

This conceptualization can be quite problematic for ethnic minorities who have family patterns that are more closely related to each other. When this pattern of family ties is considered unhealthy and family members have to be separated from each other, it can actually damage a healthy family relationship. Because whether a conceptualization is healthy or unhealthy cannot be considered separately from the context. For ethnic minorities, the fact that family members establish closer ties with each other can be quite functional in an effort to exist (Fisek & Kagitcibasi, 1999; Kagitcibasi, 2005).

Phablet and Schonpflug's (2001) study conducted with Turks who immigrated to Germany found that parental autonomy between individuals does not mean separation. As a reason for this, the values given to success in this community are not measured by individualism, but by parental collectivism. This indicates to us a more community structure and the rules and definitions of which are

determined by the parents. However, what is still important is how children make sense of this control and how it puts it somewhere in their life (Kagitcibasi, 2005).

Contemporary Turkish families are the latest products of the social, economic and cultural transformations that Turkey has been experiencing for many years. It is possible to see that some values, norms and attitudes regarding interpersonal relations, gender and family relations, as well as ongoing modernization processes, are still under the influence of strict cultural rules (Sunar and Fişek, 2005).

The current Turkish culture can be defined by its characteristics that still adhere to traditions in some communal areas, are authority-centered and maintain a patriarchal structure despite the passing time (Fişek, 2002; Sunar and Fişek, 2005). On the other hand, the findings of the very critical research (Göregenli, 1995) to understand Turkish culture indicated that given all the components of social behavior that have been identified by the literature and target groups up to now, Turkish culture cannot be placed at any end of the individualization-collectivism dichotomy. In other words, we can say that there is neither individualistic nor collectivistic for Turkish culture.

Fişek (1994) stated that child-rearing practices of Turkish families are implemented on the axis of love and control, and there are certain role differences between parents. Fathers, although they have authority, contribute to the growth of their children when the children are young. But when the children grow up, the previously established playful and affectionate relationship with the father begins to be replaced by themes of authority and respect (Sunar and Fişek, 2005).

It is stated that the paternity position in Turkey is perceived as a stage of masculinity in the life development of men, rather than relational. Although it is emphasized that control and love can work together, the father-son relationship turns out to be a relationship that involves more conflict, emotional distance, and deprivation (Bolak-Boratav, Fişek & Eslen-Ziya, 2017).

In a similar way, Sancar (2009) also identified distant, unhappy, and inadequate father-son relationships. On the other hand, he uttered that fathers in the new generation are trying to establish a closer, loving and democratic relationship

with their children, rather than continuing the distant and indifferent behavior of their own fathers (Sancar, 2009).

According to Dermott (2003), various social, cultural and economic developments which have occurred over the past 50 years have led to the questioning of traditional paternity norms. Fathers of the new age are more egalitarian, do not hesitate to take on their responsibilities both financially and at home, and take part in childcare as much as mothers, establishes a close relationship with children both physically and emotionally, is more tolerant and understanding attitude, exhibiting their physical and emotional development of children who do not hesitate to show love and support (Cabrera, Tamis-LeMonda, Bradley, Hofferth and Lamb, 2000).

In 2017, the Mother-Child Education Foundation (AÇEV) published a comprehensive report on the role of the father in child development in Turkey. For this study, 3235 fathers from 51 provinces of Turkey were investigated and 40 fathers were interviewed. The fathers were between the 20 and 44 years old and most were married and living with their spouses (Akçınar, 2017).

This study had three objectives. Its beginning purpose was to identify different paternities in specific, social and cultural conditions in Turkey and to investigate the factors affecting them. Second goal was to explain how different fatherhood and masculinity built each other in Turkey. Finally, it was aimed to create a discussion ground on the regulation and practices needed to increase “related paternity” behaviors in Turkey (Akçınar, 2017).

According to this report, the proportion of fathers who have never read a book to their child is 19%, while the proportion of fathers who have never attended school activities of their children is 13% (Akçınar, 2017). The proportion of fathers who stated that they “often” and “always” appreciate them when their children behave good-naturedly is 88%. The ratio of fathers comparing their children with other children is 49% (Akçınar, 2017). The proportion of fathers who spend time at home watching TV with their children is 78.5%. for children aged 4-10 years, this rate is up to 86%. The proportion of fathers who play fiction games with their children is only 43% (Akçınar, 2017). 94% of the participants participated in the

expressions “It gives me pleasure to be a father” and 93% of the participants participated in the expressions “I enjoy being a father”. A large majority of respondents are proud to be the father of their children (93%) (Akçınar, 2017). Among the reasons why the vast majority of fathers have children, they most Decently agreed with the statements “Because I love children so much” and “Because children bring joy to the house” (respectively 92% and 91%) (Akçınar, 2017). While 44% of fathers stated that they learned fatherhood by themselves, 38% stated that they learned it from their own father (Akçınar, 2017).

These results provide us with very important information about the practices of becoming a father in Turkey. Research points to changing paternity practices in Turkey. Gender roles attributed to paternity also change over time in Turkey.

1.3. MIGRATION

1.3.1. Migration and Mental Health

“The human need to belong is more than one for protection or the means of individual development... it is normally a strong human need, the satisfaction of which is conducive to suffering... A ‘people’ is formed by physical propinquity, a native soil, and s shared history that has formed common beliefs and values (i.e. Its culture or civilization) and conferred on it an identity. The link between a people and a land is a profound one...” (Coles,1985, p. 185-186.).

Migration can be defined as the voluntary or compulsory movement of an individual from one environment to another. This movement may also involve cultural change. Although it is more or less remote, changing the environment means changing the culture This mobility can be related to economic, political or educational. This process also includes some stress, whether willing or unwilling. (Bhugra & Jones, 2001).

According to UN Refugee Agency (UNHCR) (2022), at the beginning of 2022, more than 100 million people have been forcibly removed from their homes all over the world due to many difficult life events that threaten human life. This means that 10.7 million more people have been forcibly removed from the territory

where they lived since the end of the previous year. This shows us that the phenomenon of migration has been one of the most fundamental issues of societies since the history of mankind. Within a few months, the number of internally displaced persons displaced by force in many parts of the world has increased enormously. And this means that it is almost a record. These number of displacement people are that “26.6 million refugees” have been in the world total. This number includes that “50.9 million displaced people”, “4.4 million asylum seekers” and “4.1million Venezuelans” (UNHCR, 2022).

The classification of migration is most basically carried out in two main classifications: voluntary or compulsory, internal migration (within a nation) or international. As a result of migration studies, the most basic definitions of migrating people are classified as refugees, asylum seekers and economic migrants. In general, while the migration experiences of refugees and asylum seekers may be considered more traumatic, economic migrants are not exposed to such trauma because migration happens on their own accord and through a preparatory process. (Bhugra & Ghupta, 2011, p.45).

Pre-migration, migration and post-migration are the three stages that are included by the migration process. The pre-migration process includes preparation for the decision to migrate and preparation for migration mobility. The second stage is migration itself and is the physical movement of individuals from one environment to another. Post-migration, that is, the third stage, is defined as compliance with the social, political, economic and cultural definitions of the new society in which the immigrant migrates. Social and cultural rules of the new culture, as well as gender, employment, etc. which means relating to new roles are learned at this stage. Mental health and health problems of migrants in the early stages of migration are relatively lower than in the post-migration periods (Bhugra & Ghupta, 2011, p.2).

Bhugra, Mallett, & Leff (1999) stated that in the initial stages of migration, migrants may have relatively fewer mental illnesses and health problems than in the final stages. This is due to the fact that at a younger age at the initial stage of migration they are able to cope with the relevant problems relatively more flexibly.

The reason for the increase in the latter after migration may also be the acculturation process and the low success rate of achieving the goals set after it and achieving it, that is, the potential discrepancy between reality and imagination.

Bhugra (2004) claimed that migration has a multifaceted impact on an individual's mental health. These effects affect different aspects of an individual's development, whether biological, social or psychological. All three stages of migration can involve many difficulties and stresses.

Wojcik & Bhugra (2010) uttered that migration involves many losses, such as the loss of the root family and the society into which it was born. Migration is a process in which there is a loss of both emotional and structures such as family, friends, work environment. Language, values, social structures, and social support networks are also lost. Therefore, mourning the lost parts of all this identity can be stated as a healthy reaction and the most natural result of migration.

Dao, Poritz, Moody, and Szeto (2012) considered that there are four prominent periods of trauma for a forced migrant: pre-migration, migration, encampment, and post-migration. Whence, mental disorders can occur from some mixing of factors, including repeated exposure to traumatic experiences in the country of origin (such as loss and grief); stress encountered in the period of transition and resettlement; post-migration experiences such as insecure residency, fear or repatriation, socioeconomic discrimination, social displacement, social exclusion. The lives of a significant percentage of forced migrants, such as resettled refugees, appear to be a long list of combined and cumulative traumas. In a study by Rasmussen, Crager, Baser, Chu, and Gany (2012), refugees reported almost 50% of a list of 27 types of traumatic events. Although one trauma can be independent from another, there is a significant probability of revictimization, especially if resettlement is not guaranteed, if one's human rights are not respected and if a systematic and appropriate psychosocial support is not provided.

Blackmore, Boyle, Fazel, Ranasinha, Gray & Fitzgerald (2020) suggested their comprehensive review that produces up-to-date prevalence estimates not only for PTSD, but also for depression, anxiety, and psychosis. A high rate and persistent PTSD and depression have been observed in refugees and asylum seekers. The

results of this review indicate the need for the existence of psychological support mechanisms that start from the first time when migrating individuals settled and will continue permanently after that. Preventive mental health services are very vital in social events such as migration.

According to data from the World Mental Health Surveys, lifetime prevalence in the general population is 3.9% for PTSD and 12% for any depressive disorder, compared to this study findings of 31% for PTSD and 31.5% for depression. However, the prevalence of anxiety disorders (11%) and psychosis (1.5%) in refugees and asylum seekers appears to be less than the lifetime prevalence in general population samples: 16 % and 3%, respectively. (Blackmore et. all, 2019)

Despite the significant effects of immigration after 1980 on the socio-cultural, economic and psychological shaping of Turkish society, migration has not received sufficient attention in the world of psychiatry and psychology, but some important research has also been conducted (Gün & Bayraktar, 2008).

According to the study of Özen, Antar, Özbulut, Altındağ & Oto (2001), they investigated the relationship between mental symptom severity and gender in high school students who experienced internal migration and pointed out that migration experience may cause different symptoms according to gender. As founded by Sir, Bayram & Ozkan (1998), trauma rate of migrating adults was 66%. Aker, Ayata, Özeren, Buran & Bay (2002), compared torture victims and forced migration victims in terms of the trauma they experienced and compared them with each other, and close-level Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD) was determined.

Kübler-Ross (1969, p.31 - 91) described five stages of grief: denial and isolation, followed by anger, bargaining, depression and acceptance. Although these stages are defined for deceased patients, many of the same stages are usually observed in mourning. They are not always sequential, and often the stages are also visible at the same time (Kübler-Ross, 1969, p. 2- 8).

Eisenbruch (1990) defined as cultural mourning is a very difficult experience experienced by a person or a group that has been uprooted. Examples of these experiences include the loss of social relationships, culture, identity, and

memories. Cultural mourning involves hugging the missing almost as tightly as if they had not been lost. In fact, this hug is to hold on to an existing space. Even if emigrating individuals emigrate compulsorily or willingly, they will probably have left their families, the places they belong, and perhaps their roles behind. Leaving behind childhood friends, a large family, material inheritance, social status will quickly lead to a palpable sense of loss. This feeling of loss can delay some reactions to migration. (Wojcik and Bhugra, 2010).

Bowlby stated a four-stage mode for explaining loss process. These stages include numbness or protest; yearning and searching, disorganization and despair and, finally, reorganization. It is easy to see how these stages can be observed in refugees and asylum seekers. According to him, the environment of a person makes a significant contribution to his psychological development. (Bhugra & Ghupta, 2011, p.141).

Bowlby uses attachment theory as a way to conceptualize people's tendency to form strong emotional attachments to others and to explain the many emotional distress and personality disorders caused by reluctant separation and loss (Bowlby, 1980, page 201).

Almost all of these four stages can be seen as a stage of attachment to a culture of people, especially the culture into which the individual was born. Because of this, the influence of the first years on the relationship established with the culture is quite vital. The loss of such an important attachment 'figure' will lead to anger in the person that comes with the loss. The fear felt as a result of this loss will lead to an anxiety that can also affect the separation anxiety in the later stages. Bowlby emphasized that parents are important attachment figures. In addition, in our opinion, people cannot be seen separately from the culture in which they were born and where they live (Bhugra & Ghupta, 2011, p.142).

Taking all this information into account, we can easily say that the relationship and interaction between cultural bereavement, cultural conflict and cultural shock should be further investigated. Although they all have common characteristics of experiencing loss and anxiety, it is inevitable to conduct a detailed analysis. The mental health of migrants is often sensitive to many external and

internal factors, and some recurrent challenging events may make migrating individuals more prone to mental health diseases later in the migration. In addition, individuals can also come out of difficult life events by developing resistance. Therefore, evaluating all these processes only through an individual lens and ignoring the context will create a deficiency.

In the next part, the topic of migration and acculturation will also be discussed. The effects of migration and acculturation on the mental health of individuals will be examined in this section.

1.3.2. Migration and Acculturation Process

Tylor (1981), the British anthropologist known for his work on culture, defined culture as “that complex whole which includes knowledge, belief, art, morals, laws, customs and any other capabilities and habits acquired by man as a member of society.”

In a classical study of many definitions, Kroeber and Kluckhohn (1952) have collected the different definitions of culture found in the anthropological literature in six main classes. From these definitions, he explained psychological culture as follows “*Psychological definitions emphasize a variety of psychological features, including notions such as adjustment, problem-solving, learning, and habits. For example, culture is learned, and the result of this learning is the establishment of habits in a particular group. This category is rather broad and includes both implied and observable cultural phenomena.*” (p. 408).

Concluding their reviews with their own definitions, Kroeber and Kluckhohn (1952, p. 181) proposed that:

“Culture consists of patterns, explicit and implicit, of and for behavior acquired and transmitted by symbols, constituting the distinctive achievements of human groups, including their embodiments in artifacts; the essential core of culture consists of traditional (i.e., historically derived and selected) ideas and especially their attached values; cultural systems

may on the one hand be considered as products of action, on the other as conditioning elements of further action.”

The most classical definition of acculturation, which is also used today, is given by American Anthropologists Redfield, Linton and Herskovits (1936, p.149) defined that “It is a social event that leads to a change in the cultural patterns of one or both of these groups as a result of the constant and one-on-one interaction of groups from different cultures with each other.”

Acculturation is a rather complicated psychological process due to many factors. It becomes quite difficult to explain the concept of acculturation when all concepts such as which immigrant group the migrants are included in, the cultural structures of the place where they emigrate, the personality and sociocultural foundations of the emigrants, age and gender are all evaluated. (Berry, Poortinga, Segal & Dansen, 2002, p. 350 – 351)

The acculturation model established by Berry (1992) is the most accepted today. According to this model, acculturation consists of two independent dimensions. These dimensions are cultural adaptation that means adaptation of majority culture and cultural maintenance that means protecting own minority culture where migrants come from. Berry has determined four types of cultivation strategies according to the position of the immigrant in these two dimensions. These strategies are integration, assimilation, separation and marginalization.

Berry (2005) noted that individuals who have been migrated do not want to resume their own cultural identity and seek to new connection with other cultures, then this can be called the assimilation strategy. On the other hand, if the non-dominant group conserve their host culture and abstains relating with other cultures, this time the separation strategy is in effect. If the migrants intent to maintain both their own and other cultures, and also interact with other groups, then the integration strategy is emerging. In this strategy, the individual tries to become part of a wider social network in the society he has migrated to, on the other hand, maintains his cultural integrity by complying with that society. Marginality arises when a person has little interest in both his own culture and the culture into which the individual has migrated and shows no interest in maintaining these cultures. The behavior of

a person whose attitudes are more in line with the patterns forms the strategy of acculturation of the individual.

One of the most important elements of which acculturation strategy will be used here is the attitude of the society to which it migrated to the immigrants. Issues such as which context was migrated into and how a life is being led are among the post-migration elements of migration that affect acculturation (Bhugra & Ghupta, 2011, p.2).

When these acculturation strategies are considered, it can be said that an integration process in which an individual can maintain some parts of their own culture in their life, as well as take the parts they want from the new culture they have migrated to and carry them to their identity, is the healthiest acculturation process from the point of view of individuals in the migration process (Berry, 1997).

The direct or indirect interaction of two cultures with each other can create acculturative stress on both individuals and the interacting group. Because it can be stressful for both parties to encounter the unknown. Berry (1992) conceptualizes such acculturative stress in three ways. The first is behavioral change (where individual behaviors change), and sometimes this can be difficult. This process can also be selective or accidental. Using behavioral changes, individuals can adapt to the new culture. However, behaviors are easier to change than attitudes.

The second type of acculturative stress is that the events that occur create stress in individuals, and then this stress changes individuals. Individuals may decide that changes in their behavior may also not help them cope with the difficulties they are experiencing. This decision leads to stress, especially when they are confused by the new culture (Berry, 1992).

The third way to cope this acculturative stress is psychopathology, which can be caused by abnormal coping strategies and abnormal psychology (Berry,1992).

Berry (2007) suggested that calling this word “acculturating stress” instead of “culture shock”. He claimed that the word “shock” has more negative associations and at the same time the phenomenon is intercultural (p.63). However, shock can cause a more short-term and severe effect, while stress can be considered

as an effect that is felt in all areas and time periods of life. From this point of view, acculturation stress can also be a source of stress that spreads to a certain period of life, rather than a shorter-term effect.

Stress has always existed since people began to exist in the universe; in addition, it has also been known that animals have been experiencing stress and suffering for centuries. However, the understanding that stress has been including a role in health for long periods and disease that have been occurred by stress is becoming more current phenomenon. In this regard, it is known that culture has recently played an important role in terms of health protection and disease prevention and management (Bhugra & Ghupta, 2011, p.168).

The above informations are in the summary that people who migrate often find themselves subject to discrimination. This may mean that they are less able to successfully integrate with local host communities. In this way, they can isolate themselves with the stress and feelings of non-belonging that they will experience.

This, in turn, can cause many psychological difficulties. In this case, individuals may need some resources that they can take power in their lives. Sometimes these resources can be individual, and sometimes the family system itself can also be a resource. Therefore, the migration and family dynamics will be examined in the next section.

1.3.3. Migration and Family Dynamics

Bowlby uses attachment theory as a way to conceptualize people's tendency to form strong emotional attachments to others and to explain the many emotional distress and personality disorders caused by reluctant separation and loss (Bowlby, 1980, page 201). Bowlby proposes that attachment behavior is conceived as behavior that focuses on providing and maintaining closeness to another individual (thought of as stronger and smarter) that is differentiated and preferred.

The theory of attachment includes originality, duration, involvement of emotions, ontogenesis, learning, organization and bio-logical functions. All of these features can be used to understand by what strategy the attachment of a person to

his culture, especially the culture in which the individual was born, will be, and therefore the impact of the first years of life is very vital (Bhugra & Ghupta, 2011, p.141).

Baumrind's (1966, 1991) typology, which defines the four parenting styles first and divided them into categories, have been mentioned in many studies in the literature (Lamborn, Mounts, Steinberg, & Dornbusch, 1991; Slicker, 1998). Baumrind (1966, 1991), divided the parents according to two measures. These characteristics are responsiveness to the child's request and control over the child. According to these two parenting measures, Baumrind divided parenting styles into 4 and these parenting styles have been named as authoritative, authoritarian, indulgent, and neglecting (Chao, 2001).

Research shows that authoritative parenting style that is flexible enough to meet the child's developmental needs and blends warmth and support within the framework of an established discipline is a keystone of the psychosocial health of children and adolescents (Darling & Steinberg, 1993).

In contrast, authoritarian style is related with many negative consequences in children and adolescents which can be described being "less content, less attached to peers, and more insecure, anxious, and hostile". This style can be defined as valuing obedience and restricting autonomy (Kaufmann, Gesten, & Santa Lucia, 2000, p 232).

A third one which is called permissive, is defined as a parenting style that remains sensitive to children and adolescents' emotions, cognitions, behaviors and developmental needs too much but fails to set appropriate disciplinary, consistent boundaries which is coherent both parents. The final parenting style can be called neglectful. This parenting style includes behaviors that do not connect enough with their children and are not interested enough in their children and are minimally sensitive to the needs of the child or the behavior of the child (Brenner & Fox, 1999, p. 344).

Especially stressful events for individuals with weak attachment patterns occur anxiety and guilt (Bowlby, 1980). Close patterns can also be observed after migration from one culture to another. Undermining family functioning and

difficulties in personality development will occur poor parenting in the younger generation. Proceeding from a model is like that, acculturation can be considered with a new definition as a cultural attachment that can affect the relationship with the new culture and society. In the context of this new definition, it can be assumed that unstable emotions and resentment will be also understood as a play of a role in the expression and management of grief and mourning (Bhugra & Ghupta, 2011, p.142).

Viewpoint of family acculturation (Berry et al., 2006), evidence tell that dyad which is formed by parents and child may think differently about parent–adolescent relationships during acculturation. For example, while parents think that their children should take more responsibility for family obligations, in contrast, immigrant youth also have more expectations of adolescent rights, that is, independence, than their parents.

However, differences in opinions between young people about maternal and family obligations have changed in young people whose acculturation strategy is assimilation. The nationalist identity that has developed with the presence of more national friends has deepened the differences between adolescents' families and their opinions (Bornstein & Cote, 2006, p.27)

Among the lots of factors that can lead to well-being in the process of acculturation of individuals, especially the family is of great importance. Good family relationships which perceived support that is coming from both family members can reduce the stress felt during the acculturation process (Castillo, Conoley, & Brossart, 2004).

Together with the process of acculturation, the degree of importance attributed to the family can also change. Lots of the American-based studies conducted to understand the role of acculturation on family relationships point to different results from each other (Chun & Akutsu, 2003). In other studies, greater compliance with the massive culture has been associated with less family cohesion. However, less felt mutual support indicates more family conflicts (Brooks, Stuewig, & Lecroy, 1998). Research with Hispanic families shows that second-generation and younger immigrants are more attuned to the majority culture. However, they

also have less investment in family relationships than first-generation and older immigrants. (Sabogal, Marín, Otero-Sabogal, Marín, & Perez-Stable, 1987). However, other studies have stressed that in the process of acculturation, family relationships are strengthened. The study of Keefe (1980) showed that Mexican Americans who are more attuned to the massive culture noted increased contacts and support among family members.

Studies on immigrant families have not focused solely on the temporally different worlds of parents and children. Studies have also frequently explained on the generational gap, including the generational conflicts that arise when socializing with different cultures as well (Garcia Coll & Magnuson, 1997).

This may indicate to us that while first-generation fathers strive to protect and maintain themselves, their family members and their culture within the dominant culture in which they migrated, each attempt by the next generation to relate to the dominant culture may be perceived as a loss for the first generation. However, this situation may mean for the second generation only to integrate into life and experience their own individuality. Such differences in perceptions and emotions can cause a gap between generations.

The situation becomes more complicated if there are differences between parents according to their degree of acculturation. However, if the parents' exposure to both the ancestral culture and their new host country is different, the host culture becomes multifaceted, and therefore it is likely that children will experience messages containing contradictions (Greenfield, 1994).

Thus, Sluzki (1979) claimed that longtime delays in the family's adaptation to the migrated culture may cause conflicts between the second and first generation. Whatever prevented the first generation will appear in the second. This situation is expressed as a conflict between generations and also between cultures. Because this process is not only about intergenerational but also intercultural too.

In addition, despite the traumas of persecution, violence and displacement, most refugees have not experienced mental health loss. People have a hard time believing that (Beiser, 2009).

Just as individuals use coping strategies after traumatic events, so do families. collaborative coping strategies that are important for families include, for example, negotiation, joint problem solving, role clarity, understanding and balancing influence and control, and taking perspective (Berg, Meegan & Deviney, 1998).

Young children will have limited problem-solving skills, and their ability to take the point of view of others will be newly developed. Adults will and should have more influence and control, strengthening the coping skills of younger members. Ultimately, however, each family member contributes coping forces that can promote adaptive coping when the family is working together (Keiser, Baumgardner & Dorado, 2010).

Taking all this information into account, we can easily say that the process of migration and acculturation has quite challenging effects both on the individual and on the family system level. These effects can be called traumatic and pathological for individuals and can lead to mental health disorders. In addition, this process may also create a gap between generations. But besides all this, it is quite important not to pathologize this migration process and migrated individuals. Both individuals and the family system can heal themselves by developing self-strengths.

1.4. ALEVI MIGRATION IN THE TURKEY CONTEXT

The stages of Alevi migration movements and urbanization processes in Turkey can be counted as follows: (a) Early Republican Period (before the 1923), (b) Contact and Design Period (1919 - 1959), (c) *Takiye*, Demand and Threat Period (1960 - 1979) and (d) Recovery and Representation Period (After 1980's) (Salman, 2019, p.98).

The pre-1950 period can be described as National and Folkloric. Then, with the increasing migration movements accumulated in the 1950s, especially in the 1960s, the Alevis became more visible in the cities. Studies conducted in the 1990s show that the migrations experienced in the 1960s were a breaking point. This

breaking point also includes holding on to the city, being able to be a demanding subject in urban life and being able to face the pressures (Salman, 2019, p. 121). Especially at the end of the 1970s, people began to migrate much more from villages to larger cities in order to feel more secure (Salman, 2019, p. 135).

Çelik (2005) claimed that there has been a large wave of internal migration that began in the second half of the 1980s and increased well into the early 1990s. During this migration process, people migrated from Eastern and Southeastern Anatolia to many parts of the country. Many people have left their villages and moved either to other urban centers near their villages or to cities in Western Anatolia. Through the migration process, a significant part of the population has established a life for themselves in the slums surrounding Istanbul, Ankara, Izmir and Adana.

1.5. CONCLUSION & SUMMARY

The Alevi faith has been existing in Anatolia for many years. Alevis have also been fighting for an identity since the Republican Era. Although this struggle has been going on for many years, a number of phenomena that have been skipped, moved on, ignored have been re-existing themselves. Alevis have migrated at certain periods of history. These migrations increased even more towards the end of the 70s. Along with urbanization, new encounters have also changed the practices of Alevism. As urbanizing Alevism pushes its important breakthroughs to be trapped in narrower meanings, it becomes inevitable that these meanings will turn into accepted taboos.

Migration is a fundamental change that can go from uprooting to breaking up. Indeed, migration has a number of changes: the environment; language and forms of communication; the loss of the social network; changing social roles and family roles; restrictions on religious practices and respect for religious prohibitions; rules and laws. Leaving the “envelope”, the migrant loses the familiar sounds, places, smells and all kinds of sensations that are the basis of psychological functioning (Moro, 2003).

Most common pathologies among adult migrants; PTSD, depression, anxiety and somatoform disorders, schizophrenia, sleep disorders, identity confusion, isolation Substance abuse (alcohol, drugs, etc.). Also, acculturation process may occur a gap between generations. However, although the migration process is difficult and involves a risk of pathology formation, both individuals and the family system can develop resistances to cope with these challenges. The most important of these is that the family strengthens its ties with each other.

Fatherhood is another important phenomenon that has been investigated since the past. The literature discussed above has also shown us that paternity studies are increasing over time, and definitions and practices of fatherhood are also changing over time and Turkey context. This change and the phenomenon of intergenerational transmission of fatherhood were discussed in the second part of this study.

Lastly but not least, the terms of Alevism Culture, Fatherhood, migration, and acculturation were discussed at this study. Intergenerational transmissions of fatherhood were discussed second part of this study. These phenomena, which seem to be separate from each other, can be seen from the point of view of the intersectional perspective. "To the extent that a complete picture of intersectionality is obtained with attention to phenomenological experiences associated with intersectionality, it is not surprising that qualitative research has often been held to be central to an intersectionality approach" (DeBlaere, Parent & Moradi, 2013, p. 642). Intersectionality approach shows that some parts of our identity, although different from each other, can stand in the same place. Just like in human relations, we don't need to be the same as each other to stand side by side.

1.6. REFERENCES

- AÇEV Türkiye’de Babalığı Anlamak Serisi I: Türkiye’de İlgili Babalık ve Belirleyicileri Ana Raporu. (İstanbul: AÇEV, 2017).
- Aina, O. E., & Cameron, P. A. (2011). Why Does Gender Matter? Counteracting Stereotypes with Young Children. *Dimensions of Early Childhood*, 39(3), 11–19.
- Akbulut, O. & Usal, Z. O. (2008). Parental Religious Rights vs. Compulsory Religious Education in Turkey, *International Journal on Minority and Group Rights*, 15, 433-455.
- Akçınar, B. (2017). Involved fatherhood and its determinants in Turkey. Istanbul: Mother Child Education Foundation.
- Aker T, Ayata B, Özeren M, Buran B, Bay A Zorunlu iç göç: Ruhsal ve toplumsal sonuçları. *Anadolu Psikiyatri Derg*, 2002; 3(2):97-103.
- Alwin, D. F. (2001). Parental values, beliefs, and behavior: A review and promulga for research into the new century. In T. Owens & S. Hofferth (Eds.), *Children at the millennium: Where did we come from, where are we going?* New York: *Elsevier Science*.
- Arar, Y. Bezirgan ve Nuri Bilgin (2010). “Gazetelerde Ötekileştirme Pratikleri: Türk Basını Üzerine Bir İnceleme”, *İletişim Kuram ve Araştırma Dergisi*. Sayı 30 ss.1-18.
- Bartz, K., & Levine, B. (1978). Child rearing by Black parents: A description and comparison to Anglo and Chicano parents. *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, 40, 709-720.
- Baumrind, D. (1966). Effects of authoritative parental control on child behavior. *Child Development*, 37, 887-907.
- Baumrind, D. (1968). An exploratory study of socialization effects on Black children: Black-White comparisons. *Child Development*, 43, 261-267.
- Baumrind, D. (1991). Parenting styles and adolescent development. In J. Brooks-Gunn, R. Lerner, & A. C. Petersen (Eds.), *The encyclopedia of adolescence* (pp. 746-758). New York: Garland.

- Beck-Gernsheim, E. (2002). *Reinventing the Family. In Search of New Lifestyles.* Cambridge: *Polity Press.*
- Beiser M. Resettling refugees and safeguarding their mental health: lessons learned from the Canadian Refugee Resettlement Project. *Transcult Psychiatry* 2009;46: 539-83.
- Berg, C. A., Meegan, S. P., & Deviney, F.P. (1998). A social-contextual model of coping with every day problem across the lifespan. *Internal Journal of Behavioral Development*, 22(2), 239-261.
- Berry, J. W. (1992). Acculturation and adaptation in a new society. *International Migration*, 30, 69–85.
- Berry, J. W., Sam, D. (1997). Acculturation and adaptation. In J. W. Berry, M. H. Segall and C. Kagitcibasi (eds) *Handbook of CrossCultural Psychology*, Vol. 3, Social Behavior and Applications. Boston: Allyn and Bacon.
- Berry, J. W., Segall, M. H., & Kagitcibasi, C. (Eds.) (1997). Social behavior and applications. Vol. III of *Handbook of cross-cultural psychology* (2nd ed.). Boston, MA: Allyn and Bacon.
- Berry, J. W., Poortinga, Y. H., Segall, M. H. & Dasen, P. R. (2002). *Cross-cultural psychology: research and applications.* 2nd edn. New York: *Cambridge University Press.*
- Berry, J. W. (2005). Acculturation: living successfully in two cultures. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 29, 697–712.
- Berry, J. W., Phinney, J. S., Sam, D. L., & Vedder, P. (Eds.). (2006). *Immigrant youth in cultural transition.* Mahwah, NJ: *Lawrence Erlbaum Associates*
- Berry, J. W. (2007). Acculturation and identity. In D. Bhugra and K. S. Bhui, eds. *Textbook of Cultural Psychiatry.* Cambridge: *Cambridge University Press.*
- Bhugra, D., Mallett, R., Leff, J. (1999). Schizophrenia and African-Caribbeans: a conceptual model of aetiology. *International Review of Psychiatry*, 11(2), 145–52.
- Bhugra, D., Jones, P. (2001). Migration and Mental Illness. *Advances in Psychiatric Treatment*, vol 7, p. 216 – 223.

- Bhugra, D. (2004). Migration and mental health. *Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica*, 109(4), 243–58.
- Bhugra, D., Gupta, S., Bhui, K., Craig, T. O. M., Dogra, N., Ingleby, J. D., ... & Tribe, R. (2011). WPA guidance on mental health and mental health care in migrants. *World Psychiatry*, 10(1), 2-10.
- Bolak-Boratav, H., Okman-Fişek, G. & Eslen-Ziya, H. (2017). Erkekliğin Türkiye halleri. İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi University Press.
- Bornstein, M. H. & Cote, L. R. (2006). *Acculturation and Parent – Child Relationships: Measurement and Development*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Bowlby, J. (1980). *Attachment and Loss*. New York: Basic Books.
- Bozkurt, Fuat. *Toplumsal Boyutlarıyla Alevilik*, 5th edition. İstanbul: Kapı Yayınları, February 2005.
- Brannen, J. (2011). *Fatherhood in the Context of Migration: An Intergenerational Approach*. Retrieved from <https://www.ssoar.info/ssoar/handle/document/39222>.
- Bronfenbrenner, U. (1981). *The ecology of human development*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Brooks, A. J., Stuewig, J., & Lecroy, C. W. (1998). A family-based model of Hispanic adolescent substance use. *Journal of Drug Education*, 28, 65–86.
- Butler, J. (1990). *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. New York, London: Routledge.
- Cabrera, N. J., Tamis-LeMonda, C. S., Bradley, R. H., Hofferth, S., & Lamb, M. E. (2000). “Fatherhood in the twenty-first century.” *Child Development*, 71(1): 127- 136.
- Carrigan, T., Connell, B., & Lee, J. (1985). Toward a New Sociology of Masculinity. *Theory and Society*, 14(5), 551–604.
- Castillo, L. G., Conoley, C. W., & Brossart, D. F. (2004). Acculturation, white marginalization, and family support as predictors of perceived distress in Mexican American female college students. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 51, 151–157.

- Çelik, B. A. (2005). "I miss my village!": Forced Kurdish migrants in İstanbul and their representation in associations. *New Perspectives on Turkey*, no. 32 (2005): 137-163.
- Chambers, D. (2012). *A Sociology of Family Life. Change and Diversity in Intimate Relations*. Cambridge: *Polity Press*.
- Chao, R. K. (2001). Extending research on the consequences of parenting style for Chinese Americans and European Americans. *Child Development*, 72, 1832-1843.
- Chun, K. M., & Akutsu, P. D. (2003). Acculturation among ethnic minority families. In K. M. Chun, P. B. Organista, & G. Marín (Eds.), *Acculturation: Advances in theory, measurement, and applied research* (pp. 95–119). Washington, DC: *American Psychological Association*.
- Coles, G. J. L. (1985) *A Background Study Prepared for the Round Table on Voluntary*.
- Coll, C. G., & Magnuson, K. (1997). The psychological experience of immigration: A developmental perspective. In A. Booth, A. C. Crouter, & N. S. Landale (Eds.), *Immigration and the family: Research and policy on U.S. immigrants* (pp. 91–131). Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc.
- Coltrane, S. (1996). *Family man: Fatherhood, housework, and gender equity*. New York: *Oxford University Press*.
- Dao, T. K., Poritz, J. M., Moody, R. P., & Szeto, K. (2012). Development, reliability, and validity of the Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Interview for Vietnamese refugees: a diagnostic instrument for Vietnamese refugees. *Journal of traumatic stress*, 25(4), 440-445.
- Darling, N., & Steinberg, L. (1993). Parenting style as context: An integrative model. *Psychological Bulletin*, 113, 487-496.
- Delgado-Gaitan, C. (1994). Socializing young children in Mexican-American families. In P. Greenfield & R. Cocking (Eds.), *Cross-cultural roots of minority child development: An intergenerational perspective* (pp. 55-86). Hillsdale, NJ: *Lawrence Erlbaum*.

- Demetriou, D. Z. (2001). Connell's Concept of Hegemonic Masculinity: A Critique. *Theory and Society*, 30(3), 337–361.
- Dermott, E. (2008). *Intimate Fatherhood. A Sociological Analysis*. London: Routledge.
- Dermott, E., & Miller, T. (2015). More than the sum of its parts? Contemporary fatherhood policy, practice and discourse. *Families, Relationships and Societies*, 4(2), 183–195.
- Durgel, S. E., Bilici, G. (2012). Batı Avrupadaki Türk Göçmen Ailelerde Ana Babalık. *Ana Babalık: Kuram ve Araştırma*. İstanbul, Koç Üniversitesi Yayıncılık.
- Eisenbruch, M. (1990). The cultural bereavement interview: a new clinical research approach for refugees. *Psychiatric Clinics of North America*, 13, 715–35.
- Fişek, G. O. (1994). "Paradoxes of intimacy: an analysis in terms of gender and culture." *Boğaziçi Journal*, 8(1-2): 177-186.
- Fişek, G. O. (2002, September). "*Bende bir ben var ailemden içeri: Türkiye'de ailevi benlik araştırmaları*". Paper presented at the XII. National Psychology Conference at Middle East Technical University, Ankara September 11-13.
- Fisek, G. O., & Kagıtcıbası, C. (1999). Multiculturalism and psychotherapy: The Turkish case. In P. Pedersen (Ed.), *Multiculturalism as a fourth force* (pp. 75-90). Castleton, NY: Hamilton.
- Freeman, T., "Psychoanalytic Concepts of Fatherhood: Patriarchal Paradoxes and the Presence of an Absence Authority", *Studies in Gender and Sexuality*, 9, 2008. p. 113 – 139.
- Fuller, B., Holloway, S., & Liang, X. (1996). Family selection of child-care centers: The influence of household support, ethnicity, and parental practices. *Child Development*, 67, 3320-3337.
- Garcia-Coll, C. (1990). Developmental outcome of minority infants: A process-oriented look into our beginnings. *Child Development*, 61, 270-289.

- Garcia-Coll, C., Lamberty, G., Jenkins, R., McAdoo, H. P., Crnic, K., Wasik, B. H., et al. (1996). An integrative model for the study of developmental competencies in minority children. *Child Development*, 67, 1891-1914.
- Giddens, A. (1992). *The transformation of intimacy: Love, sexuality and eroticism in modern societies*. Cambridge: Polity Press. Retrieved From: https://psipp.itb-ad.ac.id/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/Anthony-Giddens-The-Transformation-of-Intimacy_-Sexuality-Love-and-Eroticism-in-Modern-Societies-1992-Stanford-University-Press.pdf
- Gölpınarlı, A. (1977). *Tasavvuf'tan Dilimize Geçen Deyimler ve Atasözleri*, İstanbul: İnkılâp ve Ata Kitabevleri.
- Göregenli, M. (1995). Individualism-collectivism orientations in the Turkish culture: A preliminary study. *Türk Psikoloji Dergisi*, 10, 1-14.
- Greenfield, P. M. (1994). Independence and interdependence as developmental scripts: Implications for theory, research, and practice. Retrieved from: <https://greenfieldlab.psych.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/sites/168/2019/01/80-greenfield1994.pdf>.
- Gün, Z., & Bayraktar, F. (2008). Türkiye'de iç göçün ergenlerin uyumundaki rolü. *Türk Psikiyatri Dergisi*, 19(2).
- Henwood, K., & Procter, J. (2003). The “good father”: Reading men’s accounts of paternal involvement during the transition to first-time fatherhood. *British Journal of Social Psychology*, 42, 337–355.
- Hobson, B. (2002). *Making Men Into Fathers. Men, Masculinities and the Social Politics of Fatherhood*. (B. Hobson, Ed.). Cambridge: *Cambridge University Press*.
- Hobson, B. (2004). *Making Men into Fathers Men, Masculinities, and the Social Politics of Fatherhood*. *Cambridge University Press*, UK: Cambridge.
- Hofferth SL. Race/Ethnic Differences in Father Involvement in Two-Parent Families: Culture, Context, or Economy? *Journal of Family Issues*. 2003;24(2):185-216.
- Hofferth, S. L., Forry, N. D., & Peters, H. E. (2010). Child Support, Father-Child Contact, and Preteens' Involvement with Nonresidential Fathers:

- Racial/Ethnic Differences. *Journal of family and economic issues*, 31(1), 14–32.
- Hofferth, S.L. (2003). Race/ethnic differences in father involvement in two-parent families: Culture, context of economy? *Journal of Family Issues*, 24, 185-216.
- Hogg, M. A., Graham, M. V. (2014). *Social Psychology*. Pearson Education Limited: United Kingdom.
- Kagitcibasi, C. (2005). Autonomy and relatedness in cultural context: Implications for self and family. *Journal of cross-cultural psychology*, 36(4), 403-422.
- Kagitcibasi, C., & Ataca, B. (2005). Value of children and family change: A three-decade portrait from Turkey. *Applied psychology*, 54(3), 317-337.
- Kaufmann, D., Gesten, E., & Santa Lucia, R. C. (2000). The relationship between parenting style and children's adjustment: The parents' perspective. *Journal of Child and Family Studies*, 9, 231-245.
- Keefe, S. E. (1980). Acculturation and the extended family among urban Mexican Americans. In A. M. Padilla (Ed.), *Acculturation: Theory, models, and some new findings* (pp. 85–110). Boulder, CO: Westview.
- Kehl-Bodrogi, K. (2012). *Kızılbaşlar/Aleviler* (B. E. Aybudak & O. Değirmenci, Trans.). İstanbul: Ayrıntı.
- Kessler, S. J., & McKenna, W. (1985). *Gender: An ethnomethodological approach* (2nd ed.). Chicago, IL: *University of Chicago Press*.
- King, V., Harris, K. M., & Heard, H. E. (2004). Racial and ethnic diversity in nonresident father involvement. *Journal of Marriage and Family*, 66(1), 1-21.
- Kiser, L. J., Baumgardner, B., & Dorado, J. (2010). Who we are, but for the stories we tell: Family stories and Healing. *Psychological Trauma: Theory, Research and Practice*, 2(3), 243-249.
- Kroeber, A. L., & Kluckhohn, C. (1952). *Culture: A critical review of concepts and definitions*. Cambridge, MA: Peabody Museum, Vol. 47, no. 1.

- Lamb, M. E. (1997). Nonparental child care: Context, quality, correlates, and consequences. In I. Sigel & K. Renninger (Eds.), *Handbook of child psychology* (5th ed., pp. 73-134). New York: John Wiley.
- Lamborn, S. D., Mounts, N. S., Steinberg, L., & Dornbusch, S. M. (1991). Patterns of competence and adjustment among adolescents from authoritative, authoritarian, indulgent, and neglectful families. *Child Development*, 62, 573-582.
- Matbaacılık. Yaman, A. (2011). *Alevilik ve Kızılbaşlık Tarihi*, Bolu: Nokta Kitap.
- Mélikoff, Irène. (1994). *Uyur İdik Uyardılar*, İstanbul: Cem Yayınevi.
- Miller, T. (2011). *Making sense of fatherhood: Gender, Caring and Work*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Moro, M.R. (2003) Parents and Infants in Changing Cultural Context: immigration, Trauma and Risk. *Infant Mental Health Journal* 24: 240–264.
- O'Brien, M. (1981). *The Politics of Reproduction*, London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Ogbu, J. (1981). Origins of human competence: A cultural-ecological perspective. *Child Development*, 52, 413-429.
- Öz, Baki. (2002); "Bir Alevilik Tanımlaması ya da Alevilik Tanımına Kuramsal Bir Yaklaşım" *Folklor / Edebiyat Kültür Dergisi*, Alevilik Özel Sayısı –1 Genel Kuram ve Tartışmalar, Cilt: 8, Sayı: 29.
- Özen Ş, Antar S, Özbulut Ö, Altındağ A, Oto R (2001) İç Göç Yaşayan Bir Grup Lise Öğrencisinde Ruhsal Belirti Şiddetinin Cinsiyet İle İlişkisi. *Çocuk ve Ergen Ruh Sağlığı Derg*, 8(3):156-162.
- Paechter, C. (2003). Masculinities and femininities as communities of practice. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 26(1), 69–77.
- Paechter, C. (2006). Power, knowledge and embodiment in communities of sex/gender practice. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 29, 13–26.
- Parent, M. C., DeBlaere, C., Moradi, B. (2013). Approaches to Research on Intersectionality: Perspectives on Gender, LGBT, and Racial/Ethnic Identities, *Sex Roles*, 68, 639-645.

- Phalet, K., & Schönplflug, U. (2001). *Intergenerational Transmission of Collectivism and Achievement Values in Two Acculturation Contexts. Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology, 32(2), 186–201.*
- Pleck, J. H. (1997). Paternal involvement: Levels, sources, and consequences. In M. E. Lamb (Ed.), *The role of the father in child development* (pp. 66-103). New York: John Wiley
- Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Interview for Vitnamese Refugees; a Diagnostic Instrument for Vietnamese Refugees. *Journal of Traumatic Stress, 25, 440-445.*
- Rasmussen, A., Crager, M., Baser, R.E., Chu, T. & Gany, F. (2012). Onset of Posttraumatic
- Redfield, R., Linton, R. & Herkovits, M. (1936). Memorandum on the study of acculturation. *American Anthropologist, 38, 149 – 152.*
- Repatriation Convened by the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees in co-operation with the International Institute of Humanitarian Law, San Remo, 16-19 July.
- Sabogal, F., Marín, G., Otero-Sabogal, R., Marín, B. V., & Perez-Stable, E. J. (1987). Hispanic familialism and acculturation: What changes and what doesn't? *Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences, 9, 397–412.*
- Salman, C. (2018). *Lamekandan Cihana Göç Kimlik Alevilik*. Dipnot Yayınları. Ankara.
- Sancar, S. (2009). *Erkeklik imkansız iktidar: Ailede, piyasada ve sokakta erkekler*. İstanbul: Metis.
- Savaşçı, Özgür. (2004). *“Alevi Sözcüğünün Kökeni”*, *Alevilik*, İstanbul: Kitap Yayınevi.
- Shankland, D. (1999). Antropoloji ve Etnisite: Yeni Alevi Hareketinde Etnografyanın Yeri. *T. Olsson, E. Özdalga, C. Raudvere, Çev. Bilge Kurt Torun/Hayati Torun, Tarih Vakfı Yurt Yayınları, İstanbul, 20-31.*
- Sır A, Bayram Y, Özkan M (1998) Zorunlu İç Göç Yaşamış Bir Grupta Travma Sonrası Stres Bozukluğu Üzerine Bir Ön Çalışma. *Türk Psikiyatri Dergisi 9(3):173-180.*

- Slicker, E. K. (1998). Relationship of parenting style to behavioral adjustment in graduating high school seniors. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence*, 27, 345-372.
- Sluzki, C. E. (1979). Migration and family conflict. *Family Process*, 18(4), 379–390.
- Stress Disorder and Major Depression among Refugees and Voluntary Migrants to the United States. *Journal of Traumatic Stress*, 25, 705-712.
- Subaşı, N. (2003). Anadolu Aleviliği Üzerine. *Bilimname I*, 1,175-195.
- Sunar, D. & Fisek, G. O. (2005). Contemporary Turkish families. In J. L. Roopnarine, & U. P. Gieler (Eds.), *Families in global perspective* (pp. 169-183). Boston, MA: Pearson/Allyn and Bacon.
- Szasz, T. (1997). *The manufacture of madness*. First Syracuse University Press Edition: United States of America.
- Tylor, E. B. (1871). *Primitive culture* (2 vols.). London: Murray
- West, C., & Zimmerman, D. (1987). Doing gender. *Gender & Society*, 1, 125-151.
- Wojcik, W., Bhugra, D. (2010). Loss and cultural bereavement. In D. Bhugra, T. Craig and K. S. Bhui, eds., *Mental Health of Refugees and Asylum Seekers*. Oxford: *Oxford University Press*.
- Yalçın, V. (2021). Anadolu Aleviliğinin Kolektif Melankolisi: Feda Edilemeyen İmgenin Tiranlığı (Unpublished Master Thesis). Istanbul Bilgi University, Istanbul.
- Yalçınkaya, A. (1996). Alevilikte Toplumsal Kurumlar ve İktidar, No: 17, Ankara: Mülkiyeliler Birliği Vakfı Yayınları.
- Yaman, A. (2001). *Dedelik Kurumu Ekseninde Değişim Sürecinde Alevilik*, (Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation). Istanbul University, Istanbul. Retrieved From: <http://nek.istanbul.edu.tr:4444/ekos/TEZ/35173.pdf>.
- Yıldırım, A. (2018). *Reconsidering The Negotiation Among Intersecting Identities: Lgbt+ Alevi in Istanbul* (Unpublished Master Thesis). Istanbul Bilgi University, Istanbul.

CHAPTER II

RESEARCH ARTICLE

2.1. INTERGENERATIONAL TRANSMISSION OF FATHERHOOD VIEW OF BOWEN FAMILY SYSTEMS THEORY

Bowen family therapy is one of the most important family therapy theories, although it is not the first to work with families, it is among the systematic-based approaches. Bowen, like Nathan Ackerman, was a psychiatrist who was interested in working with families while working at the Menninger Clinic. As early as 1951, he began to demand that disturbed children live in the same hospital environment as their mother's offspring (Gladding, 2015, p.234). From this experience, he became interested in studying the “mother–patient symbiosis”. This symbiosis is the intense bond that develops between the parent and the child and does not allow either person to decouple himself from the other. He recognized that the characteristics exhibited by a schizophrenic family were similar to the symptoms in many dysfunctional families (Bowen, 1978, p. 3 - 4).

The theory of family systems has radically moved away from earlier models describing the emotional functioning of human, thanks to its conceptualization of the family as an emotional unit (Bowen & Kerr, 1988, p.6). Intergenerational family therapy is based on the assumption that the origin family relationships and events that occur and continue to occur in the origin families of the clients predispose them to develop existing life problems in procreation families (Brown, 1999; Carr, 2006; Gatfield, 2017).

The first key concept of Bowen’s Family System Theory is differentiation. Differentiation is the ability to protect oneself in the face of high anxiety (staying autonomous in a highly emotional state). This differentiation includes behaviors that the self has not previously practiced in life practices within the family system, as well as changes in the relationship and functioning between thinking and emotional connection. That is why differentiation is internal and relational (Bowen

& Kerr, 1988, p.93-94). Emotions are a physiological process. Emotions can be defined as thoughts that name and mediate emotions, give them meaning. Anyone can develop symptoms under sufficient stress; people with a higher level of differentiation will be able to withstand more stress and heal themselves faster, even when symptoms have occurred (Bowen & Kerr, 1988, p.112-113).

As Papero (1990, p. 48) noted, the level of differentiation of any individual is best observed in anxious family conditions and he stated that “To the degree that one can thoughtfully guide personal behavior in accordance with well defined principles in spite of intense anxiety in the family, he or she displays a level or degree of differentiation.”

Goldenberg and Goldenberg (2008, p.180) stated that the main thing here is not to end the relationship emotionally or to isolate an objective attitude or feelings that the opposite side does not hear. It is quite important to give more effort to maintain balance, to open up space for self-understanding. However, in doing so, the following issue should not be missed. One should not lose the ability to express emotions for the sake of seeking balance. The main thing here is not to suppress emotions, but to balance how they are experienced.

The second key concept of Bowen’s Family System Theory is triangulation. The triangle defines the dynamic equilibrium of a three-person system. The greatest influence on the activity of a triangle is anxiety. At times, when anxiety is declining, the relationship between two people can be calm and relaxed. However, since a relationship can be easily disturbed by both internal and external emotional factors, usually this calm does not last very long. Inevitably, there is also an increase in anxiety to some extent, which disrupts the balance of the relationship. A two-person system can be balanced as long as it is calm, but since it is very difficult to maintain this calm, a two-person system is characterized as unstable with a more accurate definition. When anxiety increases, a third person is involved in the tension of the dyad, and a triangle is formed (Bowen & Kerr, 1988, p.135).

The level of differentiation of any person reflects the degree to which an individual can be emotionally independent of other people, both from the family and from the other. A moderate or high level of differentiation allows interaction

with others without fear of fusion. A person does not feel as if his self-perception is lost in a relationship. As the fusion and emotional ups and downs increase, one's intention to create a triangle to maintain one's own existence in a more comfortable way is expected to increase. In addition, the fact that there is a less differentiated family member does not mean that he will not be prone to forming a triangle. The processes of differentiation and individualization of the self are also quite related to the concept of triangulation (Goldenberg & Goldenberg, 2008, p.182).

Bowen did not suggest that the triangulation process is necessarily dysfunctional, but the concept is a useful way to grasp the idea that the original tension is acting elsewhere (Brown, 1999). For example, it can become problematic when the involvement of a third party prevents members of a dyad from resolving relationship stalemates. If a third-party steps in, the duo's focus may shift to criticizing this new stranger or worrying about this person. This prevents the duo from solving their original grievances and tensions (Nichols, 2016, p.71).

Bowen and Kerr (1988, p. 135) stressed that triangles in human relationships last forever. When the emotional and behavioral functioning of a triangle is fixed over time, it usually lives longer than the people who make it up. Even if a member of the triangle leaves the system, usually another person quickly fills his place. Even if actors come and go, the game has been played, and the scene has been exhibited and these can be transferred to the same pattern for generations. Children can unknowingly get into issues that have never been discussed before and start conflicts that have never happened before.

The third key concept of Bowen's Family System Theory is multigenerational transmission process. Bowen and Kerr (1988, p. 224) defined multigenerational transmission process as:

“In contrast to the assumption of a random and unpredictable process or to the assumption of a process linked only to genetic transmission, family systems theory assumes that individual differences in functioning and multigenerational trends in functioning reflect an orderly and predictable relationship process that connects the functioning of family members across generations.”

The context in which the process of multigenerational transmission is primarily based on relationships shows us that no human child has been born like a blank page since its birth. Many things begin to be transferred from their upper generations while they are still in the womb, and this continues for a lifetime (Bowen & Kerr, 1988, p. 224). Human is a flexible organism. Human is shaped by what is transferred to it and the environment into which it is born.

Bowen's Family Systems Theory contains the basic theoretical framework of this study, which is aimed at an in-depth understanding of the intergenerational transmission of fatherhood. Therefore, it was necessary to define Bowen's essential concepts of "differentiation of self", "triangulation", and "multigenerational transmission process" to better and deeper understanding of intergenerational transmission of fatherhood. For this purpose, the intergenerational transmission of fatherhood is described in the following literature.

Many studies show that the parental behavior, attitudes, feelings of a generation can be influenced by the parenting style and behavior of previous generations (Belsky, Conger, & Capaldi, 2009). Two essential aspects of parenting style have been drawn as huge impact for child development that are acceptance/responsiveness and discipline/control (Maccoby & Martin, 1983; as cited in, Hofferth, Pleck & Vesely, 2012). It has been shown that the togetherness of acceptance and behavioral control (authoritative parenting) leads to the most positive developmental results. Acceptance sends a message to the child that their needs are seen and heard, while behavioral control also places a limit on the child and also gives a sense of self-confidence. Meeting the needs and feeling of trust are also very important for the development of the child (Steinberg, 2001). When modeling parenting across generations it is quite important that two dimensions can be distinguished; factors of affecting discipline may differ from those affecting warmth (Simons, Whitbeck, Conger, & Chyi-In, 1991).

Capaldi, Pears, Patterson, & Owen (2003) considered that there are two main ways in which parenting can be passed down through the generations. One of them is direct, and the other is the transfer of parenthood by indirect means. The direct path is a consequence of observational or social learning (Bandura, 1976).

The second potential pathway is indirect; as a child, children who experience less warm and harsher parenting interact with others, leading to higher levels of aggressive behavior. This can also lead to the fact that in the future, as a young adult, he will also more aggressively parent his own children. (Simons et al., 1991).

Authoritative monitoring and control from studies examining parenting and positive development have been associated with positive adolescent development (positive interpersonal relationships, social participation, positive self-concept, and academic achievement) (Chen & Kaplan, 2001). This, in turn, has been associated with more constructive parenting practices for their own children (Chen & Kaplan, 2001; Kerr, Capaldi, Pears, & Owen, 2009).

The study which interviewed men from three different subcultures of Silverstein, Auerbach & Levant (2002) showed that the past father-son relationship is an important element in the current relationships established with children. It has been reported that most of the participants described emotionally distant relationships with their fathers and tried to change the inadequate sides in their past relationships in their own fatherhood, but it was also noted that this was not easy.

According to Hauari and Hollingworth (2009), fathers exhibit more compensatory behaviors in their relationship with their own children than modeling behavior. This means that fathers are trying to change themselves, rather than repeating the past.

Schönpflug and Phalet study of migrant families (2001) claim that despite the gap that migration and acculturation processes can create between generations, empathetic and constructive relationships between father and son facilitate the transmission of values.

2.2. THE PRESENT STUDY

Migration is a fundamental change that can go from uprooting to breaking up. Indeed, migration has a number of changes: the environment; language and forms of communication; the loss of the social network; changing social roles and family roles; restrictions on religious practices and respect for religious

prohibitions; rules and laws. Leaving the “envelope”, the migrant loses the familiar sounds, places, smells and all kinds of sensations that are the basis of psychological functioning (Moro, 2003).

Contemporary Turkish families are the latest products of the social, economic and cultural transformations that Turkey has been experiencing for many years. It is possible to see that some values, norms and attitudes regarding interpersonal relations, gender and family relations, as well as ongoing modernization processes, are still under the influence of strict cultural rules (Sunar and Fişek, 2005).

In this context, the current study seeks to examine how different migrated father generations participate in fatherhood and the experiences of migrated fathers; how migration affects fatherhood; and the processes by which fatherhood is transmitted in Alevi fathers who migrated to Izmir from different cities in Turkey. Two generational chains of men will be selected from Turkey; five chains of first generation (migrant) fathers and five chains of second-generation fathers who will be the son of first-generation fathers.

In particular, Alevis in Turkey have been challenged difficult events in the Çorum, Malatya, Maraş and Gazi Neighborhoods due to both their religious and ethnic identities. Because of this, they also have migrated. A review of the national literature on the topic revealed, there isn't any study about the migrated Alevi Fathers in Turkey (Ulusal Tez Merkezi, 2022). This thesis proposal is also important in terms of making a small contribution to this gap in the field of issues such as Alevi fatherhood, migration, and intergenerational transmission.

In this regard, this study aims to contribute to the literature on Alevi Fathers of Turkey. Other purposes are to explore the intergenerational transmission of migration and fatherhood, deeper and better understanding about being an Alevi Father in Turkey and the impact of migration on parenting and relationships.

2.3. THE PRIMARY INVESTIGATOR (PI)

I am a Turkish man who is 29 years old. I was born in Izmir, and I have spent most of my life living in Izmir. I am single and I am not a father. I am the third child of my family. I have 2 older sisters. My origin family is Alevi, and one part of my identity is being an Alevi adult. My father has migrated from his village where is in Dikili which is another township at Izmir to Menemen to work. Now, I am studying clinical psychology at İstanbul Bilgi University's master's program with an emphasis on family and couples' therapy. In terms of theoretical orientation, I would describe myself as an systemic integrative therapist that is including systemic, psychodynamic, and existential perspectives.

Growing up in a culturally minority family that has come to a different culture after migration was quite difficult for me to find a meaning for being different as a child. As an Alevi child, it was quite difficult to balance the effort to adapt to the culture that my family came into, and the contradictions caused by this adaptation process. I found a solution to this situation by hiding being an Alevi when I was a child. Over time, this situation had turned into removing Alevism from my life so much that I completely forgot about my Alevi identity. However, this situation also has meant that I have been assimilated and eventually have been became a loss for my own culture, and especially for my father. This situation also caused me to have more conflicts with my father and feel misunderstood. But underneath, it was the fear and anxiety that my father had, about losing me. I have realized this a long time later.

I have observed that this issue, which I have experienced in my own life, has also been experienced on the axis of protectionism and independence among the first and second generations participating in the study. First-generation fathers tended to protect themselves and their families more after emigration. For the second generation, this protection was more about gaining one's own individuality than about oppression. Perhaps, over time, every step taken towards decomposition began to be regarded not as a loss. One of the factors that ensured this was the new insights gained by the second generation about their own father as they grew up.

The second generations were able to speak more clearly about both fatherhood and migration, as well as about their families.

In this context, I have created my research questions by being an Alevi father in Turkey, wondering about the effects of migration on this process and the patterns transmitted between generations. I was interested in the childhood of people who went through similar processes with me, the experiences of Alevism, the processes of fatherhood, and the impact of migration on this process, and eventually the similarities and differences of different generations with each other.

During my university days, I took part in an Erasmus Project related to migration. Afterwards, I was in Van as part of the social responsibility project to help people who lost their homes in the Van Earthquake. I conducted field work as a volunteer in families who came to Izmir with forced migration. I took a course in migration psychology when I was in the third grade of my undergraduate degree. All these volunteering and field experiences have also made me work on my curiosity about these issues.

A review of the national literature on the topic revealed, there isn't any study about the migrated Alevi Fathers in Turkey. This study is also important in terms of making a small contribution to this gap in the field of issues such as Alevi fatherhood, migration, and intergenerational transmission. Research on intergenerational transmission and being a minority was usually conducted between mothers and daughters (Marazyan, 2016; Şulam, 2019). In this regard, this study aims to contribute to the literature on Alevi Fathers of Turkey. Other purposes are to explore the intergenerational transmission of migration and fatherhood, deeper and better understanding about being an Alevi Father in Turkey and the impact of migration on parenting and relationships.

I am also an Alevi adult and sharing the same identity with the participants made it easier for me to reach them because they trusted to me easier. On the other hand, sharing the same identity with the participant made it easier to me for understanding participants experiences. But also, being from same town may have make them hesitant about confidentiality. In addition that, finding participants was quite difficult even for me because everybody didn't want to talk about own past

life experiences. Beginning of the interviews sometimes was hard for me and for the participants. Both of us felt anxious. Especially when we came to questions about fatherhood, this anxiety which we felt decreased. Participants started to smile after remembering his fatherhood. As a result, the interviews proceeded more easily.

I have tried to explore the intergenerational transmission of migration and fatherhood, deeper and better understanding about being an Alevi Father in Turkey and the impact of migration on parenting and relationships from the perspective of Bowen's Family Systems Theory. It has been difficult for me from time to time to read some difficult experiences over and over again while analyzing my data. However, some of the sub-themes also gave me hope, and I also needed to see this hope quite a lot in this process.

In the summary of all these thoughts, the point where I said that I am in the field of couples and family therapy track in my 3-year master's degree adventure was the analysis of the film *My Father and Son* (Avşar & Irmak, 2005).

“Sadık”, one of the main characters of the film, left his family living in an Aegean Town for his own ideals. at the end of the 1980s, it was never easy for him and his father to return to his father's house again. This film analysis coincided with the time when I left Izmir for the first time for this master's degree, and the issues of separation from the root family here occupied an important place in my own life, as well as this thesis. I still have that word in mind in this movie as following sentences:

“Give him a room, dad. Let him have a house, but a house where he can come out and enter from time to time...” (Avşar & Irmak, 2005).

Now I am approaching the end of this process with a thesis in which I am trying to understand fatherhood in more depth.

2.4. METHOD

2.4.1. Participants

10 participants (first-generation and second-generation father dyads) from 5 different families were found to join the study. I am also an Alevi adult so; convenience sampling method (Patton, 2002) was used through word of mouth. While preparing for the interviews, the researcher asked the family and friends if they know families who fulfill the criteria for joining the study. In addition, to reach the participant who can reach first-generation and second-generation Alevi fathers online networks such as 'Psikoalan' and 'Bilgi Klinik Camia' was used via sending an e-mail. Also, this study was announced in social media accounts (Instagram) and WhatsApp groups with a brief summary of inclusion criteria and the duration of the interviews (see Appendix E).

Çelik (2005) claimed that there has been a large wave of internal migration that began in the second half of the 1980s and increased well into the early 1990s. During this migration process, people migrated from Eastern and Southeastern Anatolia to many parts of the country. Many people have left their villages and moved either to other urban centers near their villages or to cities in Western Anatolia. Through the migration process, a significant part of the population has established a life for themselves in the slums surrounding Istanbul, Ankara, Izmir and Adana.

As Çelik (2005) claimed that movement after 1980, this study was conducted with first-generation Alevi fathers who migrated due to this migration movement after the 1980 and until the second quarter of the 1990s, and then with second-generation children who became fathers in their wake. That's why this sample was chosen where the participants have lived in Izmir.

Following the İstanbul Bilgi University Ethics Committee's approval, the researcher started to get in contact with the volunteer participants by calling them to establish a meeting day. Inclusion criteria for the first-generation fathers is that; (1) migrate from hometown to another place, (2) being the first generation to migrate, because the study seeks to explore the intergenerational transmission of

migration which is coming from first generation and fatherhood which is shaped by first generation fathers migration, deeper and better understanding about being an Alevi Father in Turkey and the impact of migration which is coming from first generation on parenting and relationships, (3) the migration occurred at least 18 years ago because under normal circumstances, the legal age limit for a lower generation to be a father in Turkey is 18. Inclusion criteria for the second-generation is that; (1) being a father who hasn't migrated because the study searches how first-generation Alevi father's migration experiences transmit second-generation. To be able to easily follow the experiences of each first- and second-generation fathers dyad, the researcher classified each dyad with different number and each generation with also different numbers (1=First Dyad, F=Father, 1=First Generation or 2=Second Generation) such as 1F1 – 1F2, 2F1 – 2F2, 3F1 – 3F2, 4F1 – 4F2 and 5F1- 5F2.

First Family

First Generation Father (1F1) is middle age. The city where he was born is Muş. The city he migrated to is Izmir. He migrated nearly 35 years ago. He has nearly 10 siblings and half of them are girl and half of them is boy. He is a high school graduate. He is a married civil servant with a moderate socio-economic status. He has not received psychological support before.

Second Generation Father (1F2) is nearly 30 years old. He lives in Izmir. In his life, there is no migration history from Izmir. Nearly He has 3 girl siblings. He is a university graduate. He is a married teacher with a moderate socio-economic status. He has not received psychological support before.

Second Family

First Generation Father (2F1) is middle age. The city where he was born is Elazığ. The city he migrated to is Izmir. He migrated nearly 40 years ago. He has nearly 10 siblings and most of them are girl. His occupation is retired. He is a secondary school graduate. His marital status is married. His economic status is moderate. He has not received psychological support before.

Second Generation Father (2F2) is nearly 35 years old. He lives in Izmir. In his life, there is no migration history from Izmir. Nearly he has 5 siblings and most

of them are girl. He is a university graduate. He is a married worker with a moderate socio-economic status. He has not received psychological support before.

Third Family

First Generation Father (3F1) is at aging years. The city where he was born is Tunceli. The city he migrated to is Izmir. He migrated nearly 30 years ago. He has nearly 10 siblings and most of them boys. His occupation is retired. He is a primary school graduate. His marital status is married. His economic status is moderate. He has not received psychological support before.

Second Generation Father (3F2) is nearly 25 years old. He lives in Izmir. In his life, there is no migration history from Izmir. He has 5 siblings and most of them boys. He is a university graduate. He is a married worker with a moderate socio-economic status. He has received psychological support before.

Fourth Family

First Generation Father (4F1) is at aging years. The city where he was born is Tunceli. The city he migrated to is Izmir. He migrated nearly 45 years ago. He hasn't got any sibling. His occupation is retired. He is a literate. His marital status is married. His economic status is moderate. He has not received psychological support before.

Second Generation Father (4F2) is nearly 35 years old. He lives in Izmir. In his life, there is no migration history from Izmir. He has nearly 8 siblings and half of them are girl and half of them is boy. He is a secondary school graduate. He is a married worker with a moderate socio-economic status. He hasn't received psychological support before.

Fifth Family

First Generation Father (5F1) is at aging years. The city where he was born is Tunceli. The city which he migrated to is Izmir. Nearly he migrated 35 years ago. He has nearly 10 siblings and most of them are boys. His occupation is retired. He is a secondary school graduate. His marital status is married. His economic status is moderate. He has not received psychological support before.

Second Generation Father (5F2) is nearly 30 years old. He lives in Izmir. In his life, there is no migration history from Izmir. He has nearly 5 siblings and most

of them are boys. He is a university graduate. He is a married technician with a moderate socio-economic status. He hasn't received psychological support before.

Table 1*Demographic Characteristics of Participants*

P. no	Age Description	Sibling Number	Migration History	Education Level	Economic Status	Marital Status	Psychological Support History
1F1	Middle Age	Nearly 10	From Muş to İzmir Nearly 35 years ago	High School	Moderate	Married	No
2F1	Middle Age	Nearly 10	From Elazığ to İzmir Nearly 40 years ago	Secondary School	Moderate	Married	No
3F1	Aging Years	Nearly 10	From Tunceli to İzmir Nearly 30 years ago	Primary School	Moderate	Married	No
4F1	Aging Years	No Sibling	From Tunceli to İzmir Nearly 45 years ago	Literate	Moderate	Married	No
5F1	Aging Years	Nearly 10	From Tunceli to İzmir Nearly 35 years ago	Secondary School	Moderate	Married	No
1F2	Nearly 30	Nearly 3	No	University Graduate	Moderate	Married	No
2F2	Nearly 35	Nearly 5	No	University Graduate	Moderate	Married	No
3F2	Nearly 25	Nearly 5	No	University Graduate	Moderate	Married	Yes
4F2	Nearly 35	Nearly 8	No	Secondary School	Moderate	Married	No
5F2	Nearly 30	Nearly 5	No	University Graduate	Moderate	Married	No

2.4.2. Settings and Procedure

The researcher conducted semi-structured interviews lasting about half an hour to an hour via Turkish conversation with each participant. Compared to the first-generation fathers, the interviews of the second-generation fathers took longer. During the interviews, audio recordings were taken with the permission of the participants and the recordings were transcribed into written documents.

The semi-structured interview questions were prepared by the researcher and the thesis advisor through the adaptation of the previous literature about the intergenerational transmission of trauma of Armenian women (Marazyan, 2016). Interview questionnaire is created of questions regarding being Alevi father in Turkey, their migration related experiences and its effects on their fatherhood, their own migration related past and current experiences, their relationship with their children and the communication of migration across generations (see Appendix A). If the participants expressed the need for clarification for the questions, the researcher clarified and gave more detail.

Interviews were held in participant's home where confidentiality was ensured, and participant felt comfortable and secure. The interviews were held in a room where the participants and the researcher can be alone and feel relaxed. With this way, confidentiality was ensured. This means that face to face interviews were held in Izmir. All the interviews were held face to face way. Interviews lasted between half an hour and one hour and conducted in Turkish language.

Before the interviews started the researcher will read the informed consent to the participants and will give it to them to read and sign (see Appendix B). The consent form consisted of confidentiality and the right to skip questions or terminate the interview anytime.

In addition, information was provided that if the interview caused any Post Traumatic Stress Symptoms that (a) "Intrusion" (re-experiencing) symptoms includes recurrent memories, recurrent dreams, feeling of recurrence, distress at re-exposure, physiological reactivity, (b) "Avoidance Symptoms" about memories, thoughts, feelings and external reminders (places, people, conversation, activity,

object, situation), (c) “Negative Cognition/Mood” includes poor memory, negative self-Concept, cause/consequences (blaming self/ others), low Interest/Participation, detachment/estrangement, loss of positive emotions (American Psychiatric Association, 2013, p. 271 – 274), participants were being able to contact the researcher for the referral to the therapeutic service, where they would receive services at the appropriate fee. An addendum form which provided contact information of therapeutic service will be given to the participants (see Appendix C). During the interviews, no referrals were made for the therapeutic service because no participants indicated any symptoms of post-traumatic stress. The demographic form is presented in Appendix D.

Two pilot interviews with one father- son dyad was employed to make sure the questions were easily understood, and they explored what it was intended. If there is a change in the question forms, PI and advisor would configure it for the rest of the interviews. If there was no change, the planned interviews with other 10 participants would be conducted separately. No revision needed after the pilot study. So, pilot study was added in the analyses. It is planned to do interviews with each dyad at the same day. For example, one day will be spent for one dyad. It is aimed to prevent participants from talking to and influencing each other that is why, the planned interviews with other 10 participants will be conducted separately.

2.4.3. Data Analysis

In this study, Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) was used for data analysis (Smith & Pietkiewicz, 2014). Interpretive Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) was used to examine a deeper understanding of how participants make meaning of their life experiences and perceptions through the interpretations of the researcher (Smith & Pietkiewicz, 2014). Interpretive Phenomenological Analysis was used in this study to obtain an in-depth understanding of the how different generations engage in fathering and the experience of being fathered; how migration influences fatherhood; and the processes by which fathering is transmitted. Coding was including 3 parts which means descriptive, linguistic,

conceptual. When creating descriptive codes, it was analyzed how these codes were carried in a language and in what context they appeared.

Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) requires six operations: '(a) translating audio recordings into original transcripts, (b) writing exploratory comments about original transcripts, (c) multiple reading and making notes, (d) transforming notes into emergent themes, (e) seeking relationships and clustering themes, (f) producing the report that includes both the participant's account of his or her experience in his or her own words, and interpretative commentary of the researcher' (Smith & Pietkiewicz, 2014). MAXQDA Software program was utilized to code each session and form the themes.

While using Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA), trying to step into the participants' shoes is recommended as far as possible (Smith & Pietkiewicz, 2014). I am also an Alevi adult and sharing the same identity with the participants may be sometimes easy for understanding participants experiences, but it also might be challenging for the researcher from time to time. Primary Investigator (PI) part was written in which these issues were discussed.

2.4.4 Trustworthiness

The data was analyzed by the primary investigator (PI) and İdil Biriken Gürses who is a thesis student in Clinical Psychology Master's Program at Bilgi University will be a peer debriefer. Peer debriefer provided feedback during thematization. Also, feedbacks were taken by thesis advisor during thematization. Field notes were written after each interview. It is aimed to establish a triangulation between the researcher and the data by using these two ways that are member checking (Lincoln and Guba, 1985) and writing field notes. Field notes were written and checked. Member checking were done for giving information about results and taking feed backs from participants. With this way, it is aimed to increase the trustworthiness of the research.

2.5 RESULTS

Four themes emerged from the analysis of the interviews: Difficulties of being an Alevi man, being Alevi father in Turkey, walking through new fatherhood and fatherhood transitions from 1st to 2nd generations in the passing times (Table 1). To be able to easily follow the experiences of each first- and second-generation fathers dyad, the researcher classified each dyad with different number and each generation with also different numbers (1=First Dyad, F=Father, 1=First Generation or 2=Second Generation) such as 1F1 – 1F2, 2F1 – 2F2, 3F1 – 3F2, 4F1 – 4F2 and 5F1- 5F2. The quotes are labeled 1F1, 1F2 etc. via using this way.

2.5.1. Difficulties of Being an Alevi Man

Table 2

Summary of First Theme

Themes	Subthemes	Illustrative Example
	Difficulties that Have Happen in the Past	<i>“We live in such an environment that we couldn't figure out what we were living in, who we were. (1F1)</i>
Difficulties of Being an Alevi Man	Coercivity of Exclusionary Behaviors	<i>“Of course, these things make you sad whether you want to or not.” (4F2)</i>
	What am I doing here?	<i>“Then you're living in contradictions, and you are saying who am I and what am I.” (1F1)</i>

This main theme has emerged in the participants' narratives around the difficulties they have experienced in the past, the difficulties they have experienced due to the exclusionary behaviors they have been exposed to, and the difficulties they have experienced due to the contradictions they have experienced. In the

narratives of all participants, it was explained that there are difficulties that they experience in different time periods.

It is the most important issues that first-generation fathers, especially those who are struggling with economic difficulties one-on-one, trying to exist in a new society, differ from the second generation. The second generation of fathers are also trying to find a balance between their own culture and the culture which they emigrated was the main divergence issues of fathers and sons. Protecting family from the difficulties was the main convergence issues of fathers and sons.

2.5.1.1. Past Difficulties

In this sub-theme, the difficulties experienced by both first- and second-generation fathers in the past due to being an Alevi individual are mentioned. Participant 1F1 has mentioned the contradictions of being an Alevi child in the past as follows:

“An Alevi boy living in the West is not considered an Alevi at work. For example, when we said that we were Alevi, it is said that there is no such thing as an Alevi in the west, you are a Kurd. You have had to live in a lot of contradictions, it's not easy to grow up as an Alevi child.” (1F1)

These contradictions have also created difficulties in defining their own identities. Participant 1F1 expressed his difficulties in identifying himself as a child: *“We live in such an environment that we couldn't figure out what we were living in, who we were. On the one hand, here is your Alevism... It is not easy to be an Alevi child in these conditions because we have been experiencing many contradictions.”*

2F2 who is the one of the second-generation fathers has experienced the difficulties of being an Alevi individual in the past just like 1F1. He uttered the following:

“The things we have experienced in the past, of course, were mostly very distressing processes of existence. It was very difficult to exist as an Alevi individual in this society, especially until the end of 96-97, it was very difficult. In other words, we are saying that from the 96s to the end of the

97s, this was not actually the beginning. The process before that was also dark. After that, it gradually began to open up, but when I studied at the university, I also experienced great difficulties even there as an Alevi individual. Of course, this was a darker, but also my childhood is darker than, but it continued to lighten up a little during this process. A habitable Turkey for the Alevi gradually has begun to form.”

It has also been mentioned here that these difficult processes have become lighter over time. 2F2 expressed this process in these words: *"When you say Alevism, Alevism used to be seen by the community as a concept containing risks. Alevism carried risks. So that's how society perceived it. The majority perceived it that way, but there is no such risk at the moment."*

In all these sentences, the participants mentioned the difficulties they had experienced in the past, but it was also stated that this difficulty has continued to decrease over time.

2.5.1.2. Coercivity of Exclusionary Behaviors

In the narratives of the participants, it was observed that they were subjected to exclusionary behaviors in various fields due to their Alevi identity, especially in the early stages of migration. These exclusionary behaviors forced the participants and caused them to question their identity. One of the participants mentioned that it was difficult to find a home because of his Alevi identity at the first times of migration, the other participant could not exist in society as an Alevi, and the other participant mentioned that their friendship relations were cut off when his Alevism was learned by his friends' family in childhood. All these narratives give us information about how difficult it is to be excluded.

1F1 has emphasized the dilemmas that he has experienced and that he cannot exist in society as an Alevi himself such as:

“... on the contrary, we have always been stuck in a dilemma. Like I just told you, so you were going somewhere, and you were saying you are Alevi and they were saying that there was no such thing as an Alevi, you are not

an Alevi, so we have also encountered such things as a Kurd or a Sunni. We had more contradictions; we were more excluded.” (1F1)

As can be seen here, especially in the early times of migration, migration has led to not only the loss of a place, but also a lot of identity and self-definition. It has left the person in contradictions with this uncertainty.

5F1 emphasized that migration was difficult to find a place to live in the early days via the following words:

“... Contempt for the Alevi. Here's the exclusion. The Alevis were in this kind of thing. For example, you came to some places. It also happened in Izmir at the first times of migration. You were an Easterner, you were an Alevi, so he did not rent a house. After that, there are various troubles at work. You looked different when you're Alevi.”

There are also difficulties in the story of this person caused by the fact that he cannot find a place to live just because of his identity.

4F2 stressed that during his childhood, he tried to overcome the difficulties that he experienced after migration by establishing new friendships. However, when the Alevi identity was learned by the families of their friends, some families cut off this friendship. This exclusionary attitude has itself been challenging for a child who has migrated:

“After the migration, you are gradually starting to gain a new environment and you are starting to make new friends. After the migration, there were certain difficulties. After going through certain traumas, something began to settle down, but still in certain societies. I don't know, the kid doesn't know anything, for example. As a child, you play, you travel, you do things. No problem. But when his parents know you, when they hear that you are an Alevi, they want him to stop talking to the child and say words that exclude you. So, there is some rhetoric. I won't say it here if you want it. Ugly things about Alevism, for example, don't play with them, they are like that, they were hearing terms like that. Of course, these things make you sad whether you want to or not.” (4F2)

2.5.1.3. What am I doing here?

This sub-theme is both similar to the other sub-themes under this theme and can also be considered as a result of these sub-themes. Although this sub-theme was concentrated in only one participant, it was highly related to other sub-themes. Here, as a result of the difficulties of being an Alevi man in various fields, the participant found himself unable to feel belonging to the place he migrated to. It's like he's alienated from the place where he migrated to. At the end of the processes involving many contradictions about feeling of belonging, questions such as "What am I doing here," which also gave its name to this sub-theme, rotate in the participant's mind.

The contradictions in the story of 1F1 were the result of the fact that the Alevi identity was not recognized where he migrated. He said the following:

“There were always contradictions. The biggest problem is already that contradiction, so you are calling yourself an Alevi somewhere, for example, but the society you live in does not consider you as an Alevi and then ignores you. Then you're living in contradictions, and you are saying who am I and what am I. They don't accept you as an Alevi. Are you living in conflict, am I Alevi, Turkish or Kurdish? So, you're growing up in that contradiction.”
(1F1)

In these sentences, we can see that a person is now drifting towards a place where he has a hard time defining himself due to the fact that he is not recognized by the society he migrated to.

It was also stated that there were conflicts between siblings born in the hometown and in the place of migration. While those born in the place of emigration feel belonging to the society, those born in their hometowns do not feel like they belong to the place of migration and this situation has been expressed in the following words: “*Of course, now some of us have grown up where we emigrated. Some of us also grew up where we came from and of course, there are contradictions and troubles between us, whether we want to or not. Our brothers*

and sisters who grew up here and grew up here when they were younger feel like they belong here. We also constantly feel that we belong to the place where we migrated which is our hometown. Of course, we are experiencing the difficulties of this. So even if it's not a big problem, we've always had this dilemma within ourselves.” (1F1)

In summary, all these contradictions and inquiries continue no matter how many years the migration takes. 1F1 directly stated that:

“I mean, it looks like I've been here for 30, 33 years. I haven't adopted this place yet. For example, I also have a 1-month permission per a year. I have been using this permission in Varto for 33 years. I mean, we haven't felt like we have belonged here. So, this is not something that is more caused by us. Of course, we have come here to feel like we belong. When we came here to live, but the things as I just told you before were lived like constantly excluded, you are constantly ignored, you are constantly questioned about your identity, you are questioned about who you are, whether you think or not, who you are. What are you doing here, so you don't want to be here? You're saying you're an outcast here, you're saying what are you doing here? But you must live because, after all, you have built a life here, you have built a future. God willing, when I retire, I will settle down in my own village and make myself a home.” (1F1)

All these interrogations reminded me of a supervisor's promise that being everywhere also means being nowhere. It's like there are two places in a person's story, but there's no place at all.

2.5.2. Being Alevi Father in Turkey

Table 3

Summary of Second Theme

Themes	Subthemes	Illustrative Example
Being Alevi Father in Turkey	Defining Alevism as Honesty	<i>"...actions such as being virtuous, helping people, not violating people's rights and you will not look at the neighbors' thing." (5F1)</i>
	Alevism as Tolerance	<i>"I haven't seen him treat my friends like who this is, where this is from." (2F2)</i>
	Concealment of Alevism Identity	<i>"You always feel the need to hide yourself." (1F2)</i>
	Being Able to Live Alevism Over Time	<i>"Gradually, we began to express ourselves there." (4F2)</i>
	İzmir as a Democratic City	<i>"It became more comfortable to settle in Izmir." (3F2)</i>

One of the main objectives in this study was to understand what it was like to experience being an Alevi father in Turkey. This theme has five sub-themes, namely 'Defining Alevism as honesty', 'Alevism as tolerance', "Concealment of Alevism identify', 'Being able to live Alevism in time' and 'İzmir as a livable city'. These sub-themes show being Alevi Father in Turkey via the experiences of the participants.

2.5.2.1. Defining Alevism as Honesty

Being honest is one of the main experiences of Alevi fathers from different generations about becoming an Alevi father in Turkey. This act of being honest is described with the phrase *“To be able to control your hand, tongue and waist”* which is the basic philosophy of Alevis. However, actions such as being virtuous, helping people, not violating people's rights, not harming people are expressed under being honest.

In describing being honest in Alevism, 1F1 stated:

“Alevi identity means honesty and humanity for us. It means always helping the oppressed and the downtrodden. It means a lot, but first and foremost it expresses honesty, humanity. It expresses this the most.” (1F1)

As we will see in the definition of honesty here, honesty includes a state of honesty that is not only unique to himself, but also extends to the other. The other one here is the one who is oppressed and downtrodden.

As an Alevi father 2F1 underlined his being honest. In his words, *“By God, what does it mean? How am I supposed to explain this? This identity means being honest in public from our point of view. The one who sees a person as a person, and then, I don't know, doesn't do anything wrong.”*

Being honest here is also explained as being honest in the community where you live. For this narrative, it has been emphasized to be able to see a person as a person without distinguishing between people.

According to 5F1, honesty means that:

“I don't know much about Alevism, but what we heard from our father and grandfather, what was said, to be able to control your hand, tongue and waist which is the basic philosophy of Alevis. However, actions such as being virtuous, helping people, not violating people's rights and you will not look at the neighbors' thing. Thus, you'll be honest.” (5F1)

In this narrative, it has been emphasized that honesty is a value transferred between generations. He added that *“How do I define it with other ways? Honest, truthful, undeserved. After that, you will have your hands, your waist, your tongue.”*

You're not going to do something to someone else that you don't want done to you. That sort of things." (5F1)

In these sentences, honesty was again shared through the narrative of not harming others.

Being honest showed up in 2F2's narrative, as well. He said:

"We see Alevism as a philosophy of life. We see the cultural heritage given to us as living or keeping it alive in the same way. If we open this up a little more, one of the basic philosophies of Alevism is to have your hands, your waist, and your tongue. In other words, not to say bad words, not to look at someone else's honor with a side eye, not to steal, and to see everyone as equal, that is, not to discriminate between people." (2F2)

In these sentences, honesty is shared through the narrative of not harming others. However, it was emphasized that honesty is a value transferred between generations. And as the second generation, the desire to keep this value alive has been shared.

Defining Alevism as Honesty was similar for 3F2, too:

"... In other words, to be a human being is to be virtuous, to be honest, to be helpful, to be able to hold the hand of the one who is needing a help. We also see neighborly relations with your neighbor today, maybe your neighbor is dying next door, but no one knows." (3F2)

2.5.2.2. Alevism as Tolerance

One other point notable for most of the participants was that defining Alevism as honesty. Defining Alevism as honesty is explained by life practices and values such as not discriminating against people according to their identity, seeing all individuals as equal in family relationships without distinction of age and gender, respecting not only people but also the right to life of other living beings, and not discriminating against those who are not like themselves.

We can clearly see the importance of not discriminating people in the life practice of 1F1. As he said:

“So now it's not so important what the person is in our Alevism. It is enough for us to be human. Because the person who is important to us is human, so we say that our Qibla is human. This is really so. I mean, a person who has not experienced this cannot know this. He thinks that we are saying it as a promise, but what is really important to us is humanity, it is man. For example, I have friends, friends from all walks of life right now. We have never been restricted in this regard, there has been no pressure not to be friends with others, not to travel with others, not to work there. Because we learned not to discriminate between people from our parents. The important thing for us is humanity. So the identity, religion, language, race of this does not matter to us. There is no problem for us after we become human beings.”
(1F1)

As we will understand from this life practice, the identity, religion, language, race of people does not matter for 1F1. Not to discriminate between people has been learned from his parents. Similarly, the next generations have told us that their fathers tried to be tolerant of people without caring about their identity like their grandparents.

2F2 said, *“I mean, I've never seen my dad make that distinction. Or I haven't seen him treat my friends like who this is, where this is from. I mean, he's usually an egalitarian. I mean, whoever friend of mine came by didn't matter both in terms of religious, in terms of political opinion, and in terms of cultural perception. Whoever came cared the same way, with the same fatherly attitude, with the same sincerity. I mean, I didn't see him parsing it in any way.”* (2F2)

Like 2F2, 3F2 stated that:

“My father was never involved in my relationships with people of other faiths. And I have friends from other faiths, too. I also have Sunni friends. Even if they are Christians, my father cannot interfere. We have never judged people because of their beliefs. We've always looked at this, which means that no matter what your faith is, the important thing is to be a person. This is the essence of Alevism which means being a Human Being.” (3F2)

In both of these narratives, it is seen that fathers do not interfere in their children's relationships and do not discriminate against the people they communicate with.

Until the narratives here, it has been stated that tolerance in Alevism is towards people. With this, 3F2 uttered the following:

“... In Alevism, only people are not valuable. In Alevism, all living things are part of the God so, every living being is sacred and every living being has the right to live. For me, this is Alevism.” (3F2)

Here, in the narrative of 3F2, we can see the tolerance not only towards people but also towards other living and non-living beings in Alevism.

Similar to 1F1 and 3F2, 2F2 stated that he will also teach his own children about tolerance in Alevism. His words were; *“It will also be a very nice experience for them because there is no gender or age difference in our culture. Everyone is considered equal. Everyone has the right to an equal say.”* (2F2)

It is also noted here that tolerance for other people and beings is also observed in their own families, and this will also be passed on to the lower generation.

2.5.2.3. Concealment of Alevism Identity

In the two sub-themes before this sub-theme, Alevi fathers described their experiences of Alevism with the concepts of Alevism means honesty and tolerance in Alevism. At the same time, the experiences under these two themes were experiences that described themselves and their Alevi groups. However, in this sub-theme, a behavior that emerged as a result of their interaction with the culture they migrated to was described in a different way than the previous sub-themes. This behavior was concealment of Alevism identity. The concealment of Alevi identity has been described more intensively, especially in the early times of the migration.

2F2 described his family's experiences in the early days of migration and their concealment of Alevism in the following words:

“So, they came, as I said, after the migration, and of course, tried to exist. They're afraid of people. They tried to establish an economic order. They

were exposed to people's looks and conflicts. As I said, they couldn't literally express to people that they were Alevi. Even after we were born and raised and reached a certain age, there were people who found out long after that we were Alevi. They have shown a development process on being, trying to exist economically, taking care of children, raising children, educating children, being able to contribute to them economically and, in a sense, not attracting people's thunderbolts on them. It's been going on like this for a long time.” (2F2)

In these words, we don't just see the concealment of Alevi identity. Here, we also see a struggle for existence. This struggle for existence includes both keeping the family together, caring for children and surviving economically. But besides these, these sentences also include avoiding the gaze of others and not to attract lightning bolts on them.

Again, as we continue from 2F2, we can see that the concealment of Alevi identity and efforts of existing are not even talked within his family and outside. 2F2 stated that *“Sheltering, existing as an Alevi family, or generally these issues were not much talked about. And there wasn't much talk outside. No one shared it. Most people in our neighborhood didn't know we were Alevi. In other words, they tried to exist in a press both in a social sense and in an economic sense. They tried to make us exist. It's such a process.”* (2F2)

In this narrative, we see that the concealment of Alevi identity is not even spoken in the family, let alone spoken outside the family. What a lonely process it is, and how difficult this loneliness must be.

Not only adults, but also children have experienced the concealment of this Alevi identity. 5F2 stressed this with the following words:

“Of course, we had an adaptation process in Izmir after the migration. Of course, because you are from Tunceli, the things transmitted to us there are different. Easterners are transferred to people here differently. westerners are also transferred differently to those in the east. So, what the family told us when we came here is don't tell that you were from Tunceli and Alevi at school. We were saying that we were coming from Erzincan everywhere for

a while at school. While I have been growing up, I had able to say I am not from Erzincan, I am from Tunceli. We've been through these troubles. So that was our fears.” (5F2)

5F2 gave us another perspective on how to understand the experience of concealment of Alevism for a child. While he was hiding his hometown with the suggestions of his family at first, he was able to express himself as he grew up.

1F2 described this process with a metaphor which name is a cold war. He experienced via these statements:

“In fact, they have completely entered such a battlefield, but this war is not a physical war, but a purely spiritual one. You know, it's called the cold war, they went to a war like that. I mean, because they were so scared, they couldn't tell us exactly some things either, until we came of our own adulthood and realized that this is actually who we are.” (1F2)

Here again, it is explained that parents try not to pass on these difficulties to their children, no matter how hard it is. Nevertheless, over time, the participant began to realize what was not told to him. However, at the very end, he explained the place where he found himself with the following sentences:

“Life is a horror. and the more you get attached to this fear, the more you worry about everything. You're being insecure this time. You can't speak in public, you can't express what you want. You always feel the need to hide yourself.” (1F2)

Life is a horror. A place where you can't explain yourself, where you can't connect. Life seems to have finally turned into a place where you hide yourself and think that you will never get out of this place. I wonder what a person wants in such a place. What does he need to hear and see?

2.5.2.4. Being Able to Live Alevism Over Time

This sub-theme seems to indicate a time-dependent change of the previous sub-theme. At first, the Alevi identity could be lived by hiding more, but now it is

no longer needed as before. As discussed in this sub-theme, the participants stated that they experienced Alevism more comfortably over time.

Since 2F1 came to an Alevi neighborhood in the early days of his migration, he didn't have much trouble after the migration. These are the words she uttered: *"We migrated to an Alevi neighborhood. That's why we didn't have much trouble. Our neighbors were usually Alevi. There were Alevis, we didn't have much difficulty."* These statements allow us to clearly see why emigrants live together with other emigrants and the importance of this for them.

4F2 explained Alevism that they can live in time in the following words:

"... So we were completely hiding ourselves. After a while, their Cem House or Public Houses were opened. Gradually, we began to express ourselves there. Obviously, this has started to become a little common lately, but it wasn't like that at that time." (4F2)

2F2 stated his narratives which are similar to 4F2 via using these words:

"As I said, as Alevism was spoken and expressed in this society, we were able to say that we have been Alevi. After that, we went through normal life now. Otherwise, I think that our parents could not express themselves freely and could not participate freely in society in this way." (2F2)

Considering these two experiences, people started to live without hiding their Alevism identity by speaking about Alevism in public and Alevism became more visible. This made them feel that they had moved on to a more normal life. In other words, Alevism has become more comfortable to live in over time.

In this context, 1F2 shared similar experiences with the following words:

"I can say that the situation is relatively better now because behaviors such as not eating from Alevi were very current. Even their food is not eaten, it is not done, there was a lot of rhetoric such as let's keep our children away from them, but when it comes to today, I think that they have been overcome a little more. I think this is entirely due to the struggle for rights that the Alevi have given, that is." (1F2)

In this shared experience, as Alevism was recognized over time, prejudiced thoughts were also broken over time, and Alevism became easier to live with over time.

2.5.2.5. İzmir as a Democratic City

Concealment of Alevism is the second sub-theme and being able to live Alevism over time is the third sub-theme of this main theme. It is a very important sub-theme that allows us to understand the connection between these two sub-themes that İzmir is a democratic city. However, it is a sub-theme that describes how people's migration experience is in a context that allows us to understand this context. Again, because of this, it is also quite critical sub-theme.

As can be seen from the experiences on the above sub-themes, especially the first times of migration were quite difficult. However, living in İzmir has been described as a factor that somewhat reduces this difficulty.

2F2 underlined İzmir context as a livable city with the following sentences: “In other words, İzmir is a slightly more livable city in this regard right now. Maybe I can't say much about the past, about the first times we came. In the same way, I can't say much about the general structure of İzmir from the neighborhood where we live. However, perhaps our district, perhaps the whole of İzmir, was in the same position as the historical process. If we evaluate it in İzmir, maybe not in Turkey, but if we evaluate it in İzmir, I look at it positively, that is, it is in a much better state proportionally than in Turkey.” (2F2)

Although there is no assessment of the early times of migration in this narrative, it has been emphasized that living in İzmir is more positive right now.

3F2 explained that people of different races live in tolerance in İzmir as:

“Yes, we have not seen such discrimination in İzmir. Of course, it's not just Alevi in our circle of friends here. Of course, we are surrounded by Laz, Circassian, Kurd, and my wife is a Kurd, so she is not an Alevi. In other words, I don't know if it's the air or the water of İzmir, a little more tolerance

prevails in Izmir. I don't know how to know in other provinces because I haven't had any experience, but there is that tolerance in Izmir." (3F2)

He noted that they interact not only with Alevi, but also with people of other races in tolerance.

When it comes to 3F2, we see that he explains that there is a chance to live in Izmir by evaluating the possibility of living in other cities.

"Where I have migrated, that is, in Izmir, you have experienced the identity of Alevism. There is no such problem in Izmir, so there is no religious pressure. But Istanbul is difficult. In Istanbul, people couldn't say I was an Alevi until 20 years ago. Because there were Neighborhood pressures at that time. There is no such problem in Izmir. Izmir is a more democratic city. You haven't been forced to do somethings, so you can say your faith any way you want. You can live your Alevism faith any way you want in Izmir. In fact, our chance is to settle in Izmir. It became more comfortable to settle in Izmir. If we had gone to Istanbul or Ankara, we would have had a more difficult process." (3F2)

In these sentences, we see that the fact that it is more comfortable to live in Izmir is explained by the possibility of living in other cities.

Like 3F2, 5F2 explained that living in İzmir is more comfortable by evaluating the possibility of living in other provinces with the following words:

"... My family came from Tunceli. I already had an Alevi community there, so I haven't seen any pressure. Since the region where we moved to Izmir, where we live, is a region where Alevi are mostly concentrated, we have not seen any pressure again. But of course, there are certainly pressures in other cities. You also know about the events in Sivas. In other words, we know that certain societies in certain cities put pressure on certain sections of the Alevi, but we have never seen that pressure here. We didn't see it from around us, we didn't see it from our friends. Izmir is probably a little more tolerant in this regard than other provinces."

In this narrative, the comfort of living in Izmir has been explained by referring to some unforgettable hard events that have happened in other provinces in the past.

Finally, 3F2 talked about how the city can affect the relationship between father and child. Again, in this context, he underlined the feeling of freedom felt by living in Izmir. He also stated that they did not experience such problems due to living in Izmir with the following sentences:

“It depends on the society in which you live, that is, where you live. So let me say this: it's a lot different when you live in Istanbul, it's a lot different when you live in Izmir, it's a lot different when you live in Tunceli, it's a lot different because it depends on where you are. Because where you are makes you change the way you look at your child. This is changing the way society views your child. You know, it affects your child's life, it affects your life. Imagine that you live in a very conservative place in Istanbul. You send your child to school and your child may have experience difficulties because of being Alevi so the child's psychology may deteriorate. When you are in Tunceli, you live in the same community among the Alevi. There isn't a problem. You are coming to Izmir, and you are living in Izmir, because Izmir is more libertarian, there is no such problem. In other words, the psychology of being an Alevi father and being an Alevi child is influenced by where you live.” (3F2)

In these narratives, it is stated that living in Izmir does not create any difficulties for the father-son relationship.

2.5.3. Walking Through New Fatherhood

Table 4

Summary of Third Theme

Themes	Subthemes	Illustrative Example
Walking Through New Fatherhood	Difficulties After Migration	<i>“It was an unfamiliar environment that was not like the environment in which we live.” (3F1)</i>
	The Increasing Responsibilities of Fatherhood with Lots of Thoughts	<i>“I wonder what will happen to these children when I bring them here?” (3F1)</i>
	Being a Father Twice	<i>“When you become an Alevi father in the society you live in, you must be a father twice.” (4F2)</i>
	Look at This! I Have Grown This Tree, and How Beautiful It is!	<i>“Look! What a beautiful big tree it has become, and now it is bearing fruit.” (3F2)</i>
	We Hugged Each Other More	<i>“We hug our parents and daughter more and more” (1F1)</i>

One of the crucial main research topics of this research was the experiences of being Alevi fatherhood, and another crucial one was the phenomenon of migration. Therefore, as a result of the semi-structured interviews were conducted,

this main theme was emerged that describes the relationship between the phenomenon of migration and Alevi fatherhood experiences. This main theme is divided into five sub-themes, and each will be explored now. The sub-themes are “Difficulties after migration”, “The increasing responsibilities of fatherhood with lots of thoughts”, “Being father twice”, “Look at this! I have grown this tree, and how beautiful it is!” and “We hugged each other more.”

2.5.3.1. Difficulties After Migration

The difficulties experienced after migration have been the most frequent phenomenon in the narratives of both first-generation and second-generation Alevi fathers. Difficulties in the first generation of fathers after migration are described as difficulties in getting used to the place of migration, which were felt in the early stages of migration, and hesitation after migration. The economic difficulties experienced after the migration have been the most recurring difficult life experience among all the narratives shared.

2F1 stated the difficulties that both he and his family experienced after migration that “... *Of course, it doesn't? My oldest child was 5-6 years old when you came here. The children actually didn't know much. You know when the children can have been full of the dry bread. There were troubles, of course... There was longing. There weren't any relatives here, to be honest. We came to a foreign city in such a country. There were problems, obviously. So, it affected.*” (2F1) In these sentences, we can see the difficulties experienced by a father who has been away from his relatives and feels a longing for his hometown to keep his family afloat.

3F1 described the difficulties that he had to adapt to a new environment in the following words:

“Of course, we started to falter a little when we first emigrated. So, it was an unfamiliar environment that was not like the environment in which we live. Then we gradually adjusted to the environment. Of course, you had hard times moving from place to place. You're having a hard time adjusting

to the environment. But gradually we got used to the society. When we came from there, when we migrated, we didn't know the environment. You're hesitating, you're surprised what to do. After that, let me give you an example: Although my child was a very knowledgeable person when he went to school here, the child faltered when he went to school here. He couldn't pull himself together in six months on the way to school. Gradually after that the boy began to read." (3F1)

In the life experience here, the difficulty experienced by the family is explained by showing the example of the difficulty experienced by the child at school. Although his child is a very knowledgeable person, the school has been academically challenged due to the difficulty of the post-migration adaptation process. And 3F1 continued *"You were born there, you grew up there, you came to the age of 40 50. The air of the place you come from is not the same as the air of that place. Then you adapt and that harmony, of course, forces people. Can't it be forced?"* (3F1)

1F2 described the migration experienced by his own root family with a metaphor which name is spiritual death as follows:

"However, the only thing our family tells us about migration is that death, hunger, thirsty, poverty and cold... Cold is also very important when they first arrive. Even today, this is what they say when we ask: we sold the animals and came here But they hide behind these two sentences. When we are alone like this, or when old songs are played in his memory, the things they tell are not to sell an animal and come here, they have come here leaving their identity completely. And he can't even say it because he still can't make sense of it. But when you visit there, his land is there, everything is there. It's actually his thing which means leaving everything and coming here, so I wouldn't say it's physical, but it's kind of a spiritual death." (1F2)

To leave the animals that come to the language, but what cannot be said is to emigrate by leaving an identity behind. This identity left behind is that, like a soul, it reminds itself over and over again in old songs and memories... The person is like both subject who is losing and the object that is lost.

3F2 stated that people give up their dreams due to economic difficulties as: “So, at first, it's like this: you are migrating here, and living conditions are becoming more difficult. You can't get along with one person's work. Mom is already always at home, not anywhere else. There is a difficulty in livelihood. It is necessary that other children and other individuals contribute to the family, whether they want to or not. This is not only the case for us, but this situation is also causing many children and many young people to drop out of school. You must do it because of the economic difficulties, because a person must maintain his life first.” (3F2)

Here, the necessity of children and young adults to support the family economically by giving up school processes is explained in order for the family to earn a living after the migration. This situation has stood for children and young adults as a necessity.

And finally, the difficulties experienced after migration are seen as the difficulties experienced by the members of the root family who has come with migration for adaptation. 1F2 stressed these narratives via the following statements:

“The inability to get used to this place after migration. Let me give you an example, my father's mother has been wearing the same clothes for about 40 years. Although she has lived in Izmir for about 40 years, she has not even changed her clothes. And she can't adapt here because she hasn't even changed it. She doesn't speak any languages. Her faith sounds very different; village society, agricultural society... She has not encountered any foreign communities. When she came here, they say it's the cradle of civilizations, she cannot have found herself as she encounters different communities here, she has disappeared.”

The clothes on her are part of her past and therefore her past identity, which she does not want to forget. These clothes have been like an old acquaintance from the past who has become a companion to her...

2.5.3.2. The Increasing Responsibilities of Fatherhood with Lots of Thoughts

In this sub-theme, the increasing responsibilities of fathers with both immigration and fatherhood are explained. The increased responsibilities of first-generation fathers after migration have manifested themselves as many thoughts that come with increasing anxiety for the future of both the family and the children. In the second generation of fathers, because time has passed through migration and migration has not been experienced directly, the increased responsibilities have shown themselves at the behavioral level in fatherhood practice more than the thoughts that come with anxiety. However, for both generations, fatherhood has been experienced as increased responsibilities.

1F1 explained fatherhood and the responsibility that fatherhood brings by the analogy of being like the roof of a house. He said, *“Being a father is being the roof of a house. In other words, we can define ourselves as a roof. So, what is that roof? I can interpret the roof that keeps the family together, raises the children, keeps them alive and brings them to a good future.”* (1F1)

The responsibility of fatherhood, which is explained with the roof metaphor, has also brought many thoughts about the ability of fathers to take care of their children. At the same time, migration has also greatly influenced thoughts about caring for their children. 3F1 explained this process via the following statements:

“Of course, immigration affects people. Now you've come from somewhere, you're going somewhere else, and you're attracted to it. You're stumbling, struggling, struggling. I mean, I had a really big psychological battle with people. The kids don't know, but I do. I wonder what will happen to these children when I bring them here? What will be the end of all this? How will they make it? How will they grow? How will they read? Well, I've been thinking about all of this. These issues were all in my thoughts. And then, I was always impressed. A father always has a definition of difficulty in order to raise his own children. It's bound to be difficult.” (3F1)

Like 3F1, 2F1 shared similar thoughts. He said, “*I was wondering if I could raise my children. Would children become victims when they went to school? Could I take care the needs of children? Could I buy a house for my children in the future? So, you're thinking about whether I could take care of their needs.*” (2F1)

Both 3F1 and 2F1 explained in these sentences that they have many thoughts about taking care the responsibilities of children after migration.

However, 3F1 said that these thoughts started before the migration, and they migrated with these thoughts. He underlined that the migration experienced together with these thoughts also affected his fatherhood. 3F1 uttered:

“I’m going from here. I’m taking my children and leaving, but I wonder how I’m going to raise them there? What will I do? Of course, it made me think about it. How will I be supposed to educate these children? I wonder, if these will adapt there or not? Of course, it affected me, too. In other words, a father has had very big thoughts about migrating to another place and taking his children from hometown to another place. For example, what am I going to do? How will I grow it? What about these kids? That's how we have come here, thinking about it. We have lived all of these issues.” (3F1)

In these narratives, we see many thoughts about the future for a father before immigration. It can be interpreted from these sentences how challenging it might be to move towards into an uncertainty with these thoughts.

3F1 stated that he has done his best to raise his children via following statements:

“Of course, it was a burden on me when I had children. Raising a child, educating a child, and taking care of a child... So, these are very nice feelings. When I had children, I didn't act so that the child would grow up on its own. I have tried to raise my children better and to give them a better life. I've worked hard to be a good father to my children. I have done everything in my power to raise my children well. I mean, I didn't need anyone, and I protected my children from all of the bad things.” (3F1)

In the narratives here, thoughts about taking responsibility for children before migration and immediately after migration have been replaced by behaviors about taking responsibility over time.

This transition process, in which thoughts and concerns about taking responsibility for children were replaced by behavior, meant more work for fathers. This meant more fatigue and irritability for the fathers. P2 uttered the following:

“... You are being thoughtful. You come home and get angry because you work hard. I mean, there was a time when, for example, you go in shifts. There is no sleep, and you have to raise money. Your children will be educated. You get angry because when we quit those jobs, we were going to other jobs for the weekend. You get tired of working and then, you get angry.”

In the life experience here, we can see that a father whose social support networks have decreased after immigration and who has moved away from his family has difficulty managing his feelings such as resentment with increasing responsibility.

At the same time, since time has also passed through migration in the second generation of fathers, the responsibility for migration and its aftermath has been replaced by the responsibility for raising their child. 4F2 said:

“When I first became a father, first a person experiences a shock effect, but then as a little more time passes, a person gets used to it. You are starting to think about your responsibility which is increasing, how to raise an individual, how this individual will be useful to society, how this individual will be useful to his family. You're thinking about what kind of upbringing I should practice. You are thinking about what you can do about his future.”
(4F2)

1F2 uttered the following like 4F2:

“The first time we held the baby in our hands, it felt very small. We didn't know how to define. What do I do with it? Where do I put it? So this process has been very difficult. We got problems that were very big. How will this grow? I mean, if I touched it like that, it was like he was going to die. It was

difficult for us when the baby started crying. However, I can say that the baby gets older, the process has become better for us.” (1F2)

This process, in which fathers were forced out of responsibilities in the early days of the beginning, has turned into a process in which fathers have grown up with the needs of their children and learned more about them over time. 1F2 stated that:

“He's always asking you things, wondering, getting interested, the clothes you bought him, and when you say that you're constantly learning new things. You're getting a year older with him. You're growing up with him, you're maturing. My responsibilities are increasing, you learn to comb your hair while combing her hairs. I mean, you're always learning new things because of her. And it's not just for her that you're actually learning for yourself. There is a constant innovation happening, you don't get quite rusty as a result of the innovation. You have become more vigorous, you have understood that you need to hold on to life.” (1F2)

Here we can see that responsibilities have turned into an opportunity to grow with the child and learn new things.

However, along with all these, 2F2 explained that these processes require a sacrifice with the following statements:

“Sacrifice Of course, as I said at the beginning. You're making self-sacrifice more than you ever expected. What I call sacrifice is that while you are doing many things in life according to your own will, now you are starting to do it in a way that is good for your child. Your child has become the main factor of your life. So that's what I can say.” (2F2)

Being open to change and transformation along with responsibilities also means making sacrifices for yourself. 2F2 continued, “*On the one hand, becoming father is hard. My brother had a saying: When you get married, your life changes direction by 180°. It changes another 180 degrees when you have children. So, you can also go exactly the opposite direction from where you came from. I mean, it's not an easy thing to do, but being father just as good, of course.*”

2.5.3.3. Being a Father Twice

Being a father twice, which was formed as a sub-theme, was a very meaningful sub-theme describing the experiences of being a minority father, although in general it was not distributed as a frequency in all participants. Participants said that part of being a minority father is taking on the responsibilities of fatherhood. However, issues such as transferring their own culture coming from the Alevi identity to their children and being able to protect their own children are also experienced in fatherhood practice. In summary, being a father twice means both taking responsibility of fatherhood and fathering children through experiences in their own culture which means protecting children and transferring Alevi culture to children.

4F2 described being a father twice. His words were “... *the first was to practice normal fathering responsibilities. And, as an Alevi father, I have had to teach my child the right way which means our own culture values.*” (4F2) He continued to utter the following:

“When you become an Alevi father in the society you live in, you must be a father twice. The first is to make a fatherhood in order to raise your child normally. You're being a father like everyone else. The second thing is that you are also taking on a task so that your own child can experience his own culture. You also have to be a father there. You should be able to keep your culture alive, your child should be able to understand it. If you can transfer it correctly, the child will also transfer it correctly to his own child. I can say that it is necessary to be a father twice since here, so it is necessary to be a father in two ways.” (4F2)

In these narratives, we hear that an Alevi father sees it as a responsibility to transfer his own culture to his children. This responsibility is also emphasized as being a father twice as an additional responsibility to the general responsibility of fatherhood.

Similar to 4F2, 1F2 stated the following:

“...And the child is vulnerable. When you go out, you wonder. What to do? What? Will he be able to defend himself? You're just taking on such a responsibility. For example, if they become a father once, we become a father twice because our responsibilities are different. You need to tell him to hide himself. You can't express yourself clearly. And you can't speak your own language. You can't enlarge yourself according to your beliefs. I'm just saying that you're trying to be like the desired citizen by making some concessions. This actually restricts us as well. And we involuntarily raise our child in another way. I mean, things like this have happened.” (1F2)

In fact, we also hear in these sentences that the second part of fatherhood involves thinking about many things to protect children and from time-to-time teaching children to hide themselves. I wish there was no need for this second part of fatherhood.

2.5.3.4. Look at This! I Have Grown This Tree, and How Beautiful It is!

The sub-themes before the this sub-theme were “Difficulties after migration”, “The increasing responsibilities of fatherhood with lots of thoughts” and “Being father twice”. In these sub-themes, the difficulties of being an Alevi father who has experienced migration in different areas were shared. However, despite all these difficulties, the happiness and good feelings of fatherhood and responsibilities of fatherhood are described in this sub-theme.

1F1 who is the one of the first-generation fathers explained the feelings of happiness created by gathering around a table with his family in the following sentences:

“Of course, it changes a person's life, it makes you work a lot more. It's a little more convenient, so you put your night in the daytime. Of course, you want your kids to spend more time to change that. When you come home in the evening, you want to gather around a table with your children. I mean, it's a great happiness. I mean, nothing happens when you're on your own. You're happier when building a home and this home is your family.” (1F1)

These sentences tell us that at the end of the day all the fatigue passes along with the time spent around a table with the family.

1F2 uttered the following:

“I can say that being a father and being a father to a daughter is the most beautiful thing in the world. You're being responsible. It's a very nice thing for her to play with you. When you get home, you are becoming happy to see her, to hear her voice and joy. But it's also a responsibility. After all, there are some dogmatic thoughts towards women and responsibility is needed. You think about your children, you work for her. Responsibility is also a sweet happiness.” (1F2)

Despite all the dogmatic considerations, the pleasure that is coming from the responsibility of raising his own daughter is seen through these sentences.

Finally, the sentences of 3F2, in which the feeling of fatherhood is a good feeling is explained with the metaphor of growing a tree and which also gives its name to this sub-theme, are as follows:

“Actually, it's a good feeling. I mean, like a new life that means the sprouting of a new tree. Can you imagine that a new creature is coming, so you're working on it, you're growing it, you're doing something, and you're proud of it in the future. Because I have given you this labor. You're saying that I have grown this tree, I have made it like this. Look! What a beautiful big tree it has become, and now it is bearing fruit. So, this is it.” (3F2)

It was very challenging for me because of many challenging experiences have been shared up to this sub-theme. However, despite all these difficulties, sharing the journey of fatherhood with the feeling of happiness and beauty was a breath of fresh air for me too. Just like the tree metaphor that has given its name to this sub-theme, this thesis has become my tree too despite all of the difficulties.

2.5.3.5. We Hugged Each Other More

Another striking point in the narratives of the participants was that despite many difficulties after migration, they developed resistance as a family against

these difficulties. Strengthening family ties and connecting family members to each other are the elements of family resistance against difficulties.

1F1 uttered the following as to this point:

“You have migrated here, and there's a foreignness here. You're having a hard time at first, so we're more connected. You're hugging each other more. So, you feel alienated because you only have family and a few houses. As it happens, we have become almost like a family where we live. We hug our parents and daughter more and more because there are few people, we can express ourselves to.” (1F1)

With the alienation, both family members and a small number of people who have known each other have been more tightly wrapped up in each other. In this way, they have supported each other socially.

As 1F1, 2F2 stressed stronger family ties after migration process via the following statements:

“... I mean, after all, they came out here. They tried to exist with their children, which also means that the family is more wrapped up in each other. There are no branches to hold on to outside. That's why the family hugs each other more, which brings out a good energy and a good synergy. In fact, this is part of the general advantages and cultural heritage from here. I mean, we're actually just saying what's from where we were born and raised, as well as what's from the past, but there's also the cultural heritage that your family left you when you were growing up. This means family ties, brotherhood, sisterhood, motherhood, and fatherhood. In other words, we continue to cling to these values more and more. That's what our children see.” (2F2)

These sentences are meant to tell us that the family heritage does not only come from before the migration, but also that the family ties that become stronger after the migration will also be passed on to the children as a cultural heritage.

2F2 also uttered the following, *“In the society where we are trying to exist, issues such as family value and family balance have come to the fore a little more*

in order to strengthen family ties thoroughly, hug each other and stay afloat in this way.” (2F2)

2.5.4. Fatherhood Transitions from 1st To 2nd Generations in The Passing Times

Table 5

Summary of Fourth Theme

Themes	Subthemes	Illustrative Example
Fatherhood Transitions from 1 st To 2 nd Generations in The Passing Times	From Being Unable to Conflict with The Upper Generation Experiencing Conflict	<i>“You have the right to an expression.” (2F2)</i>
	Still Protection but More Freedom	<i>“You have to show him that you are behind him.” (3F2)</i>
	Being Able to Live Fatherhood with Their Children	<i>“We have found more time to sit and share with my father.” (2F2)</i>
	I am Missing My Hometown!	<i>“For every tree sings from its root, and every bird sings from its tongue.” (1F2)</i>
	The Desire to Keep Alevism Alive	<i>“Alevism culture mustn’t die, live through time.” (4F2)</i>

The fourth and also the last, our main theme, emerged in order to gain a deeper and better understanding of the diverging or similar parts of fatherhood experiences of the migrated first and second-generation Alevi fathers. This main theme is divided into five sub-themes, and each will be explored now. The sub-themes are “From being unable to conflict with the upper generation to experiencing conflict”, “Still protection but more freedom”, “Being able to live

fatherhood with their children”, “I am missing my hometown!” and “The desire to keep Alevism alive.”

2.5.4.1. From Being Unable to Conflict with The Upper Generation to Experiencing Conflict

In this sub-theme, the first issue in which paternity experiences have changed in first- and second-generation Alevi fathers has been the issue of conflict. It has been suggested that it is not possible for first-generation Alevi fathers to conflict with their own fathers. It is perceived as disrespectful to conflict, and therefore there were no conflicts with their fathers. In addition, the inability to conflict has been replaced by the possibility of conflicts in second generations of fathers. At the same time, the solution of these conflicts by compromise was also expressed by the participants.

2F1 who is the one of the first-generation fathers, expressed his inability to conflict with his own father in the following sentences:

“By God, there weren't any big conflicts, to be honest. I mean, we weren't making any noise when my dad was yelling and screaming. My dad wasn't doing much when we were talking, and we were talking when we were right. There wasn't much of a conflict, to be honest.” (2F1)

Children who can't make out their voice when the father is shouting and angry can only speak when they are right. In this way, there is no conflict. The absence of a conflict does not always mean that everything is going well.

5F1 reported that “*When we were kids, our dad would get mad at us, beat us up, do things. But I mean, it wasn't a conflict, it was something that happened inside the house. My father and I never have any other conflicts like that.*” (5F1)

In these sentences, we also see that even violence is not considered a conflict in fact, and the child cannot express himself.

As 5F1 and 2f1, 3F1 uttered the following as to this point which explain unable to conflict:

“No no. We've never had any disrespect for our father. And we've never clashed with our father. It's just that we couldn't talk in front of our dad. Out of respect, I mean, it's not like that. My poor man. What would he tell us and what would we tell him? We were going on like this, father, and son, somehow. I mean, we've never been disrespectful to our father.”

In these sentences, it was also seen that conflict was perceived as disrespect and conflicts were avoided. However, it is also a conflict to be able to express your own opinion from time to time, and this does not mean that it is disrespectful.

It has been explained that conflicts were experienced in the second-generation fathers. 1F2 uttered the following:

“Very. The simplest is the school you will go to, the people you will make friends with... For example, the simplest example is that when I first studied at the university, I went to that department unintentionally. We had to go to college without even wanting to. We've had more conflicts. For example, it may be in our choice of friends. Sometimes he considered some of our friends dangerous. But we were just being friends with them. Sometimes he also got mixed up with the disguise we were wearing. For example, he was saying don't wear this outfit, don't wear this color. Don't do this, but we've been doing it, too.”

Here, it is explained that in the decisions made by the second generation, conflicts are experienced between the expectations of the first-generation father and the wishes of the second-generation father.

Like 1F2, 2F2 emphasized that he had some conflicts with his father when making his own decisions as a free individual. 2F2 stated that:

“So, of course, we had a conflict. After all, you are growing up as a free individual. You have the right to an expression, or you can express yourself. You have freedom, you have the right to have a say about yourself. So, a little bit can also vary depending on this age. Maybe you express it at a younger age, but you don't question whether it is very effective in making a decision. When you reach adolescence, you express yourself, but you claim that what you are saying is true, and you start to put pressure on parents.

Well, when the other side tells you that he's not like that... You know best, but he says he's not the best on the other side. After that, of course, we had a conflict.” (2F2)

Conflicts in the narrative here include self-deprecation rather than disrespect, being able to disagree with the upper generation from time to time, wanting to decide their own terms. In a nutshell, it sounds like part of the process of individualization.

3F2 also stressed the inability to be understood as the source of conflicts. It became obvious that this state of incomprehension and, perhaps, reduced communication over time leads to some psychological difficulties. She uttered the following as to this point:

“So, you're definitely having conflicts. So let me just say, more psychological stuff. It's more that my father doesn't understand me. I mean, I'm saying something, but he sees it as his thing. So I'm saying that I'm not psychologically well. That's how I have such problems, and he says that it either passes at work, or something like that. The fact is that he does not understand you, that's where the conflict begins. If we could understand ourselves anyway, or if my father could understand me, and if he had done something for that time, these psychological problems that happened later would not have come out.” (3F2)

In this experience, we also hear that the source of conflicts is misunderstanding. Misunderstanding seems to lead to disconnection from each other over time, reduced communication, and eventually psychological difficulties. And here we also hear that he is waiting for his father to understand him about the past.

The ability to experience the conflict described in the second generation of fathers also includes the resolution of these conflicts through reconciliation. 1F2 uttered that they also consult with family elders in order to be able to reconcile in resolving their conflicts. He said, *“Of course, we had a conciliatory attitude. For example, we had a problem and couldn't solve it, and then we consulted the eldest of our family about it. We were solving the problem with the idea we got from him.*

So, when we had conflicts, we were either deciphering it among ourselves or solving the problem by taking it to the eldest of our family. Sometimes we met in a common place with a conciliatory attitude, sometimes I made concessions, and sometimes my father made concessions.” (1F2)

It is described that both the first-generation father and the second-generation father seek common ground by making concessions from themselves when finding a way to compromise. It can be thought that in such an attitude, their communication will be strengthened by feeling heard on both sides.

Like 1F2, 2F2 uttered the following to describe compromises:

“Of course, when we got through puberty, we started to prefer the Path of reconciliation rather than the path of resistance. It doesn't matter if the most logical way is yours or hers or the middle. We finally got to this point. In other words, according to our age, the conflicts we have experienced and the subject and solution of the conflicts we have experienced have become more different.” (2F2)

The most critical point heard here is that the parties can come to a place where they realize that the share of righteousness is not important in the resolution of the conflict. In this way, a common path was created.

2.5.4.2. Still Protection but More Freedom

The most important issue that has been stood out in the narratives in this part was to protect the children and then the family of both the first- and second-generation Alevi fathers. However, it has been observed that there has been a change in the ways of protecting children over time. For first-generation fathers, the way to protect their children involved suppressing them. Second generation fathers, on the other hand, unlike the first generation, the way to protect their children has been through methods such as raising them more confident, giving them the right to make decisions, and standing behind their children in the decisions they make. In this difference, we can also consider the impact of migration. The difficulties experienced immediately after the migration may have led first-

generation fathers to a more oppressive place, and this situation has softened over time.

3F1 stated that *“I looked, and I left my own land so that my children wouldn't get involved in difficult events, and I came to Izmir. Now, thank God, my children have grown up, and they haven't been involved in anything. Or they didn't oppose the state, they didn't oppose the law. I'm here for her. I came here to raise my children more peacefully, more triumphantly, better, and that's where I raised my children.”* (3F1) and he uttered the following:

“Now I have worked as a father to my children. I have done everything in my power to raise my children well. I mean, I didn't need anyone, I protected my children or my children from all evil. I have never directed my children into any evil, that is, into anything else. I have brought up my children in the best way within the rules of the law.” (3F1)

We can understand from these sentences that as a father, he did his best to raise his children and migrated to protect his children.

3F2 emphasized his thoughts about his father's protectionist behavior as:

“But because you're coming to a new environment, you're becoming more protective. Has anything happened to any of my family? How are my children? So how's Mom doing? How's Dad? So, you wonder if the child went to school, but what does he do at school? For example, parents send their children to school, but the children spend time in the park. So, you're thinking, you sent the kid to school, but your kid has gone at school right now or he has gone out. Just like I said, it has increased your protectionist feelings more. You're thinking too much about family members this time. In this way.” (3F2)

As mentioned above, it has been mentioned in this narrative that protectionism and thoughts about children and family have increased in the new environment after migration.

3F2 by making a change in the practice of this narrative, he actually stated that protectionism is not only from father to child, but also that the child wants to protect his father in the following sentences:

“... The fact that your father is entering a new environment, a new society, can increase people's protectionism a little more because you are entering an unfamiliar environment that you don't know. Father is thinking, can my child be harmed by these people? But the child also becomes protective of his father. Just as you, as a father, are trying to protect your child, your child, as a son, is trying to protect the father or his family. The same goes for the child.” (3F2)

It is a very important narrative to understand how the family system affects each other on the axis of protectionism and this cyclicity and means that it is not just a single direction from father to family viewpoint of protectionism.

1F2 explained that protecting his own daughter was about raising her more freely and self-confident, and that he learned from what his own mother had gone through. Her own mother, as a woman, was subjected to pressure after migration. 1F1 does not want that his own daughter will be subjected to such pressures, so he is raising his daughter more libertarian. He emphasized this by means of the following sentences:

“When she comes out, our fatherhood begins. I have to protect her; I have to guide her. We need to tell her how she should protect himself. That's why our wife's condition is important. My wife and mother are not the same. We have improved ourselves a little more. We are raising our daughter more confident because we have overcome that fear a little more. Otherwise, let me just say that when my parents migrated here, there was a separate pressure on women. Because they were, doing it, so you got in the way of strangers. And when you came among strangers, there were verbal pressures on the woman. But we are not like that. We are raising our daughter more confidently. But my mother, for example, was subjected to such pressure because she does not know the language. She came to Izmir for the first time. We're not like that, but because we know them a little more, we're growing a little more comfortable, a little more confident.” (1F2)

It has been important for 1F2 that a girl grows up with confidence and does not feel the pressure of others. Because of this, they are already raising their

daughters with this in mind. However, the pressure that her mother has felt on her after migration does not make her weak, it just shows us a woman who is trying to stand up in the context in which she is.

The way to protect children is to raise their children more confidently for second-generation fathers. The way to make their children more confident is to give them the right to choose and to stand behind their children in their preferences. Words of 5F2 were *“I always want to get my child's opinion. I won't tell my child to shut up because you're a child.”* (5F2)

2F2 said the following as to the topic:

“...for our child, he will have a chance to choose, because I think that whoever calls things such as good and bad will no longer be in their time. Preferences will be on the table according to him, he will have the right to choose, or he will have the right to choose, or he will have the opportunity to learn. So, they'll have all the resources. I think they will be able to find a more correct direction for themselves.” (2F2)

2F2 also expressed his desire to raise a child strong enough to make his own choices in these narratives.

The way to raise a child who is strong enough to make his own decisions and able to protect himself doesn't mean that neglecting the child, but rather to support him by standing behind him in his decisions. 3F2 said the following:

“I'm going to do this to my child because I didn't see this when I was a child, but there are things that happen like I'm going to show them to my own child. This applies to all segments of society, sometimes trying to create the Child inside his head. He is trying to orient the child in his own head in his own way. But I don't have these in my head. Let my child do whatever he wants. Let him choose whichever profession he wants to choose. As a family, what we need to do is stand behind the child, support him no matter what the child prefers. For me, this should be the most important one. That is, he wants to see that the child is not alone in his psychology. And you have to support him. You have to show him that you are behind him because he can be more successful knowing that his family is behind him.” (3F2)

In fact, the way to protect the child is neither to suppress child completely, nor to neglect child. The way to protect the child and to be confident of child for child's self-protection is to support the child in his decisions. So, this is also about being there for the child when the child needs it. This is underlined in these narratives.

Finally, 1F2 uttered the following as to this point:

“And I'm telling him; I want him to be more courageous, more confident, in all areas. And here I'm actually unintentionally doing a repeat of my father. Because he also wanted us to do something in the first place, to do it in the most perfect way. I want it too, but I have a white-blue metaphor that I give, and I always want to have a white identity.” (1F2)

What is represented by white in the blue and white metaphor here is not to lose one's own culture and to maintain it. 1F2 explained that his daughter protects herself in a confident way so that she does not lose her identity. And that means not losing her white identity.

2.5.4.3. Being Able to Live Fatherhood with Their Children

Being able to experience fatherhood more comfortably over time was another sub-theme that emerged in this study. In this sub-theme, it was revealed in the narratives of the participants that the first-generation fathers could not show their love to their children next to their own fathers due to the meaning attributed to fatherhood in the culture they live in. However, over time, perhaps due to migration, first-generation and second-generation fathers began to be able to show their love to their children more easily.

1F1 said the following as being a father:

“We couldn't pay much attention to our children besides our parents in the Alevism. We couldn't take our children much, we didn't like our children, we weren't interested, because we grew up in those conditions. When I first became a father, I couldn't feel anything because, like I said, you couldn't take your child, you couldn't love, you couldn't smell my child. It's a shame

when you're with the parents. I mean, I can say that we've never been fatherhood in the early days. Later on, we realized that we were fatherhood. Especially now that he's my grandson, I just feel like I've just become a father. Because I can love my grandson the way I say it at work, I can smell it, I can act the way I want. I mean, I can feel like I've just become a dad. We never felt this in my children, so we didn't feel it because of our culture. I mean, if we loved our child at work, it would be like we were disrespecting our mother or our father. That's how we saw it, that's how we lived it. So, like I said, we didn't live our fatherhood, but we just lived our fatherhood when we became grandparents.” (1F1)

How the role of fatherhood formed by a culture prevents a father from loving his own child has been emphasized in this life practice. This made me think about how gender roles carry huge loads, unpleasantness, and fatigue not only for women, but also for men.

However, this time first generation fathers who are now also a grandfather, actually prevented the fatherhood of his own, just like his own father, by thinking that he was actually helping, but without showing of love for his children. But, this situation has also started to change over time. 3F2 went on to describe his thoughts on this change as follows:

“My dad was a little more. My father's way of raising children was a little more about getting angry and scaring, as my grandparents used to be. That's how he raised children. And at that time, there was nothing to show love for children. There was a weight to being of a being father. But most of them had this. But the way that is carried out by our generation is a lot different. We are able to show our love to our children more easily. Either your father used to say that nothing would happen if you fell, nothing would happen, but now, for example, we are asking if anything happened when our children fell. In other words, as the current generation, we can show our love to our children much more easily. That doesn't mean our dads haven't loved us. So they weren't showing their love because of the way they saw it from their

father. In other words, the current generation loves their children more, so they show and make feel their love.” (3F2)

The second generation of fathers are able to show their love to their children by changing the way they live their paternity. This situation has also allowed first-generation fathers to show their love over time. Perhaps it was difficult for them to change this when their children were young, but as the children reached adolescence, that is, as they grew up, their communication with their fathers also increased. 2F2 went on to describe his thoughts on this change as:

“... After a certain age, when we are now slowly starting adolescence, then we have found more time to sit and share with my father. After that time, we started accompanying each other on trips like normal friends, working at work, or, I don't know, reading a book, sitting down for a drink.” (2F2)

Being able to experience fatherhood over time meant that both first- and second-generation fathers showed their love for each other and shared it more. This includes strengthening the ties in the family system even more despite difficult life experiences such as migration.

2.5.4.4. I am Missing My Hometown!

The three sub-themes preceding this sub-theme were emerged on the time-dependent change of the first- and second-generation Alevi fathers in their fatherhood transitions. However, this theme was emerged from the narrative of the commonality of the longing for the hometown of two generations of Alevi fathers and the transmission of it.

2F1 expressed his longing for his hometown with these words: *“In other words, the immigration... Every person wants to stay in their own country and raise their children there, but when there is no work or food, you have to go to other places. Effects, of course, doesn't it? The longing does.”*

Although time has passed since migration is a necessity for economic reasons, the longing for the hometown does not pass.

1F1 again conveyed the dilemmas that occurred after the migration, and this time related to the longing for a hometown, as follows:

“... So yes it's a dilemma again... Living conditions... I mean, like I said, there are more places where you can go and have fun. More places where you can live and you can visit if you're financially well. For example, my brothers and sisters who grew up here may feel happier here, of course, because they have been growing up with them all the time, but we lived our childhood there. No matter how difficult the living conditions there are for us, we are longing for him right now.” (1F1)

Although it is easier to adapt when you are born in a place of emigration, the place where your childhood passed is your roots, even though you have moved away from your roots.

Just as the first-generation fathers stated, the second-generation fathers also feel the longing for the hometown. 3F2 stressed that:

“First, you get away from your loved ones. In other words, when we say family, we should not see the family as just the nuclear family. Your family is your grandfather, so your uncles are your family, and your aunts are your family. And you have a big family that includes your grandparents, your grandparents' brothers. You're moving away from your family. You're moving away from a community you're used to. You're moving away from the things of life you're used to. Maybe it's easier for us, but it's harder for my parents. Because they leave their mothers behind, they leave their brothers behind, they leave their sisters and brothers behind. You're getting away, you're getting homesick for these people. I mean, I don't know, it probably increases people's craving for their psychology. It disrupts their psychology, increases their aspirations. Your longing for your whole family is growing.” (3F2)

In these sentences, although the longing for the homeland is more dominant for the first-generation Alevi fathers, we see that the second generation also yearns for the homeland.

2F2 described the longing for homeland accompanied by regret for migration with the following sentences:

“The things that were talked about were always regret. I wish we hadn't migrated; I wish we'd come back. When I said that the visits there would be without us, the land would be without us, what would happen to the animals, I always had a dream of coming back. When they get here from there, they feel like life is over, they have to get used to it. They haven't adapted. They keep having identity confusion. They have realized that they are easily oppressed under the conditions of assimilation, but they cannot do anything. And because they can't find a solution to this, they always talk about such despair and pessimism instead of talking about the past. In short, I can say that.” (1F2)

A state of purgatory in which it is neither possible to get used to the place of migration, nor to return... And the fact that this state of purgatory is being experienced as despair and pessimism. What kind of contradiction!

The experience of this dilemma as a desire to return to the hometown is described as follows:

“Because we have to return to our land sooner or later. For every tree sings from its root, and every bird sings from its tongue. We also have difficulty adapting here even today. We have arrived at the age of 24 - 25 and we cannot adapt even though we were born here. In a way that the ones after us won't adapt either. I think that we will eventually return to our own homeland so as not to be like them and not to melt into these wheels of assimilation. We always approach our daughter like this with information that we need to protect ourselves, which tells us a little more about our self-defense, not that we are always such a negative, not always such a death.” (1F2)

Maybe it is the longing for the homeland to be able to find its own words again, just like a bird singing in its own language.

In 2F2, he stated his dreams of returning to his hometown due to his feelings of being incomplete as follows:

“... We also have a half-life, no matter how much we are the next generation. There is a desire to return to the homeland. So, even now, we

are doing the calculation of the things. Then, even though we will retire too late, can we go to our hometown and spend a few months, 3 months, and 5 months in our hometown when it comes? Can we live a retirement life? We still have such a point of view. Even though we are a generation later, but maybe we don't feel as certain as our parents, but we both feel as if we have emigrated. I mean, I feel like I'm finally going back there. So, there is such a situation.” (2F2)

Although he has not migrated himself, he has expressed that he feels like he has migrated. And this is a very good example of the narrative of the intergenerational transmission.

At the end of all this, 2F2 stated that he will transfer his longing for his hometown to his child as follows:

“So, like I said, I have a longing for the land that has been torn away. I want to instill that longing in my children as well. In other words, as it affects me, I really want to transfer this love of homeland, that is, culture, love of culture or cultural heritage from my father to my child. I want to do more by adding on the shares that my father has shared or made with me and live with my child by collecting his missing sides. As I said, we are still longing for this and the motherland, that is, the land where we were born and came to. I want from my child to at least get to know this cultural heritage and have the right to choose according to it, being aware of it. That's all for now.” (2F2)

Both to keep his own culture alive and to complete the missing pieces in his own story in this way.

2.5.4.5. The Desire to Keep Alevism Alive

Another point that attracted attention and was shared by most of the participants was their desire to keep Alevism alive. In the narratives of the second-generation Alevi fathers, what is passed on to them from their upper generations and what they want to continue in their own lives and what they want to transmit to their own children is desire to keep Alevism alive.

4F2 said, *“My father's expectation of us as an Alevi father was that we would not go astray. Our way is the way of Alevism, walk this way. Transfer this path to your own children in the best way as well. To stay out of our way, to keep our way alive, to introduce our culture to wider circles.”* (4F2) As similar to 4F2, 2F2 stated, *“... That is, their main element is to own them or keep them alive or respect them. I mean, I don't know, not looking at the neighbor's daughter side by side or talking nonsense, being sane, getting along with people, seeing everyone as an equal, being respectful of elders. In other words, he wanted us to keep such cultural values of Alevism alive, to respect them, to make them exist. So, they still want these more right now.”* (2F2)

The place where these two narratives were similar was the expectation of first-generation Alevi fathers from their own children of the desire to keep Alevism alive.

4F2 explained the importance of keeping the Alevism culture alive with the following words:

“That is the philosophy of Alevism. Everyone wants to live their own culture. No one wants their own culture to die because people express themselves through their culture, language, and beliefs. In this regard, it is important for us that Alevism culture mustn't die, live through time.” (4F2)

2F2 reported, *“I mean, I want my child to at least get to know this cultural heritage and have the right to choose according to it by being aware of it. That's all for now.”* (2F2)

These sentences describe how the participant wants his child to be aware of the culture first. In order to create this awareness, he continued to explain his desire to transmit Alevism culture to his own child as follows:

“I want to transfer the cultural heritage given to us, that is, the cultural heritage that we cannot live or live. As I said, we are happy with our culture right now and I want to transmit it to my child via the same way. Of course, when I say the same way, I want to give him a clear and correct definition of our culture so that she knows that it is the right and beautiful cultural

heritage right now at least. I think that in this way she will have the same point of view.” (2F2)

Finally, 1F2 emphasized that he wants its own child to live the Alevism culture despite all the troubles with the following words:

“I would like him to be worthy of these values. Because he will also become a generation transmitter again. If we come here today, we are talking about many difficult situations due to migration, but we have not given up on our own values. And let him protect his own values and not give up.” (1F2)

Along with this narrative, the end of the conclusion section has been reached. 18 sub-themes were collected under 4 main themes and the emerging life experiences were described. At the end of this long process, the following poem written by Robert Frost has been evoked in my mind. In his poem, “Acquainted with the Night” Robert Frost (1928) says:

“I have been one acquainted with the night.
I have walked out in rain and back in rain.
I have outwalked the furthest city light.
I have looked down the saddest city lane.
I have passed by the watchman on his beat
And dropped my eyes unwilling to explain.
I have stood still and hushed the sound of feet
When far away an interrupted cry
Came over houses from another street,
But not to call me back or say good-bye;
And further still at an unearthly height
One luminary clock against the sky
Proclaimed the time was neither wrong nor right.
I have been one acquainted with the night.”

Like the person Frost drew for us in his strings, I went on a journey in my own mind with what the participants told me in the process, and from time to time I also encountered the night that means going in my own mind and walking around there on this journey. Just as the clock in this poem claims that time is not right or

wrong, so for me neither the past nor the present has been wrong or right. Just like the person in the poem, I have walked through the past and the present.

2.6. DISCUSSION

The discussion part is consisted of two parts such as literature part. In the first part, intergenerational transmission of fatherhood will be discussed essential viewpoint of Bowen's Family Systems Theory. In the second part, all the emerging themes will be discussed within the framework of the titles discussed in the literature review article.

Before the migration, first-generation fathers and their own fathers lived together and mostly engaged in agriculture. This situation and the state of cohabitation may be indicated Bowen's differentiation term which includes both internal and relational (Bowen & Kerr, 1988, p.93-94). Not differentiating both internal and relational occurs "undifferentiated family ego mass." (Bowen & Kerr, 1988, p.375). In this study, first generation fathers were able to achieve separation by migration. Root families, migration experience and the process of post-migration acculturation have formed the legs of the triangle. The processes of migration from the root family and separation and their aftermath have caused stress (Bowen & Kerr, 1988, p.112-113).

Goldenberg and Goldenberg (2008, p.180) stated that the main thing here is not to suppress emotions, but to balance how they are experienced. In the interviews conducted in this context, differences in self-expression and feelings between first-generation and second-generation fathers were observed. First-generation fathers started interviews with shorter sentences and giving less detail when expressing themselves. When describing their life experiences, they described them in a more attentive language. However, the second generation of fathers, on the other hand, used language with a more willing attitude and giving more details to understand themselves, their life experiences, and feelings. They included in their narratives not only statements on their own life experiences, but also statements that make sense of the lives of previous generations.

As Papero (1990, p. 48) noted, the level of differentiation of any individual is best observed in anxious family conditions. This relaxation in language use may also indicate to us that the anxious family conditions experienced after migration has dissipated over time.

The triangulation is the one of key concepts of Bowen's Family System Theory (Bowen & Kerr, 1988, p.135). If we consider the difficulties of adaptation after migration, the economic difficulties, and the acculturation stress (Berry, 2007) experienced by people as the legs of a triangle, the adaptation problems experienced due to economic difficulties will also increase the stress experienced by people.

Bowen and Kerr (1988, p. 135) stressed that triangles in human relationships last forever. In the narratives of some first-generation fathers, they stated that they could not love their children besides their own root families before the migration and that they could live their fatherhood over time. In this context, they expressed that they re-experienced fatherhood after migration, especially with their grandchildren. Grandparents, fathers, and grandchildren constitute the different legs of this triangulation (Bowen & Kerr, 1988, p.135) at the end of migration.

Another triangulation (Bowen & Kerr, 1988, p.135) is observed among the mother, home which is formed at new area after migration, and the children. After migration, the fact that the father takes on more of the financial burden of the house and therefore spends more time outdoors distracts the father from the family system. The participants stated that they spent more time with their mothers. At the same time, it has been mentioned in the narratives that there are pressures on women after migration. Mother, children, and home constitute another triangulation. In this triangulation, the child's presence in the house may reduce the anxiety experienced by the mother from time to time, but it may also increase from time to time. This may also complicate the differentiation (Bowen & Kerr, 1988, p.93-94) between mother and child. When anxiety increases about the environment, the child is involved in the tension of the dyad, and a triangle is formed (Bowen & Kerr, 1988, p.135).

The third key concept of Bowen's Family System Theory is multigenerational transmission process (Bowen and Kerr, 1988, p. 224). The assumption that the process of multigenerational transmission is based primarily on relationships does not mean that a baby is born a "blank slate" (tabula rasa), completely ready to be shaped by life experience (Bowen & Kerr, 1988, p. 224).

The last finding of all the sub themes was that "The desire to keep Alevism alive." In this context, this finding especially indicated that the second-generation fathers should first preserve the Alevism culture passed on to them from their own fathers, and then pass them on to the lower generations. This may indicate that the multigenerational transmission (Bowen and Kerr, 1988, p. 224) of the desire of keeping Alevism alive.

Steinberg (2001) suggested that togetherness of acceptance and behavioral control (authoritative parenting) leads to the most positive developmental results. The important finding which is another sub-theme was "Still protection but more freedom" indicated that process of multigenerational transmission of fatherhood which has changes over time. Second generation fathers have showed more acceptance of independence. This is way different from previous generations.

Capaldi, Pears, Patterson, & Owen (2003) considered that there are two main ways in which parenting can be passed down through the generations. One of them is direct and the other one is indirect. In this research, as described in the following paragraphs, the participants proudly describe being an Alevi father despite all their difficulties. In addition, it has been stated that especially first-generation fathers exhibit a protective paternal behavior towards their children instead of reflecting the difficulties directly on their children.

Silverstein, Auerbach & Levant (2002) indicated important of past father-son relationship for the current relationships established with children. In this context, it was emphasized by the participants that the close and democratic relationship established over time in the first generation and second-generation Alevi fathers was also wanted to transfer to their own children by the second-generation fathers.

Until this part of the discussion, the intergenerational transmission of fatherhood which transmitted in migrated Alevi fathers has been discussed in the light of Bowen's fundamental concepts which are “differentiation of self”, “triangulation”, and “multigenerational transmission process”. In the next part of the discussion section, all the emerging themes and sub-themes was discussed within the framework of the titles discussed in the literature review article.

The results of this study revealed five main themes and eighteen sub-themes that provide valuable information for answering research questions. The first major theme was “Difficulties of Being an Alevi Man”. The first major theme has emerged in the participants' narratives around the difficulties they have experienced in the past, the difficulties they have experienced due to the exclusionary behaviors they have been exposed to, and the difficulties they have experienced due to the contradictions they have experienced. In the narratives of all participants, it was explained that there are difficulties that they experience in different time periods. It is believed that this theme contains the answer to one side of one of the main research questions of the study that is “How do individuals experience being an Alevi father in Turkey?” This major theme was about difficulties about being Alevi man and being man that includes lots of difficulties too was a part of an identity of Alevi fathers.

The first sub-theme under this major theme was named “Past difficulties”. The difficulties created by the Alevi identity were caused by past times and childhood. For the first generation, it was described as quite difficult to have a minority identity in addition to migrating. Although the second generation was born here, they could not freely express their identity. The difficulties created by this situation extend to the past. At the same time, these difficulties included many contradictions regarding self-identification.

The first sub-theme focused on the past difficulties of being an Alevi man. Very similar to this, the second sub-theme was emerged by the participants answers was “Coercivity of exclusionary behaviors”. The participants mentioned that it was difficult to find a home because of the Alevi identity in the early stages of migration, the other participant could not exist in society as an Alevi, and the friendship

relations were interrupted when the Alevism of the other participant was learned by the family of his friends. The first sub-theme emphasized the temporal context of the difficulties, while the second sub-theme illustrated the content of these difficulties.

Arar and Bilgin (2010, p. 4) stated that negative approaches to what are different have been observed in almost every society in history. This is usually related to the instrumental nature of othering. Because exclusion and discrimination responses serve the interests of groups. As similarly to this, these subthemes indicated that creating another and then engaging in exclusionary behavior by attributing attitudes that do not belong to that other also creates feelings of security for the members of the exclusion group in a way. Especially in the early days of migration, two groups that did not know each other were encountered in this way. This process has made the practice of life quite difficult after migration.

Third sub theme of this major theme was “What am I doing here?”. After the difficulties mentioned in the two sub-themes above, this sub-theme has shown itself as a question of what I am doing here, exactly as it got its name.

It is observed that cultural mourning (Eisenbruch, 1990) is coming from with lots of questions like what I am doing here. Being constantly excluded and ignored leads to questions about the sense of belonging. Over the years, people find it difficult to feel belonging. These questions of identity and longing for the place of migration can also be seen as some delayed reactions (Wojcik and Bhugra, 2010).

According to Yalçın (2021), one of the most important stages in the construction of modern Anatolian Alevi memory has been to define Alevi communities as a “mourning society”. In this context, the repeated difficult events that have continued both at the individual and the institutional levels have prevented Alevi fathers from feeling belonging to the place they emigrated to, especially in the early years of migration, and have led to many interrogations. In fact, in a way, an incomplete mourning has continued. The distant past and the recent past are now identical to each other and so every pain recreates itself at individual and collective level (Yalçın, 2021).

When we try to understand this mourning process via grief theory of Kübler-Ross. Kübler-Ross (1969, p.31 - 91) described five stages of grief: denial and isolation, followed by anger, bargaining, depression and acceptance. Here, too, there is a loss of social structures, cultural values, identity, past, language that comes with migration. While staying here may seem like being in the depression stage, plans to return to the past means that returning thoughts to homeland, may also indicate a bargaining stage.

One of the main objectives in this study was to understand what it was like to experience being an Alevi father in Turkey. This theme has five sub-themes, namely 'Defining Alevism as honesty', 'Alevism as tolerance', 'Concealment of Alevism identify', 'Being able to live Alevism in time' and 'İzmir as a democratic city'. It is believed that this theme also contains the answer to one of the main research questions of the study that is "How do individuals experience being an Alevi father in Turkey?"

Alevism has also developed the rules of morality expressed in the commandment attributed to Hacı Bektaş Veli: "Be master of your hand, your loins, and your tongue." (Kehl-Bodrogi, 2012, p. 137). Although the explanations related to these words are different, the most common one is the following: "Don't take things that don't belong to you, don't lie and don't commit adultery!". Alevi place this word at the center of their religious beliefs (Shankland, 2003, p. 27).

Similarly, this, being honest is one of the main experiences of Alevi fathers from different generations about becoming an Alevi father in Turkey. As participants stated this finding here honesty includes that is not only unique to oneself, but also extends to the other. Being honest also includes not harming others by others without distinguishing between people.

It is believed that becoming insan-ı kamil (perfect human being) at the end of the yol (Yıldırım, 2018). One of the most basic principles of this yol is tolerance. When asked about what being Alevism means to them, the majority described 'Alevism as tolerance'. Participants noted that the tolerance of Alevism is not only against people, but also against all beings in the universe.

So why does a group that describes themselves as so tolerant and honest hide or have to hide themselves?

Alevism is a belief that has rituals in itself (Akbulut & Usal, 2008, p. 435; Yıldırm, 2018). However, instead of emphasizing the belief aspect of Alevism, the participants defined it as the attitude of a culture or as the philosophy of life. This finding shows us that the participants abandoned the belief aspect of Alevism and developed a new definition of their own, not carrying the faith practices of the place they migrated to. This can be defined as a marginalization strategy (Berry 1992; Berry 1997; Berry 2005) for the belief aspect of Alevism.

It is explained by takiye principle (Bodrogi, 2012, p. 186). It is one of the most basic life practices for Alevis to hide themselves. Identities that are hidden after a place can also be gradually forgotten. Or people who are exposed to exclusionary behavior due to hidden identities, their lives can flow more easily only if they are very honest and tolerant.

Despite all the difficulties described so far, the participants mentioned that they were able to experience their Alevi identity over time. Considering the shared experiences, people started to live without hiding their Alevism identity by speaking about Alevism in public and Alevism became more visible. This made them feel that they had moved on to a more normal life. In other words, Alevism has become more comfortable to live in over time. This may indicate that over time, as people get to know each other, stereotypes gradually begin to break down and a new ground of dialogue develops. The social and cultural rules of the new culture, as well as gender, employment, etc. new roles related to are learned at post migration stage (Bhugra & Ghupta, 2011, p.2). This can also show us that people are both protecting their own identity and starting to integrate (Berry 1992; Berry 1997; Berry 2005) into the characteristics of the migrated place.

The importance of the context in which this time-dependent change took place manifested itself as another sub-theme which name is “İzmir as a demographic city”. Despite the many difficulties caused by migration, it was mentioned in the narratives of the participants that living in Izmir made this process even easier. Izmir was compared to other cities, and it was emphasized that people

living in Izmir are more tolerant of each other no matter what ethnicity they have come from.

According to Çelik (2005), a significant part of the population who have migrated from east to west has moved out of the region in the last fifteen years, mostly to the vicinity of nearby cities, as well as to the slums surrounding Istanbul, Ankara, Izmir, and Adana. This finding has shown why people first migrated to Izmir and then why and how they continued their lives. Izmir has been defined as a livable city for the participants.

Another question explored in the present study was “How did migration experiences affect their fatherhood styles?” In the light of the information provided by the participants about their experiences, it was aimed to understand the migration experiences and the relationship of these experiences with fatherhood practices. It is seen that the difficulties of the migration phenomenon and its impact on their fatherhood but on the other hand there have been resilient part for both individual and family level. The second major theme for exploring this question was emerged as “Walking through new fatherhood”.

Firstly, the first sub-theme was emerged by participants narratives as “Difficulties After Migration”. Difficulties in the first generation of fathers after migration are described as difficulties in getting used to the place of migration, which were felt in the early stages of migration, and hesitation after migration. Participants have been addressed especially economic forces due to migration.

Dao, Poritz, Moody, and Szeto (2012) considered that there are four prominent periods of trauma for a forced migrant: pre-migration, migration, encampment, and post-migration. Post migration can define as a process that migrants adjust the new society (Bhugra & Ghupta, 2011, p.2). The participants talked about many problems that occurred in the post-migration period, and they are also not very different from previous themes. One of the most important factors that made it difficult to adapt after migration was the economy and the other was the language. Some participants experienced serious problems during the school process, while the older generations were unable to adapt to the emigrated place

due to the language barrier. These findings point to adaptation problems in the post-migration period.

Bowlby (1980) described a four-stage mode of loss. These stages include numbness or protest; yearning and searching, disorganization and despair and, finally, reorganization. Looking at the steps here, we can see that people go through these stages over time in their narratives after the loss of a place that was migrated, just like after the loss of a loved one, when we look at the steps here. People have first protested migration. Then, in order to survive, research was conducted and there were difficulties in adapting to the new place, that is, in the organization. And the last time they established a new order for themselves. However, as can be seen in the findings here, there may be transitions between these stages. For example, even if people establish a new order, they can still protest against migration.

Another critically important sub-theme was “The increasing responsibilities of fatherhood with lots of thoughts.” Since it happened in the first generation of fathers right after the migration, it was with a lot of thought and anxiety to take responsibility for the children as well. In addition, although the second generation of fathers also thought about the responsibilities of children, fatherhood was more taken into action than the thoughts seen in the first generation. This finding was similar to exploration of Henwood and Procter (2003) that the father of the “new” model of fatherhood that showed the possibility of becoming involved in family life rather than to leave.

Baumrind's typology (1991) explained that parents are characterized as using one of four disciplinary styles: authoritarian, authoritative, permissive, and uninvolved, based on a cross-classification of demandingness and responsiveness. From this point of view, it can be understood that all these concerns or practices are to respond to the responsibilities of the child. But at least for this sub-theme, there wasn't any indicator for demandingness.

The other critical sub-theme was emerged from father narratives was that “Being a Father Twice. An important part of this work was to be able to investigate at the experiences of being a minority father with a better and deeper understanding. Two parts of being an Alevi father were highlighted. One of these two parts was to

protect their children and the other was to be able to pass on the Alevism culture to their children. These findings were similar to Alwin (2001) claiming that black parents may display more control and less warmth than white parents, perhaps in response to a more dangerous and hostile environment. However, at least in this sub-theme, there was no less warmth in the participants' narratives.

The difference in these results may be due to cultural differences. Family is very important in Alevism culture. The main reason why the marital relationship is so important in this society is not entirely due to the marriage itself, but to some other circumstances connected with the marriage and with a creating family. So, family members are important. That may be why, warmth also was emerged in the results.

Protecting part of fatherhood included thinking about many things to protect children and from time-to-time teaching children to hide themselves. In Alevi communities, there is a lot of emphasis on protecting the family (Yaman, 2011, p. 269-272). The protection of the family from time to time included hiding and finding out about it. However, another part of protecting the family is to keep the values alive by transmitting them through the lower generations.

Despite all the responsibilities of fatherhood and the many difficulties that migration brings, another vital theme was “Look at This! I have grown this tree, and how beautiful it is!” In this sub-theme, especially second-generation fathers mentioned that they were more involved in the care of their children, and the fatherhood experiences were very nice and that they gave themselves happiness.

Although the economic difficulties (Hofferth 2003) experienced after the migration affected the fatherhood practices, it was stated that the acquired labor, such as watching a tree grow, returned to the fathers as happiness.

According to the Mother-Child Education Foundation (AÇEV) report 94% of the participants participated in the expressions “It gives me pleasure to be a father” and 93% of the participants participated in the expressions “I enjoy being a father”. The narratives of the fathers participating in this study also support this research.

Lastly, but not least, the sub-theme “We hugged each other more” portrays the resistance of both the individuals but especially the family system in the face of the difficulties experienced after migration.

There are many psychopathologies related to migration (Blackmore, Boyle, Fazel, Ranasinha, Gray & Fitzgerald, 2020). However, in this study, no pathology development was observed except for some anxiety problems that a participant had in the past. Despite the traumas of persecution, violence and displacement, most refugees have not experienced mental health loss (Beiser, 2009).

Just as individuals use coping strategies after traumatic events, so do families use coping strategies as negotiation, joint problem solving, role clarity, understanding and balancing influence and control, and taking perspective (Berg, Meegan & Deviney, 1998). In this sub-theme emerged in this research, the fact that family members are more connected to each other when they are in difficulty, trying to support each other and increasing the dialogue within the family pointed to the resistance shown at the family system level.

Greeff and Holtzkamp (2007) stressed that resilience patterns of families such as (a) traits and abilities of individual family members, (b) the family system’s internal resources and support, (c) familial integration and stability, (d) the family unit’s utilization of its internal strengths and durability to manage problems outside of its boundaries, (e) social support, and (f) a passive appraisal coping style during the crisis as important resilience-enhancing resources. In this context, this sub-theme may also indicate as a family resilience that includes the family system’s internal resources and support.

Final question explored in the present study was “How are these fatherhood experiences similar and different from the first and second generations of Migrated Alevi fathers? In the context that includes information of first- and second-generation Alevi fathers gave about their fatherhood experiences were tried to explore.

This main theme which name is “From Being Unable to Conflict with The Upper Generation to Experiencing Conflict” is divided into five sub-themes. The

sub-themes are “From being unable to conflict with the upper generation to experiencing conflict”, “Still protection but more freedom”, “Being able to live fatherhood with their children”, “I am missing my hometown!” and “The desire to keep Alevism alive.”

The first sub-theme which is from this major theme was “From being unable to conflict with the upper generation to experiencing conflict”. In this sub-theme, it is seen that conflicts which were coming from differences of opinions that first-generation fathers couldn't live with their own fathers, can be experienced when they are fathers now and with their own children. There is a huge shifting at this corner especially first-generation fathers.

Contemporary Turkish families are the latest products of the social, economic, and cultural transformations that Turkey has been experiencing for many years (Sunar & Fişek, 2005). At that time, this cultural change has come with migration. Even control and love can work together, the father-son relationship turns out to be a relationship that involves more conflict, emotional distance, and deprivation (Bolak-Boratav, Fişek & Eslen-Ziya, 2017). Perhaps the relations of the first generation of fathers with their own fathers can be seen as more distant due to the fact that even conflicts cannot be experienced. However, despite this, the fact that the first generation of fathers has opened up space for their own children to experience conflicts may indicate their relationship. And, this may be seen as authoritative parenting style that includes both demandingness and responsiveness Baumrind (1991).

Another critical sub-theme was “Still protection but more freedom”. In this sub-theme, the protection of children is common among two generations of Alevi fathers. But besides this, the method of protection of children has changed over time. For first-generation fathers, protecting their children was more about putting pressure on them, while for second-generation fathers, the way to protect their children was to raise confident children by giving them more autonomy.

Kagitcibasi model offers a synthesis of two constitutive human needs of agency and relatedness with her construct of autonomous-related self (Berry, Segall, & Kagitcibasi, 1997, p. 36-39). In this context, it is seen that especially the

second-generation fathers can separate with their own children by considering the protection needs of their children. This indicates that Fişek's nurturant hierarchy (Bolak-Boratav, Fişek & Eslen-Ziya, 2017) and connectedness (Akyıl, 2012) have continued with different way.

Besides, can it be explained only on the axis of individualism and collectivism that first-generation fathers put more pressure as a method of protecting their children?

Göregenli (1995) indicated that Turkish culture cannot be placed on one or the other side of the individualization-collectivism dichotomy. On the other hand, when ethnic minorities with interdependent family patterns is considered unhealthy and forced to leave, it can actually damage a healthy family relationship (Fişek & Kagıtcıbası, 1999; Kagıtcıbası, 2005).

In this context, it has also been seen in the previous sub-themes that there are many thoughts and concerns under the protection behavior of first-generation fathers who immigrated from their own homeland. Therefore, I propose to focus on the cultural context of the contradictions experienced by fathers who are stuck between two cultures, rather than describing this behavior of fathers only by their gender roles (West & Zimmerman, 1987; Carrigan, Connell & Lee, 1985; Coltrane, 1996, p.50; J. Butler,1990). But if we also evaluate it in terms of gender roles, I also propose to see how exhausting and challenging performative side of gender roles (Butler,1990) are for first-generation fathers, especially after the migration process.

Findings also showed that are being able to live fatherhood with their children in passing times. In the narratives of the participants, it was stated that both the first- and second-generation fathers were able to experience their paternity more over time. First-generation fathers, although they are men, have told us that they cannot love their children next to their own families. However, it has been stated that over time, as their children grow up, the time spent seeing them as a friend increased. This finding was different from the finding that was stated by Sunar and Fişek, (2005) as, fathers, although they have authority, contribute to the growth of their children when the children are young. But when the children grow up, the

previously established playful and affectionate relationship with the father begins to be replaced by themes of authority and respect.

The findings of this study, on the contrary, showed that the time spent, and the love shown increased over time. Perhaps this may also indicate that a father who left his birthplace after emigration and was becoming alone can get support from him as his child grows up. This may show that this progression may be called as family resilient (Berg, Meegan & Deviney, 1988).

First-generation fathers have been more socioeconomically challenged in the past. They are also inferior in education to their own children. Due to emigration, they left the city where they grew up, and their children grew up in the metropolitan area. Over time, with the increasing use of technology, it has become quite easy to access information. Such sociocultural differences between generations may also have led to this change.

Experiencing fatherhood over time included showing love, participating more in the care of your child. This finding was similar to Sancar (2009) that new generations are trying to establish a closer, loving and democratic relationship with their children, rather than continuing the distant and indifferent behavior of their own fathers. Again, this finding may indicate that an authoritative parenting style (Baumrind, 1991).

One important finding that both the first- and second-generation fathers had in common was the longing for the place where they were born, and this longing was emerged as follows: "I am Missing My Hometown!"

Although the participants' lives were spent here, the dream of returning to their hometown one day was shared by the participants. This has manifested itself as a contradiction in everyday life. Findings also show that a state of purgatory in which it is neither possible to get used to the place of migration, nor to return... And the fact that this state of purgatory is being experienced as despair and pessimism. The contradictions experienced may have caused this pessimism.

Bowlby uses attachment theory as a way to conceptualize people's tendency to bond with others or objects, and to explain the many emotional

difficulties and personality disorders caused by reluctant separation and loss (Bowlby, 1980, p. 201).

Although participants get used to the place of migration after many losses, some of them want to return to their roots again. Any moment when this desire is suppressed or not seen can also manifest itself as stress and anxiety. This makes it difficult to bond, and after a place like a child who is separated from his mother, people may not feel connected to the culture and community they are connected to. The fear expressed as a result of this loss will lead to anxiety, which can also be influenced by separation anxiety (Bhugra & Ghupta, 2011, p. 142). It may be relevant ambiguity loses (Boss, 2007).

Cultural diversities and sociopolitical thinking can be seen just like the parts that make up a mosaic (Falicov, 2007). This mosaic includes relational, community and socio-political/cultural dimensions. Where do families come from and where do they go to? Are the families treating the events they have experienced as a story of honor or a story of shame? Temporal and social changes form the basis of all these components (Falicov, 2007). In current study, participants shared their life narratives with such honor, and it has given them also a resilient.

With such a point of view, building new communication networks that will be established by family members and individuals from different cultures in society and socialization can lead to the decimation of the cultural gap between generations (Sluzki, 1979).

This can also indicate that integration strategy (Berry 1992; Berry 1997; Berry 2005) is the fundamental for maintaining relational, community and socio-political/cultural dimensions (Falicov, 2017). This means that people are both protecting their own identity and starting to integrate new conditions (Berry 1992; Berry 1997; Berry 2005).

The last finding was that “The desire to keep alevism alive.” This finding especially indicated that the second-generation fathers should first preserve the Alevism culture passed on to them from their own fathers, and then pass them on to the lower generations.

The assumption that the process of multigenerational transmission is based primarily on relationships does not mean that a baby is born a “blank slate” (*tabula rasa*), completely ready to be shaped by life experience (Bowen & Kerr, 1988, p. 224).

In this context, it is understood that each generation is born into a certain culture and then shaped by this culture. Here, the desire to keep Alevism alive through the transfer of Alevism culture has been emphasized. Whatever prevented the first generation will appear in the second. This situation is expressed as a conflict between generations and also between cultures (Sluzki, 1979). The prevention here may require being more conservative in order to protect the Alevi generations. In Alevi communities, there is a lot of emphasis on protecting the family (Yaman, 2011, p. 269-272). The very process of preserving and transferring Alevism culture can cause intergenerational conflicts.

Schönpflug and Phalet (2001) claimed that despite the gap that migration and acculturation processes can create between generations, empathetic and constructive relationships between father and son facilitate the transmission of values.

So how about an empathetic and constructive relationship here? Sometimes the ways to deal with problems can be the problem itself. Therefore, in an environment where both generations are able to convey their own feelings and thoughts to each other, this relationship can be constructive and empathetic. Such a relationship itself, as mentioned above, can turn into a structure that protects the family and the family can take strength from this relationship, even if there will be hard times.

2.7. CLINICAL IMPLICATIONS

The findings of this study reveal the importance of understanding being an Alevi father, immigrating, and the impact of this migration on paternity and how it is transmitted between generations. Therefore, most important starting point for both therapists and those working in the field is not to ignore the cultural context in

their interventions and studies. We cannot think human apart from the culture they were born into and live their lives in. Therefore, the culture-specific adaptations of the interventions and studies should be studied more. In this context, in this study, the effect of migration and subsequent acculturation on fatherhood practices first and then phenomenon of the intergenerational transmission of this has been tried to understand.

1F2 described the migration experienced by his own root family with a metaphor which name is spiritual death as follows:

“... When we are alone like this, or when old songs are played in his memory, ... he can't even say it because he still can't make sense of it.” (1F2)

This sentences of 1F2 were a critical starting point for my first clinical implication which was described as spatial death. This was such a silence that its existence is not even understood by the person who experience that silence and can only be expressed by the next generation.

Perhaps what we can understand from this is that the difficult life experiences or traumas experienced are experienced in silence. The difficulties experienced cannot be spoken of as an experience, and the lived difficult experiences are separated from conscious awareness (Bradfield, 2011). That was describe as a metaphor of spiritual death. The silence as a clinical implication may show us those kinds of things that cannot be spoken doesn't mean absent.

So, in therapy, therapist should be being curious and give space for open up these memories. And also, therapists should understand dominant narrative and also alternative narratives which underlines the noble, powerful, resilient sides of clients. Exploring in transmission, asking about pride and shame stories of being an immigrant father. Cultural genogram (Hardy & Laszloffy, 1995) should be use as one of the main interventions for better and deeper understanding of these transmissions.

In this study, it was stated that fathers could not love their children besides their family elders in the past times and that they could experience their paternity over time. I also propose to see how exhausting and challenging performative side of gender roles (Butler,1990). However, although this research was conducted with

fathers, some findings also pointed out that a minority of women and mothers who emigrate spend more time at home because the outside world is perceived as unsafe. Here, too, both with the impact of migration and gender roles, women spend more time at home, and also makes themselves more dependent on their husbands, the reduction of adaptation to the outside world. Gender roles complicate the life practices of both sexes. Sharing these challenges among spouses and family will reduce the difficulties that have been experienced. Such communication can become a resource for the family.

Not every difficulty means trauma, and sometimes people come out of some difficult life experience by changing and developing resistance. While this resistance may be at the individual level, it may also be at the family level (Berg, Meegan & Deviney, 1998). However, we can say that one of the most important parameters of experiencing a difficult life experience as a traumatic experience is that a person becomes lonely in that experience. Therefore, the supporting of family members to each other is very important for this reason.

For this, the family should build strong relationships with each other and support each other in moments of stress. In addition, whether they are clinicians or experts in other fields working in the field, they should work more on culture by developing sensitivity to cultural diversity. And not only the traumatic aspects of migration should be focused on, but also the psychological resilience of individuals and families should not be underestimated.

However, sometimes this state of protection in minority families can create more closed systems in itself. Every differentiation effort can be seen as a threat to this system. Trying not to lose can itself lead to more suppression and, eventually, it occurs intergenerational conflicts and gaps (Sluzki, 1979). Therefore, a system in which the needs and feelings of each person are seen and supported by each other creates a sense of security that will allow people to explore.

And finally, again, in what context the events took place is quite important for the comprehension process. In this study, the sharing of Izmir as a livable city was a factor that reduced the difficulties experienced by people after migration by some. This has been a very critical finding in order to make sense of the experiences

experienced. So, the characteristics of the society in the place of migration are very important for the integration of migrating individuals into the society in which they migrated. Therefore, instead of exclusionary behaviors, individuals in different cultures should develop a new understanding to know better each other. Such an attitude is very important for living in a more peaceful society and for everyone to feel safe.

Sancar (2009) stated that new generations are trying to establish a closer, loving and democratic relationship with their children, rather than continuing the distant and indifferent behavior of their own fathers.

This research also shows that fatherhood is experienced over time. While fathers experience their paternity over time, they also share childcare with the mother. Society should also allow this situation, and fathers should be more involved in the family system. Because both the mother needs to feel more belonging to her husband, the child's father, and the father needs to feel more belonging in the family. In this way, a healthy family functioning will be formed by putting all the feet of the triangle on the ground.

In summary, my suggestions for the social field gender roles can be challenging for both men and women from time to time. Sharing this within the family will reduce the difficulties. Another point is that others who are not like us are not always enemies, bad, dangerous or risky. I believe that the meetings and the new language that will be established in this context, both on an individual and social level, will provide a more livable environment for everyone.

2.8. LIMITATIONS AND FURTHER RESEARCH

This qualitative study sought to examine how different generations engage in fathering and the experience of being fathered; how migration influences fatherhood; and the processes by which fathering is transmitted in Alevi fathers in who migrated to Izmir from different cities in Turkey and how their experiences of intergenerational transmission of fatherhood interact with concepts of Bowen's Family Systems Theory. Participants' experiences investigated through semi-

structured interviews and in accordance with the IPA methodologies, it has been studied with a small and homogeneous group in itself. Thus, the participants' experiences were understood in more depth, but this is not generalizable.

This study was conducted with first- and second-generation fathers. Therefore, no definition has been given for the children of second-generation fathers. This is another limitation. Therefore, other studies can be carried out in the light of the demographic information of the third generation such as age and gender. In this context, comparative studies can be conducted to study the transmission of fatherhood by using more heterogeneous groups according to different genders or age ranges.

At the same time, studies that process of the acculturation strategies of different demographic groups can also be studied using Four-Statement Acculturation Measurement Method. In future studies, the acculturation strategies of different age groups, gender groups or groups that have migrated from different places can be measured using this quantitative measurement tool. Thus, larger and different groups can compare with each other.

Although it is a question of taking the migration story, whether migration is compulsory, or voluntary is also an important parameter. Again, only with the groups that will be created using this definition, issues such as acculturation and intergenerational transmission of fatherhood can be studied.

Another important point is self-selection bias issue. The participants described being an Alevi father as a source of pride despite all their difficulties. In addition, they may have agreed to participate in this study because they experienced this identity in this way. Those who did not experience this identity in this way may not have already participated in the study. This can also be considered a limitation in terms of creating a bias.

Even this study was on fatherhood, the experiences of being a minority woman and mother were shared, albeit small, after migration. Even if the current study did not work with women, the role of the mothers at home could be asked. In a broader framework, nevertheless, on the axis of these research topics, it is possible

to work with women and families and conduct future studies on family dynamics and femininity and motherhood practices.

Finally, acculturation studies focus on whether intergenerational change is caused by developmental periods or acculturation. Therefore, if I develop the same, the differences here can be understood by conducting comparative studies with groups with and without migration experience at the same stage.

Despite these limitations, this study has established a strong foundation for future research in this field by attempting to understand fatherhood experiences and the intergenerational transmission of fatherhood, migration, and acculturation process of the first- and second-generation Alevi fathers.

2.9. REFERENCES

- Akbulut, O. & Usal, Z. O. (2008). Parental Religious Rights vs. Compulsory Religious Education in Turkey, *International Journal on Minority and Group Rights*, 15, 433-455.
- Alwin, D. F. (2001). Parental values, beliefs, and behavior: A review and promulga for research into the new century. In T. Owens & S. Hofferth (Eds.), *Children at the millennium: Where did we come from, where are we going?* New York: Elsevier Science
- American Psychiatric Association. (2013). *Diagnostic and statistical manual of mental disorders* (5th ed.). <https://doi.org/10.1176/appi.books.9780890425596>
- Arar, Y. Bezirgan ve Nuri Bilgin (2010). “Gazetelerde Ötekileştirme Pratikleri: Türk Basını Üzerine Bir İnceleme”, *İletişim Kuram Ve Araştırma Dergisi*. Sayı 30 ss.1-18.
- Baumrind, D. (1968). An exploratory study of socialization effects on Black children: Black-White comparisons. *Child Development*, 43, 261-267.
- Beiser M. Resettling refugees and safeguarding their mental health: lessons learned from the Canadian Refugee Resettlement Project. *Transcult Psychiatry* 2009;46: 539-83.
- Belsky, J., Conger, R., & Capaldi, D. M. (2009). The intergenerational transmission of parenting: Introduction to the special section. *Developmental Psychology*, 45, 1201–1204.
- Berg, C. A., Meegan, S. P., & Deviney, F.P. (1998). A social-contextual model of coping with every day problem across the lifespan. *Internal Journal of Behavioral Development*, 22(2), 239-261.
- Berg, C. A., Meegan, S. P., & Deviney, F.P. (1998). A social-contextual model of coping with every day problem across the lifespan. *Internal Journal of Behavioral Development*, 22(2), 239-261.
- Berry, J. W. (1992). Acculturation and adaptation in a new society. *International Migration*, 30, 69–85.

- Berry, J. W. (2005). Acculturation: living successfully in two cultures. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 29, 697–712.
- Berry, J. W., Sam, D. (1997). Acculturation and adaptation. In J. W. Berry, M. H. Segall and C.
- Berry, J. W., Segall, M. H., & Kagitcibasi, C. (Eds.) (1997). Social behavior and applications. Vol. III of Handbook of cross-cultural psychology (2nd ed.). Boston, MA: Allyn and Bacon.
- Blackmore, R., Boyle, J. A., Fazel, M., Ranasinha, S., Gray, K. M., Fitzgerald, G., Gibson-Helm, M. (2020). The prevalence of mental illness in refugees and asylum seekers: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *PLOS Medicine*, 17(9), e1003337.
- Bolak-Boratav, H., Okman-Fişek, G. & Eslen-Ziya, H. (2017). Erkekliğin Türkiye halleri. Istanbul: *Istanbul Bilgi University Press*.
- Bowen, M. (1978). *Family therapy in clinical practice*. New York: Jason Aronson.
- Bowlby, J. (1980). *Attachment and Loss*. New York: Basic Books.
- Bradfield, B. (2011). The dissociation of lived experience: A relational psychoanalytic analysis of the intergenerational transmission of trauma. *International Journal of Psychoanalytic Self Psychology*, 6(4), 531-550.
- Brown, J. (1999). Bowen family systems theory and practice: Illustration and critique. *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Family Therapy*, 20(2), 94-103.
- Butler, J. (1990). *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. New York, London: Routledge.
- Capaldi, D. M., Pears, K. C., Patterson, G. R., & Owen, L. D. (2003). Continuity of parenting practices across generations in an at-risk sample: A prospective comparison of direct and mediated associations. *Journal of Abnormal Child Psychology*, 31(2), 127–142.
- Carr, A. (2006). *Family therapy: Concepts, process and practice*, (2nd ed.). West Sussex, UK: Wiley- Blackwell.
- Carrigan, T., Connell, B., & Lee, J. (1985). Toward a New Sociology of Masculinity. *Theory and Society*, 14(5), 551–604.

- Çelik, B. A. (2005). "I miss my village!": Forced Kurdish migrants in İstanbul and their representation in associations. *New Perspectives on Turkey*, no. 32 (2005): 137-163.
- Çelik, B. A. (2005). "I miss my village!": Forced Kurdish migrants in İstanbul and their representation in associations. *New Perspectives on Turkey*, no. 32 (2005): 137-163.
- Chen, Z.-Y., & Kaplan, H. B. (2001). Intergenerational transmission of constructive parenting. *Journal of Marriage and Family*, 63, 17–31.
- Coltrane, S. (1996). *Family man: Fatherhood, housework, and gender equity*. New York: *Oxford University Press*.
- Dao, T. K., Poritz, J. M., Moody, R. P., & Szeto, K. (2012). Development, reliability, and validity of the Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Interview for Vietnamese refugees: a diagnostic instrument for Vietnamese refugees. *Journal of traumatic stress*, 25(4), 440-445.
- Eisenbruch, M. (1990). The cultural bereavement interview: a new clinical research approach for refugees. *Psychiatric Clinics of North America*, 13, 715–35.
- Fisek, G. O., & Kagıtcıbası, C. (1999). Multiculturalism and psychotherapy: The Turkish case. In P. Pedersen (Ed.), *Multiculturalism as a fourth force* (pp. 75-90). Castleton, NY: Hamilton.
- Frost, J. (1928). "Acquainted With the Night", <https://www.vqronline.org/acquainted-night>, (10.04.2022).
- Gatfield, E. (2017). Augmenting Bowen family of origin work: Using the genogram and therapeutic art- based activity. *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Family Therapy*, 38(2), 272-282.
- Gladding, S. T., (2015). *Family therapy: History, theory and practice*, (6th ed.). New Jersey, NJ: Prentice-Hall, Inc.
- Goldenberg, H. & Goldenberg, I. (2013). *Family therapy: An overview* (8th ed.). California, CA: *Brooks/Cole Cengage Learning*
- Göregenli, M. (1995). Individualism-collectivism orientations in the Turkish culture: A preliminary study. *Türk Psikoloji Dergisi*, 10, 1-14.

- Hauari, H. & Hollingworth, K., *Understanding Fathering, Masculinity, Diversity and Change*, (2009). Retrieved from <https://discovery.ucl.ac.uk/id/eprint/1477791/1/understanding-fathering-diversity-full.pdf>.
- Hofferth SL. Race/Ethnic Differences in Father Involvement in Two-Parent Families: Culture, Context, or Economy? *Journal of Family Issues*. 2003;24(2):185-216.
- Hofferth, S. L., Pleck, J. H., & Vesely, C. K. (2012). The transmission of parenting from fathers to sons. *Parenting*, 12, 282–305.
- Kagıtcıbası, C. (2005). Autonomy and relatedness in cultural context: Implications for self and family. *Journal of cross-cultural psychology*, 36(4), 403-422.
- Kehl-Bodrogi, K. (2012). Kızılbaşlar/Aleviler (B. E. Aybudak & O. Değirmenci, Trans.). İstanbul: Ayrıntı.
- Kerr, D. C. R., Capaldi, D. M., Pears, K. C., & Owen, L. D. (2009). A prospective three generational study of fathers' constructive parenting: Influence from family of origin, adolescent adjustment, and offspring temperament. *Developmental Psychology*, 45, 1257–1275.
- Kerr, M. E., & Bowen, M. (1988). *Family evaluation: An approach based on Bowen theory*. New York, NY: W. W. Norton & Co.
- Kübler-Ross, E. (2008). *On Death and Dying 40th Anniversary Edition*. Oxon: Routledge.
- Lincoln, Y., & Guba, E. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Marazyan, J. (2016). "Like I Always Knew It": The Phenomenology of Intergenerational Transmission of Trauma In Three Generations Of Armenian Women In Turkey (Unpublished Master Thesis). İstanbul Bilgi University, İstanbul.
- Nichols, P. M. (2016). *Family therapy: Concepts and methods* (11th ed.). New Jersey, NJ: Pearson Education, Inc.
- Papero, D. V. (1990). *Bowen family system theory*. Boston: Allyn & Bacon.

- Patton, MQ. *Qualitative research and evaluation methods*. 3rd Sage Publications; Thousand Oaks, CA: 2002.
- Phalet, K., & Schönplflug, U. (2001). "Intergenerational Transmission of Collectivism and Achievement Values in Two Acculturation Contexts", *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, 32(2), 186–201.
- Phalet, K., & Schönplflug, U. (2001). *Intergenerational Transmission of Collectivism and Achievement Values in Two Acculturation Contexts*. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, 32(2), 186–201.
- Pietkiewicz, I., and Smith, J.A., A Practical Guide to Using Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis in Qualitative Research Psychology, *Psychological Journal*, 20, 1, 2014, 7-14.
- Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Interview for Vitnamese Refugees; a Diagnostic Instrument for Vietnamese Refugees. *Journal of Traumatic Stress*, 25, 440-445.
- Sancar, S. (2009). *Erkeklik imkansız iktidar: Ailede, piyasada ve sokakta erkekler*. İstanbul: Metis.
- Shakland, D. (1999). Antropoloji ve Etnisite: Yeni Alevi Hareketinde Etnografyanın Yeri, Alevi Kimliği, Ed. *Tord Olsson, Elisabeth Özdalga, Catharina Raudvere, Tarih Vakfı Yurt Yay., İstanbul*.
- Silverstein, L. B., Auerbach, C. F., & Levant, R. F. (2002). Contemporary fathers reconstructing masculinity: Clinical implications of gender role strain. *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*, 33(4), 361–369.
- Simons, R. L., Whitbeck, L. B., Conger, R. D., & Chyi-In, W. (1991). Intergenerational transmission of harsh parenting. *Developmental Psychology*, 27(1), 159–171.
- Sluzki, C. E. (1979). Migration and family conflict. *Family Process*, 18(4), 379–390.
- Steinberg, L. (2001). We know some things: Parent-adolescent relationships in retrospect and prospect. *Journal of Research on Adolescence*, 11, 1–19.

- Sunar, D. & Fisek, G. O. (2005). Contemporary Turkish families. In J. L. Roopnarine, & U. P. Gieler (Eds.), *Families in global perspective* (pp. 169-183). Boston, MA: Pearson/Allyn and Bacon.
- Ulusal Tez Merkezi. (2022). Retrieved from <https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/>
- West, C., & Zimmerman, D. (1987). Doing gender. *Gender & Society*, 1, 125-151.
- Wojcik, W., Bhugra, D. (2010). Loss and cultural bereavement. In D. Bhugra, T. Craig and K. S. Bhui, eds., *Mental Health of Refugees and Asylum Seekers*. Oxford: *Oxford University Press*.
- Yalçın, V. (2021). *Anadolu Aleviliğinin Kolektif Melankolisi: Feda Edilemeyen İmgenin Tiranlığı* (Unpublished Master Thesis). Istanbul Bilgi University, Istanbul.
- Yaman, A. (2001). *Dedelik Kurumu Ekseninde Değişim Sürecinde Alevilik*, (Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation). Istanbul University, Istanbul. Retrieved From: <http://nek.istanbul.edu.tr:4444/ekos/TEZ/35173.pdf>.
- Yıldırım, A. (2018). *Reconsidering The Negotiation Among Intersecting Identities: Lgbt+ Alevis in Istanbul* (Unpublished Master Thesis). Istanbul Bilgi University, Istanbul.

CHAPTER III

DISCUSSION

Fatherhood is important phenomenon that has been investigated since the past. Also, fatherhood studies are becoming a phenomenon that has been of increasing interest and studies have been produced especially recently.

The current study seeks to examine how different generations participate in fatherhood and the experience of fatherhood; how migration affects fatherhood; and the processes by which fatherhood is transmitted in Alevi fathers in who migrated to Izmir from different cities in Turkey. Two generational chains of men will be selected from Turkey; five chains of first generation (migrant) fathers and five chains of second-generation fathers who will be the son of first-generation fathers.

The first article reviewed briefly the literature on Definitions of Alevism and Alevi Culture. The concept of fatherhood is explained in the light of the concepts of fatherhood and gender roles, being a minority father and being a father in Turkey. The phenomenon of migration was also explained with the concepts of migration and mental health, migration and acculturation processes, and migration and family dynamics. Finally, a brief historical context of Alevi migration in Turkey is given. These phenomena were discussed, and these phenomenon's relationships were tried to understand via considering intersectional perspective.

The second article is the research article aiming to understand deeply Intergenerational Transmission of Fatherhood view of Bowen Family Systems Theory. In this respect, Bowen's Family Systems Model and three fundamental concepts -differentiation of self, triangulation and multigenerational transmission process are defined for better and deeper understanding of intergenerational transmission of fatherhood. The results showed quite important points about being an Alevi father in Turkey, the relationship of these fatherhood experiences with migration and the practices of fatherhood that transmitted between generations.

Although it was especially difficult to carry the Alevi identity in the past, this difficulty has been decreasing over time. Again, although the first years of

migration were difficult in terms of adaptation, there were decreases in difficulties with the passing time. Being an Alevi father, like other fathers, involved taking responsibility for his child and transferring Alevism culture to him. While fathers live their fatherhood more comfortably over time, changing times are also increasing when fathers spend time with their children. Although there are difficulties, strengthening family ties to cope with difficulties is another important finding. This article concluded with a discussion of clinical implications for not only clinical practice but also other applied areas of psychology.

Beyond the discussion, more research is needed on how the culture we live in, or the cultures we encounter, affect our attitudes, feelings, and behaviors. However, although paternity studies have been increasing recently, more paternity studies are also needed. With this study, it is aimed to make a small contribution to the gaps in these issues.

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A. INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

GÖRÜŞME SORULARI

Birinci Kuşak Alevi Babalar İçin Görüşme Soruları

Bu görüşme birinci kuşak Alevi babaların göç ve babalık deneyimlerini araştırmaya yönelik yüksek lisans tezi kapsamında yapılmaktadır. Görüşme toplamda 38 sorudan oluşmakta ve yaklaşık 1 - 1,5 saat sürmesi beklenmektedir. Görüşmemiz ses kaydına alınacaktır ve bu kayıtlar araştırma boyunca saklanacaktır ancak hiçbir şekilde araştırma dışında izniniz haricinde kullanılmayacaktır. Ayrıca çalışmanın gizliliği kapsamında isimleriniz hiçbir şekilde kullanılmayacaktır.

Başlamadan önce sormak istediğiniz herhangi bir şey var mı?

- 1) **Sizin için Alevilik nedir? Aleviliği nasıl tanımlarsınız?**
 - Alevilik kimliği sizin için ne ifade ediyor?
- 2) **Sizin için Alevi bir çocuk olmak ne anlama geliyordu?**
 - Sizce şu anda Alevi bir çocuk olarak yetişmek ne demek?
 - Sizce çocuğunuz için Alevi bir çocuk olarak büyüme nasıl bir deneyimdi?
- 3) **Baba olmayı nasıl tanımlarsınız?**
 - Baba olduğunuzda neler hissetmiştiniz?
 - Baba olmak hayatınızı değiştirmiş miydi? Değiştirdi ise bu değişiklikler nelerdi?
 - Baba olmanın hayatınız için size öğrettiği şeyler nelerdi?
- 4) **Yaşadığınız toplumda Alevi bir baba olmayı nasıl tanımlarsınız?**
 - Yaşadığınız toplumda Alevi bir baba olmayı nasıl deneyimliyorsunuz?
 - Alevi bir baba olmak üzerine ne hissediyorsunuz?
- 5) **Ailenizin yaşadığı göçü nasıl anlatırsınız?**
 - Göçü hangi tarihte yaşadınız?
 - Nereden nereye göç ettiniz?
 - Göç ederken yanınızda kimler vardı?
 - Yaşanılan göçle ilgili ailenizde neler konuşuldu?
 - Hangi sebeplerden dolayı göç etmeye karar verildi?

- Göç sırasında yaşanan herhangi zorlayıcı bir olay olmuş muydu? Olduysa bu olaylar nelerdi?
 - Göç sonrasında neler yaşandı?
 - Göç ettiğiniz yerde Alevi kimliğinizi yaşamanız için ne kadar alan açıldı?
 - Şu anda yaşadığınız topluluğa aidiyet duygunuzla ilgili neler söylersiniz?
 - Sizce göç öncesinde, göç sırasında ve göç sonrasında yaşanan olaylar sizin ailenizi nasıl etkiledi?
- 6) Yaşanılan göç ev içi rollerinizi (babalık, annelik, çocukluk gibi) nasıl etkiledi?**
- Yaşanılan göç babanızın sizle olan ilişkisini nasıl etkiledi?
 - Babanızın Alevi bir baba olarak sizden beklentileri nelerdi?
 - Babanızın Alevi bir baba olarak başka inançlardan olan kişilerle ilişkinizden beklentileri nelerdi?
- 7) Yaşanılan göç sizin babalığınızı nasıl etkiledi?**
- Yaşanılan göç babalıkla ilgili davranışlarınızı nasıl etkiledi?
 - Yaşanılan göç babalıkla ilgili duygularınızı nasıl etkiledi?
 - Babanızın babalık şekli ile sizin babalık şeklinizin benzer ve farklı yönleri nelerdir?
 - Kendi çocuğunuzla ilişkinizde kendi babanızdan gördüğünüz neleri taşıdınız?
 - Bunun neden dolayı önemli olduğunu düşünüyor ve sürdürüyorsunuz?
 - Kendi babanızla çatışmalar yaşar mıydınız? Çatışmalar yaşandıysa bu çatışmalar nasıl çözüldü?
 - Kendi çocuğunuzla ilişkinizde kendi babanızın babalığından neleri taşımak istemediniz? Neleri değiştirdiniz?
 - Sizin Alevi bir baba olarak kendi çocuğunuzdan beklentileriniz nelerdir?
- 8) Genel olarak, yaşadığınız toplumda göç deneyimi olan Alevi bir baba olmanın olumlu ve olumsuz yönleri nelerdir?**
- 9) Eklemek istediğiniz bir şeyler var mı?**

İkinci Kuşak Alevi Babalar İçin Görüşme Soruları

Bu görüşme ikinci kuşak Alevi babaların göç ve babalık deneyimlerini araştırmaya yönelik yüksek lisans tezi kapsamında yapılmaktadır. Görüşme toplamda 35 sorudan oluşmakta ve yaklaşık 1 - 1,5 saat sürmesi beklenmektedir. Görüşmemiz ses kaydına alınacaktır ve bu kayıtlar araştırma boyunca saklanacaktır ancak hiçbir şekilde araştırma dışında izniniz haricinde kullanılmayacaktır. Ayrıca çalışmanın gizliliği kapsamında isimleriniz hiçbir şekilde kullanılmayacaktır.

Başlamadan önce sormak istediğiniz herhangi bir şey var mı?

1) Sizin için Alevilik nedir? Aleviliği nasıl tanımlarsınız?

- Alevilik kimliği sizin için ne ifade ediyor?

2) Sizin için Alevi bir çocuk olmak ne anlama geliyordu?

- Sizce şu anda Alevi bir çocuk olarak yetişmek ne demek?
- Sizce çocuğunuz için Alevi bir çocuk olarak büyümek nasıl bir deneyim?

3) Baba olmayı nasıl tanımlarsınız?

- Baba olduğunuzda neler hissetmişsiniz?
- Baba olmak hayatınızı değiştirmiş miydi? Değiştirdi ise bu değişiklikler nelerdi?
- Baba olmanın hayatınız için size öğrettiği şeyler nelerdi?

4) Yaşadığınız toplumda Alevi bir baba olmayı nasıl tanımlarsınız?

- Yaşadığınız toplumda Alevi bir baba olmayı nasıl deneyimliyorsunuz?
- Alevi bir baba olmak üzerine ne hissediyorsunuz?

5) Babanızın yaşadığı göçü nasıl anlatırsınız?

- Yaşanılan göçle ilgili ailenizde neler konuşulurdu?
- Hangi sebeplerden dolayı göç etmeye karar verildi?
- Göç sırasında size aktarılan herhangi zorlayıcı bir olay olmuş muydu? Olduysa bu olaylar nelerdi?
- Göç sonrasında neler yaşandı?
- Göç ettiğiniz yerde Alevi kimliğinizi yaşamanız için ne kadar alan açıldı?
- Şu anda yaşadığınız topluluğa aidiyet duygunuzla ilgili neler söylersiniz?
- Sizce yaşanan göç sizin içine doğduğunuz ailenizi nasıl etkiledi?

6) Yaşanılan göç ev içi rollerinizi (babalık, annelik, çocukluk gibi) nasıl etkiledi?

- Yaşanılan göç babanızın sizle olan ilişkisini nasıl etkiledi?
- Babanızın Alevi bir baba olarak sizden beklentileri nelerdi?
- Babanızın Alevi bir baba olarak başka inançlardan olan kişilerle ilişkinizden beklentileri nelerdi?

7) Göç eden bir babanın çocuğu olmak sizin babalığınızı nasıl etkiledi?

- Yaşanılan göç babalıkla ilgili davranışlarınızı nasıl etkiledi?
- Yaşanılan göç babalıkla ilgili duygularınızı nasıl etkiledi?
- Babanızın babalık şekli ile sizin babalık şeklinizin benzer ve farklı yönleri nelerdir?
- Kendi çocuğunuzla ilişkinizde kendi babanızın babalığından neleri taşıdınız?
- Bunun neden dolayı önemli olduğunu düşünüyor ve sürdürüyorsunuz?
- Kendi babanızla çatışmalar yaşar mıydınız? Çatışmalar yaşandıysa bu çatışmalar nasıl çözüldü?
- Kendi çocuğunuzla ilişkinizde kendi babanızın babalığından neleri taşımak istemediniz? Neleri değiştirdiniz?
- Sizin Alevi bir baba olarak kendi çocuğunuzdan beklentileriniz nelerdir?

8) Genel olarak, yaşadığınız toplumda göç deneyimi olan Alevi bir baba olmanın olumlu ve olumsuz yönleri nelerdir?

9) Eklemek istediğiniz bir şeyler var mı?

APPENDIX B. INFORMED CONSENT FORM

BİLGİ ÜNİVERSİTESİ KLİNİK PSİKOLOJİ YÜKSEK LİSANS BÖLÜMÜ

Bitirme Tezi- Bilgilendirilmiş Onam Formu

Değerli Katılımcı,

Bu araştırma, Bilgi Üniversitesi Klinik Psikoloji Çift ve Aile Terapileri Yüksek Lisans Programı bünyesinde bitirme tezi olarak, Dr. Yudum Söylemez danışmanlığında Psk. Utku Çetin tarafından yürütülmektedir.

Araştırma, farklı kuşaklardan Alevi babaların kuşaklararası aktarılan ebeveynlik ve göç deneyimlerini incelemeyi amaçlamaktadır. Bu araştırmayla, Alevi baba olmak, göç ve kuşaklararası aktarım gibi konulara ışık tutulması hedeflenmektedir.

Araştırmacı, sizinle yaklaşık 1- 1,5 saat sürecek bir görüşme yapacaktır. Görüşme sırasında ses kaydı alınacaktır. Araştırmacı size kişisel geçmişiniz, aile ilişkileriniz ve ebeveynlik deneyimlerinize ilgili sorular soracaktır. Görüşmeler yüz yüze ya da online platform kullanarak yapılacaktır. Yüz yüze görüşmeler, kendinizi rahat ve güvende hissedebilmeniz ve aynı zamanda gizliliğin de güvence altına alınabilmesi için sizin evinizde yapılacaktır. Online görüşmelerde ise kullanılacak olan uygulamanın görüşmeye özel bir şifre ile aktif olan bağlantı linki katılımcılara görüşmeler öncesinde araştırmacı tarafından iletilecektir.

İsminiz kayıt altında yapılan görüşmeler esnasında, ses kayıtlarının yazıya döküldüğü transkriptlerde ve demografik bilgi formunda kullanılmayacaktır. İsminiz sadece şu an okuduğunuz Bitirme Tezi- Bilgilendirilmiş Onam Formu'nda bulunacaktır. Araştırma boyunca sizlerden kimlik belirleyici hiçbir bilgi istenmeyecektir. Tüm belgeler özel ve kilitli dosyalarda saklanacaktır. Bitirme Tezi- Bilgilendirilmiş Onam Formu bu belgelerden ayrı bir yerde saklanacaktır.

Alınan kayıtlara sadece araştırmayı yapan kişi (Psk. Utku Çetin), verilerin incelenmesine destek olacak kişi (İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Klinik Psikoloji Yüksek Lisansı Çift ve Aile Alt alanı öğrencisi Psk. İdil Biriken Gürses) ve tez danışmanı (Dr. Yudum Söylemez) tarafından ulaşılabilecektir. 3. Şahıs ve kurumlarla asla paylaşılmayacaktır. Cevaplarınız çalışması planlanan tez kapsamında ve olası herhangi bir başka yerde sunulması ve/veya yayınlanması planlanan araştırmalar için kullanılacaktır. Bütün veriler (ses kayıtları, transkriptler ve onam formları) araştırma bittikten 6 ay sonra imha edilecektir.

Bu araştırmaya katılarak kendiniz, göç deneyiminiz ve ebeveynlik ile ilgili yeni bilgiler keşfetmeniz beklenmektedir. Araştırma sonuçlarıyla Alevi baba olmak, göç ve kuşaklararası aktarım gibi konularda literatüre katkıda bulunacaksınız.

Görüşmeye katılımın üzerinizde herhangi bir olumsuz etkisinin olması beklenmemektedir.

Görüşmeye katılımınız tamamen gönüllülük esasına dayanmaktadır. Görüşme sırasında kendinizi rahat hissetmediğiniz soruları cevaplandırmayabilir ve görüşmeyi istediğiniz anda sonlandırabilirsiniz. Herhangi bir sebep göstermeden alınan ses kaydının silinmesini isteyebilirsiniz. Görüşme öncesinde, sırasında ve sonrasında istediğiniz taktirde araştırmacıya soru sorabilirsiniz.

Araştırmayla ilgili daha fazla bilgi almak için araştırmacı Utku Çetin'i arayabilir ya da mail adresi üzerinden iletişime geçebilirsiniz.

Zamanınızı ayırdığınız ve araştırmamıza verdiğiniz değerli katkılarınız için teşekkür ederiz.

Yüz Yüze Görüşmeler İçin:

Bu Bitirme Tezi- Bilgilendirilmiş Onam Belgesi'ni okudum. Çalışmaya katılmayı kabul ediyorum ve bu belgeyi kendi hür irademle imzalıyorum. Araştırmacı saklamam için bu belgenin bir kopyasını bana teslim etmiştir.

Adı-Soyadı:

İmza:

Tarih:

Online Görüşmeler İçin:

Bitirme Tezi - Bilgilendirilmiş Onam Formu aşağıdaki cümleler ile e-posta üzerinden alınacaktır.

"Mail yolu ile gönderilen Bitirme Tezi - Bilgilendirilmiş Onam Formunu okudum. ekte gönderdiğim Bitirme Tezi- Bilgilendirilmiş Onam Formunu kendi hür irademle onaylayarak, araştırmaya katılmayı kabul ediyorum."

APPENDIX C. ADDENDIUM FORM

EK FORM

Değerli Katılımcı,

Görüşmenin ardından, duygusal bir rahatsızlık yaşadığınızı hissettiyseniz ve bir terapi desteği alma ihtiyacı duyarsanız İzmir Ekonomi Üniversitesi Psikoloji Uygulama ve Araştırma Merkezi (PUAM) ve İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Psikolojik Danışmanlık Merkezi Klinik Psikoloji Yüksek Lisans, Özyeğin Üniversitesi Çift ve Aile Merkezi (ÖzÜÇAM) Psikoloji Yüksek Lisans eğitimi kapsamında uygun ücretle danışan kabul etmektedir. İzmir Büyükşehir Belediyesi Psikososyal Destek Birimi de ücretsiz olarak psikolojik danışmanlık hizmeti verebilmektedir. Bu hizmetlerden faydalanmak isterseniz ilgili merkezlerin iletişim bilgileri aşağıdadır. Katılımınız için teşekkür ederiz.

- 1) İzmir Ekonomi Üniversitesi Psikoloji Uygulama ve Araştırma Merkezi (PUAM)
Bilgi ve Başvuru için İletişim Bilgileri:
Web Sitesi: puam.ieu.edu.tr
İletişim: puam@ieu.edu.tr - 0232 488 82 17
- 2) İzmir Büyükşehir Belediyesi Sosyal Projeler Müdürlüğü Psikososyal Destek Destek Birimi
Bilgi ve Başvuru için İletişim Bilgileri:
Adres: Zübeyde Hanım, Baş Pehlivan Karaali Cd. No: 377, 35730
Karşıyaka/İZMİR
Tel: 0232 293 38 84
- 3) Özyeğin Üniversitesi Çift ve Aile Merkezi (ÖzÜÇAM)
Bilgi ve Başvuru için İletişim Bilgileri:
İletişim: ozu-cam@ozyegin.edu.tr - 0549 810 86 25
- 4) İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Psikolojik Danışmanlık Merkezi
Bilgi ve Başvuru için İletişim Bilgileri
İletişim: pdm@bilgi.edu.tr - 0212 311 76 74

APPENDIX D. DEMOGRAPHIC FORM

BİRİNCİ KUŞAK BABALAR İÇİN DEMOGRAFİK BİLGİ FORMU

Yaşınız

Doğduğunuz Şehir

Göç Ettiğiniz Şehir

Kaç Sene Önce Göç Ettiniz?

Kaç Kardeşiniz? Kaç Erkek? Kaç Kız?

Mesleğiniz

Eğitim Durumunuz

Okur- Yazar Değil

Okur - Yazar

İlkokul

Ortaokul - Lise

Üniversite

Yüksek Lisans

Doktora

Medeni Haliniz

Bekar

Evli

Boşanmış

Eşi ile Ayrı Yaşıyor

Diğer

Ekonomik Durumunuz

Çok Düşük

Düşük

Orta

Yüksek

Çok Yüksek

Psikolojik Destek Aldınız Mı?

Evet

Hayır

DEMOGRAPHIC FORM

İKİNCİ KUŞAK BABALAR İÇİN DEMOGRAFİK BİLGİ FORMU

Yaşınız

Doğduğunuz Şehir

Şu an Yaşadığınız Şehir

Kaç Kardeşsiniz? Kaç Erkek? Kaç Kız?

Mesleğiniz

Eğitim Durumunuz

Okur- Yazar Değil

Okur - Yazar

İlkokul

Ortaokul - Lise

Üniversite

Yüksek Lisans

Doktora

Medeni Haliniz

Bekar

Evli

Boşanmış

Eşi ile Ayrı Yaşıyor

Diğer

Ekonomik Durumunuz

Çok Düşük

Düşük

Orta

Yüksek

Çok Yüksek

Psikolojik Destek Aldınız Mı?

Evet

Hayır

APPENDIX E. ANNOUNCEMENT TEXT

ARAŞTIRMAYA KATILIM DAVETİ DUYURU METNİ

Merhabalar,

İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Klinik Psikoloji Yüksek Lisansı programı bünyesinde, Dr. Yudum Söylemez danışmanlığında birinci ve ikinci kuşak Alevi babaların göç ve babalık deneyimleri ile bu deneyimlerin kuşaklararası aktarımını inceleyen bir araştırma yürütüyorum.

Aşağıdaki kriterleri sağlayarak bu çalışmaya katılabileceğini düşündüğünüz kişilere araştırmaya katılmaları için bilgilendirme yapmanızı rica ediyorum. Araştırmaya katılım içi kriterler:

Birinci kuşak Alevi babalar için;

-Doğduğu yerden başka bir yere göç etmiş,

-Göç eden ilk kuşak olmaktadır.

İkinci kuşak Alevi babalar için;

-Göç edilen yerde doğup ve buradan göç etmemiş olmaktadır.

Araştırma, farklı kuşaklardan Alevi babaların kuşaklararası aktarılan göç deneyimlerini ve bu deneyimlerin babalıklarını nasıl etkilediğini incelemeyi amaçlamaktadır. Bu araştırmayla, Alevi baba olmak, göç ve kuşaklararası aktarım gibi konulara ışık tutulması hedeflenmektedir.

Araştırmaya katılmayı kabul eden katılımcılarla yaklaşık 1 - 1,5 saat sürecek yüz yüze veya online görüşmeler yapılacaktır. Katılım gönüllülük esasına bağlıdır. Çalışmadaki kişisel veriler gizli tutulacaktır. Araştırmaya katılım ve bilgi almak için mail adresimden benimle iletişime geçebilirsiniz.

Değerli vaktiniz için şimdiden teşekkür ederim.

Sevgiler,

Utku.

APPENDIX F. MEMBER CHECKING CONTENT

GÖÇLEŞEN BİRİNCİ VE İKİNCİ KUŞAK ALEVİ BABALARIN BABALIĞIN KUŞAKLARARASI AKTARIMINI ÇALIŞTIĞIMIZ ARAŞTIRMANIN BULGULARININ ÖZETİ

Merhabalar,

Yürütülen araştırmada, farklı kuşaklardan Alevi babaların kuşaklararası aktarılan ebeveynlik ve göç deneyimlerini incelemeyi amaçlamaktadır. Bu araştırmayla, Alevi baba olmak, göç ve kuşaklararası aktarım gibi konulara ışık tutulması hedeflenmektedir. Bu bağlamda 5 birinci ve 5 ikinci kuşak Alevi babayla yapılan görüşmeler sonucunda, sizlerin Alevi baba olmak, göç ve babalığın aktarımı gibi konularda paylaştığınız deneyimlerinizi anlamak ve anlamlandırmak için ulaştığım bilgileri sizlerle paylaşmak isterim. Bu bilgilerin sizlerin hayat deneyimlerinizi ne kadar yansıtıp yansıtmadığına dair de geri bildirim alabilmeyi isterim.

Bununla birlikte şunu da belirtmek isterim ki, her araştırmada olabileceği gibi bu araştırmada da bütün deneyimleri içeren bir sonuç elde etmek maalesef mümkün olamamıştır. Ancak, sıklıkla tekrar eden, bazı çarpıcı ve anlamlı deneyimler sonuçlar kısmında ele alınmıştır. Bu bağlamda sonuçlar kısmında 4 ana tema ve bu ana temaların altına dağılan 18 alt tema oluşmuştur. Bu tema başlıkları şunlardır:

- Alevi Erkek Olmanın Zorluğu
- Geçmişte Yaşanan Zorluklar

Bu alt tema Alevi babaların çocukluk zamanlarında ve geçmişlerinde yaşadıkları zorlukların anlatılarından oluşmuştur.

- Dışlayıcı Davranışların Zorlayıcılığı

Bu alt tema Alevilere karşı uygulanan dışlayıcı davranışların yarattığı zorlukların anlatılarından oluşmuştur.

- Burada Ne İşim Var?

Bu alt tema ise yaşanan bu zorluklardan dolayı yaşanan çelişkileri ve katılıcıların göçe dair kendilerine sordukları sorulardan oluşmuştur.

- Türkiye’de Alevi Baba Olmak
 - Aleviliği Dürüstlük Olarak Tanımlamak

Bu alt tema Alevi babaların Aleviliği dürüstlük olarak tanımlamasından ve bunu yaşam pratiklerine uygulamalarının aktarımından oluşmuştur.
 - Hoşgörü Olarak Alevilik

Bu alt temada Alevi babalar Aleviliği hoşgörülü olmak olarak anlatmışlardır.
 - Alevilik Kimliğinin Gizlenmesi

Bu alt temada katılımcılar özellikle geçmişte Alevi kimliklerini gizlediklerini anlatmışlardır. Ancak zamanla bu durumun değiştiğini de vurgulamışlardır.
 - Aleviliği Zamanla Yaşayabilmek

Bu alt temada ise Aleviliği geçmişte yaşamının daha zor olduğu ancak zamanla Aleviliğin daha rahat yaşanabildiği anlatılmıştır.
 - Yaşanabilir Bir Kent Olarak İzmir

Bu alt temada ise göçün ilk zamanları her ne kadar zor da olsa İzmir’deki kişilerin birbirine hoşgörülü tavrı ve İzmir’in daha yaşanabilir bir kent olması anlatılmıştır.
- Yeni Bir Babalığa Doğru Yürüyüş
 - Göç Sonrası Zorluklar

Göç sonrasında babaların anlattığı deneyimlerde yaşanan zorluklar vurgulanmıştır. Bu alt tema ise bu anlatılardan oluşmuştur.
 - Babalık Sorumluluğunun Pek Çok Düşünce ile Artması

Bu alt temada babalar hem çocuklarına hem de ailelerine karşı göç sonrasında artan sorumluluklarını anlatmışlardır. Bu sorumluluklara da pek çok düşünce eşlik etmiştir.
 - İki Kere Baba Olmak

Bu alt temada Alevi baba olmanın iki yönü vurgulanmıştır. Bu iki yönün biri babalığın getirdiği sorumluluklar bir diğeri de azınlık olmanın getirdiği sorumluluklardır.
 - Buna Bak! Bu Ağacı Ben Büyüttüm ve O Ne Kadar Güzel!

Bu alt temada ise yaşanan pek çok zorluğa rağmen babalığın ne kadar güzel bir his olduğu bir ağacı büyütme benzetmesi ise vurgulanmıştır.
 - Birbirimize Daha Çok Sarıldık

Burada ise yaşanan zorluklarla aile olarak birbirine bağlanarak baş edildiği vurgulanmıştır.

- Birinci Kuşak Babalardan İkinci Kuşak Babalara Babalığın Geçen Zamanla Aktarımı
 - Üst kuşakla çatışmamaktan, Çatışmaların Yaşanabilmesine
Birinci kuşak babalar babalarıyla çatışma yaşayamazken bu durum zamanla ikinci kuşak babaların babalarıyla çatışma yaşayabildiği bir yere gitmiştir.
 - Hala Korumacılık ancak Daha Çok Özgürlük
Hem birinci hem de ikinci kuşak babalarda çocukları korumak benzer bir tema olarak vurgulanmıştır. Ancak birinci kuşak babalar için çocuklarını korumamak zaman zaman onları baskılamaktan geçerken, ikinci kuşak babalar için çocuklarını korumanın yolu onları daha özgüvenli yetiştirebilmektir.
 - Babalığın Yaşanabilmesi
Birinci kuşak babalar kültürleri gereği kendi ebeveynlerinin yanında babalıklarını yaşamakta zorlansalar da bu durum zamanla değişerek babalık daha kolay yaşanabilmiştir.
 - Memleketimi Özlüyorum!
Bu alt temada hem birinci hem de ikinci kuşak Alevi babalar için ortaklaşan memleket özlemi anlatılmıştır.
 - Aleviliği Yaşatma Arzusu
Bu alt temada ise yaşanan zorluklara rağmen Alevi kültürünü yaşatma arzusu dile getirilmiştir.

Sizlere bu araştırmaya katılmayı kabul ederek, yaşam deneyimlerinizi benimle paylaştığınızdan dolayı tekrar teşekkür ederim. Herhangi bir sorunuz, yorumunuz ya da araştırmacı olarak kapsayamadığımı düşündüğünüz noktalar için eklemek istedikleriniz var ise bunları duyabilirsem oldukça sevinirim.

Deneyimlerinizi dinlememe izin verdiğiniz ve bu süreçte bana katılmayı kabul ettiğiniz için teşekkür eder, keyifli günler dilerim.

Utku.

APPENDIX G. ETHICS BOARD APPROVAL

Ethics Board Approval is available in the printed version of this dissertation.